Wijesekera (O.H.D.A)
Ph.D., 1936.
Indo-Aryan.

REFERENCE COPY.
SYNTAX
of
THE CASES
in
THE PĀLI NIKĀYAS.

by

O. H. de A. Wijesekera B.A.(Lond)


1936
An Abstract of the Thesis.

"The Syntax of Cases in the Pāli Nikāya's!"

The thesis is based principally on the prose parts of the Sutta Piṭaka but peculiarities of the syntax of gāthā literature have been dealt with in comparison with the former. This study is made in seven chapters each of which discusses one case with a variety of examples showing its fundamental notions, general and special applications, and points of contact with other cases. The morphology of cases in relation to syntax has been treated in a separate introductory chapter, which forms a supplement to Geiger's presentation in his Pāli Literatur und Sprache.

In dealing with syntactic facts observations have been made in three ways, viz. the grammatical, the logical, and the psychological point of view. Syntactic categories are established according to the available material in comparison with those valid for Vedic and Class. Sanskrit wherever it was possible, with special consideration of points of similarity with the Vedic usage. In following this historical and comparative method parallelisms with the older idiom and divergences from it have been noted by references to Speyer's conclusions in particular and to those of other authorities such as Brugmann in general.

The syntactic notions of local grammarians, chiefly of Pāṇini, Moggallāna and Kaccāyana have been critically examined and discussed in relation to Nikāya concinnity. As far as possible
their method of looking at fundamental syntactic problems has been considered with reference to the scientific point of view. From the Pāli Commentaries Buddhaghosa's observations on the cases, especially those with regard to archaic and sporadic uses, have been collated and compared with those of orthodox grammarians as well as of modern scholarship.

O. H. De A. Wijesekera
B.A. (Honours), Lond.

14th Nov. 35.
Syntax of the Cases in the Pali Nikayas.

INTRODUCTION.
INTRODUCTION.

The scope of the following treatise is a detailed analysis of the syntax of cases in the Pāli Nikāyas. With the latter we refer mainly to the prose section of the Sutta-Piṭaka, that which is usually designated by "the older Nikāyas". When necessary either for illustration or for explanation (especially in instances where examples are not found in prose attesting to a normal or historical construction), the Gāthā literature has been drawn upon.

It is sufficiently clear from these investigations that the Pāli Nikāyas represent an idiom which in its general outlines bears close affinities to Vedic syntax, thereby showing a nearer relation to Indo-European than Classical Sanskrit; a fact that may be considered as further support for Franke's contention that "certain appearances exclude the possibility that (Classical) Sanskrit and Pāli (in growth and development) belonged to one and the same region" (Z.D.M.G. 1892, pp.315 et seq.). At the same time, however, there are conspicuous divergences in Pāli from Vedic as much as from later Sanskrit, (vide §§ 45, 65, 106, 122, 164 etc.). The fact of its being a Prākritic dialect, as distinct from the refined speech (samskrta), also explains the marked influence of the popular idiom on its syntax, which is due in most cases to psychological reasons (vide §§
Other points under consideration which also throw light on the understanding of Pāli (and Indo-Aryan) syntax are: (1) The remarks of indigenous grammarians as well as of commentators, on Pāli cases. Although on the whole Pāli grammarians make it a point to adduce examples from the canonical books themselves, in laying down rules they merely follow the precedence of Sanskrit writers, particularly of Pāṇini. It must be stated, however, in favour of Kaccāyana that he pays more attention to what may be called 'exceptional usages' (cp. §76) than Moggallāna, the prominent feature of whose observations is that he takes a wider view than the former. For the most part they repeat the conventional illustrations of Pāṇini. One notable deviation in the terminology of commentators from the grammarians is found with reference to the terms used to denote the cases (kārakas). This is particularly seen in the case of Buddhaghosa's designation of the nom., acc., abl. and loc. (see Appendix). An effort has been made to do justice to their point of view and bring it into line with our comparative and psychological methods. (2) The morphological aspects of the cases in its bearing on their form and function in relation to Sanskrit (especially Vedic) and also Prākrit. This is also important for developments in Pāli concerning case affinities and substitution. A special (the introductory) chapter has been
devoted to this question.

It has further been endeavoured to show the importance of an understanding of syntactical relations for a correct interpretation of the Pali texts. A considerable number of wrong translations (sometimes doctrinally important) have been found to contain errors which could only be detected through a more intense study of the Pali case syntax.

London 26 Jan. 1936. O.H.de A.W.
ABBREVIATIONS.

1. General and Grammatical.

abl. = ablative
acc. = accusative
adj. = adjective
adv. = adverb
Balt.-Slav. = Balto-Slavonic
c. = with (cum)
Comy. = Commentary
dat. = dative
Dict. = Dictionary
Eng. = English
et seq. = and the following
ex. = example
f. (fem.) = feminine
f.n. = foot-note
gen. = genitive
ger. = gerund
Gr. = Grammar
I.E. = Indo-European
inst. = instrumental
kaś. = kāśikā (on the sūtras of Pāṇini)
lit. = literally
loc. = locative
loc. cit. = in the place cited
m. (masc.) = masculine
nom. = nominative
nt. (neut.) = neuter
obj. = object
para. = paragraph
pl. = plural
p.p.p. = past passive participle
Prk. = Prākrit
R. (Rem.) = Remark
sci. = being understood (scilicet)
sg. = singular
Skr. = Sanskrit
subj. = subject
s.v. = under the word (sub voce)
vārtt. = vārttikā
Ved. = Vedic
voc. = vocative
### 2. Titles of Books, Periodicals etc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HKS</td>
<td>Untersuchungen zur Kausasyntax der indogermanischen Sprachen von Wilhelm Havers, Strassburg 1911.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.P.T.S.</td>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; Päli Text Society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.R.A.S.</td>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; Royal Asiatic Society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K.Z.</td>
<td>Kuhn's Zeitschrift für vergleichende Sprachforschung.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pāṇ.</td>
<td>Pāṇini's Aṣṭādhāhyāya.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLS</td>
<td>Pāli Literatur und Sprache von W. Geiger, Strassburg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS</td>
<td>Sanskrit Syntax by J.S. Speyer, Leyden 1886.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VG</td>
<td>Vedic Grammar by A.A. Macdonell, Strassburg 1910.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VGS</td>
<td>A Vedic Grammar for Students by A.A. Macdonell, Oxford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VSS</td>
<td>Vedische und Sanskrit-Syntax by Speyer, Strassburg 1891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZfB</td>
<td>Zeitschrift für Buddhismus.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Abbreviations of Pāli Texts appear in the form used by the Pāli Text Society (see P.T.S.Dict.). To these add:
- Pj. ......... Paramatthajotikā
- Pps. ......... Pāpañicasūdantī
- Sum. ......... Sumanā galavilāsinī.
REFERENCE.

Brugmann (Karl)........ 1. Kurze vergleichende Grammatik der indogermanischen Sprachen, Berlin 1933.

2. Griechische Grammatik, München 1900.

Chakravarti (P.C.)..... The Philosophy of Sanskrit Grammar, Calcutta University Publication 1930.

Cappeller (Carl)....... Sanskrit-English Dictionary, Strassburg 1891.

Duroiselle (Chas.)..... Pāli Grammar, Rangoon 1921.

Franke (R.Otto)....... Pāli und Sanskrit, Strassburg 1902.


Havers (Wilhelm)....... Untersuchungen zur Kaußyntax der indogermanischen Sprachen, Strassburg 1911.

Hultsch (E.)........... Inscriptions of Asoka (Corpus Inscriptionum Indicarum Vol.I.) 1925.


Macdonell (A.A.)..... 1. A Vedic Grammar for Students, Oxford 19...


Minayef (J.)......... Grammaire Pālie, Paris 1874.

Müller (Ed.)......... A Simplified Grammar of the Pāli Language, London 1884.

Renou (Louis) ........ Grammaire Sanscrite, Paris 1930.

Smith (Maria Wilkins) ... Studies in the Syntax of the Gathas of Zara-thushtra (Language Dissertations published by the Linguistic Society of America 1929.).

Speyer (J.S.) ......... 1. Sanskrit Syntax, Leyden 1886.


Wilson (H.H.) ........ Sanskrit Grammar, London 1847 (second ed.)
CASE FORMS in the NIKAYAS.

(Introductory Chapter)
CASE-FORMS IN THE NIKĀYAS.

§1. Nominal Themes.

Although historically Pāli inherits its inflexion from the older language the original themes on the whole are continually being replaced by later ones mostly derived from oblique cases, a process seen clearly in the consonantal declension. Original vowel stems however are inflected as they are except in the diphthongal and r- declensions. In the former beside a few historical forms (PLS §88) cases formed from a new stem derived from original oblique cases are frequently found: e.g. nāvā M I.134 "ship", nom. sg. from a stem nāvā- (< Skr. acc. sg. nāvam, inst. nāvā); gavassa M I.429 "of the cow" dat.-gen. sg., abl. sg. gava D I. 201, loc. gave Sn 310 from a stem gava- (< Skr. inst. sg. gava etc. ); a stem gava- is also found in gāvī f. nom. sg. A IV.418, Ud 8,49, the long ā being due to the pl. forms (< Skr. nom. pl, gāvā etc.). In the latter (r- declension) a few cases occur from derived stems: e.g. satthāra inst. sg. D I.163 from a stem satthāra- (< Skr. acc. sg. satthāram). In the gāthā literature there is evidence for a stem in -u (from the base exhibited in the Skr. abl., gen., sg.) e.g. satthuno dat.-gen. sg. Sn 547,573; Thl.131 (cp. PLS §90).

But the consonant stems, especially those identical with roots, are comparatively rare in the Nikāyas due to the
phonetic law of the falling off of the final consonant in Pāli as in Prk. (cp.PLS §75). Only a few historical forms survive which point to consonant stems. Of these the new themes are mainly formed in two ways:

1. The final consonant of the Skr. nom. sg. which is either the stem terminal or its phonetic variant is elided and the stem thus vocalized is inflected according to the corresponding vowel declension of that gender, thus:

(a.) Radical stems:
- parisā- from Skr. pariṣad f. "assembly" e.g. parisāyaṁ loc. sg. D II.218; parisāsu pl. S II.27; It 64; vijju- from Skr. vidyut f. "lightning" e.g. vijju nom. sg. S I.100; A I.124;
- brahma- from Skr. brahman m. e.g. brahman acc. sg. Sn 151, 286; M I.2, 328; muddha- from Skr. mūrdhan m. "head" e.g. muddhaṁ acc. sg. Dh 72; Sn 987; D I.95; also neuter stems kamma-, pabba-, etc., from Skr. karman, parvan (PLS §94 for instances);
- brahmam acc. sg. Sn 151, 286; M I.2, 328; muddha- from Skr. mūrdhan m. "head" e.g. muddhaṁ acc. sg. Dh 72; Sn 987; D I.95; also neuter stems kamma-, pabba-, etc., from Skr. karman, parvan (PLS §94 for instances);
- sēṭṭhī- from Skr. śreṣṭhīn m. "treasurer" e.g. sēṭṭhīsa gen. sg. S I.90;
- hatthī- from Skr. hastin m. "elephant" e.g. hatthī nom.pl. S I.211; sāmi- from Skr. svāmin m. "lord" e.g. sāmiṁ acc. sg. Sn 83; similarly thapattissa M II.23; cakkavattissa M III.176 gen. sg.;

(b.) an- stems:
- brahma- from Skr. brahman m. e.g. brahman acc. sg. Sn 151, 286; M I.2, 328; muddha- from Skr. mūrdhan m. "head" e.g. muddhaṁ acc. sg. Dh 72; Sn 987; D I.95; also neuter stems kamma-, pabba-, etc., from Skr. karman, parvan (PLS §94 for instances);
- brahmam acc. sg. Sn 151, 286; M I.2, 328; muddha- from Skr. mūrdhan m. "head" e.g. muddhaṁ acc. sg. Dh 72; Sn 987; D I.95; also neuter stems kamma-, pabba-, etc., from Skr. karman, parvan (PLS §94 for instances);
- sēṭṭhī- from Skr. śreṣṭhīn m. "treasurer" e.g. sēṭṭhīsa gen. sg. S I.90;
- hatthī- from Skr. hastin m. "elephant" e.g. hatthī nom.pl. S I.211; sāmi- from Skr. svāmin m. "lord" e.g. sāmiṁ acc. sg. Sn 83; similarly thapattissa M II.23; cakkavattissa M III.176 gen. sg.;

(c.) in- stems:
- sēṭṭhī- from Skr. śreṣṭhīn m. "treasurer" e.g. sēṭṭhīsa gen. sg. S I.90;
- hatthī- from Skr. hastin m. "elephant" e.g. hatthī nom.pl. S I.211; sāmi- from Skr. svāmin m. "lord" e.g. sāmiṁ acc. sg. Sn 83; similarly thapattissa M II.23; cakkavattissa M III.176 gen. sg.;

(d.) a- stems (Skr. -as, -is, -us):
- mana- from Skr. manas nt. "mind" e.g. manaṁ acc. sg. S IV.7; manassa dat.-gen. sg. S IV.17; mane loc.sg. A II.158; S I.40, also manasmiṁ S V.171; raja- from Skr. rajas nt. "dust" e.g. rajena inst. sg. M I.25; rajassa dat.-gen. sg. Sn 406;
- sira-, ura-, teja- from Skr. sīras, uras, tejas, e.g. sīrasmiṁ M II.75; urasmīn A I. 141; tejasmiṁ A V.319 loc.sg.
In this declension a nom. sg. in -o is frequently found agreeing with the masculine ending -o of the adjective pointing thereby to a change of gender, e.g. tamo vihato M I.22 "the darkness is destroyed"; mano anicco S IV.4 "the mind is impermanent"; mano dukkho S IV.2 "the mind is sorrow"; tejo pātukato M II.184 "the fire is kindled" mano supañihito Sn 165 "the mind is well directed". But that this change of gender is a later phenomenon due to the influence of the preceding -o on the adjectival ending as seen from the above examples is shown by the fact that when the adjective precedes the noun the original gender is preserved, e.g. santam tassa manam hoti Dh 96. -is stems: sappi- from sarpis and others (vide PLS §75); -us stems: cakkhu- from Skr. caksus nt. "eye" e.g. cakkhum nom. sg. S I.115; M III.136.

2. Themes are derived from the bases exhibited in original oblique cases, particularly the acc. sg. by virtue of its frequent use, thus: (a.) From original root stems as in: vācā- from Skr. vāc (< acc. sg. vācam) f. "speech" e.g. vācāya inst. sg. D I.114; vācā nom. pl. M III.76; D III.13; vācānaṃ gen. pl. Sn 454; pāda- from Skr. pād (< acc. sg. pāda) m. "foot" e.g. pāde loc. sg. A II.144; pāde acc. pl. Sn 573; (b.) From an- stems as in: raṇṇa- a sporadic stem from the weakest Skr. base rājā- m. "king" (cp. Skr. inst. rājā, loc. sg. rājā etc.) e.g. raṇño nom. sg. A II.113,116,117; raṇṇe loc. sg. D III.83; nāma- from Skr. nāman nt. "name" (cp. acc. sg. nāma) e.g. nāmena inst.
§2. Archaic Adverbs.

As remarked above there are a few historical forms in Pāli which without exception can be traced back to Vedic (cp. R.O. Franke, *Pāli und Sanskrit*, p. 150 et seq.). Some of these have lost their inflexional value in Pāli and come to be regarded as adverbs or prepositions, and, according to commentators, even as particles or indeclinables (nipāta). This is chiefly characteristic of genuine adverbial cases like the acc. and inst., and to a lesser extent of the abl., gen. and the loc. as well. In the Nikāyas 18 such forms occur mostly as adverbs of time.

Thus, from stems like vāsin- from Skr. vāsin m. "dweller" (< acc.sg. vāsinam) e.g. vāsine acc. pl. D II.272; similarly, palokine acc. pl. Th2.101 from Skr. pralokin; pānine acc. pl. Sn 220; vereinesu loc. pl. Dh 197; (d.) From nt-stems: āyasmanta- from Skr. āyuṣmant m. "venerable one" (< āyuṣmantam acc. sg.) e.g. āyasmante loc. sg. S I.56, III.133; āyasmantānam gen. pl. M I.64; similarly, arahante loc. sg. M I.254; mahantasmiṃ loc. sg. A I.148; bhavantānam gen. pl. M II.148; here there is also a new stem ending in -ata formed from the Skr. weak stem(ant) found in sg. oblique cases; e.g. arahatam acc. sg. A II.182 (yatra hi nāma taṃ Bhagavantāṃ arahatam sammāsambuddham āsādetabbaṃ); also-saṭo nom. sg. (instead of) sante) S V.333 (bhikkhu-saṭo-viharanto).
and place and rarely of manner, viz., a.) from original acc.: uddham "above" D I.23,153,251, II.293,294, III.104; A III.323, V.109; Sn 894; acc. sg. of Vedic ārāhva-; ciraṁ "for a long time" Sn 678,730, from Vedic cira-; ālam "rightly" M I.130; S II.18, from Vedic āraṁ acc. sg. of an obsolete stem āraṁ- "sufficient" (VGS §178); nattam "by night" Sn 1070, from Vedic acc. sg. nāktam (VGS §178.2); nāma "by name" or "namely" S I.33,235; Sn 167,177, from Vedic acc. sg. nāma of nāman nt. "name"; raho "secretly" M II.251, III.157, from Vedic ráhas acc. sg. of ráhas; khippam "soon" or "quickly" A II.118,III.164; Sn 413,682,998; Dh 65,137,236, 289, from Vedic adj. kṣipra (VGS §197.5.b.); sayam "by -self" D I.12; Sn 57,320, from Vedic svayām originally nom.sg. of svā- (VGS §115.a.). b.) from original inst.: divā "by day" S I.183; M I.125; Dh 387, from Vedic inst. sg. divā; micchā "wrongly" Sn 438,815(vide P.T.S.Dict. s.v.), from Vedic inst. sg. mithuyā found as mithyā in the Brāhmaṇas (VGS §199.6.a.); sāhasā "forcibly" Sn 123; A II.209, from Vedic inst. sg. sāhasā (VGS §178.3); musā "falsely" D I.52 from Vedic instf. sg. mṛṣā "by or with neglect". c.) from original abl.: pacchā "after, afterwards" D I.205; Sn 645, 773,949; Dh 172,314,421, from Vedic abl. sg. paścāt; ārā "far, far from" Sn 156,736; Dh 253, from Vedic ārāt (VGS § 178.5.). d.) from original gen.: cirassa "since long" "after a long while" e.g. na cirass' eva D III.11; sucirass' eva S I.193 also cirassam in same sense D I.179; S I.142,
where the nasal is due to the frequency of the acc. ending
-am as adverb; divassa used adverbially in compound with
divā (see b.) e.g. divā-divassa "early in the day" S II.95;
e.) from original loc.: ratto "by night" Sn 223; Th2. 312;
Dh 296, from loc. sg. rātrau. Pāli has two archaic dat. forms
cirāya "for long" Dh 342 and svātanśaya "for tomorrow" D I.12;
which however do not occur as such, that is to say adverbially,
in the older dialect.

§3. Dual Forms.

The main inflectional peculiarity of Pāli
and Prk. as compared with Vedic and Classical Skr. is the
loss of the dual in the former. Its place is taken by the
plural in all declensions (vide PLS §77.1.). So we find it
with all names of things by nature considered in pairs such
as eyes, ears, hands, legs etc., e.g. hatthe dhovati M II.
138 in place of hastau dhāvati in the earlier language;
similarly in dvandva-compounds usually expressed by the
dual in Skr.: e.g. ime pi candimurasuriye evam mahiddhike etc.
(acc. pl.) M I.69 and candimurasuriyānaś (gen. pl.) D I.10.
According to Geiger (PLS §77) dve and ubho are the only
regular dual forms existing in Pāli. The latter is the normal
masculine form (nom. and acc.) corresponding to Skr. ubhau
but the former is only the feminine or neuter form, which is
due to the fact that the nom. and acc. forms of numerals were
used without discrimination for all genders in Middle Indian
(cp. Pischel, Prk. Gr.§438). So it is found with masculine
nouns e.g. dve dharmā D II.60; dve pabbajitā D I.57. The form duve occurs only in gāthā literature e.g. Thl.245 (vide PLS §114). These forms however exist only sporadically for the dual as a number no more influences Pāli declensions. This is attested by the oblique case-forms of these in use as the loc. ubhosu (tīresu) S III.137; Sn 778; inst. ubhohi (hatthehi); gen. ubhinnam S I.62, which are formed simply by adding the normal plural endings to a stem *ubha- in the first two examples and the gen. appears to be formed on the analogy of other numerical forms (dvinnam, tin nam, catunnam etc.), beside the proper nom. ubho S I.87; A III.48; It 16, 43; Sn 661. There are however two or three other instances where we meet with probably the dual forms of dvandva-compounds. The first of these occurs in kasirena ghāsa cchādo labhati A I.107, where the Burmese MS.(Ph) has the v.l. ghāsaccam which is evidently a later 'correction'. At A III.85 the above reading of the P.T.S. text is repeated, but once A III.335 the phrase occurs as kasirena ghāsacchādo labbhati the passive form of the verb showing that ghāsacchādo is here regarded as the masculine nom. sg. of ghāsacchāda-. But the compound consists of two masculine words ghāso "food" = Skr. ghāsāḥ and acchādo "clothing" = Skr. acchādaḥ, and as such, must be treated either as a dual or collectively as a neuter sg.. The proper construction then would be ghāsacchādam labhati or labbhanti with ghāsacchādā, the pl. being employed for the dual. So the above reading with the passive is ruled out, establishing the first reading
ghāsacakāda labhati as correct. Consequently the ending -o would represent the older masculine dual in -au, as in ubho (< ubhau ). But there is however another alternative, that is, we may possibly be having here an earlier ghāsacakāda acc. pl., the -e having been later regarded as an eastern form and changed to -o. The other occurs in the phrase nāthi hāyanavadāhane nāthi ukkāṃśāvakāmse "there is no high and low, there is no increase and decrease". These occur at least twice in the Nikāyas viz., at S. III. 212 and M. I. 518 and so cannot be misprints. If these coordinative compounds are taken as neuter sg. the form may be the eastern -e, but if, as is quite possible, they are used as plurals then the ending -e represents the dual nt. nom., subject of nāthi which can agree with any number. Another instance of a similar doubtful character is āyasmante, voc. M. I. 474, which probably is an eastern form standing for āyasmanu corresponding to the Skr. dual āyasmantau (vide §10).

INFLEXIONAL TERMINATIONS.

§4. Stems in -a (m. Ant.).

In the singular all the historical endings are retained, with the phonetic changes peculiar to Pāli, except the dat. which has been superseded by the gen. form -ssa. The older ending -āya, however, appears in the Nikāyas quite a number of times but it has there almost
completely lost its original significance and in the few instances attested, denotes only aim, direction or purpose (vide §§96, 113, 106 & 107, cp. PLS §74). The reason for this replacement is to be found in the fact that already in the earlier dialect the dat. by virtue of its syntactical character had come into logical contact with the gen. in many of its proper functions. So, even as early as in the period of the Brāhmaṇas (VGS §202.B.2.a.), the latter had encroached upon many uses of the former and in later Skr. almost ousted it from its legitimate sphere of employment (SS §80). This process is seen also in the Prākrits where the -āya form as represented by its phonetic developments -ā, āyā, -āe etc. (Pischel Prk.Gr. § 363) occurs mostly in the artificial dialect of dramatic poetry (SS p.100 f.n.).

§5. Pronominal Endings.

The influence of the pronominal declension is found in the endings -smā and -āmā which exist beside the normal -ā (Skr. -āt) of the abl. sg. and -smī, -āmī beside the historical -e of the loc. sg.

a) An analysis of the Dīgha- and Majjhima Nikāyas has shown that the form -smā occurs only 4 times (leaving aside the repetitions) against some 95 of the -ā form. Of the latter 21 denote cause, -smā being never used in that sense in spite of the causal implication of the pronominal adverbs kasmā "why", tasmā "therefore" and yasmā "wherefore".
It is also significant that it is always the -ā form that is used in syntactical agreement with the 6 prepositional adverbs 'governing' the abl., viz., yāva, aññatra, tiro, uddhāma, adho and paraṃ. e.g. yāva c'aggā yāva ca mūlā D I. 75; M II.170,III.12 "from the top to bottom"; aññatra avusitattā D I.90 "except from imperfection"; tiro raṭṭhā tiro janapadā M II.167 "across country and province"; uddhāma pādatāḷaadhokasamatthakā D III.104; M III.90 "above from the soles of the feet and down from the top of the head"; paraṃ marañā M III.101 "after death". The forms in -smā and -māhā are confined to one particular syntactical category, viz., the abl. of separation (in the wider sense). So the former (-smā) mainly occurs in connection with the verb pabbajati "sets out", especially in the stock phrase agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajati "he sets out from home to homelessness" e.g. D I.18,60,115,202;II.16,230;III.31,147; M I.200,267,345,459;II.66,181;III.261. It also occurs in gāthā literature e.g. Sn 1002,1003, and with another verb of motion at S I.185,i.e. agārasmā anagāriyaṃ nikkhatā; also with the causative pabbājeti "expels" at D I.92,i.e. raṭṭhasmā pabbājesi. The historical form -ā however is the more popular even here, occurring in the Dīgha- and Majjhima Nikāyas over 25 times with about 15 different verbs of motion. The verb pabbajati itself occurs twice with the -ā form, viz., Sakyakulē pabbajito M II.167, and once its causative: raṭṭhā vā nagaṟā vā pabbājeyyum D I.90,91. In all the Nikāyas the -smā form appears only with 4 other verbs all of which
signify detachment, release, or aloofness. e.g. anissaṭṭa bhavasmā Ud 33 "not free from becoming"; ganaṃma vūpakaṭṭho M III.110; Ud 41; A IV.435 "detached or aloof from the crowd"; virato methunasmā D.II.241(verse) "abstaining from copulation"; na parimuccanti dukkhamma M I.8,66 "are not released from sorrow". The form -mhi which is its phonetic development is even rarer in the Nikāyas, occurring only 3 times in the Dīgha and Majjhima, viz., /maṅgaramhi pāyāsi M II.119; Rājagahamhi niyyāsi D I.49 and muṇjaṃhā isīkaṃ pabbāheyya M II.17 "would draw out the reed from the muṇja grass". These examples show that -mhi too is used only for the notion of separation, particularly with verbs of motion denoting that from which there is a movement. It is evident therefore that the pronominal endings were confined, in the case of the abl., to its function of signifying separation, while the historical ending -ā was still in the Nikāyas the popular form for all its varied uses in general.

b) The pronominal form of the loc. sg. in -sīmī and its phonetic variant -mhi are not so rare in the Nikāyas as the corresponding abl. forms. The former is by far the more frequent of the two and occurs in almost every syntactical function of that case. e.g. lokasīmī viharati D I.23 "he lives in the world"; veyyākaraṇasīmī bhaṅgamāne D I.46 "while the explanation was being declared"; sīlasīmī hoti D I.65,66,67 "is part of his virtue". The latter -mhi however is less frequent and is mostly used in verse, decidedly metri causa. e.g. vanamhi jhāyato Sn 221; setamhi
chatte anuhīramāne D II.15(verse) and the intermediate phonetical stage is also found in verse, e.g. antalikḥasmi S I.67 "in the intermediate space or sky". The v.l. -asmī which appears in one text is not in keeping with the metre.

