

original sources of individual lemmata are given without mentioning specific verse numbers. Occasionally, references to the relevant secondary literature are inserted. A welcome unusual addition is a separate index of the Sanskrit words at the end of the book. The dictionary was obviously collated at great speed and would have benefited from more extensive consultation. In this way the lacunae and minor mistakes could have been limited. The Introduction claims without hesitation that the Śvetāmbara canon of forty-five texts was redacted in 508 CE, though the debated conventional dates are CE 453 or 466 (p. 1). There is also no specific 'school' associated with another cited list of fifty-two canonical texts. Moreover, the use of the word *Jinisten* (p. 1) for the modern word *Jains* (Skt. *Jainas*) sounds somewhat old fashioned. One wonders whether German Jains would recognise themselves if so addressed.

However, these are minor criticisms. Students of Indology and those who study Jainism from the point of view of Anthropology, History or the Study of Religions will welcome this extremely useful and informative dictionary, which is available in paperback. The author has to be congratulated for having accomplished within a short period of time what four generations of distinguished Prakrit scholarship in Germany failed to do. With his two dictionaries he has prepared the ground for a transformation of Jainology in the German-speaking world from an inaccessible 'secret science' of academic elites into a subject which can be easily learned and taught.

Peter Flügel

PAUL DUNDAS, *The Jains. Second Edition.* (Library of Religious Beliefs and Practices). London: Routledge, 2002. XIV, 354 pages, index, US\$ 35.95. ISBN 0-415-26606-8(pbk), 0-145-26605-X (hbk).

At present, only four textbooks in European languages can be recommended unreservedly to any student of Jainism. The oldest and still most comprehensive work is Helmuth von Glasenapp's *Der Jainismus: Eine Indische Erlösungsreligion* (Berlin: Alf Häger Verlag, 1925) which was belatedly translated into English under the title *Jainism. An Indian Religion of Salvation* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidas, 1999). Although it contains long chapters on the history of Jainism and the Jain scriptures, the presentation of Jain doctrine is synchronic. It is largely based on the *Tattvārthasūtra* of Umāsvāti of the 4th Century CE, the only text which is accepted by most Jains. Yet, sources from all periods are used, under the assumption that the 'essential aspects' of Jain doctrine remained the same through the ages. At the time, Glasenapp's chapters on Jain universal history and hagiography were original contributions. Their principal sources are the works of the Śvetāmbara authors Hemacandra (12th CE) and Vinayavijaya (17th CE), though conscious attempts are made to give equal consideration to Digambara views throughout. The last chapters of the book provide a general depiction of

Jain society and contemporary religious practice on the basis of secondary sources.

One decade after *Der Jainismus*, Walther Schubring's modern classic *Die Lehre der Jainas. Nach den alten Quellen dargestellt* (Berlin: Walter De Gruyter & Co., 1935) appeared, and a translation of the revised German text was published in 1962 (*The Doctrine of the Jainas. Described after the Old Sources* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidas, 1962/1977/2000)). For a long time it remained the only systematic representation of Jainism in English – its standard portrait. Schubring's exemplary book remains unsurpassed as a work of original research. Yet its scope is limited. It offers only an analytical summary of the contents of the Śvetāmbara canon. Post-canonical and Digambara sources are not covered. Nor does the book convey an impression of contemporary Jain religious life. Moreover, it is written in a condensed *sūtra*-like style which restricts its usefulness for teaching and learning. The study is not a-historical *per se*. Schubring gives many clues how the individual components of the canonical compilations can be dated, but inevitably presents the material as a synchronic totality. The first accessible scholarly introduction to Jainism for the English speaking readership, and therefore for a global audience, was Padmanabh S. Jaini's *The Jaina Path of Purification* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979). It is the clear favourite of students, because of its lucid style, insightful interpretations and ample learnable detail of classical Jain soteriology and ritual. In contrast to Schubring's book, the text is mainly based on post-canonical and Digambara sources. In scope and structure the work resembles Glasenapp's text, although it focuses almost exclusively on Jain ethics and ascetic practice, with an excellent chapter on the category *samyak-darśana*, or right insight, at its centre.

For different reasons, Glasenapp, Schubring and Jaini present canonical and classical Jain doctrines in an a-historical form. Not much consideration is given to the differences between canonical and classical Jainism, nor to post-classical, medieval and modern developments, such as the emergence of the contemporary Jain sub-sects, in particular the aniconic sectarian Jain traditions, from the 11th century onwards, or current religious practices, which are only hinted at because of a lack of information. These previously unresearched aspects were for the first time explicitly addressed in Paul Dundas' admirable study *The Jains* (London: Routledge, 1992), which was sold out within a few months. The long overdue and much improved second revised and expanded edition of this important work was published ten years later. Though structurally identical, it is seventy-eight pages longer due to the publisher's use of a larger font, added material, an extended index and bibliography, as well as expanded notes, reflecting the unprecedented increase of research on this once obscure subject during the last decade. The value of the text has been further enhanced by the use of diacritics throughout the text whose omission was much lamented by reviewers of the first edition. Originally, the work was conceived as a primer on Jainism for the series *Library of Religious Beliefs and Practices* (edited by John

Hinnells and Ninian Smart) which produces scholarly introductions to the religions of the world. Yet, as in the case of Glasenapp, Schubring and Jaini, Dundas' book is not really a text for the beginner (as seven years of undergraduate teaching of Jainism taught the present writer). It is rather a commented summary of the state of the art in Jain Studies, drawing on both textual and ethnographic sources, which became increasingly available since 1985, while contextualising the relevance of recent findings within the wider academic discourse on South Asian religion, culture and society. The style of the well written book is discursive rather than encyclopaedic or matter of fact. Specialists and students alike are invited to deliberate with the author over the numerous points of detail of Jain history and culture which remain obscure, and many, now updated, sections contain nuggets of original research or reflect the author's extensive publications in this field.