§6. Inst. sg. in -ā.

With regard to the inst. sg. it has to be remarked that beside the usual form in -ena a form in -ā corresponding to Vedic -ā (inst. sg. of a-nouns, m. & f.) occurs many times in the Nikāyas (cp.PLS §78). Franke has conclusively shown that such forms represent the inst. and not the original abl. sg. in -āt (Z.D.M.G.1892,pp.313-316). It occurs with both masculine and neuter nouns, especially in the frequent phrase sahatthāi santappesi "served or fed with his own hand" e.g. M I.393;II.50; A I.274; D I.109; Sn p.107 etc. which the Comy. glosses in most places by sahatthena (e.g. 'sahatthāi sahatthena' Manorathapūrani II.372; Sumanāgalavilāśini I.277). It occurs but once in the Nikāyas outside this context i.e. in na sahatthāi pahravīṃ khanati M II.51 "he does not dig the ground with his hand". Here too the Comy. has asahatthena (Sum.III. 814). This ending however is not restricted to the above word. In mā sokā pahato bhava Thl.32 "do not be overcome by grief", sokā is definitely the inst. sg. denoting means (cp.PLS §78). Since the abl. in -ā (< Skr. -āt) does not occur in this
function, that is, to signify means in general or instrument, in the Nikāyas, we may regard the following as representing original inst. in -ā of neuter verbal nouns: dāsanā pahātābbā M I.7 et. seq.; bhāvanā pahātābbā M I.12; vinodanā pahātābbā "should be got rid of by ..." M I.12. In all these examples the verb pahātābbā would require an inst. of means (by which) rather than an abl. of cause (through which), since effort on the part of the agent is implied. Similarly in viriyā nimmathitām padhānābbhinnābatti m M II.130 the sense prompts us to regard the -ā as inst. sg., Chalmers translating it correctly as "kindled by effort and fired by striving", the preposition by implying means and not cause. In sahattha referred to above also the inst. denotes means and is not due to a preposition saha which Franke (loc.cit.) thought is here contracted to sa-. On the other hand the compound stands for *svahastā, sa- being the reflexive pronominal adjective Vedic or Skr. sva. When this inst. occurs with saha, the preposition meaning with or together with, the sense implied is simultaneity or association (vide Sociative Inst.§64). e.g. saha parinibbānā D II.156; S I.159 "simultaneously with the passing away"; saha vacanā Ud 16 "simultaneously with the word" i.e. "as he spoke" (cp. Geiger, FLS §78.1. " zugleich mit dem Wort, im Augenblick, wo er es sagte ").

In the plural of the a-declension Pāli differs from Skr. in the acc. and dat. The historical ending -ān of the acc. is lost due to fact that, since phonetically it becomes -ā by the falling off of the terminal consonant, it is liable to be confused with the nom. pl. in -ā. The form in -e which is the regular acc. ending in Pāli and Prākrit is borrowed, as Geiger suggests (PLS §78.3), from the pronominal declension, where the original masculine acc. pl. -tān took the form of the nom. -te because it had lost its accusative character through the dropping of -n and in order to distinguish it from the feminine -tāh which too would give in Pāli -tā. But Geiger has drawn attention to one solitary survival of the -ān form appearing in gāthā literature, viz., in the eempo phrase veñhāñ-upasañkamiñ Thl.564.

§8. The Inst. Pl. in -e.

In the inst. pl. the regular form is -ehi, the phonetic development of Skr. -ebhīs. It has been shown that the aspirate bh in Pāli is retained when it is in the body of the word but is generally reduced to -h- in inflexional endings (cp. R.L. Turner, The phonetic Weakness of Terminal Elements in Indo-Āryan, J.R.A.S. 1927, p.227). Nevertheless the intermediate form -ebhi also occurs, though not frequently, mostly in archaic instances (cp. Geiger PLS §79). e.g. ariyebhi Dh 162; Ud 6. The same
is found in other declensions e.g. jhāyibhi jhēnasīlibhī M Ii.

13. The inst. pl. in -aia which is in fact the older of the two in Old Indian has come to be gradually lost even in Vedic (vide Macdonell, VGS p. 78 f. n.). It has left no trace either in Pāli or in Prk. owing to the confusion with acc. pl. in -e, except for one solitary instance. The form dhīro occurring at Dh 207, it has been suggested by V. Lesny (A new reading of the Dhammapada 207, J.P.T.S. 1928), stands for dhīra, the older inst. pl. In all the MSS. of the Pāli version of the Dhammapada the reading is:

bālasaṅgataśāri hi dīghām adhāna socati,
dukkha bālehi saṃvāsa amitten' eva sabbadā,
dhīro ca sukhasaṃvāsa nātinam va samāgamo.

"Verily he who walks in the company of fools suffers for a long time; living with fools is always painful as with an enemy; living with the pleasant is wise, like meeting with kinsfolk". The underlined is the literal rendering of the phrase dhīro ca sukhasaṃvāso and the Comy. (Dhammapadattha kathā P.T.S. Vol. III. p. 272) too follows the same reading but does not comment on the form dhīro. However, as has been pointed out so cleverly by Lesny such a translation does not indeed make good sense, though grammatically there can be no objection to it. It is evident from the parallelism with the first part of the second line, viz., dukkha bālehi saṃvāso, that the reading should be either sukho ca dhīrasaṃvāso, as Max Muller suggested, or more likely dhīra ca
ca sukhasamvāso, as Lesný takes it. The latter is supported by the Kharoṣṭhī version which attests to the fact that the second part is -sukhasamvāso (...suhavasa Ṣātihi va samakamo, 39, Les fragments Dutreuil de Rhins, par Emile Senart. Journal Asiatique 1895, p.297), and not dhirasamvāso, and also by the Skr. text which fills in the lacuna in the Kharoṣṭhī version by the inst. pl. dhiraś (dhiraś tu sukhasamvāso, XXX.26, L.de la Vallée Poussin Documents sanscrits de la seconde collection M.A.Stein J.R.A.S. 1912, p.369). Geiger (FLS §79) has instanced another place where the inst. pl. -e is authentic (Buḍravamsa 2.32, guṇe dasah'upagataḥ) but the -e forms given by E.Müller in his Simplified Grammar of the Pāli Language as inst. pl. used with the sense of the dat. (such as yācaka etc.) are not however instrumentals but only the loc. sg.(-e) denoting the person to whom something is given or offered.


The dat. pl. in Skr. is the same as the abl. pl. ending in -(e)bhyas which is retained in Pāli for the latter (abl. pl.) of a-stems as -ehi, which has been shown to be a phonetic development of *ebhio ( < *ebhiyo ), the aspirate being reduced to -h- as described above (§ 8). Pandit S.Majumdar Sastri in a monogram entitled 'The Dative Plural in Pāli', on the evidence of some survivals of the old dat. pl. in -ehi in the Asokan dialect, suggested the possibility of a few of these forms remaining in Pāli where
the form normally used is the ending -śnam of the gen. which as pointed out above (§4) is due to the syntactical displacement of the dat., in the pl. as in the sg., by the gen. But a close investigation of the Nikāyas shows that no certain vestiges of ãhistorical dat. pl. exists in Pāli. There are however some instances of the -ahi form the sense of which seem to be bordering on that of the dat. (or the abl.) In the frequent phrase yāvadeva manussehi suppakāsitam D II. 113, 114, 219, III.122 etc., which Rhys Davids (Dialogues II.113, translated as "until in a word it shall have been well proclaimed among men", manussehi can be syntactically the dat. denoting the persons to whom something is proclaimed (vide §93.a.b.c.d). There is also the reading Yāva deva-manussehi Ud 64 which is supported by the Comy. on D III.122 'deva-lokato yāva manuṣa-lokā suppakāsitam' and also by the Buddhist Skr. parallel at Divyāvadāna 201 'yāvad-deva manuṣyēbhyaḥ'. Whatever the reading may be it is an open question whether the ending -ahi here represents an older dat.(pl. -abhyaḥ) agreeing with the verb 'suppakāsitam' or an abl. construed with yāva taken as a preposition. But if the latter be the case the rendering would be "proclaimed upto or as far as (gods and) men" which however does not make good sense. On the other hand if yāva is taken merely as the adverb meaning "completely" (cp. Rhys Davids, "in a word") or "just" as found in alam vo tam yāvadeva sītassa
paṭṭāghāṭāya D III.130 "just enough to stand the cold", the phrase makes satisfactory sense. Accordingly it is quite probable that what we have here is an old dat. pl. We are confronted with a similar difficulty in the case of -əhi in ayaḥ bhikkhave uppati asādhāraṇā puthujjanehi A II.128 "this birth, monks, is not common to worldlings". The adj. sādhāraṇa in Pāli as well as in Skr. is capable of being construed with either the gen., dat. or inst. (vide Monier Williams Dict. s.v.) but with the inst. its sense is usually "equal" because here a comparison is implied. When, however, the sense is "common to" as in the above example the dat. appears syntactically the more suitable construction. The -əh ending therefore may here possibly stand for the older dat. pl. rather than the inst., preserved because of the option in the construction.

§10. Eastern Forms.

Among the sporadic forms of the above (a-) declension we may group the so-called Māgadhisms under which Geiger (PLS §80) includes the nom. and voc. sg. in -e both masculine and neuter. In the Dīghā- and Majjhima Nikāyas there are 6 such nom. forms of masculine nouns and 3 of neuters. The existence of these eastern forms can be justified on the ground that all these are put into the mouth of one or the other of the six leaders of heretical schools whose
dialect was naturally some kind of eastern Prakrit. Moreover it is significant that they are clustered together in passages of philosophic importance reported to have been said by them. These statements occur in the Sandaka Sutta of the Majjhima- and in the Sāmaññaphala Sutta of the Dīgha Nikāya. They are: bāle ca pandite ca kāyassa bhedhā ucchijjanti D I.55; M I.515,518; donāmite sukhadukkhe, pariyantakaṭe samsāre natthi hāyanavaddhane natthi ukkaṃsāvakamse M I. 518; D I.54; ājīvasate, parībbañjasate, nāgāvānasate, vīse indriyasate, timse nirayamsate M I.517-518; D I.53; sattagulikhitte nibbethiyamānem eva paleti M I.518; kamme ca addhakaṭe ca M I.517; sukhe dukkhe jīve satt' ime M I.517 with the less accurate reading sukhe dukkhe jīvasatt'ame D I.56. These statements are repeated in a discourse by the Buddha at S III.211(§§5,6&7). Also in the Sunakkhatta Sutta of the Majjhima Nikāya the -e form is 5 times used by the Buddha in a talk with Sunakkhatta, the Licchavi. Here too they occur in a passage of philosophic importance, viz., ye lokāmisasamyojane se pavutte M II.254; ye anañjasamyojane se bhinne M II.255; ye sāniññāyatanasamyojane se vante M II.255; ye nevasaññāsaññāyatanasamyojane se ucchirna ucchinnamūle tālavatthukate anabhāvakate āyatīṃ anuppādadhamaṃ M II.255. There are three other instances of the -e form outside the above context, viz., ke ca chāve sāle, ke pana sīhanāde ti? D III.24, where probably it is due to the fact that the phrase is borrowed from popular speech as an
exclamatory metaphor conveying a sense of disparagement; ye ाताने वैदितावभे 5 IV.98, which the Comy. takes as nom.
sg. ('ताम्य ये ाताने वैदितावभे ति तम कारानं जानिताबभम ति
attho' Saratthapakasini 391, v.l. veditabbo); idha pana
bhikkhave bhikkhu...tasmā ca sukhe anadhimucchite (for hoti)
hoti M II.223 "here, monks, a bhikkhu is not infatuated in
the matter of that happiness".

Geiger has instanced the voc. sg. (in -e) in
ehi tvam samma Bhesike D I.225 which he regards with Pischel
(Prk.Gr.§366.b) as a nom. used in address as voc. In fact
Pāli like Prk. has sometimes the actual nom. sg. instead of
the voc. (-a) in addressing. e.g. kin nu kho ावuso bho
Gotamo tam jīva tam sarīra udāhu aññam jīva aññam sarīra
D I.157 (cp. Ardha-Māgadhī voc.sg. putto, Prk. Gr. §363). We
have also the reverse case where the form in short -a is used
for the nom. sg. in -o . e.g. Kahan nu kho bho Nāgita etarahi
so bhavaṃ Gotama viharati...? D I.150., which may be either
due to eastern influence (cp. Ardha-Māgadhī nom. sg. Buddha-
putta for Buddha-putto, Prk. Gr.§364) or the sandhi form of
the original Gotamaḥ with the dropping of the visarga. In the
voc. pl. of āyasmaḥ beside the regular āyasmantā and āyasmano
we find a form -ante used in addressing two persons. e.g.,
āyasamente (voc. pl. or dual) M I.474. If this be a dual form
corresponding to Skr. -antāu , standing for āyasmano, the -e
can be regarded as being due to eastern influence. Such
influence is positively seen in the archaic nom. pl. ending
§11. Sporadic Forms of the a- Declension.

In the above paragraph we have referred to the archaic ending -āse of the nom. pl. masculine which represents the eastern derivative of the Vedic double ending -āsas, both feminine and masculine. In Pāli however this ending is never found with feminine nouns (PLS §79).

In the neuter of the a- declension there are a few remnants of the older Vedic plural of the of the nom. in -ā, beside the regular -āni. e.g. rūpā Thl. 465; D I.245; sotā Sn 345; netā Th2.257 etc. On the analogy of the masculine inflexion a neuter acc. pl. -e is formed. (m. nom. pl. -ā; m. acc. pl. -e = nt. nom. pl. -ā; nt. acc. pl. X ). e.g. rūpe passitum Ud 30; rūpe ca pajānāti M I.61; rūpe paṭicca S IV.18. This is also found with the verbal nouns in -nam, all being used in the plural thus removing the possibility of their being Māgadhī nt. sg. acc. in -e. e.g. nīvaraṇe pahāya D I.73; Sn 17, beside nīvaraṇāni (vide P.T.S.Dict. s.v.). But sometimes masculine adjectives are found used with them. e.g. cattāro satipaṭṭhāne bhāventi M II.11, showing that the identity of forms had later on given rise to a change of gender.
§12. Feminine in -ā.

In the feminine ā- declension the older historical endings of the inst., dat., abl., and gen. have been replaced by -āya which is also used for the loc. beside the normal -āyā. The ending -āya seems to be a later phonetic development of the Skr. abl.-gen. -āyas, the -ḥ- being dropped owing to the phonetic law already mentioned (vide §1.) and the shortening of the final vowel being due to the general phonetic weakness of terminal elements in Middle Indian as referred to (§8.). The replacement of the dat. both in the sg. and in the pl. by the gen. form is due to the same syntactical phenomenon as discussed in the case of the masculine declension (§4.). The older inst. -ayā is also lost being replaced by the abl. sg. -āya due to similar syntactical reasons (vide §§ 62,116 & 118). But a considerable number of inst. fem. in -ā, as in the masculine and neuter declensions, is found in the Nikāyas. e.g. saddhā pabbajitvā M I.16,123 "leaving (home) through or by faith", beside saddhāya gharā nikkhamma Sn 337; tassā issā na supatī Sn 110 "he does not sleep through jealousy for her"; assavanatā dhammasa D II.38; M I.168 (Comy. 'assavanatā ti assavanatāya dhammasa' Sum.II.467); vyārosanā paṭighasaṁhā Sn 148 "through anger and hatred"; ekapuggalassa bhikkhave kālaśāya bahuno janassa anutappā hoti A I.22 "owing to the death of one person there is worry for many people". It is however difficult to say whether this ending -ā corresponds...
to the older Vedic inst. in -ā of feminine nouns as in
doṣā, barhānā etc., or is a phonetic contraction of -āya (cp. Prk. -āa ). Geiger (PLS §§ 27.2, 81) is inclined to
favour the latter possibility though Franke thought it was
et seq.). Even the form -ā in abhīñā sacchikatvā D II.92, 153, beside abhīñāya desitā D II.119 can be inst. sg. of
means, though Geiger (§27.2) regards it as a contraction
of the gerund in -āya after the Comys. (e.g., 'tad abhīñā
ti tad abhijānitvā' Sum. I.p.59).

§13. The Vowel Declension ( -hetu ).

Of the sporadic forms belonging to
this declension the form hetu (abl. sg. m.) is interesting
owing to its peculiar syntactical function. It is evidently
a phonetic development from Skr. hetos , abl.-gen. sg. of
hetus m. "reason or cause", the dropping of the final -h -
and the the reducing of the vowel -o to -u being due to the
phonetic peculiarities of such terminal elements as described
in the foregoing paragraph. As to the weakening of the vowel
we may compare sajju (< sajjo) corresponding to Skr. sadyas
(vide Geiger, PLS §§22&23). It is mostly used as postposition
denoting cause, e.g., in which case it appears as a periphrase
for the inst. or the abl. of cause. e.g., attahetu parahetu
dhanahetu Sn 122 "because of oneself, others or wealth"; na kho, Udāyi, etassa sacchikiriyāhetu bhikkhū mayi brahma-
cariyam caranti M II.37 "it is not, Udāyi, due to (the
intention i.e. for the purpose of) realizing this... that
monks live the Holy Life under me"; kāyassa pīñanahetu M II.
191 "for (lit. because of) the pleasing of the body". As seen
from the rendering of the latter examples -hetu implies not
only cause but purpose as well. It may not always appear, however,
always as postposition in a compound. There are many instances
where it is used as a separate word agreeing with a gen. of
the noun or pronoun which denotes the material cause implied.
e.g., puttadārassa hetu M II.187 "lit. from the cause of son
and wife" i.e. "due to or for the purpose of son and wife";
yesaṃ hetu labhāmase Kh 6 "owing to whom, lit., because of
whom, we acquire... (cp. Comy. 'ye nissāya yesaṃ kāraṇā' Para-
mattha jotikā II.p.210). From these it is evident that what we
have in the stock phrases tam kissa hetu D I.14; M I.1;
A II.31, "why is it?", lit., "because of what is it? and
kissa hetu A III.303, IV.393; Sn 1131, is an abl. sg. hetu
and a gen. of the pronoun (kissa, cp. kissa nirodhā tanhā
nirodhāti D II.33, where too kissa is gen. sg. "of what" and
nirodhā is abl. similar to hetu). The suggestion that -hetu
may be an elliptical form of the acc. sg. hetum (vide P.T.S.
Dict. s.v.) is therefore unwarranted.
§14. **The Consonantal Declension (parisatiṃ).**

In the feminine parisā-, originally belonging to the consonantal declension (< Skr. parisād), the historical form parisati corresponding to Skr. parisādī occurs quite a number of times e.g., D III.18; A II.180. Here the replacement of -d- by -t- is probably due to the influence of other original consonantal stems like sarit- (e.g. acc. sg. saritaṃ Sn 3) where in Pāli beside a nom. ending in a vowel (cp. sarī parallel to parisā) oblique cases are found with a -t-. This is however not a sporadic phonetic change peculiar to Pāli as Geiger suggests (PLS §39.4). In the examples adduced by him viz. kusīta, mutinga and pātu- (Skr. kuśida, mṛdaṅga and prādur) it is not quite certain which form is the earlier. The first two are most probably loan-words in Indo-Aryan and the etymology of the last is uncertain. This form which is the loc. sg. is sometimes found with a final anusvāra as parisatiṃ, e.g., parisatiṃ dhammaṃ deseti M II.140 "he preaches the doctrine in (or to) the assembly"; So Rājagaha parisatīṃ evam vācaṃ bhāsati A I.185 "At Rājagaha he tells these words to the (or in the) crowd". At another place it occurs with the masculine pronoun, e.g., sādhu te pañca dhamma imasmin parisatiṃ bhāsassūti M II.199 "well, declare to (or in) this assembly the five dhammas". Here we have a v.l. imissam parisati. The appearance of the anusvāra is probably due to
the syntactical fact that verbs of speaking sometimes agree with an acc. of the person to whom the words are addressed (vide §§36.b,58.c.). The proper loc. significance of the historical form parisati being lost due to its archaic nature the construction was replaced by the more popular idiom, viz., the acc. with verbs of speaking. So the acc. ending -ām is added to a theoretical stem parisati- (f.). The fact that the loc. form, whether historical or later, is preserved when there is no actual verb but only the participle also strengthens the validity of our surmise. e.g., bhāsātā kho pana te es' āvuso Pāṭika-putta Vesāliyam parisati vācā D III. 18; "Were these words spoken by you, friend Pāṭika-putta, at Vesāli among the rabble?" parisāyam bhāsato D II.218, "speaking in the assembly". For it is to be generally observed in Pāli concinnity that the loc. appears in such adnominal instances in place of an acc. which is the more usual in the adverbal construction.

The Pronominal Declension

§15. The Enclitic Forme.

Whereas in Vedic and Classical Sanskrit the enclitic forms me, te sg. are found only for the dat. and gen., no, vo pl. are found only in the acc., dat. and gen., Pāli like Prākṛt has extended their use to other cases as well. (vide Pischel, Prk.Gr. §420; acc. sg. me

1. Supplementary to Geiger's presentation (PLS §§104-112).
inst. sg. me; acc. pl. no, ne; inst. pl. ne). Though not
frequently, the forms me and te occur as accusatives
in Pāli. e.g., te ekena khaṇena ekena muhuttaṇa ekamas-
khalaṁ ekamasapunjaṁ karissāmi M I.377 "In a flash, in a
moment, I shall reduce you to one mash, one mass of flesh".
Franke has also given as acc. sg. in Pāli the forms me and
te, (vide, Pāli und Sanskrit, p.152). This employ seems to have
originated in the contact between the uses of the acc. and the
inst. as in the following causative construction where the
causative verb pāpetu can take either the acc. or the inst.
of its primitive subject or that which would have been its
subject in the original non-causative state (vide §59). e.g.,
sādhu me bhante Bhagavā tapo-jigucchāya aggam yeva pāpetu
sāram yeva pāpetūti D III.48 "may the Blessed One make me
attain to the summit, to the essence of disgust-for-asceticis
where me can be either the acc. or the inst. In the pl.
no and vo are similarly found for the acc. e.g., upāsakā
no bhavaṁ Gotamo dhāretu M I.413 "may the venerable Gotama
take us as disciples"; pahāya vo gamissāmi D II.120 "I
shall go leaving you"; āmantayāmi vo D II.156 "I address
you" (cp. Māgadhi and Sauraseni acc. pl. vo, Prk. Gr. §422).
In the inst. there are definite examples where the form me
is used for the agent. e.g., maggam kho me gacchantena A IV.
334 "by me going the way"; kamman pana me karontena A IV.
"by me doing an action"; akatena me ettha katām M I. 515 "lit. by me not doing it is done, i.e., without my doing any task is done"; mūṭhena me evam katām M II.248 "thus done by my deluded self". It is also found agreeing with feminine nouns, e.g., suto yeva me..upanaccantīyā D II. 268 "was heard by me..(while)..dancing". Buddhaghosa regards me in the stock phrase evam me sutam D I.1.etc. as standing either for the inst. or the gen. of agency (vide §154). He says: "me saddo tisu atthesu dissati: Tathā hi 'ssa gāthābhigītaṁ abhojaneyyaṁ ti ādisu mayā ti attho (i.e.inst.). Sadhu me bhante Bhagavā saṅkhittena dhammaṁ desetūti ādisu mayhaṁ ti attho (i.e. dat.). Dhammadāyādā me bhikkhave bhavathati ādisu mama ti attho (i.e. gen.). Idha pana mayā sutanti mama sutanti ca atthadvaye yujjati". Sum.I.p.28, Papañcasūdatā I.p. 24. There is no doubt therefore that the form me was from very early times used as an inst. sg. This extension of its use seems to have originated in the agent-use of the gen. forms me and te, which is a frequent construction in Pāli. e.g., api ca m' ettha puggalavemattā viditā D II.152; Sn p.102 (Comy. 'api ca mayā...' Pj.II.2. 436); tam kim maṃhasi gahapati, sutam te.... evam bhante sutam me M I.378; Samaṇo me Gotamo nimitito Sn p.104; te ca me evam puṭṭhā D I.192,III.26; etam me abhipatthitaṁ D II.266(Comy. 'etaṁ mayā abhipatthitaṁ' Sum.III.p.702); bhāsitā me esā vācā D III.54; kicchena me adhigatam D II. 36; yan te karaniyam; punarāyuca me laddho D III.285(V.);
sahitaṁ me asahitam te....āropitā te vādo M II.3 ; tam me idām bhante Bhagavā sakkhi diṭṭho M I.370. In all these examples the gen. is as permissible to denote the agent as the inst.. It is probable that the me here originally stood for the gen. but later on came to be regarded as the inst. of agency. Finally, in two instances no and vo appear in the rôle of nom. plurals. e.g., yam no Bhagavā dhammam bhāsissati tam no sossāmāti M II.5 "what doctrine the Blessed One will preach to us, that we shall hear"; mā vo muñcittha koci namā "Ye let not one escape, whoever it be". In both these examples there is the alternate possibility of the enclitic being used merely as emphatic particle, but in tam no sossāmāti the emphasis, if no implies such, is not needed according to the context, though vo in the other instance may have an emphatic sense.

§16. Sporadic Forms.

Among the sporadic forms of the pronominal declension we may place the nom. pl. amhā formed on the analogy of the a- declension (nominal acc. pl. -e : pronominal acc. pl. -e = nominal nom. pl. -ā : pronominal nom. pl. X ). e.g., tena ca amhā attamanā M II.132, 177, "thereby we were pleased". Similarly on the analogy of the -a- declension the relative pronoun vo has a dat. sg. masculine yāva. e.g., yāva eva kho pana atthāya D I.90, beside the
usual yassa, which is the gen. form used as dat. e.g., yassa atthāya M I.392. In the inflexion of the demonstrative pronoun a gen. pl. sānām f. "of those(women)" occurs beside the regular tāsaṁ or tāsānaṁ. e.g., bālḥā me dukkhā vedanā abhikkamanti no paṭikkamanti abhikkamo sānām paññāyati S V.30, 345. A few archaic forms of the reflexive pronoun sa (Skr. sva) "one's own", occur mostly in the gāthā literature. e.g., sam niṁo atimāṁati Sn 104 "he disparages his own relatives"; nihino sena mēnena Sn 132 "devoid of his own pride"; samhi āsane D II.225 "in his own seat"; sehi dārehi Sn 108; sehi dhammehi Sn 238.

Finally, it may be mentioned that a few eastern forms have crept into the pronominal declension as in to the nominal. e.g., ye for yad or yam, and se for tad or tam. These are also found in the passages already referred to (§10) e.g., Tattha yaṁce savitakkaṁ savicāraṁ, ye avitakke avicāre se paṁitatare D II.278; evam eva kho, Sunakkhatta, sammah nibbānādhimoto purisapuggalassa ye neva saṁnāsaṁnāyatanasamyojane se ucchinnamule... M II.236 (cp. Prk. Gr. §423). The same form se occurs also in the frequent adverbs seyyathā D I.145 for tad + yathā "just as, such as" and seyyathidaṁ D I.39, II.91; S V.421;It 99 "as follows" for tad + yatha + idam. The eastern form ye for yam is found also in compound yebhūyyena D I.17, II.139, which is made up of Skr. yad and bhūyas. The interrogative ke for ko m. sg. also occurs in one of the above-mentioned passages (vide §10).
CHAPTER I

THE NOMINATIVE CASE.

§17.a. The Nom. of Subject.

The nominative or the first case (pathamā vibhatti = Skr. prathamā vibhakti), as in the older languages, is mainly used to express the subject of the simple sentence with the verb in the active voice. India grammar has no term to denote the subject of the active verb or grammatical subject. The term kartṛ signifies only the agent or the logical subject (cp. Speyer SS p.1., f.n.1). The logical connection between the subject and the main verb varies according to the nature of the latter. With a transitive verb the subject denoted by the nom. case is the virtual doer of the action (kriyā) whose influence is exercised on some object. e.g., seyyathā vā pan; Uḍāyi, puriso asim kosiyā pabbāheyya M II.17 "As if a man, Uḍāyi, were to draw out his sword from the sheath"; Bhagavā dhammaṃ deseti M II.5 "the Blessed One preaches the doctrin

But when the verb is intransitive the nom. merely expresses the person or thing about whom or which a statement is made, it being not implied that he, she, or it exercises any
influence on another person or thing. Or viewed from another point, with such verbs the subject expressed by the nom. is the sufferer of the action. e.g., Tathāgato loke uppañjati D I.62 "the Master arises in the world"; dipā jhāyanti D I.50 "lamps are burning"; vāttaṃ vattati D II.64 "the round(of life) goes round". In this last example the nom. and the verb are etymologically related, a phenomenon that can be compared to the cognate accusative (vide §36).

b. Not seldom the pronoun standing as the subject of a sentence can be omitted or left to be understood. e.g.,

adinnadān̄aṃ pahāya adinnadānā paṭīvирato hoti D I.63
"abandoning theft (sci. he = so) lives abstaining from taking what is not given". In such instances the pronoun is obligatory if the subject is to be emphasized and not the predicate. e.g., so dhammaṃ deseti D I.62 "he preaches the doctrine". In impersonal constructions an action expressed in the verb may sometimes be referred to (cp. Lat: demonstrare to point out) by the demonstrative pronoun in the neuter sg., e.g., tassa purisassa etad ahosi D II.130 "to that man it occurred:..."; mamā hi pubbe etad ahosi D I.18,III.29 "to me in the past it occurred:...". The demonstrative adverb evam is often substituted for the pronoun in such instances. e.g., Tassa evam assa D I.71 "it would occur to him thus:..."; tumhākaṃ evam assa
§18.a. **Subject of Clauses.**

In the case of participial clauses, especially those with the gerund in -tvā having the active sense, the normal construction generally permits of the same nom. being the subject of the clause or clauses as well as of the main sentence. e.g., Atha kho āyasma Śāriputta nivāsetvā, pattacīvaraṇādāya, yena Dhānañjanissa brāhmaṇasenaṃ tena upasāṅkami, upasaṅkamitvā paññatte āsane nisīdi M II.192. "Then the venerable Śāriputta having robed himself, taking his bowl and upper garment, went whither the dwelling of the brahmin Dhānañjani was, having gone he sat on the seat that was prepared for him". Here āyasma Śāriputto is the subject of all the gerunds, viz., nivāsetvā adāya and upasaṅkamitvā.

b. Instances are not rare, however, in Pāli where the subject of the gerund expressed by the nom. of the noun may further be taken up by its corresponding pronoun which then 'govern the main verb. e.g., Yathā va pan' eke bhonto samanabrahmaṇā saddhādeyyāni bhojanāni bhūnjitvā ta evarūpam.

---

1. When the gerund is passive in meaning the logical subject is denoted by the inst. case, being the agent.
dījagāma-bhūtagāmasamārāmbhāṁ anuyuttā viharanti D I.5

"Since certain reclusees and brahmins having eaten the food provided through faith live addicted to the injury of animate and inanimate things". Here the pronoun te could be omitted without any loss to the general construction of the sentence or to its meaning as a whole. But such repetitions, though unnecessary from a strictly syntactical point of view, are not foreign to the Pāli idiom. Indeed it is not impossible in Pāli even to have one subject for the clause and another logically different subject for the principal sentence. In the above example the subject in both clauses is logically the same, for te really stands for and refers to the nominal subject brāhmaṇā. But in the following instances the subject of the main clause is not the same as that of the secondary one: e.g., api ca me bhante imaṁ dhammaṁ sutvā lomāni haṭṭhāni M I.83 "however, Sir, having heard this doctrine my hair stood on end"; Iti kho Ambaṭṭha itthiyā vā itthiṁ karitvā purisena vā purisaṁ karitvā khattiya vā seṭṭhā hīnā brāhmaṇā D I.98 "So it happens, Ambaṭṭha, that having taken woman to woman or man to man the warriors are the best and brahmans are inferior"; addasam kho aham ... itthiṁ mūlhaṭhagabbhaṁ..., disvāna me etad ahosi M II.103 "I saw ...a woman suffering in delivery..., and having seen (her) it occurred to me..."; Puna ca paraṁ, bhikkhave, sappuriso... upasampajja viharati, paññāya c' assa disvā āsavā parikkhayāpenti M III.45
"Furthermore, monks, a good man...having entered...abides therein, and having seen with his insight the cankers are destroyed"; in this last example the causative form of the verb parikkhayapenti being apparently used for the passive, there seems to be some doubt about the reading c. On the borderline between the above two constructions we may place the following example where app'ekacce, though referring to an antecedent brāhmaṇa-gahapatikā, is still a syntactically different subject: Atha kho Thullakoṭṭhitakā brāhmaṇa-gahapatikā yena Bhagavā ten' upasāṅkamīsu, upasāṅkamitvā app'ekacce Bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā ekamantaṃ nisīdimśu, app'ekacce ...(etc.)...M II.56 "Thereupon the brahmins and householders of Thullakoṭṭhitā came to where the Blessed One was, and having come, a few saluting the Blessed One sat on a side, a few more ...(etc.)..."

d. It is also not unusual in Pāli to find the same nom. appearing as subject of the principal sentence and of a relative clause at the same time, the connecting relative pronoun being absent. So we find such instances as:
Ayam vuccatī bhikkhave bhikkhu pheggum aggahesi brahmacariyassa tena ca vosānaṃ āpadi M I.192 "This (one) is called, brethren, a monk (sci. who = yo) has captured the pith of the Higher Life and thus attained the Consummation"
§19.a. **Nom. with Passive Verbs.**

With passive verbs the nom. expresses the *logical object*, the logical subject being put in the agent case (inst.). In other words it denotes the original object, expressed in the acc., of the active verb. E.g., dhamma ca desiyati D III.264; A IV.225 "the doctrine too is preached"; evarūpaṃ bhojanam diyati D II.354 "food such as these is given"; assutavā puthujjano na parimuccati M I.3 "the unlearned worldling is not released".

b. The logical object thus put in the nom. with passive verbs is not necessarily the 'affected object' with verbs of influence (vide §31); it may represent an original acc. denoting the place gone to with verbs of motion. E.g., Āraññakenā āvuso bhikkhunā nātiśālena...gāmo pavisitabbo M I.469 "lit. Brethren, by a monk dwelling in the forest the village should be entered before a long period (has elapsed). Here in the active construction the place entered may be denoted either by the acc. (vide §40) or the loc. (vide §168). The road along which or on which one walks is also subject to the same alternative construction but the loc. is by far the more frequent. This too is put in the nom. in the passive voice. E.g., maggo kho me gantabbo D III.235 "the road should be walked by me". The sense of the verb (gacchati) in this passage shows that it could also be used 'transitively' meaning to traverse. In fact the
idiom maggam gacchati actually occurs in the Nikāyas (vide §36.d.).

c. The **infinitive** when used with such words as *arahati* "deserves", *sukara-"easy" and *sakkā "is possible", as complement to the predicate, exhibits a passive sense and consequently agrees with the nom. of the noun which in the original active form would have been expressed by the acc. e.g., Na arahati 'yaśmā Ambatṭho....abhisajjitunti
D I.91 "The venerable Ambattha does not deserve to be accused"; Nayidaṃ sukaraṃ agāraṃ ajjhāvasatā.....brahma-
cariyāṃ caritam M II.55 "This Higher Life is not easy to be practised by one living at home"; Na kho pana mayā
sukaraṃ anadhigatā vā bhogā adhigantuṃ adhigatā vā bhogā
phātim kātuṃ M II.66 "It is not indeed easy either unacquired riches to be acquired by me or those acquired to be increased"; Nāyaṃ sukaro.....jīvitā voropetuṃ S III.113 "this (person) is not easy.....to be deprived of life"; Sakkā pana bhante upamā kātuṃ Sn p.126 "Is it possible, Sir, an illustration to be made". From these examples it becomes clear that the **infinitive** in Pāli, just as in Vedic and later Skr. (cp. VSS §219), performs the syntactical functions of the active, middle and passive infinitives.

1. cp. English "he is not easy to kill", which stands
§20. The Predicative Nom.

a. The nom. is frequently found in a predicative function with verbs of 'being' such as bhavati, attathā, vijjati, sampajjati etc. which are, generally speaking, the so-called verbum substantivum (cp. SS §2.). It is also found with other verbs of allied meaning such as viharati and vasati. With all these the nom. strictly speaking constitutes the complement of the predicate. e.g., Aham tena samayena purohito brāhmaṇo ahosi D I.143 "At that time I was the brahmin chaplain"; asappuriso nāto hoti yasassī M III.38 "a wicked man is noted and prosperous"; ete aṭṭha sahāyā ahesu D II.230 "these were eight friends"; te kārā mahapphalā assu M I.33 "these actions were greatly fruitful (lit. of-great-fruit)"; yam vipāko bhavissati D II.226 "which will be the result"; aññadatthu Bhagavato sāvakā sampajjanti M II.123 "but actually (they) become the disciples of the Blessed One"; bhikkhu...viharati ātāpi sampajjano satimā M II.11 "the monk lives strenuous, mindful and self-possessed".

b. But sometimes in Pāli just as in Skr. the so-called verbum substantivum is not subjoined to the noun predicate which may be the nom. of a substantive, adjective or an adjectival formation. e.g., taṁ jīvaṁ, taṁ sarīraṁ... aññāṁ jīvaṁ, aññāṁ sarīraṁ D I.57 "that (is) the life-
principle and the same the body .... one the life-principle and another the body"; aham pi manusso D I.60 "I too (am) a man"; sambādho gharavāso rajāpatho, abbhokāso pabbajjā M III.33 "home-life (is) an impediment and an abode of dust, renunciation (is) the open(-space)"; bahukicca mayaṃ bahukaraṇīyaṃ M III.14 "we(are) busy and full of duties". The same is found with adjectival formations derived from verbs such as gerundives and the like. e.g., so tattha pujjo, so tattha pāsāmo M III.41 "he (is) in this matter honourable, he (is) here praiseworthy"; Na c' esa brāhmaṇa pañho evaṃ pucchitabbo D I.19 "This question, brahmin, (is) not-to-be-asked in this manner". Since the verb is implied in these participles, the verbum substantivum is hardly ever subjoined in such cases.

c. When the subject of the sentence is a pronoun (demonstrative or relative) the gender of the latter follows that of the noun-predicate. e.g., yaṃ mamā assa upādānaṃ, so mam' assa vighāto D I.25 "What is my clinging (to existence), that would be vexation for me"; so mam' assa kilamatho, sā mam' assa vihesā M III.28 "that would be exhaustion for me, that would be annoyance for me". In the first example here so, though referring to upādānaṃ, anticipates the gender of vighāto (masculine), whereas syntactically tam would be more logical. This shows that Pāli in such cases prefers the pronominal adjective to the neuter pronoun or the pronominal substantive. So even with
the interrogative pronoun the same agreement is found:
Ko nu kho bho Gotamo hetu ko paccayo.....D I.144 "What (lit. which) is the reason, venerable Gotama, what is the cause.....?"; ke tumhe hothāti M II.157 " who are you?".
In these examples ko and ke are used in the masculine because hetu, paccayo and tumhe are of that gender. But exceptionally the nom. sg. of the neuter pronoun is found in similar constructions. e.g., kim hutvā kim ahosiṁ ahāṇ atītādaddhānaṁ ?Mīś. "what had been I, what was I in the long past?". Here ko hutvā etc. would be as permissible.

d. Pāli just as Vedic and Classical Skr. (videVSS §100) employs certain adjectives (nom.) predicatively where we would normally expect an adverb. Speyer regards this as peculiar to Indian syntax. In some of these we can substitute the adverbial acc. with- any loss to the general construction. e.g., yassa vitakkā vidhūpitā ajjhattam suvikappitaḥ aṣeṣā Sn 7, "whose reflections are destroyed and scattered complete (i.e. completely cp. adv. aṣesam );
idham kusala-śīla aparisesā nirujjhanti M II.25,26 "here merits and virtues cease remainderless ( i.e. without a remainder, cp. adv. of manner aparisesam)"; te caranti suddhā D II.254 "they wander pure"; yo 'ham ākinnō viharāmi D II.30 "that I (should) live crowded"; cattāro ca Mahārājā catuddiṣā nisinnā honti D II.221 " the Four
Great Kings were seated on-the-four-sides (catuddiśā probably standing for cātuddiśā, the derived adjective). All these nominatives logically correspond to adverbs of manner.

§21. The Nom. with iti.

With verbs of speaking, thinking, knowing, considering, accounting for and reckoning that which is stated about the object is denoted by the nom. followed by iti. The clause consisting of the nom. and iti is used predicatively. The nom. itself is however generally regarded as a predicative nominative (vide VSS §§14 & 99), though strictly speaking it approximates to a label use (§22). e.g., Imam kho aham Udāyi puggalam samyutto ti vadāmi no visamyutto M I.453 "This individual, Udāyi, I say (is) under bondage (and) not free from bondage"; anāpattam āpattiti dipenti A V.78 "they make out a transgression (to be) to a non-transgression"; sīho ti attānām samekkhiyānām D III.25 "considering himself as a lion" or "to be a lion"; jānāsi taṃ pāsādaṃ...ucco vā nīco vā majjhimo vā ti? D I.243."do you know whether that mansion is high, medium or low?"; coro t' eva saṅkhām gacchati M II.38 "he passes off as a thief". This nom. (neuter singular) may sometimes be impersonally employed. e.g., ariyasāvako
...virāgā vimuccati, vimuttēśmiḥ vimuttaṁ iti nānaḥ hotī

M I.500 "the āryan disciple is emancipated through non-attachment, on being emancipated he obtains the knowledge that there is emancipation". A curious distortion of the same construction is found where the person about whom the statement is made is denoted by the nom. with iti and the thing said by the acc., e.g., seyyāḥ so ti vādāmi; pāpiyāḥ so ti vādāmi M II.179 "I declare he is better; I say he is worse", which should normally stand as tāṁ seyyo ti vādāmi etc.

§22. The Label Use of the Nom.

The nominative is also used when the noun or the idea of the noun alone is signified. This may be called the label use as distinct from the adverbal nom. described in the preceding paragraphs (cp. KVG §§ 529 etc). The nom. is therefore found either adverbally as subject or predicate of the verb or absolutely, that is, as an entity separate from the rest of the construction of the sentence. There are no genuine adnominal uses of the nom. unless we regard so the nom. of apposition and the nom. that forms the first member of co-ordinative (dvandva) compounds. Local grammarians have defined the nom. as fundamentally expressive of this crude or label notion. Pāṇini states: prātipadikārthālingaparimāṇavacanamātre prathamā (II.3.46),
"the first case serves only to signify the gender and number of the thing designated by the word's crude form or prātipdiaka" (cp. SS p.26 f.n.). This is echoed by both Kaccāyana and Moggallāna. The former has only curtailed the Skr. grammarian's definition: liṅgatthe paṭhamā (Kac.286) which means, according to the vutti, that the first case-ending is used to express the gender and the mere designation of a thing (liṅgatthābhidhānamatte paṭhamā vibhatti hoti). The latter lays down the terse aphorism: paṭhamatthamatte (Mog. 39) which according to the vutti implies that the first case is employed to denote just sense of the noun or the designation (abhidheyya) of the thing. Thus Pāli grammarians seem to have merely followed the existing tradition as regards the definition of the nom., and no Indian grammar refers categorically to its subjective or predicative uses. The orthodox schools are however not agreed as to the exact meaning of 'liṅgatthe'. According to the Kāntanya system prātipdiika or liṅga is defined as that crude form of a word which, though significant by itself, is other than roots and detached from actual vibhaktis(vide, Philosophy of Skr. Grammar, p.171). Anyhow it is clear enough that what they refer to here is the above-mentioned label use of the nom.

§23.

a. This label use is mostly found when the nom. is employed alone as designation or title of a book, chapter, or any
other literary composition e.g., Dīgha Nikāya, Majjhima Nikāya, Selasuttaṃ, Raṭṭhapālasuttaṃ etc. Here the nom. merely plays the part of a label. Such titles are mostly used absolutely, that is, without any case-ending, the crude form of the noun only being used.

b. It is frequently found in enumerations beginning with seyyathidam "lit. which is thus:" or "such as" and yadidam "lit. which is:" or "that is, namely". The nom. after the former may refer to an antecedent in some other case as illustrated by the following example where it refers to an inst.: ....micchājīvena jīvikaṃ kappenti seyyathidam mani-lakkhanaṃ dandalakkhanaṃ...(etc.) D I.67 "they live by wrong means of livelihood such as: fortune-telling from jewels, fortune-telling from sticks, (etc.)............"; sammad eva āsavehi vimuccati seyyathidam kāmāsavā bhavāsavā diṭṭhāsavā S II.187 "he is completely released from the cankers, namely, the canker of lust, the canker of becoming and the canker of false views"; esa paccayo jarāmaranassa yadidam adhimutti jāti D II.57 "this is the reason for decay and death, namely, birth". In the following example the adverb tattha represents an antecedent loc. case: atha kho ahāṃ eva tattha bhīyo yadidam adhimutti D I.74 "Furthermore, I myself am superior even in that (lit. there), that is to say, higher emancipation".
c. With manñe “methinks, as it were”, the person to whom someone else mentioned before is likened is denoted by the nom. which stands detached from the rest of the construction; hence it is logically akin to the above-described label use. e.g., Ayam hi rājā Māgadho Ajātasattu Vedehiputto.............
paricāreti devo manñe D I.60 "This king Ajātasattu of Magadh son of Vedehi....amuses himself like a god"; kevaṭṭā manñe macchavilope M I.456 "like fisher-folk over their catch"; putta-mattā manñe natta-mattā manñe M I.460; Ud 24, " as it were, just sons and grandsons.

§24. The Nom. of Apposition.

a. Closely related to the above label nom. is the one used in apposition to and side by side with another noun, which is usually the name of a person. e.g., Raṭṭhapālo kulaputto M II.57 "Raṭṭhapāla, the householder(-son)”; Ayam Aciravati nadi pūrā udakassa D I.224 "This river, Aciravati, is full of water". It has to be remarked in this connection that in Pāli as in Skr. such usages as 'the city of Pātaliputta' etc. are not permissible. There is no gen. of apposition in Indian languages, the nom. being the only idiom. The label function of such nominatives is clearly seen in such semi-absolute uses of it as found in: yad ariyo sevamāno Satthā ganam anusāsitum arahati M III.216 "associating which the noble one, the Master, is fit to instruct a school". Its absolute nature is further seen by instances as the following
where the nom. in apposition differs in number from the other: assoei mahājanakāyo caturāṣṭī-पाण-sahasāṇi D II.29
"(thus) heard the great assembly (of) 84000 beings".

b. Sometimes, however, the particle nāma which originally was the adverbial acc. of nāman (vide §2) is subjoined to the noun in apposition. e.g., Kāli nāma dāsi M I.125 "the maid-servant, by name, Kāli"; tāpasa-brahmacārī Nigrodho nāma D I.176 "the ascetic-student Nigrodha by name";
Raṭṭhapālo nāma kulaputto(cp. above a.) M II.55 " the householder(-son), Raṭṭhapāla by name"; Mano-padosikā nāma devā D I.20 "gods by name 'shining through mind' ".

c. With numeral nouns such as satam, sahassam and sahassāṇi the nom. of apposition or the partitive gen. (vide §144.c) are concurrently employed. The latter is by far the more popular construction (cp. PLS §117.c) but the nom. is not by any means rare. e.g., pañcasatāṇi upāsakā D II.93 "five hundred lay disciples"; paro-sahassam puttā D I.89 " over a thousand sons"; Gandhabbā cha sahassāṇi Thl.164 "six thousands (of) Gandhabbas". These may be optionally construed with the gen. thus: pañcasatāṇi upāsakānaṃ "five-hundred of lay disciples"; paro-sahassam puttānaṃ "over a thousand of sons"; Gandhabbānañ cha sahassāṇi "six thousands of Gandhabbas."
§ 25. The Nom. in Elliptical Clauses.

The nom. is also met with, used in an absolute manner, that is to say, detached from the main construction, in certain elliptical clauses or sentences where hoti is almost invariably to be understood. But due to the frequency of such idioms the necessity for the predicate element is not always felt.

a. In the following examples nāma occurring in the parenthetical clause has the force of hoti and to a certain extent covers the gap in the construction: Ekam samayam Bhagavā Kurūsu viharati Kammāsaddhamma nāma Kurūnaṁ nigamo D II.55, 291 "Once the Blessed One was living among the Kurūs - (sci. there was) Kammāsaddhamma a hamlet of the Kurūs"; Sā kho pana bhante bhaginī parakāminī hoti; Sikhadi nāma Mātalissa sangāhakassa putto, tāṁ abhiṣaṅkhati D II.268 "That sister, Sir, was desirous of other men - there was Sikhadi, the son of the charioteer, - she loved him".

b. Similar is the use of the nom. after the adverb yena in the frequent construction 'yena....tena...'. e.g., yena Bhagavā ten' upasaṅkama M II.91 "whither the Blessed One, thither repair". But when a second place has to be mentioned for precision the adverb yena may either be repeated or the nom. alone may be used. e.g., yena Sappiniyā tīraṁ (sci.yen paribbājakārāmo ten' upasaṅkami A II.29 "whither the bank
of Sappinī, (whither) the hermitage of Wanderers, thither he repaired".

c. Again, hoti is to be understood with the nom. found in hypothetical clauses with seyyathāpi. e.g., seyyathāpi, brāhmaṇa, puriso daliddo assako anālhiyo, tassa akāmassa.EM II 1.81 "Supposing, brahmin, (there was) a man, poor, destitute and wretched and to him..."; seyyathāpi Mahā-rāja udaka-rahado D I 74 "supposing, Great King, (there was) a lake".

d. When a point in time or space is to be reckoned from another point, the noun denoting time or space is put in the nom. and the incident that occurred at that distant point is denoted by a clause beginning with yam "that". e.g., Ito so bhikkhave eka-nāvuto kappo yam Vipassī Bhagavā...loke udapādi D II 2 "It was the ninety-first aeon from this one that the Blessed One Vipassi arose in the world". This use of the nom. is the same as that allowed by Skr. grammarians in such constructions as 4 ātama kroṣāḥ Somanāthāt "a hundred krośas from Somanātha, where, however, the acc. is the more logical idiom (vide Monier Williams Skr. Grammar § 823)."

The **nom. absolute** is not a regular construction in either Pāli or Skr. It is not entirely absent in the latter but as an idiom is very rare (cp. Monier Williams, Skr. Grammar §840). In Pāli however it seems to have been noted as part of the established concinnity by the author of the Miruttidīpanī (p. 146), who mentions a so-called nom. absolute. But in the example adduced, *viz.*, gacchanto Bharadvājo so, addasā ajhutan isīm, the nom. gacchanto Bharadvājo is also the subject of the final predicate addasā in spite of the presence of so (cp. the insertion of the demonstrative pronoun with the gerund, § 12.b.), and consequently the nom. is not strictly speaking **absolute**. Duroiselle also in his *Pāli Grammar* (§ 603.ii) refers to a nom. absolute in Pāli but gives no examples. In the Nikāyas we come across a few uses of the nom. with the participle in agreement, that appear to be as much legitimate absolute constructions as are the loc. or gen. absolute (§§180 & 158). These even exhibit the *temporal* sense. But since it is hardly found in the Vedas or the Brāhmaṇas or even in later Skr. literature the only explanation as to its appearance in Pāli is that it is a characteristic of the popular speech out of which the literary Pāli arose. We are supported in this assumption by the fact that there is evidence for such an idiom in the dialect of the
Asoka Inscriptions (cp. tūrathā karu “if one is acting thus”, Gīrār XI.4., according to Hultsch, Syntax of Gīrār, p. ixx.). Moreover the context in each case shows that there is a psychological reason behind the use: it is mostly due to the fact that in a long statement the nom. of the subject with which the speaker begins is so far removed from the predicate that he loses sight of the intended construction and concludes the sentence in quite an unexpected manner. So we find usages as the following:

Sāvatṭamāno loko yebhuyyena sattā ēbhassara-sāvatṭanikā honti D I.17 “the world evolving, the beings for the most part are involved in radiance”; Evara eva kho bhikkhave idh’ekacco kulaputto imasmiṃ dhammavinaye āgāraṃ anāgāriyam pabbajito cattāri bhayāni paṭikaṅkhitabbāni A II.123 “Thus when a certain householder enters ordination in this Doctrine and Training, four things should be feared”. Here the v.l. kulaputte etc. shows that it was even felt by the earlier editors to be an absolute construction, and the v.l. -ssa is also syntactically permissible as denoting the gen. with the verb of fearing, paṭikaṅkhati.

a. In both the above examples the subject of the principal sentence is different from that of the participial clause. Sometimes the construction appears less absolute owing to the subject of the sentence being only the pronoun (so, sā, tam or tad) referring to the subject of the clause, as in:
Sugata vā bhikkhave loke tiṭṭhamāno sugatavinayo vā tad assa bahujana-hitāya... sukhāya devamanussānam A II.147

"The Sugata, brethren, remaining in the world or his Way of Discipline, that would be for the advantage.......for the happiness of gods and men." Here the concinnity would remain even if tad were to be omitted; but Pāli prefers to take the nom. as after the gerund, which we have discussed earlier (§ 18.b.).

b. When the nom. is followed by the present participle santa- or samāna-. the construction approximates to an absolute use due to the temporal sense implied in the participle. Still the nom. being the subject of the main sentence it cannot be strictly called an absolute nominative. Since it nevertheless constitutes a temporal participial clause, we may regard it as a semi-absolute construction. 

e.g., Rājā samāno kim labhati D III.172 "Being a king what does he get?"; itthattam āgato samāno agārasma anagāriyam pabbajati D III.31 "being come (i.e. having come) to this state he sets forth from home to homelessness";

In the following instances the context does not clearly show whether santo refers to antecedent mayā or the following tapo-jiguccha. In the former case it would be a genuine nom. absolute: mayā kho bhante tapo-jiguchcha-vādā.......viharāma. Kathāṃ santo nu kho bhante tapo-
§ 27. The Nom. of Address.