An important aspect of the book which has not been sufficiently appreciated by reviewers of the first edition such as K.R. Norman (*Modern Asian Studies* 29, 2 (1995): 439–441), perhaps because it is too obvious, is the shift from *Jainism* to *Jains* in the title of the book, which signals a conscious move away from the over-reliance on texts and doctrines towards the study of the agents of religious history. Dundas does not attempt 'to give an ethnographic account of Jainism' (p. 11). But his style of writing history adopts the outlook and results of the new field studies and integrates them with the classical Indological approach befitting a professional Sanskritist. Rather than textual ideals, questions of practice and identity of 'individuals, monks and nuns, laymen and laywomen, who would down through the centuries describe themselves and their mode of life as Jain' (p. 3) move into the foreground. Who are the Jains? Dundas starts with the modern Sanskrit dictionaries and defines the *Jains* (Sanskrit *Jaina*) as the followers of the *Jinas*, the spiritual conquerors, such as Mahāvīra, the last prophet of the Jains: 'The Jains are at the most basic level those who credit these spiritual conquerors with total authority and act according to their teaching of the Three Jewels, namely, right knowledge, right faith and right conduct' (p. 3). This definition alludes to the first aphorism of the *Tattvārthasūtra* which lists the three principal means of salvation. The problem is that most lay Jains, the *śrāvakas* or listeners whose historical role Dundas' book strives to reassess, are unable to live up to this high ideal and would not qualify as category members. Proper knowledge and proper practice are difficult to attain at the best of times even for faithful ascetics. Dundas points out that it is 'not clear when the term "Jain" was first employed to designate an adherent of a specific religious path', but speculates that 'it was probably in use by the early centuries of the common era', 'it was no doubt the gradual emergence of a self-aware laity supporting the bondless ascetic which led to "Jain" eventually becoming current for both the teachings of the religion and those who followed them' (p. 3f.). This may, however, not have happened before the 17th century, becoming widespread only in the 19th and 20th centuries. There is no clear evidence for earlier uses of the word *Jaina* in the sense of 'followers of the Jinas' to date. On the other hand,

Dundas analyses the contextually 'shifting nature' of Jain-Hindu self-categorisations and religious practices and in the new edition reiterates a point that is generally associated with Louis Dumont's work on caste – that there is no 'all or nothing' exclusivity of religious identity in 'South Asia' but 'a commonality of religious culture' (p. 6f.). Yet, this hypothesis clearly does not correspond to the contemporary participants' view: 'It would be misleading to pursue this too far', writes Dundas. 'In common with many contemporary Jain writers, I would wish to see Jainism [sic!] as representing the various levels of meaning embodied in the Sanskrit word *samskr̥ti*, "culture", "civilisation", a specifically Jain mode of life which is independent, coherent and self-contained and yet at times can also intersect with the conceptual world which surrounds it' (p. 7). The implications of the recent analytical distinction between *Jainism* and *Jains* (see also the work of John E. Cort) are by no means certain, neither for the Jains nor for academic analysis, and remain to be explored since there are no easy alternatives. The title of the book signals the opening up of a new field for research. It does not pretend to be the last word.

There are minor points in both editions of the book which will continue to provoke criticism, at least from within the Jain community. Statements such as 'The major sect, numerically at any rate, is the Śvetāmbara, 'White-clad' (p. 3) are somewhat speculative in the absence of hard data, but reflect the continuing lack of detailed studies on the Digambara tradition. The somewhat mislabelled section 'recent developments' covers the period from the 15th century, and assembles for the first time material on the aniconic Jain traditions which are followed by approximately 30% of all Jains without any details being mentioned in other textbooks. It also describes the 20th century lay movements of Śrīmad Rājacandra and Kāñjī Svāmī, without however marking out the modern period. The chapter heading demonstrates the continuing focus on the doctrinal works of the classical period in the current academic discourse on Jainism. More research can be expected in these areas as well.

Dundas' book emphatically succeeds in presenting a succinct summary of more two thousand years of religious and social history while boldly venturing into unexplored territory and setting new targets for future research. Given the vast amount of new research since the 1980s, when the groundwork for the first edition was done, one wonders whether a further revised edition can be expected or rather a completely new account, oriented towards the history and ethnography of the contemporary sub-sects each with its own official doctrinal interpretation and idiosyncratic ritual and institutional framework, which will build upon the four classical textbooks of the Jain tradition.

Peter Flügel