The person addressed is denoted by the nom. case or, more particularly, the vocative. Though in the singular of certain declensions the forms of the latter differ from those of the former, still there is no logical difference in the employment of the two cases. Normally the crude form of the noun is only used, e.g., ambho purisa II.33; alam samma ghaṭikāra II.46. In the feminine singular the voc. form differs prominently from that of the nom. e.g., ayye I.299 "O lady!" beside the nom. ayyā. Local grammarians too enjoin the use of the nom. for the purpose of denoting the person addressed. Pāṇini denotes this use by the term āmuntrīta (II.3.48) and lays down in the next sūtra that the voc. sg. is especially to be called sambuddhi. What is remarkable is that they do not make any syntactical difference between the nom. and the voc. (Pāṇ. sambodhane ca ibid 47 and sāseamantrītan 48; Kac. ālapane ca 287; Mog. āmantane 40) and do not consider the voc. as a distinct eighth case (cp. SS §38 & f.n.). It is peculiar to Buddhaghosa's terminology that he explains this use as 'the case denoting the person engaged in listening to what is said' (kathāśavāṇayuttapuggala-vacanaṃ, Pāpañca-sūdanī I.p.13).

A few special voc. forms used for
polite address are also found such as *Evuso M I.184 "friend" and bhante D II.154.283 "Sir, venerable one". The former probably has its origin in an older *Ayusah (the derived adj. from Ayus "life") having the sense of "O long-lived one!" and the suggested derivation from Ayusman or the pl. base Ayusmant seems to be phonetically less likely (vide PLS §46.1. and P.T.S. Dict. s.v.). The latter (bhante) is regarded as a Māgamānaism (PLS §98.3.) corresponding to Skr. bhadanta (cp. Prk.Gr. §366.b).

Both these forms may appear in syntactical agreement with a pl. verb. To this class also belongs the use of the nom. with the third person implied in bhavan. e.g., Tam kim manānti bhavan Mahā Brahma D II.228 "What does the great Brahma think? (i.e. What do you think, O great Brahma?).

§ 28. The Nom. of Exclamation.

The nom. when used in an exclamatory function is free from any syntactical connection and may be regarded as akin to the label use. Viewed from another point it is logically related to the nom. of address. It is mostly found with such exclamatory particles as aho etc. e.g., aho Buddhō aho dhammo aho dhammassa svākkhātā ti vadeti M II.96 "he says: a marvel, the Buddha! a marvel, the Doctrine! a marvel, its perfect exposition!"; aho sukham aho sukhati Ud 20 "alas happiness! alas happiness!"; aho nūna Bhagavā, aho nūna kusalo M II.31 "a marvel, the Bless. One! a marvel indeed the (power of) goodness!". This may sometimes appear with out any exclamatory particle. e.g., samanassa mahiddhikatā mahānubhāvata M II.144 "the greatness
ness of his powers, the greatness of his majesty!".

a. Not seldom is met with a nom. of certain adjectives and pronouns used in an exclamatory sense expressing usually surprise, confusion, bewilderment, a longing or a wish such as in greeting. It is however doubtful whether these are nominatives of the neuter adjectives and pronouns as the preceding with abo of the acc. singular of exclamation as found in Skr. with dhik (SS §56) and in Latin (cp. O fortuna tam, natam me consule Romam! "O blessed Rome, new born when I was consul"). But in the instances found in the Nikāyas the ending -am seems more likely to be the nom. sg. neuter agreeing with an implied tam or etam in an impersonal construction. e.g., acchariyanam vata bho abhutaṁ vata bho M II.144; D II.107 "(it is) wonderful indeed, marvellous indeed!"; sāgatam bhante Bhagavato D II.173; M I.212,514 "Welcome to the Blessed One"; alam Vakkali kim te iminā putikāya na diṭṭhena S III.120 "enough! Vakkali, what is the use of seeing this putrid body for you?"; kim pana bhante saddam assositi D II.130 "what! Sir, have you heard any sound? (cp. English 'what!').

b. The pronouns ayam, idam etc. are sometimes used with a semi-exclamatory sense though agreeing with a following nom. which however do not qualify in strict logical sense. Here the pronoun is very much like a particle of demonstration such as English 'here!' and 'there!'. e.g., Ayam samāno
Gotamo āgacchati M II.2,30, "here! the recluse Gotama is coming"; niśdatu bhante Bhagavā, idam āsanam pāññattam M II.2
"may the Blessed One sit down, here! a seat has been prepared".
CHAPTER II

THE ACCUSATIVE CASE.

§ 29. The primary function of the acc. or the second case (dutiya) is to denote the direct or near object, in other words, that which is mainly affected by the verb-concept. Brugmann favours the term grammatical object in this connection (KVG §866). The name kamma (Skr. karman) of the local grammarians, on the other hand, strictly means the logical object, whatsoever may be its grammatical function; it implies the object of the active verb as well as the subject of the passive or the objective genitive (cp. SS p.1, f.n.). Apparently Indian grammar did not distinguish between the grammatical and the logical object, just as it did not make any difference between the subject and the agent both being commonly denoted by the same term kattā (Skr. kartr) meaning literally "doer" (vide § 17). The logical connection between the object and the verb, just as in the case of the subject and the latter, varies according to the nature of the action (kriyā). The acc. is more conspicuously adverbal than any other case. Even in its adnominal function the other noun to which it is connected bears a marked predicative character, being usually a verbal noun, agent-noun or some such formation.
§ 30. "That which the agent does or performs is the object" says Kaccāyana, while Pāṇini defines it as "That which is most desired (sci. to be affected) by the agent". Moggallāna has no special rule for this purpose but lays down in the vutti that "what is done by, or is intimately connected with, the action of the agent is the object". It may be remarked that none of these does give a comprehensive idea of the logical function of the object but rather tries to explain the connection between the agent and the object. This is due to the common characteristic of all Indian grammarians, namely, dealing with syntax only from the point of view of the agent and not viewing the sentence as one whole psychological unit. Strictly speaking Kaccāyana's definition holds good only for verbs like making, doing, performing etc., while Pāṇini and Moggallāna come closer to, if not actually anticipate, the modern conception, namely, that the noun-concept that is affected by verbs of influence is the object and is put in the acc. case (vide KVG §560). But the defect of Pāṇini's method is evident from his next

1. yaṃ karoti taṃ kammam. Kac. 282.
3. karīyati kattukiriyābhisambhandhiyatiti taṃ kammam, on the sutta kamme dutiyā. Mog. II.2.
sūtra "Or that which is not desired if it is not connected with the verb", illustrated by "viṣaṃ bhakṣyati and caurāṇ paśyati", whereby he attempts to surmount the difficulty caused by the narrow meaning of the term 'Ipsitatamāṃ' (most desired). Patanjali however thought that this rule might be done away with¹. As regards Kaccāyana's definition, the only justification is that the verb of physical action is best instanced by the root kr (karoti) "to do, to make". All the examples he adduces contain either that verb or an equivalent. But Moggallāna appears to have taken a wider view for his illustrations extend to such verbs as pacati "cooks" and passati "sees". As usual of course both the Pāli grammarians for the most part merely repeat the conventional illustrations of Pāṇini (e.g., kaṭam karoti).

§ 31. The Acc. of External Object.

Verbs of direct agency or verbs of influence (i.e. affecting) in their primitive or non-causative state may take an external object (cp. KVG §561), that is, the noun put in the acc. case may denote an actual, physical or material, object such as a person, thing or place. This may be called the concrete external object. e.g., mā Tathāgatam vihesesi M I.332 "do not harass the Tathāgata".

¹ vide Philosophy of Sanskrit Grammar p.258.
gāvim vadhítvā M I.58 "having killed a cow"; gattāni anomajjāmi M I.80 "I rub down the limbs"; te bhoge rājāno vā haranti,....aggi vā dāhati, udakāṃ vā vahati M I.86 "those riches either kings(will) seize,...the fire burn or the water carry away"; thusodakaṃ pivāmi M I.77 "I drink gruel"; andhakāre telapajjotam dhāreyya M I.512 "would hold a lamp in the darkness"; kaṭṭhāni pālenti Sn p.104 "chop wood".

a. The same external object may represent an abstract concept such as a mental state in which case we have an abstract external object. e.g., Samano Gotamo dhammaṃ deseti M I.77 "The recluse Gotama preaches the doctrine"; abrahmacariyaṃ pahāya M I.345 "having abandoned immoral conduct".

b. Some of these verbs of influence or affecting may permit of an etymological object. e.g., āhāram āhāreti D I.166, II.283 "takes food"; -bhojanāṃ bhojimha M I.367 "ate a meal"; mantāṃ manteyya D I.104 "would utter a charm".

§ 22. There are some other verbs which can be only in an abstract sense called verbs of affecting. Such are those of seeing, knowing, perceiving, hearing and the like. With these the actual effect of the action is more or less on the agent himself and the physical object is merely the cause for that influence. e.g., satte passāmi M I.504 "I see
beings"; dharmapariyāyaṃ sutvā M I.83 "having heard the doctrinal system"; jātisamudayaṃ pañānāti M I.50 "knows the origin of birth". Local grammarians denote this function by the term 'viṣayatva' or "the state of being the object of cognition".

§ 33. The Adnominal Acc. of Ext. Object.

In the above examples the acc. is used adverbially, that is, the noun-concept is the object of a proper verb which is the predicate of the sentence or the clause. Corresponding to each of these we may have an adnominal construction, where the acc. represents the object not of an actual verb but only one implied by a verbal noun agent-noun or a similar formation of a verbal character. In such cases there is the alternate construction with the gen. of the object (§ 143). Certain dependent (tatpurusā) determinative compounds which preserve the acc. of the first member (aluk-samāsa), such as piyām-vada D II.163 "pleasant-speaking", also belong to this class. In the adnominal construction too we may have all the logical differences as were found in the adverbial such as the concrete, the abstract and so on. Here the second member which is really the verb-concept or the predicative element though employed nominally may be either an agent-noun, verbal substantive,

1. vide Philosophy of Sanskrit Grammar p. 199.
verbal adjective, or any other secondary formation such as those with the suffixes -ka and -ika. e.g.; Agent-noun: samanāṇaṃ vā brāhmaṇaṃ vā apasādetā D III.44 "reproacher (of) recluse or brahmin"; samagga-karaniṃ vācaṃ bhāsitā D I.64, III.154 "speaker (of) uniting speech"; aṇṇe samanabrāhmaṇe pucchitā D I.51 "questioner (of) other recluses and brahmins"; attānāṃ āvikattā M II.125 "revealer (of) himself"; pāṇaṃ jīvitā voropetā M II.103 "depriver of life (of) being(s)"; Verbal noun: Gotamaṃ dassanāya D I.113 "for the purpose of seeing Gotama"; dassana-kāmā hi mayam tam Gotamaṃ D I.150 "we are desirous of seeing that Gotama". Here the expressions dassanāya and dassana-kāmā are almost infinitives of purpose (cp. PLS §77). Verbal adjective: bhattam bhutāvissa D II. 127 "of one-who-has-taken (his) meal"; Secondary formations: ārādhako hoti nāyam dhammaṃ kusalaṃ M II.197 "is one undertaking (accomplishing) the method, the law and what is good".

§ 34. The Acc. of Internal Object.

When the noun-concept is represented as the result of an action and that result outlasting the process of the action exists separately, it is called the acc. of internal object (cp. KVG §561.2). This known as nirvarttya karmān according to orthodox grammarians. In an
example like ghaṭāṃ karoti "makes a pot" it is held that the pot is not logically supposed to have existence prior to the action, and, therefore, it is not strictly correct to take ghaṭa as an example of karmakāraka¹. The contention appears to be reasonable when we consider the fact that it is actually not the pot which is made but the clay which is made into a pot. But this however does not affect the actual grammatical relation existing between karoti and the object. Naturally enough, therefore, the internal object is only found with such verbs as those of making, building, constructing, creating and the like. e.g., nivāsanāni māpetum D II.87 "to build dwellings"; Saṃśī yānakaśaputto rathassa namim tacchati M I.31 "Saṃśī the cartwright(-son) fashions a hub for the chariot"; app'ekacce uddhanāni khaṇānti Sn p.104 "some dig out fire-places".

a. Just as in the case of the external object this can also appear in an abstract sense. e.g., kopaḥ na pātukaroti M I.128 "does not manifest anger". Here the noun and the verb are frequently etymologically related. e.g., udānaṃ udānāsi D II.186 "uttered a solemn utterance"; anuttaraṃ samāsambodhiṁ abhisambuddho D II.140 "realized unsurpassed and perfect Enlightenment (lit. awoke to the highest Awakenment) ".

1. vide Philosophy of Sanskrit Grammar p.218.
b. These constructions may occur adnominally as well, e.g.,
na dhūman kattā hoti M I.220 "is not a producer of smoke";
pāpakam cittam uppādetā M I.79 "producer (of) evil thought".

§ 35. The Object of Contents.

The same internal object may represent a nominal concept that exists only during the verbal action. The noun put in the acc. thus denotes the process by which the action is manifested. Since it is contained within the action it has been called the object of contents (KVG § 561.2.b.). By their very nature of being simultaneous with the verbal process they consist generally of cognate uses. e.g., vitakkam vitakkessati M I.122 "lit. will think a thought" i.e., "reflect"; loka-cittam cinteti S V.447 "thinks a worldly thought"; mā pāpakam akusalam cittam cinteyyātha S V.418 "do not think any evil, unmeritorious thought"; dussutam assumha M II.186 "we have heard a bad thing (lit. a bad hearing)"; vedanam vedeti M I.90 "he feels a sensation"; sīhanādam nadeyyam D III.23 "roars a lion's roar"; karunām jhānam jhāyati D II.239 "he meditates (a meditation) on compassion"; kumāra-kīlikam kili D II.96 "he played children's games"; brahma-cariyam caritvā D II.208 "having lived the Higher Life"; caratha bhikkhave cārikām D II.45, 250 "wander forth, O monks, (lit. the wandering)"; nāgāpalokitam Vesālīm apaloketvā D II.122 "having taken (lit. looked) a graceful
a. Sometimes the verb used may not be the same as the radical element of the noun but may be cognate only in sense. E.g., cetiya-cārikaṃ āhinḍanta D II.141 "travelling on pilgrimage"; pahāraṃ dadeyya M I.124 "would give a blow"; seyyaṃ kappemi M I.78 "I make my bed".

b. To this class also belong certain compound verbs where the first member is the acc. singular of a substantive standing as internal object, in most cases cognate, to the verb karoti, which here does not contain the full meaning of "to do" or "to make" but merely expresses the cognate idea contained in the noun. E.g., padakkhinam katvā D II.40, 163 "having gone round to the right" (i.e. having paid his respects); dukkhass' antaṃ karonti D II.252 "they make an end of Sorrow"; ātappam akaruṃ D II.256 "they made an effort" rajjaṃ kāreyya D II.140 "would administrate the government"; kālam karissati D II.93, 140 "he will die"; in verse the acc. may appear after the verb, thus: tam jano kurute piyam Dh 217 "him the people love", which should normally stand as tam jano piyam kurute; hence the Comy. glosses it by piyam karoti (vide Dh Comy. III.286).


Many uses of this acc. seem to border on the logical spheres of other cases. The following
division may be admitted:

a. With verbs of asking, begging, imploring, learning etc. the person asked and so on is denoted by the acc. Here the abl. as found used in Sanskrit (SS §95.5.) appears to be the more logical construction. e.g., bhikkhate pare Dh 266 "he begs (from) others"; Bhagavantaṁ yāci D II.104 "he implored the Blessed One"; sakam acariyakam uggahetvā D II.104, 105 "having learnt from his teacher". With verbs of fearing the source of fear, if it is a thing, is optionally construed with an abl. (§122.e.) or a gen. (§150.c.), but if it is a person the acc. seems to be the more proper case. e.g., bhāyasi mām samanāti S I.207; Sn p.48 "do you fear me, recluse?"

b. The inst. is the usual case to signify the person with whom one converses or talks (§ 63.a.iv), but the acc. is used to denote the person talked to, implied by the prefix ā- (cp. Kac.302). e.g., saca mām samanō Gotamo ālapissati aham pi tam ālapissāmi S I.77 "if the recluse Gotama talks to me I shall also talk to him". Other examples of such verbs taking the acc. will be given later (§58.c.). Logically related to such uses is the acc. of the person addressed (cp. SS §42). e.g., bhikkhū āmanṭesi D II.90 "addressed the monks".

c. Sometimes the acc. is used where the dat. is also admiss-
ible. With the verb saddhati "to have faith in or to trust" the normal idiom is the dat. ($94.a.$) or the loc. ($166.c.$) of the person trusted, but the acc. of the thing, e.g., saddhati Tathāgatassa bodhi $A II.66$ "has faith in the Enlightenment of the Tathāgata". With verbs of teaching the older idiom is the dat. of the person taught but the acc. is also found. e.g. amhe vācessasi $S I.120$ "you will teach us". It has to be remarked here, however, that the verb has the causative form and the acc. may denote the original subject of the primitive verb, in which case the meaning will be "you will cause us to recite".

d. In Pāli just as in Sanskrit (vide $SS §42$) certain verbs normally regarded as 'intransitives' occur with a different sense construed with the acc. denoting an object. The acc. with most of these seems originally to have implied relation. Such verbs are: roci in the secondary sense of "approve of", e.g., kasa vā tvaṁ dharmam roceti $M I.170$; $S I.133$ "whose doctrine do you approve of"; cinteti in the sense of "think about, reflect over, consider", e.g., diṭṭhigatāni cintayanto $Sn 834$ "thinking about the heresies"; rodenti in the sense of "cry about or at, lament over", e.g., matampū amma rodanti.....kasmā maṁ amma rodasiti $Thl.44$ "they weep for one dead.....why mother do you weep for me"; araheti in the sense of "be as worthy as", e.g., arahasī vā maṁ tvam na vā maṁ tvam arahasiti $D I.99$ "are you held as worthy as I or are
you not...?"; gacchati in the 'transitive' sense of "walk, traverse", e.g., maggaṃ kho pana me gacchantassā kāyo kilamissati D III.258 "of me going the way the body will be tired", which may logically be regarded as a cognate use.

§ 37. The Acc. of Direction.

Verbs which imply motion towards any object which may be a person, place or condition take an acc. of such a noun-concept. This has been also called the acc. of the aim (SS §40). Verbs of this type are usually those of pure motion such as the following frequently employed in the Nikāyas: gacchati with or without the prefixes upa-, anu-, adhi-, abhi- etc.; kamati usually with abhi-, ava-, upa+sama-; yāti with abhi-, ni(s)-, ud-, abhi+ud-; eti with upa-; serati with anu-; dhāvati with anu-; ruvhati with ā; gāhati with ava-; pājati (pad) with ā-, ud-, paṭi-, upa-; visati with or without prefixes; vattati with pa-; kirati with ava-; vassati usually with abhi+ni-. In most of these, especially in the last three examples, the acc. is usually regarded as being due to the prepositional force of the prefixes. But in the earlier language a verb of the type of varṣati was capable of taking the acc. even without any prefix (cp. SS § 42). These prefixes are generally supposed to change the so-called intransitive verbs into transitives. According to this view
the acc. with the above verbs when they occur with any of
the said prefixes is due to its being the object. But in
Old Indo-Aryan such indeclinables as 5, adhi, anu, pari,
pri etc. are found both as prepositions and postpositions
just as in Old Greek. In Indo-European the so-called
prepositions were merely adverbs referring to an action
but later came to attach themselves and 'govern' particular
case forms of nouns like the acc., inst., abl., gen., and
loc., thus losing their separate and independent existence
as help-words in the sentence. Their pre-verbal use is due
to the peculiar syntactical relation they bore to the verb
as adverbs. Classical Sanskrit shows fewer particles with
a prepositional or postpositional employ than Vedic (vide
VSS §§ 85 - 90). In Pāli they are hardly used as adnominal
prepositions.

§ 38. The Acc. of the Aim.

Local grammarians consider the
varied logical functions of the acc. with such verbs under
the common category of gati i.e. motion (vide Kac. 302). Nevertheless according to the various meanings implied by
the verb, with or without prefixes, these uses differ from
one another in the syntactical relations expressed.

1. vide S. Chatterjee, 'Origin and Development of the
Bengali Language' Vol.II. §509.
a. The simplest use of this acc. is to denote the person, place or thing to or towards which motion is directed.

This may be called the terminal acc. e.g., pokkharāṇīṃ āgamiṣati M I.76 "will go to the pond"; so ālāhanāṃ gantvā gantvā M II.60 "he having gone continually to the cemetery"; dakkhiṇāṃ janapadaṃ gantvā D I.96 "having gone to the southern country"; khattiya-parisāṃ upasāmkamitvā D II.109 "having approached (lit. walked to) the assembly of princes"; uyyāna-bhūmiṃ niyāsi D II.179 "went (lit. down) to the pleasure-ground"; yam paṭidhāveyyātha M III.9 "whom you would run back to"; maṃ Mithilāṃ paṭinetu M II.80 "lead me back to Mithilā"; na heṭṭhāpāsādaṃ orohati D II.21 "he does not descend to the lower storey"; pāsādaṃ āruyha D II.39 "having ascended to the terrace"; paṭhavikāyaṃ anupeti D I.55, 180 "does not go to an earthly body".

Sometimes two accusatives of aim may appear with the same verb in the same sentence. e.g., abhikkāmuṃ bhikkhunāṃ samitiṃ vanam D II.256 "they went to the meeting of the monks to the forest (i.e. in the forest)". A similar double acc. construction is found with the stock-phrase saraṇam gacchati. e.g., Bhagavantam saraṇam gacchāmi A III.242; M I.290; D I.116 "I go to the Blessed One as refuge"; saraṇam tam upema Sn 31 "we go to you as refuge".

Commenting on the frequent phrase Buddhāṃ saraṇam gacchāmi
Buddhaghosa makes the following observation: “In elucidation of the gamana-formula a critic has urged: In the phrase 'Buddham saranam gacchami', he who goes to the Buddha for (lit. to) refuge, may go either to the Buddha or for (lit. to) refuge. In either case the (use) of one word is meaningless. Because there is no double object for the action of going; nor do the grammarians find here a double object as in 'ajaṃ gāmam neti' etc. It is however (a) proper (construction as in the case of ‘he goes to the east and he goes to the west’). Thus he regards both as accusatives of direction.

b. Sometimes however the termination denoted by the acc. may be unspecified. In other words the mere direction may be only implied, which is generally due to the indefinite nature of the noun-concept. e.g., puratthimāṃ disam pavattati D II.172 “rolled on towards the eastern direction”; nabham abbhussukkamāno D II.183 “ascending to(-wards) the sky”.

c. With certain verbs of going prefixed by abhi- it denotes

1. “Gamanīyadipanāyam codako āha: Buddham saranam gacchāmīti ettha, yo Buddham saranam gacchati, esa Buddham vā gaccheyya saranam vā; ubhayathā pi ca ekasa vacanam niratthakam, kasmā gamanakiriyāya kammavāyābhāvato, na h'ettha 'ajaṃ gāmam ānetīti ādisu viyā dikammakattām akkharacintaka icchanti, gacchat'eva pubbaṃ disam gacchati pacchimaṃ disamti ādisu sātthakam evati ce.”. Paramatthajotikā I.p. 17-18.
the person or party against whom one marches etc. e.g., asurā deve abhiyamsu S I.216 "the demons marched against the gods"; rājānaṁ Pasenadīṁ Kosalaṁ abbhuyyāsi S I.93 "he marched against King Pasenadī of Kosala".

d. When they are prefixed by anu- the acc. denotes the object or person that is pursued. This application may cover such English usages as "in the wake of" or "after". e.g., mā sandiṭṭhikam hitvā kālikaṁ anudāvi S I.9 "do not leave the present and run after the future"; phalaṁ anusarati S IV.303 "follows up the result". It is also found with the verb anubandhati where the original root (bandh "tie, connect") is not one of pure motion but gains such an implication by the addition of the prefix anu- through the figurative sense of "start after", hence "follow"; e.g., Bhagavantam anubaddhā honti D II.102 (cp. D I.1) "they were following (lit. started after) the Blessed One".

e. When the prefix adhi- is added to the verb of motion the acc. logically borders on that of the external object. Such verbs are generally treated as 'transitives'. e.g., madhupiṇḍikam adhigaccheyya M I.114 "he would obtain a ball of honey (lit. come to)"; kusalaṁ dhammaṁ adhigaccheyya D I.224 "he would attain to something good", lit. "he would come to or up to something good".
§ 39. **Acc. of Direction in Abstract Sense.**

In certain metaphorical constructions we find the acc. used with similar verbs of motion, implying the aim in an abstract sense. e.g., āgato imām saddhammaṁ M I.47 "come to this good doctrine"; so yasam paramam patto Sn 138 "he attaining to the highest glory"; paṭhama-jjhānāṁ sampajji D II.156 "attained to the first ecstatic state"; uccāvacāṁ āpajjati D II.283 "comes now to the high now to the low"; pallomam āpadam M I.20 "came to (i.e. got) confidence"; bhavadiṭṭhim upagataṁ M I.65 "come to the false doctrine of existence"; gārāyam ṭhānaṁ āgacchati D I.161 "comes to a blame-worthy position"; vuddhiṁ virūdham .... āpajjissathāti D II.63 "would attain to growth and magnitude" vosānaṁ M I.196 "came to the end"; visādaṁ vā pāpuṇāti D I.248 "he comes to grief(lit. dejection)". Various other nuances of the same use may be observed:

a. Certain other abstract uses of the acc. of direction consist of stereotyped idioms where it merely forms part of the verb. Such compound verbs generally have the implied sense of considering or reckoning. Logically they can be compared to the compound verbs with karoti (§35.b.). e.g., saṅkham upeti S III.93 "is reckoned as (lit. goes to the category)"; saṅkham gacchati D I.200 "is considered as" saṅgahaṁ gacchati M I.184 "is considered as (within)"; samodhānaṁ gacchati M I.184; A I.234 "is included".
b. The acc. construed co-ordinately with the inst. in idioms of the type of kālena kālam also belongs to this group. e.g., te kālena kālam upasāṅkaṁitvā D III.60 "they having come from time to time", where the Comy. has 'kālena kālam ti kāle kāle' (Sum.III.851). Even in the following the acc. really belongs to the idiom aṅkena aṅkam and is not necessarily the acc. of direction with the verb parihāryati "is carried": aṅkena aṅkam parihāryati D II.20 "is taken care of (or carried) from hip to hip". But the normal sense of pariharati in the Nikāyas is generally the former, that is, "attends to, takes care of, etc." (vide P.T.S.Dict. s.v.).

§ 40. The Acc. of the Goal.

The acc. may also denote the place or state entered, that is, the actual goal into which motion is implied. This is mostly found with verbs of descending, entering, falling, throwing, being born into and the like. It is only to be expected here that the loc. is, if not the more frequent, at least the concurrent construction ( § 165). e.g., mātu-kucchiṁ okkamati D II.108, III.163 "he enters into the mother's womb"; pokkharāṇam otaritum S I.123 "to descend into the pond"; ogahe te thanūdaraṁ D II.266(V.) "I would enter into thine bosom"; samudṛṣṭam ajjhagahetvā
D II.173 "having descended into the ocean"; geham pavisante
M II.178; D I.83 "entering the house"; vihāram pavisitvā
D II.143 "having entered the monastery"; upari-vehāsanā
khitto S II.184 "thrown into the sky above"; aṅgārakāsām
papatissāmi M I.365 "I shall fall into the pit of charcoal".
When the noun-concept in the acc. denotes a person the use
is more or less abstract. e.g., Tatra vata maṃ bhayaṃ vā
sārājāṃ okkamissati M I.72 "In that matter, fear or flurry
will come upon me (lit. enter into me).

a. With the verb uppajjati "be born", the acc. and the loc.
are promiscuously employed in the Nikāyas. Logically however
the former's application seems to be due to the original
meaning of "attain to" (uppajj- < Skr. ud+pad = step up)
which develops into the sense of "be born into" (cp. Skr.
uppāda= birth), and , the latter (loc.) is construed with it
as denoting the place where one is born (§163.a.iii) according
to this derived meaning of the verb. In any case the acc.
here signifies direction in the wider sense. e.g., Tusitaṃ
kāyaṃ uppajjati D II.14 "is born into the Happy Abode";
Vessavanassa Mahārājassa sahavyataṃ uppajjāmi D II.206 "I am
born into the company of Vessavāna, the Great King"; saggam
lokaṃ uppajjanti D II.142 "they are born into the heavenly
world"; nirayaṃ uppannam D I.162, III.264 (cp. D II.208;
A IV.75) "(him) born into hell".
b. The acc. denoting the surface on to which motion is implied also comes under this category. It is found with verbs of the type of abhivassati "rain on to, upon" and okirati "scatter upon". Here too the loc. can be optionally employed. e.g., mahaḥ iva sūro abhivassaḥ D III.160 "like the rain showering on the earth"; sarīraḥ okiranti D II.137 "fall on (to) the body" (lit. scatter).

§ 41. Secondary Uses of the Acc. of Direction.

With verbs having the sense of bending towards, leaning, depending, hanging on, clinging on to and tending to, the acc. logically implies direction just as in the examples adduced in the preceding paragraphs. Speyer puts such uses on the boundary between the acc. of near object and the acc. of the aim ( SS §40). Though these verbs do not imply any motion in the fundamental sense, still, being of a dynamic character, they are capable of taking an acc. of the thing on to or towards which 'influence' (in the sense that Brugmann ( KVG §560) uses the term) is meant by the action. Speyer (loc. cit.) says that in Skr. the acc. can be used after the primary verb śrayati without any prefix in the sense of bending towards. e.g., tvaḥ śrayati "he bends to you". But in Pāli it always occurs with prefixes. e.g., Brahmāḥ ajjhosissāmi M I.328 "I am attached to (lit. bent on) Brahma"; dvayaḥ nissita S II.17, III.134
"depending on both"; vibhavadiṭṭhiṁ ajjhositā M I.65
"holding on to the view of non-becoming"; bhavadiṭṭhiṁ
allīnā M I.65 "clinging on to the view of becoming";
kapīśisaṁ ālambitvā D II.143 "hanging on to or leaning against
the door post"; sattā dhātuṁ abhinivisanti D II.282 "beings
hold on to an element". The primary verb namatī however can
take the acc. even without any prefix in the sense of "bowing".
e.g., Tathāgataṁ namassatā D II.20 "bowing (down) to the
Tathāgata" (cp. Skr. árayati, above). It is to be remarked
that in the adnominal construction with namo it is not the
acc. but the dat. that is commonly employed (§112). Even
adverbally the latter is concurrently used (§96.b.). The
verb atthu (imperative) in conjunction with nouns of blessing
and greeting as well as their opposites may take an acc. of
the person unto or on whom such a wish is meant to be con­
ferred. e.g., Bhavam atthu bhavantam Jotipālaṁ mānavaṁ D II.
231 "May good fortune attend the honourable Jotipāla". It is
clear here that the acc. is due to the 'direction' implied in
atthu, a construction parallel to the dat. of advantage which
is elsewhere frequently applied in such connections (cp. Cony.
'bhoṭo Jotipālassa...hotu...' Sum.II.p.660). We may compare
with this the usage dhī-ī-atthu mama jīvitaṁ Sn 440 "fie! on
my life" where too the acc. is due to the 'direction' implied
in atthu rather than to the force of the exclamatory particle
dhi (cp. Skr. dhik c. acc., SS §417.2).
§ 42. The Acc. of Relation.

We have already referred to certain uses of the acc. with verbs of speaking etc., where it seems to have originally implied the idea of relation as denoting the thing or person referred to by the action rather than the object proper, (§36.d). Though this construction is undoubtedly pre-Indo-Aryan (cp. KVG §561.5., Latin Acc. of Respect), still in Skr. it had for the most part gone into disuse, the loc. being there the normal case for that function. Moreover, such verbs as those capable of being thus construed became 'transitives' owing to the addition of prefixes (§37), and the acc. came to be regarded as being due to their prepositional force rather than to the special character of the verb. In most of these instances Indian grammarians explain the acc. as being due to the accented prefixes (karmapracacaniyaya cp. Pāṇ. II.38). A striking example of this is found in the frequent passage tam kho pana bhavantam Gotama evaṁ kalyāṇo kittisaddo abhuggato D I.87; Mī II.83 "to this effect has the good report arisen concerning that venerable Gotama", which the vutti on Kaccāyana 301 takes as an instance for the construction 'kammappavacanīyayutte'. But the same occurring at Sn p.103 the commentator (Buddhaghosa) styles as 'itthambhūtayogayutte' (vide Paramatthajotika). The acc. of the person referred to with the verb vadati
can therefore be regarded as originally denoting the person concerning whom a statement is made. The noun clause ending with iti consisting of that statement is here the actual object. e.g., kulaputto ti bhikkhave Nandaṃ sammā vadamānō vadeyya A IV.166 "one could, brethren, rightly say speaking of Nanda that he is the scion of a noble family"; that the iti clause is the actual object and not the noun denoting the person, is shown by the use of tam in the following: Sāriputtaṃ eva tam sammā vadamānō vadeyya M III.29 "one could, rightly speaking, say this of Sāriputta"; asammohasatto loke uppanno.ti....sukhāya devamanussānanti maṃ eva tam sammā vadamānō vadeyya M I.21 "one could say this, rightly speaking, of me: that an undeluded being is born in the world......for the happiness of gods and men".

b. With the verb vyākaroti the acc., though logically denoting the person about whom something is declared, can also be regarded as being the external object of that verb in the sense of "reveal". e.g., paricārake abbhātīte kālakate uppattīsu vyākaroti D II.200 "makes declarations as to the rebirths of (lit. concerning) such followers as had passed away"; iti maṃ jano jānātūti sāvake abbhātīte kālakate uppattīsu byākaroti M I.465 "makes declarations as to the births of such disciples as had passed away (saying): thus may the people know me".

c. A more logical instance of an acc. of relation occurs
in the following: te aññamaññam migasaññam paṭilabhissanti
D III.73 "they receive the impression of a deer with respect
to each other"; or adnominally: aññamaññam agūravā Thl.976
"disrespectful towards each other". From these translations
it becomes clear that the acc. here stands parallel to the
loc. known as nimitta- sattamī (§177.a). This is supported
by the v.l. aññamaññamhi at D III.73 "with regard to each
other", which also shows that it is unnecessary to consider
the acc. aññamaññam as an adverb.

§ 43. Acc. of Relation with Reflexive Participles.

An acc. is also found in the Nikāyas with
certain reflexive participles, denoting originally an
external object with the indicative forms of the verb but
with the participles appearing as accusatives of relation.
This is the exact counterpart of the Latin construction
already referred to (cp. manus victus = bound with respect
to the hands). e.g., cakkhundriyam asaṃvutam viharantuṁ
D I.170; A II.16 "dwelling unrestrained with respect to
the sense of sight", where the loc. is concurrently used
(cp. cakkhundriye saṃvaraṁ āpajjati ); yaṁ pañ' assa khamati
tam gathito mucchito ....D III.42 "being fettered and
infatuated as to that which pleases him", where too the loc.
is parallelly used (vide P.T.S.Dict. s.v.); evañ'Isam nahātassa
D II.160, 172 "of him (who was) bathed with respect to his head"; sīsapārutanā S I.167 "covered as to the head"; here the v.l. sasīsān looks like an attempt to make the concinnity more normal regarding the acc. ending -am as adverbial. A similar acc. occurs with puṭṭho "asked"; e.g., labujam vā puṭṭho ambām vyākareyya D I.58, 56 "inquired as to a goad replies about a mango"; cp. yo atṭham pucchito santo anatṭham anusāsati Sn 126 "who being questioned (regarding) what is useful admonishes (regarding) what is useless".

§ 44. **Acc. of Extension in Space or Time.**

This use of the acc. shows most clearly the original idea of the case, viz., to restrict the application of a verb or a noun to a certain length of space or time. With regard to the latter conception it is usually designated the acc. of duration of time, which Macdonell considered to be in origin only a special form of the cognate acc. (VGS §197.2). He adduces such examples as satya jīva śaṛādo vārdhamānah"live prospering a hundred autumns" (R.V. X.1614), where certainly the cognate sense is clear enough. But in the example tāsmāt sārvān ṛtūn varṣati "therefore it rains during all the seasons" no cognate idea is manifest, because the verb-concept varṣatati has no semantic connection whatever with the noun-concept ṛtūn. This shows that the cognate acc.
is not the only source from which the duration idea may have developed. Pāli grammarians call this kāladdhānamaccanta-saṁyogadutiya vibhatti, "the second case applied to (denote) the extension in time and space", (Kac.300; Mdg.II.3; cp. Pīn. II.3.5).

a. Extent of Space.

This may denote the space traversed or the range over which an action is executed. Here the acc. is clearly seen to limit the application of the verb. e.g.,
yugamattañ ca pekkhāti M III.137 "he fixes his gaze within the range of a yoke"; samantaṁ yojanaṁ passati D II.20 "he sees for a yojana on every side"; metaphorically, sattaporisam pi mahāsamudde udakam saṁsthāti A IV.102 "there is water in the ocean to a depth of seven times the height of a man"; adnominaly, dvādasa yojanaṁ āyāmena D II.146 "twelve leagues in breadth".

b. Extent in Time.

This usually signifies the time during which an action continues or is carried on. e.g.,
satipaṭṭhāne evaṁ bhāveyya satta māsāni M I.63 "and so for seven months one should develop the bases of mindfulness"; so cattāre māse parivasati D I.176, II.152 "he dwells for four months"; tiṭṭhatu Bhagavā kappam D II.103 "may the Blessed One live for an aeon"; imaṁ rattim dukkham sessati
§ 46. Acc. of Place Where.

The acc. may also denote the place where something happens. The few examples found, however, seem to border on
the sphere of the adverbial acc. (of place). e.g.,
upasaṅkamitvā vehāsaṃ atthāmsu S I.23 "having approached 
they stood in the air (or adv. airily)"; ekamantam nisIdi 
D II.91, 102 "sat on a side (cp. adv. aside); ekamantam 
āṭṭhāsi D II.112 "stood on a side or aside". These two 
examples are clearly adverbial, the stem anta- being hardly 
used in the Nikāyas except in adverbs of a historical nature. 
It is not common either in Vedic or in Classical Sanskrit 
and Buddhaghosa commenting on the phrase ekamantam nisIdi 
D II.65 says that it is either an adverbial use (bhāva-
napumsaka-niddeso) as visamaṃ in 'visamaṃ candimā-suriyā 
paharanti' or is an acc. used in the sense of the loc. 
(bhummatthe - Sum.II.p.483). Similarly on ekamantam āṭṭhāsi 
Sn p.13 he has the remark: ekamantanti bhāvanapumsaka-niddeso, 
ekokāsan ekapassanti vuttaṃ hoti, bhummatthe va upayoga-
vacanam (PJ.II.p.140). The loc. itself occurs in the Nikāyas 
though not very frequently, e.g., ekamante ṭīṭhēyya D I.104 
"would stand on a side". The fact that ekamantam is an 
adverbial use, however, does not preclude the possibility of 
it being at the same time an acc. of place where. It may even 
stand as an acc. of direction, e.g., ekamantam apanetvā 
D I.221 "having led... aside (lit. to a side)", or any other 
logical type. Adverbial uses always arise from such original 
functions as these. It may be noted however that the funda-
mental notion underlying these various is the same, viz., the 
spatio-temporal conception.
There is also a class of accusatives denoting place where which had already assumed the rôle of adverbs in the earlier language. Local grammarians treat them as indeclinables or nipētas. Such are the accusatives in the constantly occurring phrase uddhaṃ adho tiriyaṇ D I.163, II.280 "above, below and across" (vide §2).

A similar acc. is found with certain verbs of motion like carati and anucaṅkamati where it denotes the space over which one wanders etc. Here it borders on the acc. of extent in space (§44.a). e.g., gāman vā nigamaṇ vā piṇḍaya caranto D III.265 "going out for alms through (over) village and hamlet"; Vesāliṃ piṇḍaya caritvā "having wandered through Vesāli for alms"; ekamantaṇ anucaṅkamamāno M II.158 "walking up and down on a side". The loc. is here the concurrent idiom (§164.b).

§ 46. Acc. of Time When.

Just as the acc. of place where is connected to the idea of extension in space, so is the acc. of time when related to the notion of extension in time. Therefore the renderings "in" and "through" are both permissible in such instances as the following: e.g., ye pi te bhikkhave ahesuṃ atItaṃ addhānaṃ arahanto samāśambuddhā D II.144 "whichever holy ones, perfectly enlightened Buddhas, there were during (or in) the long past"; ye hi keci atItaṃ addhānaṃ samag...
pañcanubhosaṃ D II.213 "whichever....recluses experienced...during the long past"; yaṃ pi bhikkhave Tathāgato purimāṃ jātiṃ purimāṃ bhavaṃ purimāṃ nīketāṃ pubbe manussabhūto samāno...D III.145 "that the Tathāgata in (or during) a previous birth, existence or life, being then a human being"; yaṃ nānāṃ bhante aññaṃ jātiṃ kodhaṃ ahosim A II.204 "were I, Sir, in another birth (or during another life) irritable"; purimāni bhante divasāni purimatarāni...devā...sannisinnā honti D II.207 "some few days ago...the gods...were assembled" (lit. on or during some previous days...etc.); yaṅca Ananda rattim Tathāgato anuttaram sammāsambodhīṃ anusambujjhati D II.134 "in or during which night the Tathāgata realized unique and perfect enlightenment".

a. In some other examples however the notion of extension in time is hardly implicit for they merely signify the time when. The most prominent employ of such an acc. is found in the stock phrase ekam samayaṃ occurring at the beginning of all suttas. Buddhaghosa commenting on this says it is only an acc. used to suit the sense determined by the context (vidida Pañcañcasūdanī I.p.9-10) and parallel to the more usual loc. (bhummam eva attho, Sum.I.p.33). In the latter Comy. he discusses the use as follows: 'Kasmā pana ettha yathā Abhidhamme yasmin samaye kāmāvacaranti ca, ito aññesu Sutta-padesu yasmin samaye bhikkhave bhikkhu vivicceva kāmehi ca bhumma-
vacanena niddeso kato, Vinaya ca: Tena samayena Buddhō Bhagavā ti, karaṇavacanena, tathā akṛtvā ekaṁ samayanti upayogavacanena niddeso kato ti? Tattha tathā idha ca aṁnathā atthasambhavato'. Then he goes on to say that in the first instance the loc. is used to denote a state (bhāva); in the second, the inst. is employed because the time was itself the occasion (tena samayena hetubhūtena karaṇabhūtena) for the instituting of the precept; in the third, it is a peculiar use of the of acc. of extension of time (yaṁ hi samayam Bhagavā imaṁ aṁnām vā suttantaṁ desesi accantaṁ eva taṁ samayam karaṇaṁ vihārena vihāsi tasmā tadattha-jotanatthan idha upayogavacananiddeko kato ti). He is therefore quite aware of the logical connection between the acc. of time when and that of extension. But the following examples, as pointed out above, have purely the notion of time when: atha kho Bhagavā pubbanhasamayam nivāsetvā D I.178, II.102,122 "thereupon the Blessed One having robed himself in the fore-noon"; pubbanhasamayam abhiruhitvā D II.174 "having ascended... in the fore-noon". It is significant, however, that even in such applications Buddhaghosa sees the implication of extension. On pubbanhasamayaṁ Sn p.13, he makes the following observation: "pubbanhasamaye ti attho ... pubbanho ekaṁ khananti vuttam hoti, evam accanta-samyoge upayogavacanan labbhati" (Pj.II.139). Similarly: rattiyā paccūrasamayaṁ paccuttāhāya D II.203 "having risen up early in the morning"; imaṁ bhikkhave rattim aṁnatarā devatā imaṁ... upasaṅkami A IV.28 "this night, monks,
a certain deity approached me..."; yañ ca rattim pari-
nibbāyati D II.134 "whichever night...(the Tathāgata)... passes away". The day on which something happens is also denoted by the acc. e.g., attha kho sattaman divasaṃ Kosinārakānaṃ Mallakānaṃ etad ahosi D II.159 "on the seventh day it occurred to the Mallas of Kosinārā"; Acela Korakkha-
ttiyo sattamaṃ divasaṃ...kālaṃ karissati D III.7 "A. K. will die on the seventh day"(Comy. glosses it by 'sattame divase').

b. The acc. of certain compounds in which the first member is a past (passive or middle) participle and the second is pubbam (acc.) occurs frequently in the Nikāyas denoting the time when. This is mostly found in the instance bhūtapubbaṃ which appears as an introductory remark in narration. e.g.,

Bhūtapubbaṃ bhikkhave rājā ahosi Pacetano nāme A I.3111 "(It happened) in the past, there was a king by name Pacetana;
Bhūtapubbaṃ Pūraṇo Kassapo anekasatāya parisāya dhammaṃ desesi M II.3 "It happened in the past that Pūraṇa Kassapa was preaching his doctrine to a crowd of many hundreds"(cp. D II.130,169); sannisinna-pubbaṃ sallapita-pubbaṃ D II.109 "met in the past, conversed in the past". In Skr. pūrvam occurs in narration in the same sense instead of atīte e.g., Vārānasīyāṃ abhūt pūrvam Brahmadatt śbhido nṛpaḥ, Kathā-
saritsāgara I.7 (cp.I.3). The compound bhūtapūrvam too is met with in the Mahābhārata and Kāvya literature (vide Monier Williams Dict. s.v.). In such instances the acc. -pubbaṃ is
adverbially referring to what has been before.

c. There are also a few temporal accusatives of an archaic character used in the Nikāyas as adverbs. e.g., āyatim pi evarūpena pāṇitena pindapātena pariviseyyati M I.369 "would treat again (lit. in the future) too with such excellent alms as this"; sāyapātaṁ upaṭṭhānaṁ āgacchati D II.188 "they come for the purpose of attending (on him) morning and evening".

§ 47. The Adverbial Accusative.

The acc. singular of substantives and neuter adjectives is copiously employed in the Nikāyas in adverbial sense. As in the other languages adverbs formed from adjectives predominate and it is only rarely that substantives are so used, most of them being treated by local grammarians as particles (nipāta), especially those stereotyped adverbial accusatives inherited from Vedic like nāma etc. (cp. §2). In their particular functions these adverbs admit of the usual classification into local, temporal, modal, causal and so on. On the whole Brugmann's division as found in his Greek Grammar (§441) tallies with the distinctions that appear in the Nikāya prose. In the preceding paragraphs we have already referred to a few such uses. The following is a more exhaustive treatment:

The acc. as adverb of time and space is mostly found of adjectives and participles that imply these conceptions. The following are temporal uses:

ṣīghaṁ A I.45 "quickly" (mostly found in compounds where the ending -am is dropped for euphony); sanikaṁ D II.333; M I. 120; S I.82,203; khippaṁ A II.118, III.164 (cp. Sn 413, 682, 998) "soon"; tuvaṭaṁ (cp. Skr. tvaritaṁ) A V.342 "hurriedly"

The adverbial acc. of nominal stems is only found in one or two archaic instances, e.g., yena samantā yojanaṁ passati divā c'eva rattīṇca D II.20 "sees a yojana all around by day as well as by night", where the use of the inst. divā side by side with acc. rattīṁ proves beyond doubt that the latter is an adverbial usage (cp. Vedic naktām "by night"; vide § 2). The local use of this kind of adverb is not so frequent as the above in the Nikāyas since it is more liable to fall in with the adverb of manner. e.g., rassam assasāmīti pajānāti.....dīghaṁ assasāmīti pajānāti M I.56 "lit. he knows that he breathes short, .... he knows that he breathes long". A similar acc. is found of nouns denoting the cardinal points. e.g., uttarīṁ Vesāliyaṁ D III.10 "to the north (lit. northly) of Vesāli". In the commonly found idiom yena.....tad avasari D II.126, 156 "whither.... thither went" (§81.b.ii), it is almost certain that the acc. tad is a local adverb though the verb ava-sari is
capable of taking the acc. of the place entered (§40). Another local use seems to be contained in the phrase (tam) mūlam chindeyya A II.199, which is admitted as a textual variation of mūla chindeyya. Here, if the former reading is authentic, which is not unlikely, mūlam would be an adv. acc. meaning "if one were to cut (it) by the root".

§ 49. Adv. Acc. of Contents (internal object).

a. Some cognate accusatives are adverbially used parallel to the construction with katvā (§35.b) as in the idiom visum karoti "makes apart, scatters" etc.; almost all are adverbs of manner. e.g., so tam thūnam khandā-khandikam chindeyya A II.199 "he would cut the post into pieces (lit. piecemeal)". Here the verb chindeyya contains the notion of "bits" or "pieces" which is the sense of the noun khandā. Local grammarians would paraphrase it by 'so tam thūnam khandā-khandikam katvā chindeyya'.

b. Closely related to the above is a class of adjectival compounds used adverbially, its second member being the etymological object of the verb following. The origin of this construction can be traced back to the Vedic dialect, where it is found with the privative particle a-. e.g., '.....lokān anapajayyām abhy ājayan' "unconquerably (i.e., irrevocably) conquered these worlds" (vide VGS §196.5.b).
In Pāli it occurs mostly with the particle su- "well", e.g.,

samaṃ suvibhattaṃ vibhaji D II.166,235 "he divided (it)
equally and well (lit. well-dividedly)", where the parallel
use of samaṃ, a pure adverb, shows that the latter too is
employed in the same manner; suvinihaṃ vineti D III.189
"he trains (him) well (lit. well-trainedly)". There are a
few instances where the first member is an adjective or a
participle. e.g., chinnapapitaṃ papatanti D II.140 "falls
prostrate on the ground (lit. falls a-fall-as-if-it-were-cut)";
gālha-bandhanaṃ baddho D I.245 "bound tightly (lit. by a
strong binding)". A similar cognate use is found with yatha-.
e.g., yathabhuttaṃca bhunjathāti D II.173 "may ye eat as ye
have eaten (before)". In all these examples the inst. can be
substituted for the acc. without any alteration of the meaning.
In later Pāli the inst. is actually found in such places
showing clearly how the original adverbial sense of the acc.
is being gradually lost, the latter being superseded by the
former (inst.) which becomes the commoner adverbial case
after the model of Classical Sanskrit, though in Vedic, as
mentioned above, the adverbial employ of the acc. is not
unusual.

§ 60. Neuter Pronoun (acc. sg.) as Adverb.

a. Within this class of adverbial accusatives Brugmann
includes the acc. sg. of neuter pronouns (interrogative,
relative and demonstrative) used adverbially (Greek Grammar, §441.2.b.). This is widely used in Pāli and Skr. In the case of those derived from interrogatives, by virtue of their origin, they come to mean "how, why?" etc. and are therefore adverbs of manner or of reason. e.g., kinti me sāvakā dhamma-dāyādā bhavayyum no āmisadāyādā ti M I.12 "How now, do my disciples become the heirs of my Law and not of my possessions?"; kin ti te sutam D I.104 "why, have you not heard?"; kin ti te D II.174 "how then?"; kin nu kho āvuso D II.8,131 "why, friends?" (but why, why in the world etc. vide P.T.S. Dict. s.v). This seems to be a development from the acc. of relation, implying originally "as to what..." (cp. Latin 'Quid ille me castigat? Why (lit. as to what) does he lecture me?').

b. In similar context we find the acc. tam and yam used to denote "therefore" and "wherefore" respectively. yam is more frequent in this connection. e.g., yam sukho bhavam tam sukha mayam, yam dukkho bhavam tam dukkhā mayam D II.233 "since (lit. wherefore) you are happy therefore we are happy, since you are sorrowful therefore we are sorrowful" (cp. Latin 'Quod non venisti, timebam', "because (lit. as to the fact that you did not come, I was anxious").

c. Related to this is the employ of the relative neuter pronoun yam as connective between the principal sentence and subordinate clauses. This corresponds to yad in Skr. (cp. Monier-Williams Dict. s.v.), which can stand either for the nom. or
for the acc. according to the context. e.g., yampi Bhotoc
Sonadaṇḍassa yaso hāyissati saṃaṇassa Gotamassa yaso abhi-
vaddhissati iminā pā ngena na arahati bhavaṃ Sonadaṇḍo....
Gotamam dassanāya upasaṅkamitum D I.113 "since the fame of
venerable Sonadaṇḍa will diminish and that of the recluse
Gotama will increase, because of this very fact it is not
fitting that the venerable Sonadaṇḍa should go to see him";
kim atthi yaṃ āvuso saṃaṇe Gotame brahmacariyam vussatiti
S IV.51 "what (profit) is there, friend, now that the Holy
Life is lived under the recluse Gotama? "; atṭhānaṃ kho
etam mārisa anavakāso yaṃ ekissā loka-dhātuyā dve arahanto
saṃsambuddhā apubbaṃ acarimaṃ uppaṃ jeyyudd D II.225 "It is
not possible, friend, there is no chance, that in the same
world-system two Holy Ones, perfectly enlightened Buddhas
can arise at the same time"; Buddhaghosa calls yaṃ in this
context 'the nom. used in the sense of the inst.' ( kāraṇa-
tthe paccattam ) and glosses it by 'yena kāraṇena' (Sum. II.
p. 659). It is however more likely that the form yaṃ here
represents an acc. after the type of the adverbial accusatives
discussed above. The following examples support the latter
view: Tasmā-t-iha Ānanda tuyh' ev'etam dukkaṭām .... yam
tvam .... na Tathāgataṃ yači D II.115 "Therefore, Ānanda,
this mistake has been committed by you...that you......did
not implore the Tathāgata"; nāhaṃ bhante etam rodāmi yaṃ
maṃ Bhagavā evam āha M I.389 "I do not grieve, Sir, over
this, that the Blessed One has spoken to me thus"; na hi
sādhu yam uttama puggalassā sarīra-bhaṅge siyā sampahāro
D II.166 "it is not good that there should be a quarrel
over the distribution of the relics (lit. the body) of the
noblest man"; It may be remarked here that sometimes instead
of the connective (nt. acc. sg.) the actual relative pronoun
agreeing with the subject of the clause in number and gender
is employed in similar constructions. e.g., na kho me tam
paṭirūpaṃ yo 'ham ākinnā viharāmi D II.30 "it is not fitting
for me that I should live crowded"; ovadatu māṃ bhante
Bhagavā anusāsatu māṃ bhante Bhagavā yam māṃ' asa dīgha-
rattattāṃ hitāya sukhāyāti S III.1 "may the Blessed One advise
that me and admonish me,(sci. it = tam) may conduce to my benefit
and weal for a long time". The origin of this idiom may have
been due to such contact as afforded by instances of the
type: yam rūpaṃ aniccam dukkham viparināmadhammaṃ ayaṃ
rūpassa ādinavo S III.62 "that the form is impermanent,
subject to grief and change, this is the danger of form",
where the proper connective yam accidentally agrees in gender
and number with the subject of the subordinate clause, viz.,
rūpaṃ.

d. The acc. yam is also used as a temporal adverb meaning
"when", usually introducing adverbial clauses or even in
the temporal function of "since", often to be rendered by
English 'that'. e.g., ito so bhikkhave eka-navuto kappo
yam Vipassi Bhagavā ... loke udapādi D II.2 "it was the
ninety first aeon hence that the Blessed One Vipassi ....
was born in the world". Commenting on this Buddhaghosa says that yam is found in four distinct uses: 1. **paccatta-vacane** "in the sense of the nom."; e.g., yam me bhante devānam....sammukhā sutam.....ārocemi tam bhante Bhagavatoti, where it is only the relative pronoun agreeing with the subject sutam. 2. **upavoga-vacane** "in the sense of the acc."; e.g., appucchimha akkittayI no aṇṇam, yam pucchāma tad āṅgha brūhiti, where too it is the relative pronoun acc. sg. agreeing with the object tad. 3. **karana-vacane** "in the sense of the inst."; e.g., aṭṭhānam etam bhikkhave anavakāso yam ekissā loka-dhārayā ti, where, as has been shown in the foregoing (c), it is the proper connective adverb. 4. **bhum'atthe** "in the sense of the loc."; as in the context under discussion (idha pana; Sum. II.p.410). The commentarian is therefore, aware of the syntactical distinctions of the uses of yam. Its purely temporal application is attested by many other examples too. e.g., Atha kho Bharanī Kālamo Kapilavatthumā pakkāmi, yam Kapilavatthumā pakkāmi tadā pakkanto va ahosi na puna pacchāgaṇḍhi A I.278 "Then B.K. set out from Kapilavatthu and when he left it (then) it was never to return", where the parallel use of tadā is proof of the temporal sense of yam; So kho Ānanda samayo yam mahā-vātā vāyanti D II.107 "That is the time, Ananda, when great gales blow"; bhavissati bhikkhave so samayo, yam imesam manussānam dasavassāyukā puttā bhavissanti D III.71 "there will be that time when these men will have sons who will
(only) live upto ten years", where the Comy. has 'yaṃ imesanti yasmiṃ samaye imesam ....'; hoti kho āvuso samayo yaṃ kadāci karahaci dīghassa addhuno accayena ayam loko samvaṭṭati D II. 28 "there is a time, brethren, when at some time or other after the lapse of a long period this world will evolve....". All these examples go to show that the acc. in ayaṃ samayam occurring at the beginning of all suttas has its origin in the above-discussed temporal adverbial use.

§ 51. Adverbial Use of Acc. (nt.sg.) of Adjectives.

a. Adjectives denoting quantity or degree form corresponding adverbs. e.g., atibāḷhaṃ paridevesi D II.232 "he lamented very much"; suññatāvihārenāhaṃ, Ānanda, etarahi bahulaṃ viharāmīti M II.104 "mostly I spend my time now, Ānanda, in the (lit. by the) dwelling on Emptiness"; etad eva bahulaṃ bhikkhūnaṃ dhammīṃ kathāṃ karoti D II.123 "he speaks much to the monks on doctrinal matters"; yo ciram jivati so vassa-satam appam vā bhiyyo D II.4 "he who lives long lives a hundred years or less more or less".

b. Several acc. adverbs are formed from comparatives of adjectives in -tara (cp. VGS §196.5.). e.g., yathā ahaṃ cirataraṃ passeyyaṃ D II.178 "that I may see longer". The suffix may be added even to adverbial case-forms like divā. e.g., Kālīdāsi divataram yeva utṭhāsi M I.125 "the maid Kāli rose up earlier-in-the-day".
c. Adverbs are also formed from adjectives denoting *priority* and *posteriority of time*. *e.g.*, *samma-sam-buddhā* *apubban* 
acarimaṇṇa uppajjeyyam D II.226 "All-Enlightened Ones are born neither before nor after (the other, *i.e.* simultaneously)";
tadanantaraṇ paṭissallinā D II.266 "meditating the meanwhile";
na ciraṃ Tathāgatassa parinibbānaṃ bhavissati D II.119 "ere long (*lit.* not long after) will take place the passing away of the Tathāgata".

d. The acc. sg. nt. of the numeral adjective eka "one" is found in a peculiar adverbal usage in a passage of philosophic importance, *viz.*, *ye te samaṇabrāhmanā.....ekaṃ attānaṃ*

damenti ekaṃ attānaṃ samenti ekaṃ attānaṃ parinibbāpenti A II. 63. To the student of syntax ekaṃ here clearly appears as an adverb meaning "once"(*i.e.* one time) and not by any means as an adjective qualifying attānaṃ. Accordingly the sense would be: "whichever recluses and brahmins........once train themselves, again (*lit.* once) calm themselves and still again (*lit.* once) tranquillize themselves"; *cp.* eka- standing for ekaṃ (adv.) in ekajāṃ vā dijam vā pi Sn p.21 "once-born or twice-born"; also devo ca ekamekaṃ phusāyati Ud 5 "and it rains drop by drop (*lit.* one by one)". This adverbial use of ekaṃ is only a logical development from the adverbial acc.sg. of neuter ordinals such as paṭhamam "firstly", dutiyam "secondly" and tatiyam "thirdly"(*cp.* Latin primum etc.). *e.g.*, dutiyam pi...tatiyam pi kho...D II.103 "secondly...thirdly..."
e. The acc. sg. of certain nouns implying divisions of time like khanam "a moment" is used adverbially to denote frequency or continuity with the prefix abhi- e.g., so abhikkhanam... dukkham paṭisāṃvedi M I.308 "he experienced...sorrow continually (i.e. moment by moment)". The numerical adverbs in -khattuṇ (Skr. kṛtvāḥ) denoting the number of times are also formed on the model of adverbial accusatives. e.g., tikkhattum pada-kkhiṇam katvā D II.163 "having walked round to the right (i.e. paid respects) three times".

§ 52. Acc. as Adv. of Manner.

a. A large class of adverbial accusatives play the part of adverbs of manner. These seem to have developed from the original appositional accusatives (cp. VG §642.b.). They are either the acc. sg. of substantives, neuter pronouns, adjectives or adjectival compounds. e.g., from substantives: dukkham sessati S I.83 "will sleep miserably" (cp. A I.137; M I.192); sukkham seti S I.212 "he dwells at ease (i.e. happily)" (cp. A I.136). A similar acc. is found in the following examples where it has the sense of 'after the manner of' or 'like': udumbarakhaḍikāṁ 'vāyaṁ kulaputto bhoge khādatīti A IV.283 "This clansman eats his wealth like a fig tree-glutton"; ajaddhumārikāṁ 'vāyaṁ kulaputto marissatīti (ibid) "this clansman will die like a starveling" (cp. E. M. Hare Gradual Savings IV.189); from adjectives: samaṁ vibhajī D II.166,235 "divided equally"; sādhukāṁ manasikaroṭha D I.63;II.2,285 "reflect well"; sādhukāṁ uggahetvā D II.119 "having learnt well";
from adjectival compounds: **pundarikāni**... **samodakaṃ thitāni**

D II.38 "white-lotuses ... standing at a level with the water";

**ime dhamme anavasesāṃ samādāya** D I.165 "having taken up these doctrines completely (lit. remainderless-ly)";

**pasannacittam anussareyya** M I.210,211 "would reflect over with a delighted heart (lit. delighted-hearted-ly)". A class of compounds with **-upamaṃ** as the second member is used adverbially implying accordance. e.g., **kullūpamaṃ vo bhikkhave ājānantehi dhammā pi vo pahātabbā** M I.135 "according to the parable of the raft even the dhammas should be discarded by you when you, brethren, attain to realization".

b. To this category belongs a class of acc. adverbs formed from descriptive determinatives where the first member is an adverb (inclusive of particles and prepositions) and the second is a noun or a past passive participle with substantival significance. Such compounds when employed thus as adverbs are treated by local grammarians as a special class called **abbayī-bhāva** (Skr. **avyayī-bhāva samāsa** ; cp. Kac.321). e.g.,

**ajjhattam arūpasaññī** D II.112 "internally conscious of the formless"; **ajjhattam kāye kāyānupassī** D II.216 "internally he sees the body in terms of the body"; **paccattam yeva parinibbāyati** D II.68 "attains parinibbāna individually or himself"; (Comy. attanā); **paccattam veditabbo** D II.217 (cp. D I.24) "should be known personally or individually"; **nivātaṅca vata ayaṃ ca Migāramātupāsādo ....asaṅkampi** S V.270 "even in the absence of a gale (without a storm) this mansion of Migāramātā
trembled”; cp. archaic acc. anuraho maṃ ... codeyyum M I.27
"they would accuse me....secretly" (vide §2); yathābhūtām
pajānāmi D I.162 "he knows according to reality" (cp. M I.91);
yathābhīrantaṃ viharītvā D II.94,126 "having lived as long as
he desired (lit. according to fancy)"; yathā-kāmaṃ S I.227
"according to inclinations"; yathā-sattīṃ yathā-balam D I.102
"according to energy, according to strength"; yathānínam
pavattamānaṃ A II.140 "flowing downward according to the
bent"; yāva-jīvaṃ anatikkamanīyā D III.1332 "not to be trans­
gressed as long as life (lasts)"; to this adv. acc. is
related the peculiar use of taṃ in the stock phrase yathā taṃ
e.g., yathā-taṃ Mārena pariyuṭṭhita-citto D II.103 "because
(lit. according to the fact that) his mind is obsessed by the
Evil One"; the Comy. has the characteristic remark ‘ettha tanti
nipāta-mattam’; cp. yathā-taṃ D II.264,269;III.8 ; M I.249, II
142 "because, accordingly as"; tiro-kuddaṃ tiro-pākāraṃ
tiro-pabbataṃ asajjamāno gacchati M I.69 "he goes without
going stuck through wall and mountain". There are also to
be found a few similar adverbial formations with the particle*
– sa– which is the contracted form of either the sociative adv.
saha or the prefix saṃ– . e.g., sanidāṇaṃ samāṇo Gotamo
dhammaṃ deseti M II.9 "the recluse Gotama preaches the doct­
rine reasonably"; sasīsaṃ pārupītvā M II.16 "covering himself
head and all (lit. with the head)"; cp. sapadhānaṃ piṇḍāya
caramāno Sn p.21 "going for alms (from house to house)
uninterruptedly".
c. The acc. sg. of certain other compound formations is used as adverbs of reason. e.g., na ca mañ ca dhammādhikaranam viheṭhesi M III.270 "he did not give me trouble by way of any doctrinal point"; tato-nidānam hi so bhikkhave maranam vā nigaccheyya A IV.130 "by reason of that, brethren, he would either meet death..."; so tato-nidānam labhetha pāmuja D I.72 "by reason of that he would obtain joy". The inst. or the abl. is the more usual in this function.

§ 53. Acc. with Adverbs.

Certain adverbial formations, mostly the inst. or abl. sg. of older (Vedic) nominal stems (cp.VGS §197), take an acc. of the noun-concept which they qualify or 'govern'. Here the abl. and the gen. are concurrent idioms (§§130 & 150). e.g., uttareṇa Opasāda M II.167 "to the north of Opasāda"; antareṇa Campana M I.340 "this side of Campana"; antara ca Sāvatthi ca Sāketam M I.149 "between Sāvatthi and Sāketa"; antara ca Rājagaha ca Nālanda D I.1 "between Rājagaha and Nālanda", where Buddhaghosa observes that the acc. is used because it is construed with the word antara ( 'antarā saddena pana yuttattā upayogavacanaṃ katam' Sum.I.p.35 ); samantā Vesali D II.98 "around Vesali"; santike nibbāna S IV.74(V.) "near nibbāna"; Bhagavanta sammukhā D II.155; Sn p. 100 "before the Blessed One"; pacchā bhitta D II.102,122 "after the meal"; kim paccayā D II.31 "due to (lit. depending
on) what?"; ime...dve paccayā D II.207 "owing to these two (reasons)". In the phrase kim kāraṇā ti? D III.65 "due to what?", it is quite clear, therefore, that the acc. (kim) is certainly due to treating kāraṇā as an adverb on the analogy of paccayā above, unless it is a contamination of the two idioms kim kāraṇam and kasmā kāraṇā (vide P.T.S.Dict. -kāraṇā).

§ 54.

Acc. with Prepositions.

The acc. is governed by more prepositions than any other case in Pāli just as in the older language (VGS §197.c.). Most of these are adverbial prepositions, e.g., ati, "beyond", anu "after", abhi "towards", pati or pati "against, near", and tiro "across" (cp. VG §176.1.1).

a. The only prepositions used adnominally in the Nikāyas are pati or pati, always found as postposition in gāthā literature, tiro and anu which are difficult to distinguish from those employed as first member of adverbial compounds of the type discussed in the preceding paragraph. e.g., suriyassā uggamanam pati Thl.517,628 "about, near, sunrise"; utuveramaṇam pati Sn 291 "(the time) about the cessation of menstruation"; nadiṃ Nerañjaraṃ pati SN 74 "near the river Nerañjarā"; tiro dussam tena manteti D I.103 "converses with him through a curtain"; anvaddhamasaṃ saṅghamajjhhe osaranti M II.8 "come into the midst of the Order every half-month (lit. after every half-month)". There is a similar uncertainty with regard to
the syntactical function of the adverbial prepositions *adho*, *paro*, *anu* etc. which too apparently occur only as the first member of avyayībhāva compounds. e.g., *adho-mukham* M I.132, 134 "with head downwards, i.e., headlong"; *paro sahassam* D II.16; S I.192 "over a thousand"; cp. *anuraho* M I.27.

b. Most of these prepositions, however, are only found in the Nikāyas adverbially i.e. as prefixes to verbs which in their normal form do not take an acc. of the object (cp. § 37.).

*ati*:

*e.g.*, te anāśe deve atirocanti D II.208 "they outshine the other gods"; *anu*: padhānem anuyūṇa D II.144 "lit. strive after exertion"; cp. *anuyogam anuyutto* D I.167, II.223; bhāsitam anumodi D II.279 "rejoiced in (lit. after) what was said"; cp. anujāto Tathāgataṃ Sn 557 "born after the Tathāgata".

*abhi*:

Bhagavato bhāsitam abhinandi D II.71, 277 (cp. 54, 69) "rejoice at (lit. after) the speech of the Blessed One"; this verb nandati, however, could take the acc. even in its primitive form in the older language (cp. SS §42); *pa* : savanam pamajjati A IV.24 "neglects the hearing.."; (adhi+) *ā* : agāraṃ ajjhāvasati D I.63, II.16 "inhabits the house"; *upa* : (tam) upaṭṭhāti M III 25; S I.167; A III.94 "wait upon him"; *vati* : Vipassim Bhagavantam ...imā...gāthā paṭibhamsu D II.36 (cp. M I.79) "these verses dawned... upon... the Blessed One Vipassi"; sādhu vata bhavantam yevera bho Gotamaṃ paṭibhātu etassa bhāsitassa attho D I.124 "well, the meaning of what is said may dawn upon the venerable Gotama himself". The acc. in such examples, as has
been mentioned earlier, is regarded by Indian grammarians as being due to the karmapravacanīya or 'adjuncts to sambandha or relation between kriyā and kāraka' (vide §42). The gen. is the alternate construction in this special instance. In mamā (v.l. mama) yeva sāvakā anusāsaniṁ paccāsīmsanti M II.10 "the disciples look to me for advice" the pronoun mamā or mama may be either acc. or gen..

§ 55. Acc. with Indeclinables.

A class of words which are treated as indeclinables by Pāli grammarians but which were originally the gerunds of certain verbs, usually with the prefixes pa-, ud-, ā- and ni(s)-, by virtue of being verbal formations take an acc. of the thing 'governed' i.e. the original object. Such are:

paṭicca (< prati + itya) "on account of"; e.g., etama paṭicca M I.265 "on account of this"; macchariyaṁ paṭicca ārakkho D II.58 "on account of avariciousness care"; katamām ....... atthavasaṁ paṭicca D II.143 "on account of what....matter?";

ārabbha (< ā + rabhya of rambh) "beginning with, taking into consideration,(hence) referring to, about"; e.g., bhikkhu-saṅgham ārabbha D II.100 "concerning the Order of monks";

paricārake ārabbha D II.204 "about the followers"; santim ārabbha D II.157 "about peace"; also at D I.180; A II.27,301;

āgama (< ā + gamya of gam) "lit. coming to,(hence) on account of"; e.g., D I.229; It 79; used as synonym for the above;

uddissa (< ud + diśya of diś) "pointing out, (hence) with reference to, concerning"; e.g., bhavam Gotama uddissa M I.16 "concerning venerable Gotama", where bhavam should be corrected to bhavam; it is mostly found in the developed sense of "for the sake of", e.g., (ānata) devam yeva uddissa D II.80 "brought especially for the sake of the lord"; kam si tvam āvuso uddissa pabbajito M I.170 "on account of whom, friends, have you left home?"; where it comes to mean "following whom...etc. ".
nissāya (< ni + sāya of sāri) "leaning on (cp. bhittim nissāya D III.208 ),(hence) depending on, owing to"; e.g., dhammaṃ yeva nissāya A I.109 "owing to the doctrine"; rājānaṃ nissāya M II.185 "owing to the king"; its sense is further developed in Ālārakālāmaṃ nissāya nissāya atikkamiṃsu D II.130 "they went on keeping close to Ālārakālama" i.e. "followed Ā. closely".
sandhāya (< sam + dhāya of dhā) "putting together, (hence) considering, on account of"; e.g., na kho āvuso Bhagavā sukham yeva vedanaṃ sandhāya sukhasmin paññāpeti M I.400 "the Blessed One, friends, does not lay down (a thing) as (part of) happiness just on account of the pleasant feeling".

§ 56. The Accusative Absolute.

a. The absolute use of cases is generally connected, with, if not directly inherited from, their temporal application. We have in the earlier paragraphs observed many temporal uses of the acc., which were syntactically parallel to the loc. of time. Similarly a few instances are found in the Nikāyas of the
accusatives of substantives agreeing with some participle, making up an obviously absolute construction. The participle mostly found in this connection is santa- "being", which is involved in a similar acc. absolute in Greek (Greek ἐν = Skr. san-), the origin of which Brugmann traces to the appositional use of the acc. "this being so..." (Greek Gr. §582). The construction being thus quite historical in I.E., the possibility of the ending -am, in such instances as are found in the Nikāyas, being a restoration of the normal loc. sg. -e as a result of the confusion of -e and -o in Prākṛt, seems to be precluded. The following therefore may be reasonably regarded as acc. absolutes expressing the conditions during the permanence of which another event occurs. e.g., santam yeva kho pana param lokam atthi paro loko ti'ssa diṭṭhi hoti M I.403 "there being a further world, he gets the notion that there is another world"; santam yeva kho pana kiriyam atthi kiriyā ti param saṅnāpeti M I.406 "there being action, he convinces others that there is action". Here, just as in the case of the loc. absolute (§186), the adverb evam can sometimes stand for the nominal member put in the loc. e.g., evam santam kho te Poṭṭhapāda aññā vā saṁñā bhavissati añño attā D I.186,187 "it being so, Poṭṭhapāda, is perception one (thing) and the soul another". On the analogy of these constructions it seems not impossible that the acc. in the following is also absolutely employed though the verb pajāṇāti can take an external object when used in the sense of "perceive". e.g., santam vā ajjhattam...
byāpādaṃ atthi me ajjhatto byāpādo ti pajānāti M I.60 "there being inward ill-will, he knows that there is inward ill-will"; santasaṃ vā ajjhattam rāgadosamoham atthi me ajjhatto rāgadosamohi ti pajānāti S IV.140 "there being inward passion, hatred and delusion, he knows that he has them".

b. There are also a few other constructions with different participles. It is however not quite certain whether they are legitimate absolute uses. E.g., na bhikkhave mātā puttanā jīramānaṃ evam labhati: aham jīrami mā me putto jīriti A I.179 "when the son is aging, monks, the mother does not find it possible (to say): let me decay but not my son!". That the acc. here is not necessarily meant to be the object of labhati is shown by the similar 'intransitive' use of the latter in: So 'ham na labhāmi: mā me bhonto athakarāne nisinnasa antarākatham opātentū M II.122 "As such I do not find it possible (to say): do not interrupt me, friends, when I am presiding over the administration of justice". Similarly, in the following, though Buddhaghosa regards the construction as elliptical, supplying "nātvā" after the participial clause, the acc. may still be considered as used absolutely: Atha kho Suppavāśa Koliyadhītā Bhagavantāḥ bhuttāviṃ onitapattapāniṃ ekamanam nisidi A II.63;cp. D II.93;M I.393 "then the Koliya maiden Suppavāśa, when the Blessed One had eaten and taken out his hand from the bowl, sat on a side". The nom. "bhuktāvī......" in the BSk. version (cp. Mhvs. III. p.142) further supports the suggestion that it might be an acc. absolute.
§ 57. The Acc. of Purpose.

Since the notion of purpose is only the metaphorical application of the idea of direction, both implying the aim in a general sense, it is not surprising to find the acc. employed as a case denoting purpose, a use which is evidently derived from the acc. of direction (§37). This is to be particularly seen in the case of the dat. in -āya which id preserved in Pāli only in its functions of direction and purpose (§4). Hence many examples of the acc. of direction with verbs of motion have the implication of purpose at the same time and consequently appear to be used parallel to the dat. or infinitive of purpose. e.g., upaṭṭhānāṁ gacchati D III.183 "he goes for the purpose of (lit. to) attending on..." cp. upaṭṭhātum "to attend" A V.72; Sakkassa...amucariyam upāgami M II.264 "he came for the purpose of waiting upon Sakka, lit. he came to the waiting of Sakka"; divā-seyyam upagato D I.112; M II.164 "gone for the day's rest"; Rājagaham vassāvāsam osaṭā M II.2 et.seq. "entered Rājagaha for the passing of the rainy season"; vāsam upagacchi A V.29 "went for residence" i.e. "took up abode"; janapadacārikaṁ pakkamīsu D II.48 "they set forth on their mission of (lit. for the purpose of) tramping the country"; cp...methunāṁ dhammaṁ nāsu gacchanti brāhmaṇā Sn 292 "the brahmins did not go for sexual intercourse", where the Comy. has: 'methunāṁ dhamman ti methunāya dhammāya; sampadānavacanappattiyā kir'etaṁ upayogavacanaṁ'
The acc. of purpose occurs only rarely with verbs other than those of motion. e.g., divā-vihārum nisinno Ud 5 "seated down for the day's rest". The postposition -attham (acc.) is the usual periphrasis, often appearing in compound, like its dat.-atthāya, which takes the place of this construction. e.g., parikkhārattham dānam deti D III.258 "he gives alms for the purpose of (obtaining) requisites".

§ 58.

Double Accusative.

a. Direct + Appositional Object.

Just as in Vedic (VGS §198) and Classical Sanskrit (SS §46.a) so in Pāli a second acc. appears in apposition to that of the direct object with certain verbs. It usually defines or qualifies the latter and is placed side by side with it in the sentence. e.g., maṃ hi bhante aṇṇa-tīththiyā sāvakaṃ labhitvā M I.379 "those of other sects having received me, Sir, as a disciple"; upāsakaṃ maṃ bhavāṃ Gotamo dhāretu D I.110; Sn p.25 "may the venerable Gotama accept me as a disciple"; Sakyā kho pana Ambaṭṭha rājānam Okkākaṃ pitāmahāṃ dahanti (v.l. dissanti) D I.92 "the Sākyans, Ambaṭṭha, claim (lit. put up, place; cp. Comy. 'ṭhapenti', Sum.I.268) king Okkāka as their ancestor"; here the abl. is the parallel idiom e.g., mittato daheyya S III.113 "would consider as a friend". On the analogy of these the acc. in the stock phrase saraṇāṃ gacchati, to which reference has already been made in
another connection (§ 37.a), can also be regarded as an acc. used in apposition to the other one. e.g., bhavantam Gotamaṃ saranam gacčhamaṃ M I.290 "we go to the Venerable Gotama as refuge"; Bhagavantam yeva tānaṃ gavesi D I.95 "sought the Blessed One as protection".

b. Direct + Predicative Object.

An acc. other than the direct object of the simple verb appears predicatively with verbs of speaking (in the sense of "calling"), thinking, knowing, perceiving, making and the like. This is closely related to the above appositional use.

With verbs of speaking: This, however, is only found in the gāthā literature. e.g., taṃ ahaṃ brāmi brāhmaṇam Sn 620 "him I call a brahmin"; tatiyam bhikkhunam āhu maggajīvam Sn 88 "the third monk they call 'one living in the way' "; etad āhu vasuttamam Sn 274 "this they call the best gem". In the Nikāya prose this construction has been superseded by that of the nom. with iti (§ 21). With verbs of thinking: e.g., taṃ kim maññasi Fukkanusa D II.131 "what do you think it (is), Fukkanusa ?"; taṃ kim maññatha bhonto deva Tāvatimsa D II.213 "what do the honourable Tāvatimsa gods think it (is) ?". With verbs of knowing: e.g., yadā te Bhagavā aññasi kallacitte...... D II.41 "when the Blessed One knew them to be (lit. as) of suitable indisposition....."; bhāsamānaṃca maṃ na jānanti D II.109 "they do not know me to be speaking"; petaṃ maṃ jānahi Fv II.9 "know me as a departed(spirit)"; cp.also taṃ vā pi dhīrā munīṃ
vedayanti Sn 212 "him the wise know as a sage". With verbs of making: cittam attano ujukam akamsu D II.284 "they made their minds straight"; ekamsam uttarasaanga karitva D II.172 "(lit.) having made the upper robe one-shoulder-covering" i.e. "having put the upper robe over the left shoulder"; similarly, ekamsam cIvaram katva D II.163. When the expressions such as ekamsam karoti are regarded as compound verbs (cp. §35.b), however, the construction loses its original significance.

c. Direct object + acc. of person indirectly affected.

i. Beside the acc. of the thing said, which is the direct object, another is found denoting the person to whom the statement is made with verbs of speaking. e.g., §yasmantam Sariputtam etad avoca M I.31 "he told the venerable, this"; Kaliṃ dasim etad avoca M I.125 "she told this (to) the maid-servant Kali"; te nighante etad avoca M I.92 "he told the naked ascetics this"; as seen from these examples the idiom is only frequent when the direct object is etad (cp. also D II.102, 165). With other verbs the dat. is employed.

ii. A similar double acc. construction occurs with the verb pucchati, where the person questioned is also put in the acc. e.g., Bhagavantam imam patherman pañham pucchi D II.76 "he asked the Blessed One this second question"; samanam Ananda...phasuviharam puccha D I.204 "inquire (from) the recluse Ananda his ease and comfort"; yaṃ kiñci maṃ Subhaddo pucchissati D II.150 "whatever Subhadda shall ask me".
This can be compared with the similar use of the double acc. with yācati often found in verse. e.g., pabbajjam ayāci Buddham Thl. 869 "asked ordination (from) the Enlightened One"; pabbajjam aham ayaciṃ sabbasattāna uttamaṃ Thl. 624 "I implored the highest of all men for ordination".

iii. A double acc. construction occurs also with verbs of doing, the second standing in place of the dat. of the person indirectly affected (§ 101). e.g., kinti nāṃ karosīti A II.112 "what do you do (to) him?"; tam enam bhikkhave nirayapālā pañcavidhabandhanam nāma kāraṇaṃ karonti A I.141 "to him, brethren, the warders of Hell do the punishment called the 'five-fold-binding' "; Sakuludāyīṃ paribbājakaṃ antarāyaṃ akāsi M I.39 "they did harm to (opposed) the wandering ascetic Sakuludāyi".

Yet with none of the said verbs is the double acc. of necessity, as Speyer points out (SS §47). In Pāli especially the variety of idiom and expression permits of other constructions which are quite as usual and sometimes even preferable. Thus verbs of speaking and teaching may take a dat. of the person spoken to; verbs of asking may take an abl. of the person questioned (vide § 93.b).

d. **Direct object + (original) agent of causative verb.**

A second acc. occurs with the causative verb, if in its simple state it was 'transitive', to express the agent, i.e. the subject of the verb in the primitive or non-
causative state, beside the acc. of the original affected object. This agent or the original subject can also be denoted by the inst. (vide § 59). e.g., ekamekam Bhagavantaṃ vandāpessāmi D II.148 "I shall make each in turn worship the Blessed One".

ii. When the verb is 'intransitive' and denotes motion, the acc. of the aim (which, however, is never a person, in which case the loc. is used, cp. VGS §198.3. f.n.2.) is preserved and the agent as before is put in the acc., e.g., uppannuppanne pāpake akusale dhamme .... anabhāvaṃ gameti M I.11 "lit. the constantly arising, evil, unmeritorious thoughts..... he causes to go to non-existence".

iii. The difference between these actual causative verbs and the faded causatives such as vācetī "teach" in the following example is an essential. For verbs such as those of teaching take the double acc. even in the older languages (cp. §§ §47). e.g., tīni māṇavakasatāni mante vācetī M II.166 "he teaches the mantras to 300 young men"; sattaca brahmaṇamahāśāle sattaca nahātakasatāni mante vācesi D II.236 "he taught the mantras to seven noble brahmans and 700 initiated students". The person taught may also be expressed by the dat. (§ 93.e). We have probably a similar faded causative in the following where the acc. balaṃ may be alternately put in the loc. : te imehi kāyāṃ balaṃ gahenti M I.238 "with these they infuse strength in to their bodies".
§ 59. **Accusative with Causative Verbs.**

As has been shown in the preceding paragraph, the subject of the simple verb which would be expressed by the nom. in the original sentence is put in the acc. case denoting the agent with the causative. This is invariably the case if the simple verb was 'intransitive'. e.g., Atha kho Sakko ca devānāminde Vessavano ca mahārāja āyaśmantaḥ Mahāmoggallānāṁ Vejayante pāsāde anucaṅkamāpenti anuvicarāpenti M 1.253 "Then Sakka, the lord of the gods, and the Great Regent Vessavana caused the venerable Mahāmoggallānāṁ to walk and move to and fro in the mansion Vejayanta". But if the simple verb be a so-called 'transitive' there is diversity of construction. In that case the inst. is also permissible to denote the agent (vide § 88.d.).

This alternate idiom, though frequent in the dialect of the Brāhmaṇas (VGS §198.3) and in Classical Sanskrit (SS §49), is, however, not so popular in the Nikāyas. Still it is enjoined by Pāli grammarians. e.g., Kosinārake Malle Bhagavantaṁ vandāpesi D II.148 "he made the Mallas of Kusirāra worship object (pay their respects to) the Blessed One". The original of the simple verb is naturally preserved in the acc. e.g., (tam) aññā khīram pāyenti D II.19 "others make (him) drink milk" i.e. "others suckle him".

1. cp. 'gatibodhāhārasaddatthākammakabhaṛajādīnāṁ payojje'

Mog. II.4 et seq.
§ 60. **Acc. with Passive Verbs.**

In the case of verbs that admit of two accusatives, like pucchati etc., if in the passive construction the person is put in the nom. case as the grammatical subject of the passive verb, the logical subject being denoted by the inst. as the agent of the action, the thing questioned is preserved in the acc. case (cp. §43). E.g., samāna-brāhmaṇa... phāṇham puṭṭhā D I.24 "the recluses and brahmāṇa... being put asked a question". In a similar way the passive past participle used actively (or the reflexive participle) may take an acc. of the thing or person that was the object of the verb in the primitive state. E.g., tam enam Paṇḍuputto... paccupāṭṭhito hotī M I.31 "Paṇḍuputta... was attending on him (or was present by his side)"

The passive potential participle (-tabba) used in the acc. nt. sg. as predicate of the clause in an indirect statement takes an acc. of its original object. E.g., Tathāgata arahante sammā-sambuddhe āsādetabbaṃ maññati D II.24 "thinks that the Tathāgatas, the holy and perfectly enlightened ones should be appeased". Buddhaghosa, surprised by this peculiar employment of the acc. with the passive potential participle and ignoring the possibility of a legitimate construction with the impersonal -tabbaṃ, says the ending -e stands for the plural and -tabbaṃ for -tabbe. The suggestion is at any rate syntactically plausible since the verb maññati is capable of taking the double acc. (§58.b.). But the reading need not be altered as it appears also in other places. E.g., amhe ovaditabbaṃ m. maññanti M I.460.
§ 61. The fundamental use of the inst. in Pāli as in the older languages is to denote the thing with which an action is performed. Hence Brugmann prefers to call this the with-case ('Mit-Kasus', KVG §540), because the with-idea may either signify connection or denote the means by which an action is done or something happens. Kaccāyana defines this (viz. karaṇa-kāraka) as "that by which an action is done" 1 and further lays down the rule that the third case-affix is to be employed to expresses the karaṇa 2, while Moggallāna merely states that the third case denotes the agent or the instrument 3. We may observe in this connection that Indian grammarians are very careful to distinguish the logical function of cases which they call kāraka from the purely grammatical notion of cases. Pāṇinī meets this difficulty in much the same way. He first defines the karaṇa-kāraka

1. 'yena vā karīyate taṁ karaṇam' Kac. 290.
2. 'karaṇe tatiyā' Kac. 288
3. 'kattu-karaṇesu tatiyā' Mog. II.18.
as 'that which is especially auxiliary for the accomplishment of an action', a more comprehensive definition than that of the Pāli grammarian, and then adds the rule that in denoting the agent or the instrument the third affix is to be employed. It is interesting to note that Kaccāyana has a separate rule for the agent, which is syntactically preferable to the others' treating them together.

§ 62. Modern grammarians regard the inst. of agent as only one aspect of the inst. of means in its widest sense (KVG §554). There is however a fundamental difference both grammatically and logically between the two. The inst. of agent is only applicable with the passive or the causative verb and virtually denotes the subject of the action; it is no mere 'auxiliary' as is implied in the designation 'inst. of means'. All Indian grammarians regard kartr-kāraka and karaṇa-kāraka as quite distinct in their logical functions.

This case seems to have had a varied and confused application even in early I.E., overlapping the uses of other cases, notably the abl. and the dat., and so lost its separate existence in some of those languages. Neither Greek nor Latin

1. 'sādhakatamam karaṇam Pāṇ. I.4.42.
2. 'kartṛkaraṇayo trṭiyā ībid. II.3.18.
3. 'kattari ca' Kac. 290.
has any separate form for this case; in Greek the dat. supplies the want, in Latin the abl.¹. This may perhaps explain why there is such a confusing similarity between the uses of the abl. and the inst. in Pāli (vide §§73.6, 81, 122). Speyer has drawn our attention to the fact that though the third case has been styled the instrumental after its most usual employment of expressing the instrument or means or agent, yet its starting point is rather the conception of accompaniment for which reason some call it the sociative.² "Nor can there be any doubt", he says, "the suffixes, by which the third case is made, viz., -bhi and -ā convey the meaning of accompaniment, simultaneousness and nearness" (SS §57). In Pāli however the inst. alone for the sociative is not very frequent being superseded by the constructions with prepositions like sāha and sādham or sa- in compounds. But in principle even the inst. with such prepositions falls within the sociative class because it signifies the idea of accompaniment, association, concomitancy or mutual relations as the case may be. In addition to these uses sāha may denote simultaneousness or even form an adverbial phrase with the substantive in the inst. case(§64), which functions are logically closely related to the idea of accompaniment, though perhaps not so directly as the rest.

---

1. Buckland Green, Notes on Greek and Latin Syntax §80.
2. View of Delbrück in his treatise Ablativ, Localis, Instrumentalis.
§ 63. Inst. of Association or Accompaniment.

a. This is the *sociative* use proper; it expresses the person who accompanies the *agent* with verbs denoting *motion* and the *like* (cp. KVG §541). e.g., Āyasmā Ānanda........

Cetakena bhikkhunā pacchā-samāśana yena Subhassa... nivesanām ten' upasaṅkami D I.205 "the venerable Ānanda... set out for the residence of Subha.... with the monk Cetaka as attendant(-recluse). An extion of the same use is frequent in the Nikāyas to denote mutual relations between people:

i. It may express the person who is united with another. e.g., mātaram pi puttena samāśana tā ahosi D III.160 "he was one who joined mother with son"; missīrāvam gato tayā D II.267 (V.) "gone to union with thee".

ii. Similar is the construction with verbs meaning to enter into talk or discussion. e.g., kena sākaccham samāpajjati D III.38 "with whom will he enter into conversation?".

iii. All verbs of *conferring, conversing, talking, discussing* etc. likewise take a similar inst. e.g., Mahā-Govind brahmaṇo Brahmunā sākacchati sallapati manteti D II.237 "the brahmin Mahā-Govinda (Lord High Treasurer) converses, talks and deliberates with Brahmnā"; Ambattho mānavo caṇka-manto pi nisinnena Bhagavatā kaṇci kaṇci kathāṃ saraṇīyam vītisāreti D I.90 "the young Ambattha even while walking up and down conversed on various matters with the Blessed One who was seated"
b. This same sociative inst. is used to express the thing with which or together with which another is presented and so on. e.g., Tena kho pana samayena Aggika-Bhāradvāja brāhmaṇaśa sappinā pāyāso sannihito S 1.166 "At that time milk-rice was provided for the brahmin Aggika-Bhāradvāja together with clarified butter"; cp. sālinam annām paribhājanaṁ, sakuntamamaśehi susāṅkatehi Sn 241 "eating food made of (the best) rice with well-dressed fowl". The thing thus denoted may express the idea of accompaniment in much the same way as the person who accompanies. e.g., Atha kho Bhagavā yathā dhotena pattena Pañcasālāṁ brāhmaṇagāman piṇḍaya pāvisi S 1.114 "Then the Blessed One entered Pañcasālā, the village of the brahmins, for alms with his well-washed bowl (i.e. taking his bowl)". The parallel idiom in this case would be the acc. with the gerund ādāya "taking", which is the prevailing construction in later prose. The gerund ādāya due, to this employment came to be regarded as an indeclinable with prepositional force (c. acc.; vide P.T.S.Dict. s.v.). The same is found used metaphorically in verse, in which case it borders on the inst. of attendant circumstance or characteristic. This is similar to the construction inst. + sampanna which usually appears as compound. e.g., nibbiṭṭhena carāmi sabbaloke Sn 25 "with what I have gained I wander about in the world". In spite of the various nuances in which this inst. is applied, the fundamental notion underlying all such uses is the same, viz. the sociative idea.
§ 64. **Sociative Inst. with saha, saddhim & sa-.**

All these instrumentals can be accompanied by saha, saddhim or sa- "with" which are prepositional adverbs according to Macdonell (VGS §199 B.3. cp. Vedic sahá and sákam). Local grammarians too regard the inst. in such instances as being originally due to the prepositions saha and saddhim. It is however clear from the preceding paragraphs that the inst. alone can be used here without any such help-word and that these adverbs were only later introduced probably to avoid syntactical confusion with other instrumentals such as those of means etc. and in certain cases for emphasis and precision. These uses can be illustrated under the various sub-headings of the sociative class, thus:

a. With the inst. of accompaniment and association; e.g., mahatā bhikkhu-saṅghena saddhim ....D II.90 "with a great multitude of monks"; saha rājūbhi. D II.258 "with the kings". The word saha may be contracted to sa- in compounds. e.g., sadevake loke samārake sabrahmake sassamana-brahmaniyā pañjāya sadeva-manussāya D II.12 "in the world of gods and men with its Māra and Brahma, together with its hordes of recluses and brahmins, kings(lit. gods) and men".

b. With the inst. expressive of mutual relations such as union, conversation, discussion etc.; e.g.,, Bhagavatā saddhim mantayamānassa M I.205 "of him conferring with the Blessed One"; evam dutiyena saha mam'assa vācābhilāpo....Sn 49 "thus if I shall pass words with another..."
c. With the inst. expressing simultaneity; e.g., saha
dassanen' eva A IV.213 "at the mere sight of (lit. with the
y very sight...); parinibbute Bhagavati saha parinibbānā(§6).
S I.169 "simultaneously with the passing away of the Blessed
One".

d. With the inst. denoting the accompanying circumstances; e.g,
saha viññānena.........D II.64 "with consciousness............";
saha dhammena.........D II.104 "with righteousness............";
the second example is almost adverbial in employment and can
be rendered "righteously" like an adverb of manner. Hence
logically it comes to border on the inst. of means.

§ 65. Inst. of Attendant Circumstances.

Closely related to the above sociative inst. is the
inst. used to express the attendant circumstances, that is to
say, incidents, conditions, moods, feelings and manifestations
that accompany or characterize the agent (cp.KVG §542). These
may be broadly classed under the well known designations of
manner and quality, parallel to the Latin abl. modi et quali-
tatis (cp.SS §63.II.31v, & §67). It has to be mentioned here,
however, that by the term manner is not implied the purely
adverbial function of that case. Perhaps the former is better
designated the inst. of description. In Pāli this inst. has
an extensive use and in many instances borders, as has been
observed in the foregoing paragraph (d.), on the inst. of means.
(§66), especially in the case of the inst. denoting the posture or mood. It has a logical relation to the absolute uses of the loc. and the gen. (§§132&153) just as some uses of the inst. of means (§68.c.). One can hardly fail to recognize the absolute nature of the inst. in such examples as: atha kho pāpimā āyasma Viḍhuro bhinnena sīsena lohitena gaḻantena Kakusandham yeva Bhagavatam... anubandhi M I.337 "then the evil Elder Viḍhura, with his head broken and blood oozing, began to follow the Blessed One Kakusandha". The following distinctions as to its general application may be noticed:

a.i. The inst. denoting attendant circumstance or incident in the literal sense is seldom found in the Nikāyas. e.g., kharassarena paṇavena rathiyāya rathiyam... (taṃ)... parinetvā D III.61 "having led (him) from street to street... to the accompaniment of the harsh sound of a drum (lit. with a rough-toned drum)".

ii. It may also denote a continued action which attends upon another (action). e.g., kāya nuṭṭha bhikkhave etarahi kathāya sannisinnā D II.1 "with (i.e. engaged in ) what kind of talk were you seated (together) just now, O monks?"; yāya mayam etarahi kathāya sannisinnā D I.178 "engaged in which talk we were seated just now".

iii. Or it may signify a certain circumstance, such as a mark, sign or injury, temporarily characterising a person. Such, for instance, is the already cited semi-absolute employment. e.g.,
Atha kho bhikkhave Kāli dāsī bhinnena sīsena lohitena gālantena pāṭivissakānaṃ ujjhāpesi M I.126 "Then the maid-servant Kāli, with her head broken and blood oozing (therefrom), called to (lit. stirred up) the neighbours". This however is not the same as the inst. of characteristic which is illustrated by Pāṇini with the example jaṭābhīhī tāpasaḥ "an ascetic by (the fact of his having) matted hair", though it signifies a mark or sign characterising a person. This logically falls under the category of cause (§67).

b. Very similar to the above is the inst. used to express physical and mental attributes or manifestations. This may denote either quality (cp. Sa §67) as in mahāpurisalakkhaṇehi samannāgato D II.16 "gifted with the signs of a super-man", or manner as in rājā niyyāsi....rājānubhāvena D I.49 "the king...set forth.....in (lit. with) royal splendour"; cp. Vedic út sūryo jyotiṣā devā eti (KVG §542) "god Sūrya rises with splendour".

c. It is also used to express conditions of body and mind which attend the agent engaged in an action. e.g., rakkhitenā eva kāyena ....gāmanā vā nigamanā vā piṇḍāya pavisissāmi S II.271 "with my body guarded shall I enter village or hamlet for alms"; dissamānena kāyena dhammam desesi S I.156 "he preached the doctrine with his body visible"; sucibhūtena attanā viharati "he lives with his self (Comy. mind) purified".

1. 'itthambhūtalaksāne' Pān. II.3.21.
cp. ken'attanā gacchati Brahmalokam Sn 508 "with what body (lit. self) does he go to the Brahma-world?".

d. The state of the mind or mood (cp. KVG §542) in which one acts or exists is also denoted by this inst. e.g.,
aaññatarena samādhinā nisinno hoti D II.270 "he is seated in a particular intent state of mind"; anupādisesaśya nibbāna-dhātuyā parinibbuto D II.109,140 "entered Utter Peace in that element of cessation wherein no basis (for rebirth) is left".

e. It also denotes the posture in which one sits or lies. The parallelism with the Latin abl. modi is here very clear. e.g., pallāṅkena nisideyya D II.211 "would sit with legs cross-wise"; dakkhinena passena ślhasēyya kappesi D III.209 "he slept like a lion on his right side"; ēkāse pi pallāṅkena kamati D I.78 "he travels cross-legged in the sky" (cp. Dial. II.89); dāndo upari vēhāsaṁ khitto aggena nipatati S.II 184 "the stick thrown up into the air falls with its top (down)".

f. The same logical function as denoted by the inst. expressing mood (d.) is implied in a peculiar idiom which is used parallel to the cognate object. e.g., santena vata bhante pabbajitā vihārenā viharanti D II.130 "those who have gone forth (into the Holy Life), Sir, indeed live in a peaceful manner (lit. dwelling)"; cp. santena nūn'ajja Bhagavā vihārenā vihāsīti D II.205. 
§ 63. Out of the inst. of attendant circumstances has developed a peculiar idiom which closely resembles the dat. of purpose (§106), thus providing another instance of case contact. e.g., Kosinārakā Mallā santhāgāre sannipatitā karaṇīyena D II.47 "the Mallas of Kusinārā were assembled in the mote-hall with some business (at hand)". Here the notion of attendant circumstance is quite clear. The idiom appears accordingly to be on the borderline between "with a business" (attendant circumstance) and "for a business" (purpose). Similarly: Campāyaḥ paṭivasanti karaṇīyena D I.113,150 "they were living at Campā on some business"; Virūṭhakassa...santike karaṇīyena D II 207 "near Virūṭha...for (lit. with) some work"; The idea of purpose, however, is more marked with verbs of motion: e.g., Dasamo gahapi Atthakanāgaro Pāṭaliputtaṃ anuppatto hoti karaṇīyena M I.349 "the householder Dasama Atthakanāgara had come to Pāṭaliputta for some business". Hence it is not surprising to find the idiom yena atthēna employed just like yassa atthāya to denote purpose, though the idea of attendant circumstance is not yet lost in the former. e.g., yena atthēna ... sannisinnā D II.209 "assembled for which purpose"; yena atthēna devā sannipatitā D II.225 "the gods...met for which purpose". It is also found in the gāthā literature. e.g., yen' atthēna idhāgato Sn 430 "come hither for which purpose"
§ 66. Instrumental of Means.

In the category of means in its widest sense are included the instrumentals of means (in the ordinary sense), of instrument, of way by which, and even of the agent by some authorities. But, as has been already pointed out (§62), the agent is better treated separately by virtue of its 'independent character' in the conception and construction of the sentence. Pāli grammarians too preserve this distinction.

The inst. of means has a varied use in the Nikāyas, extending by stretch of idiom and usage into other established categories. Its most frequent and essentially fundamental application is to express the means or the instrument, in the physical (narrow) sense of the term, by which an action action is accomplished.

e.g., na musalena...pathavin khaṇatī M II.51 "he does not... dig the earth with a tool"; mahānaṅgalena kasanto S III.1556 "tilling with a large plough"; varattāhi bandhitvā D III.21 "having tied with a strapē"; ekena cīvareṇa nem acchādehi D II. 133 "cover him with one robe".


2. 'svatantrya', as opposed to the other cases which are called 'paratantrya' or dependent by Skr. grammarians, especially, Patañjali; cp. Philosophy of Sanskrit Grammar, p.228.

It may be mentioned here that the inst. of means can sometimes border on the inst. of cause or even of relation (§67 & 69), as in the following example where all these nuances seem to be implied by it: Mahā-Govindaḥ brāhmaṇaḥ dhanena sikkheyīma D II.245 "let us gain over the brahmin Mahā-Govinda by means of (through or in point of) money". Or sometimes the substantive in the inst. may denote an idea contained in the verb, in which case we have a striking parallel to the cognate use of the acc. (§35). e.g., agginā daheyya A I.136 "would burn with fire". Here daheyya alone would convey the necessary meaning. This inst. can also be used in abstract manner like the other cases. e.g., aminā p'etam pariṣayena S V.110 "by this method". In the following instance the inst. pañehi seems to be more like a sociative (gone with their lives) though in a way it can be regarded as denoting the means: Sañhaṁ khalu bho Gotamaṁ anekāni deva-sahassāni pañehi saranāṁ gatāni D I.116 "many thousands of gods gone to the recluse Gotama as refuge with their lives". This is used parallel to the frequent phrase yāvajīvanā pāṇupetāṁ saranāṁ gatāṁ

a. This same inst. of means is invariably employed in expressing the part of body or limb exercised in accomplishing an action. e.g., ubhohi hatthēhi udakaṁ omasītvā D II.176 "having touched water with both his hands"; pāñinā talām śhaccā D II.262 "striking the earth with his hand"; na sahaṭṭha sahaṭṭhā paḷṭhavim khaṇāti M II.51 "does not dig the earth with his own hand"; sahaṭṭhā santappesi M I.393; A I.274;
D I.109; Sn p.107 "fed with his own hand". In these examples the particle sa- (in sahatthā) has to be taken as meaning "his own", corresponding to Skr. sva (vide §6; cp. sadesa "one's own country" P.T.S.Dict. s.v.), and not as the contracted form of saha "with", as suggested by Franke (Z.D.M.G. 1892 p.313). For saha + inst. never directly signify the means by which an action is done or the instrument, because saha is only a sociative adverb (vide §64) denoting either accompaniment or attendant circumstance. This is also supported by the fact that sahatthā can stand side by side with the pure inst. of means (instrument) as with musalena "with (by) a tool" in the cited context: na musalena na sahatthā... M II. 51. Moreover the Avestan tā zastā which Franke adduces as a parallel is also the inst. of means, tā being only "his", the personal pronominal adjective. Other examples which belong to this class are: padasā yeva pavattesi D I.107 "caused it to roll with his foot"; sirasā vahdati D II.148 "worships with (bowed) head"; samehi pādehi patiṭṭahitvā D II.15 "having stood firm with level feet"; mukhena eva khādati D III.6 "eats with the mouth"; Bhagavato pādāni mukhena ca paricumbati M II.120 "he kisses the feet of the Blessed One with his flit. mouth) lips". With certain verbs, such as those meaning "to take, bear, carry", the inst. is interchangeable with the loc., when the limb or part of the body

1. cp. M.W.Smith, loc.cit. p.100 (yasna 43.4 & foot-note).
with or by which such action is done implies at the same time that part at which the carrying etc. is made. Though this optional construction is logically permissible and is actually attested in Indian syntax (SS §74.8), in the Nikāyas the inst. seems to be the popular idiom even here (but cp. §§166.e. & 165.f.). e.g., gabbhaṃ kucchinā pariharati M I.266 "she bears the embryo in (lit. with) her womb"; aññā ākāṇa pari-
haranti D II.19 "others carry (him) about on their hips"; ākāṇa vāhitvā M II.97 "having carried on the hip"; vāmena hatthena bhīnkāraṃ gahetvā D II.172; III.63 "having taken the jar with his left hand".

b. The faculty exercised in feeling and perceiving is similarly denoted by the inst. e.g., cakkhuṇā rūpaṃ disvā D I.70 "having seen an object with the eye"; kāyena paṭi-saṃvedi D II.186 "felt by the body"; cetasa ceto pari-
vitakkaṃ aññāya D II.36 "having known the thought of the (other's) mind with his own mind"; manasa pi no aticarī, kuto pana kāyena D II.176 "she did not behave faithlessly even in mind, how then in body ?".

c. It is also used to denote the medium through which one communicates, converses etc. with another. gāthāhi ajjha-
bhāṣiṃ M I.171; Sn p.66 "he declared in verses"; gāthāhi paccabhāsi D II.39 "he said in verse"; sāruppāhi gāthāhi abhitthavi Sn p.101 "he lauded in fitting verses"; sarena
viññāpeti D II.202, 211 "communicates (lit. convinces) by means of the voice"; imāhi gāthāhi anumodi D II.208 "gave benediction with these verses". The medium or manner by which one's assent or desire is conveyed may be a mood or a particular attitude, in which case the construction plainly borders on the inst. of attendant circumstance. e.g.,

adhiṇāsī bhagavā ṣunāhībhāvena D I.225, II.180 "the Blessed One acquiesced in silence" or "gave his assent by or with silence".

The name by which one is addressed is also denoted by this inst. e.g., nāmena vā gottena vā āvuso-vādeha vā samudācarītabbo D II.184 "should be addressed by name, clan or the appellation of 'friend'".

d. Similar is the inst. used to express the means by which, especially the conveyance in which, one travels etc. e.g.,

yāva nāgassa bhūmi nāgena gantvā D I.50; M II.113 "as far as the ground was suitable for the elephant, having gone on (lit. by) the elephant".

e. It is used with the local sense with words meaning path or door to express the passage by which a moving (exit or entry) takes place or the way by which one goes etc. e.g.,

dakkhinena dvārena nikkhāmiṇītvā D III.67 "leaving through the southern gate"; uttareṇa dvārena nāgaram pavisitvā D II.161 "entering the city by the northern gate"; vātapānena rasmī pavisitvā S I.103 "the rays having entered through the window";
f. Just as in the case of the inst. of attendant circumstance, (§65.f.) here too we may have an idiom parallel to the cognate object. In most of these instances the inst. and the verb are etymologically related. e.g., ovādana ovadati S V.385 "he advises with an advice"; antevāsābhisekena abhisittā D II.152 "initiated with the initiation of a co-resident pupil"; khattiyābhisekena abhisitto A I.107 "anointed with the anointing of a prince". Sometimes however they are not etymologically similar and the inst. is cognate only in meaning. e.g., adhunābhhisitto rajjena D II.201 "newly consecrated with kingship".

g. The inst. of means is also used in a participial sense; that is to say, it can be used parallel to the gerund in -tvā, which itself was originally the inst. sg. of the verbal noun in -tu (VGS §163.2). This is naturally restricted to verbal nouns or substantives with a strong verbal element. e.g., nāham tam gamanena lokassa antaḥ......patteyyanti vadāmi S I.61 "I do not say that by going (having gone=gantvā) I would reach the end of the world"; samvāsena kho Mahārāja sīlam veditabbaḥ S I.78 "by living together, Great King, should right conduct be ascertained".

h. The inst. of means can sometimes logically stand for an acc. of the external object. The syntactical difference in such cases is due to the difference in view-point and is idiomatical. e.g., mam......pamsukena okiranti M I.78 "they
scatter down soil on me", lit. "scatter me down with soil"; samvibhajetha no rajjenāti D II.233 "distribute the kingdom among us", lit. "...us with the kingdom". Here probably the inst. is due to the influence of the prefix sam-

§ 67. Instrumental of Cause.

The inst. of cause expresses the reason or motive for an action or an existing condition (KVG §550; VGS §199.3.). This use brings the inst. into close contact with the abl., in view of which Sanskrit grammarians enjoin special rules in certain instances forbidding the employment of the abl. to avoid confusion. "The abl. is forbidden and the inst. is of necessity, if, firstly, the cause or motive be at the same time the agent; secondly, if it be an abstract noun of the feminine gender expressing a quality" ¹. In Pāli the confusion is worse confounded by the fact that the old inst. in -ā, which Franke has definitely shown to survive in Pāli (Z.D.M.G. 1892) falls in with the abl. sg. in -ā from Skr. -āt (vide §6). Logically too there is ample scope for the two cases to come into contact (§122).

a. The inst. of cause cannot be strictly separated from the inst. of means (§66.a) because the idea of means with which an action is performed is not far removed from that of its

¹. See §72.7 (Rem) in Speyer's Sanskrit Syntax where he cites the sūtra of Pāṇini (II.3.25) 'vibhāṣā guṇe striyām'.

instrumental of cause expresses the reason or motive for an action or an existing condition (KVG §550; VGS §199.3.). This use brings the inst. into close contact with the abl., in view of which Sanskrit grammarians enjoin special rules in certain instances forbidding the employment of the abl. to avoid confusion. "The abl. is forbidden and the inst. is of necessity, if, firstly, the cause or motive be at the same time the agent; secondly, if it be an abstract noun of the feminine gender expressing a quality" ¹. In Pāli the confusion is worse confounded by the fact that the old inst. in -ā, which Franke has definitely shown to survive in Pāli (Z.D.M.G. 1892) falls in with the abl. sg. in -ā from Skr. -āt (vide §6). Logically too there is ample scope for the two cases to come into contact (§122).

a. The inst. of cause cannot be strictly separated from the inst. of means (§66.a) because the idea of means with which an action is performed is not far removed from that of its
cause. Indian Grammar, however, makes an important distinction between the two. Here there is an elaborate treatment of hetu and karana. The argument may be summed up in the words of Cakravarti, thus: "The very conception of kāraka is intimately related to that of cause (kriyānimittam kārakaṁ). By hetu is meant the material cause. In the grammatical conception of hetu, we should remember, there is no room for action. Karana or instrument, defined as a 'cause associated with an action' (vyāpāravat kāraṇam karanaṁ), is intimately related to action. There is however no essential difference between hetu and karana, it is only the association with action that makes the difference" 1. It is interesting to see from this discussion how far the ancient grammarians' conception of syntax tallies with modern scientific notions.

b. Kaccāyana after Pāṇini lays down the rule that the third case-affix is to be used in the sense of hetu, i.e., cause, reason or motive 2. The examples adduced are: annena vasati; viṭṭāya vasati; sakkārena vasati; dhammena vasati. The last however does not strictly mean "he lives by means of the Law" or "he lives by means of righteousness", but simply denotes "he lives righteously", in which case we have here only an adverbial instrumental. Its logical import seems originally to have been the idea of attendant circumstance (vide §65.c, cp. §64.d) rather than one of means.

1. Philosophy of Sanskrit Grammar p.46.
2. 'hetvatthe ca' Kac.291; cp.'hetau' Pāṇ. II.3.23.
§68. a. The commonest use of this inst. is to express the cause for the existence of a thing or for some happening, e.g., dānena damena sāmyamena saccavajjena natthi puññam S III.209 "there is no merit in (lit. by reason of) giving, discipline, restraint and truthfulness"; sakena lābhena attamano S II.198 "he was pleased with his gain". It may denote the reason for an action, in which case it almost implies the means though not the actual instrument as pointed out in the preceding paragraph. e.g., kāyabalena gacchati M II.137 "goes by reason of his bodily strength". But such instances are very rare and in the following it merely signifies the cause: in the sense of by way of, e.g., āhārena suddhiti M I.80 "purity by way of food"; udakena suddhīm pacceti S I.182 "desires purity by way of water"; or in the sense of on account of, due to, e.g., sabba-phāliphullā honti akālā-pupphehi D II.137 "in full bloom due to blossoms out of season"; atthi bhikkhāve aññeva dhammā...ye Tathāgato pavedeti, yehi Tathāgatassa yathā-bhuccam vanṇam sāmā vadamāno vadeyyam D I.12 "there are, brethren, other things (doctrines) which the Tathāgata declares on account of which, speaking rightly, people extol the praises of the Tathāgata in keeping with facts". It may also denote the disease of which one dies. e.g., alasakena kālam karissati D III.7 "will die of a boil"; ten'eva ābādhena kālam akāsi S I.150 "he died by that very disease".

b. When it expresses the motive it is often to be rendered by
through or owing to. e.g., satthugāravana na puccheyyātha D II.185 "were you not to ask through respect for the Master";
attano paṭibhāhānaṁ aññe pesale bhikkhū atimāññeti S I.187 "he slights other amiable monks owing to his intelligence"; ubhyena vata maṁ bhe so Bhagavā atthena anukampī diṭṭhadhammikena eva samparāyikena S I.82 "considering both points of advantage (lit. through both motives) the Blessed One pitied me, for my benefit in this very life and also hereafter".

c. This same use is extended to express quite another turn of idiom, which Macdonell calls the inst. of accordance (VGS §199 1.6), meaning for the sake of, on behalf of etc. e.g., bhavantam vacanena gamissāmi M II.148 "I shall go in accordance with your word (i.e. at your bidding)"; mama vacanena ...
Moliyaphaggunāṁ bhikkhuṁ āmantehi M I.123 "call the monk M. in my name" (cp. D II.143); mama vacanena samaṇaṁ Ānandaṁ appābādham ......phāsvīhāram pučcha D I.204 "on my behalf inquire of the recluse Ānanda as to his health and convenience".

d. There are a few instances where the inst., though categorically coming under the causal group, still, by the peculiar viewpoint obtained in the idiom, approximates to an absolute use. Speyer mentions a similar inst. in Skr. (just as in Latin) which he calls the semi-absolute construction. He says that in all of them the loc. might have been used, corresponding to the Latin abl. absolute (SS §372 ). Here the inst. expresses
represents the action, expressed by the participle, as the cause, or motive, or means of the main action. E.g., evam hi so bhante kakkaṭako sabbehi aše hi samchinnahi..... abhabbo tam pokkharānim puna utaritum S I.123 "thus, Sir, (owing to the fact of) his limbs being broken....., the crab is unable to go back into the pond"; so rūlhena vanana samchavinā n'eva maraṇaṁ vā nigaccheyya na maraṇamattam vā dukkhaṁ M II.259 "with the closing up and healing of his wound, he neither dies nor comes to deadly woe" (cp. Dial. Vol. IV. Part II. p. 149).

§ 69.

Instrumental of Relation.

The inst. of relation has also been called the inst. of the point because it expresses the point in which a term is applied. Perhaps the designation inst. of specification is the more appropriate term (vide KVG § 551). This inst. resembles very closely the inst. of manner, in a logical sense, and in many cases overlaps the uses of the inst. of cause. In fact it is justifiable to regard it as a division of the latter. Macdonell calls this use inter alia the inst. of accordance (VGS § 199. 1.b) because it denotes that according to which some other thing or person is named or distinguished. Pāṇini says that "any mark, or attribute, by which is indicated the existence of a particular state or condition is denoted by the third case"1. Moggallāna has merely followed the Sanskrit

1. 'itthambhūtalakṣāne' Pāṇ. II.3.21.
grammariam. Kaccayana has the rule that "the third case-affix is to be employed in qualification" and the vutti illustrates it by the examples: gottena Gotamo "Gotama by clan" and tapasa uttamo "best in asceticism".

§ 70. The inst. of relation may express:

a.i. that by which (in accordance with or in point of which) some person or thing is qualified. e.g., Vipassi bhikkhave Bhagavā khattiyo jātiyā ahosi D II.2 "the Blessed One Vipassi, brethren, was a prince by birth"; ....Kondaño gottena ahosi D II.3 "was (known as) Kondaño according to his clan". This is frequent in gāthā literature also. e.g., Ādīccā nāma gottena Sakyā nāma jātiyā Sn 423 "according to clan called Ādīccas and according to birth Sākyans"; kammanā vasalo hoti Sn 146 "becomes a slave according to one's deeds". A few of these instrumentals are inherited from the older language as adverbs. e.g., pakatiyā sīlavati D II.12; M II.99 "by nature virtuous". The adverbial implication makes it border on the inst. of manner or means.

ii. The above uses depend on nouns (substantive or adjective) and are therefore adnominal uses. Similarly we may have adverbial uses where the inst. of relation qualifies the action denoted by the verb. e.g., sīlena vaddheyyum D III.164 "they would increase in virtue"; abhivadanti aṭṭhādasahi vatthūhi

1. 'lakkhane' Mog.II.20.
2. 'visesane ca' Kac.294; also 'yen'āṅgavikāro' 293.
D I.13 "accuse in point of eighteen matters". It may occur also with participles (potential or passive), in which case it closely resembles the inst. of means. e.g., īmīnā dutiyena thānena navā bhikkhū gārayhā bhavanti M I.14 "in view of this (or by means of this) second point new disciples (lit. monks) become censurable"; anupakuṭṭho jātivādena Sn.p.115 "unreproached in point of birth"; aninājamāno kāyena M I.94 "unmoving in (point of) body"; kāyena saṁvuto D I.60 "restrained in (or with regard to) body"; vācāya saṁvuto M I.93 "restrained in speech"; on the last two examples compare Kac. 317.

b. the point in which a comparison is made. e.g., ye keci Sōna samāṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā aniccaṇa rūpena dukkhena viparināmādhāmena seyyo'ham asmi ti samanupassanti (also with sadiso and hino) S III.48 "whatever recluses and brahmins, Sōna, regard themselves superior in point of (this) impermanent body subject to grief and change"; tesaṁ aggam akkhāyati yaddīdam mahantattena M I.184 "is deemed the highest of them, that is to say, in point of grandeur";

c. the standard by which multiplicity etc. is reckoned or the dimension in which extent is measured. e.g., tena māsena dvādasamāsīyo saṁvaccharo A I.214 "an year consisting of twelve (months) in terms of that month"; ekūnatiṃso vayasā D II.115 "thirty years (in point) of age"; dvādasayojānāni āśāyāna D II.146,170 "twelve leagues in length"; sattayojānāni vitthārena D II.170 "seven leagues in width"; eatu-
§ 71. Inst. in special connection with Verbs.

Most of the uses of the inst. described above are found with particular classes of verbs (KVG §546), and, since without the inst. such verbs generally appear incomplete in meaning the former is said to be 'governed' by the latter (cp. VGS §199). That particular distinction in sense by virtue of which the inst. is 'governed' is brought in the case many verbs by the prefix sam- "co-". But it cannot be maintained in all instances that the inst. is solely due to the prefix, for, as already remarked in the case of the acc. (§37), the case is not directly due to the prefix but the verb; the prefix only emphasizes the direction or the particular kind of action denoted by the verb.

a. The inst. taken by the great majority of verbs come within the means-group (in the wider sense; cp. KVG §546.2.). Such are verbs expressing enjoyment and satisfaction. e.g., nandati "delights in": abhavana asa na nandati D III.187 "he does not delight in his ruin"; cp. nandati puttehi puttimā Sn 33 "she who has sons delights in sons". The opposite of nandati, viz. socati, admits of the same construction since logically the connection indicated is the same. So we have in the next verse in the Sutta-Nipāta: socati puttehi puttimā Sn 34 "she who has sons grieved at her sons"; tussati "is satisfied": e.g., santuttho hoti kāyaparihārikena cīvarena
D I.71; M I.268 "he is satisfied with a robe to wear on the body"; cp. santuasa-māno itaritarena Sn 42 "being content with this or that"; ramatī "rejoice at, delight in": e.g., ramatī nacca-gītehi D III.197 (V.) "he delights in dance and song"; here the loc. is the concurrent idiom (§177.b.) as the rendering "delight in" implies; abhirama Tissa aham ovādena aham anuggahena aham ahun anuggahena S III.109 "rejoice Tissa, rejoice at my advice, at my favour, at my admonition"; santappeti "satisfies, pleases": khaḍaniyena bhojaṇiyena santappayitvā D I.109 "having treated (lit. satisfied).... with hard and soft food".

b. Similar is the use with verbs expressing repetition like pūreti "fills" and pharati "be congested with". e.g., pattam odanena pūretvā S I.174 "having filled the bowl with rice"; aham Jambudīpo.... phuto bhavissati manussehi D III.75 "this land of Jambudīpa.... will be filled with people". In such instances the gen. can be employed instead of the inst. (vide inst.-like gen. §149). In a way similar to that discussed above (a.), the opposite idea of deficiency or emptiness can also be denoted by the inst. or the gen. (§88).

c. With verbs expressing purchase, exchange and bartering such as kipati "buys", dadati "gives for" and icchatī "expect for": e.g., hiraṇṇena kayakkayanā Kh p.6 (V.) "bartering in gold" lit. "buying and selling in gold"; Dehi je Ambapāli etam bhattam D II.96 "Come now, Ambapāli, give this (invitation for a) meal

1. The nom. form for the gen. mama (?).
for a hundred thousand (gold-pieces)"; appena bahum icchati
D III.186 "for a little he expects much".

d. Verbs expressing subsistence, sustenance, or means of
livelhood such as jivati "live by or on", yapeti "subsist on",
vasanti, "lit. dwell" but by stretch of meaning "live on",
found only in verse: e.g., micchäjävena jivikam kappenti D I.9
"make a living by (means of) wrong livelihood"; cp. puthu-
sippena jivati Sn 613 "lives by different arts"; yena sippa-
țthinena jivikam kappenti M I.85 "by whatever craft they make
a living"; yava-jivam surä-mamsena eva yapeyyam D III.9
"I would subsist on liquor and flesh till life lasts"; ekissä
pi dattiyä yapeti D I.166,179; S II.142 "keeps going on a
single offering (of food a day)"; kolehi yapema M I.80 "let
us sustain ourselves with beans"; vasi Godävariküle unchena
caphalena cä Sn 977 "lived on gleanings of and fruits on
the banks of the Godävari".

e. Verbs expressing the thing with which one plays or sports
such as dibbati and kiliati: e.g., akkhehi dibbanti M II.106;
DII. 312 "play at (lit. with) dice"; yäni täni kumärakänäm
kiḷäpanakäni tehi kiliati M I.266 "sports with whatever are
(toys for children". This inst. of means is to be distinguished
from the sociative use of the same case expressing the person
with whom one plays or sports. Still, as may be seen from
the above examples, the two conceptions are logically related
however slight the connection may be.
§ 71. With some other verbs the application falls under the inst. of cause discussed above (§67). It is as much related to the inst. of means as the independant use is to the same. It is generally found:

a. With verbs expressing disgust, repulsion etc. such as atīvati "be inaccommodated with, worried at", harāvati "be ashamed of", jīgucchati "be disgusted of or with". This use brings the inst. into contact with the abl., gen., acc. and even the loc., for in Skr. jugupsate "to shrink from, shun, or despise" could be used with the abl. or the inst. as found in the archaic literature, and in the later works even with the acc. (vide SS §97 R). The similar verb nibbindati occurs in the Nikāyas with the loc. and the gen. (§166.d.ii). The inst. seems to be the most frequent case with such verbs. e.g., iddhipūṭihāryena atīyāmi harāyāmi jīgucchāmi D 1.213; MIII. 300 "I am disgusted of, ashamed of and loathesome of displays of supernormal powers"; aham pi brāhmaṇa jīgucchāmi kāya-duccaritena A IV.174 "I too, brahmin, am loathesome of evil conduct in body". The Comy. interprets the inst. in the passage jīgucchati kammehi pāpakhehi Sn 215, which may be either abl. or inst., by the acc. (muttagataṃ viya jīgucchati, Pj. II.p.266).

b. With verbs meaning to be offended with, be busy with and be born of such as abhisajjati etc. e.g., imāya appamattāya
§ 73. With another class of verbs the inst. is used to denote association. Such instances belong to the sociative group (§63). This is mostly found:

a. With verbs expressing union and the like, which normally have the prefix sam- such as samāgacchāmi "come together, collide" and samsandati "join with" etc. e.g., na pi sakaṭena samāgacchāmi S V.369 "nor do I collide with a carriage"; Gaṅgodakāṃ Yamunodakena samsandati D II.223 "the waters of the Ganges join with the waters of the Yamunā". A similar inst. is found in the peculiar idiom etena 'p'etaṃ nakkhamati D II.67 "this does not tally with that".

b. With verbs having the sense of contending, competing, contesting, fighting and quarrelling such as saṅgāmeti, vivadati, viggaphati etc. e.g., asura devehi saṅgāmesum A IV 433 "the demons fought with the gods"; cp. (adnominally) yadāpi āsi asurehi saṅgāmo Sn 681 "when the battle with the demons took place"; mātā pi puttena vivadati M II.120 "the mother quarrels with her son"; rājā rājūhi vivadanti M I.120 "rulers contend with rulers"; na kenaci loke viggayha M I.108
"at strife with no one in the world"; aham pi ṇānavādavo kho pana ṇānavādena arahati....iddhi-pāṭihāriyam dassetum D III. 12 "I am also a professor of supreme knowledge, and (as such) am indeed fit to display (in competition) my supernormal powers with another one who professes supreme knowledge".

c. With verbs expressing separation. Here the abl. is the more logical construction (§126) but the use of the inst. is due to the psychological fact that underlying both union and separation there is the notion of mutuality1. e.g., sumuttā mayaṃ tena mahāsamaṇena D II.162 "we are completely free from that great recluse"; maranadhamma satta maranena parimuuccanti S I.88, V.3 "beings subject to death are released from death". In fact the inst. and the abl. occur co-ordinately in the same context. e.g., na parimuuccanti jātiyā jāra maraṇena.....na parimuuccanti dukkhasma ti vadāmi S I.24 "I declare he is not free from birth, decay and death". Similar parallel employment is found even in the older language (vide SS p.47,f.n.).

1. "Delbr. Itl. p.71 'Der begriff trennung ist zwar logisch der gegensatz von zusammensein, liegt ihm aber deshalb psychologisch sehr nahe'. Or to speak more correctly, it is not the conception of separation that is expressed or signified by the inst., but the notion of mutuality underlying both union and separation find in it its adequate expression". Speyer SS p.46 f.n.
§ 74. **Instrumental as Adverb.**

Many instrumentals, mostly of the sociative, means, causal, local and temporal classes, having more or less the character of adverbs (SS §77), have come to be applied in a purely adverbial sense in the Nikāyas. These may be the inst. sg. of nouns, pronouns including numerals, adjectives usually of the positive degree, or of compound formations. Beside the numerous instances where the case-connection (or inflexion) appears to be normal, there is a group of older inherited inst. forms, mainly Vedic in -ā, of which already in the Rg-Veda the adverbial use is indicated not only by the sense but by a shift of the accent (VGS §198.6), and which have come to be regarded by local grammarians as mere particles or indeclinables (nipāta-mattam). Such are, for instance, micchā, inst sg. of mithu found as mithuyā in the Vedas and mithyā in the Brāhmaṇas and divā inst. sg. of dyū found as divā with shift of accent in the Vedas (VGS p.85, f.n.1; cp.§2 here). This adverbial use of the inst. being in most cases parallel to that of the acc. (§§47-52), it furnishes another striking instance of contact between the two cases. This is generally found in the case of modal, local and temporal adverbs formed from them.

§75. The uses may be classified in the following manner with respect to their logical functions:
a. Some of these adverbs go back to the inst. of means and are therefore modal in character. E.g., manasā pi no ati-cari D II.176cp. M III.179; Sn 1024 "she did not transgress even mentally"; api ca me satthā paricinno Dīgharatam manāpena no amanāpena S IV.57 "however the Master has been worshipped by me during all this time willingly not unwillingly"; pharusenāpi vuccamāno A I.284 "being spoken to harshly"; saṅkhittena bhāsitassa evam vitthārena atthām ājānāmi D II.281 "of that which has been concisely stated I know the meaning extensively (in detail)"; cp. the inst. vitthārena, occurring also at D III.241; S IV.98; A II.77,177, 189, with abl. vitthārato having similar adv. sense, found in later works (vide P.T.S.Dict.s.v.); somanassam....duvidhena vadāmi D II.278 "I describe happy-mindedness two-foldly", where the inst. stands for the usual idiom duvidham katvā; cp. adverbs from other adjectival formations mostly occurring in the gāthā literature: virūparūpena mathenti cittam Sn 50 "agitate the mind diversely (under their different aspects)"; anekapariyāyena pakāsito Sn 16 "declared multifariously".

b. There is a smaller of adverbial instrumentals denoting "in accordance with". They do not connote any instrumental sense, as Macdonell has pointed out (VGS §199.1.b), but more or less border on the relative use of the inst. and possibly also on the sociative in the narrower sense of attendant of circumstance.
e.g., atthe panāyati nāyena D II.21 "he settles the cases legally" (i.e. according to justice); dharmena bhoge pari-
yesāmi Sn p.87 "righteously I pursue pleasures"; etc te
Kassapa ubho ante anupagamma majjhena Tathāgato dhammaṃ deseti
S I.20 "the Tathāgata, Kassapa, without going into either of
the extremes preaches the Law medially (i.e. according to the
middle way)". We have already mentioned the example pakatiyā
silavatī D II.12; M II.99 "naturally (by nature) virtuous" (§ 70)
where the inst. clearly denotes relation but borders on the
adverbial use at the same time (cp. VGS § 199.1).

c. The inst. of attendant circumstance proper may itself
appear in the rôle of an adverb, thus: e.g., bandhanā muc-
cceyya sotthiṇā avayayena D I.72 "he would be released from
bondage safe and sound (lit. safely and uninjuredly)"); cp.
sotthiṇā "safely, prosperously D I.96; II.246; M I.136 ; A IV.
126; cp. sukhena Thl.220, "happily" or "safely", parallel to
the adverbial use of the acc. in sukham seti S I.41; A I.136
and sukham viharati A I.96; III.3; kicchena me adhigatam D II.
36 "acquired by me with difficulty"; cp. Skr. kṛcchrena (SS §
77) as adverb; kasireṇa ghāsacchādod labhati D I.251; M I.104;
A I.107; S I.94 "one finds food and clothing with difficulty".
To this class also belongs the old inst. adverbs of the type
of micchā Sn 438, 815 "falsely" (vide § 74) and uccā (P.T.S.
Dict. s.v.) "high".

d. The inst. sg. of neuter pronouns is extensively used as
adverb mostly in the sense of reason. e.g., tena hi samma Gaṭikāra muṇca, gamissāmā ti M II.48 "therefore friend Gaṭikāra, let me off, we shall go". This is usually found followed by hi with verbs such as sunohi and sunātha, as for instance at D I.62,II.2; Sn p.21, and, as Buddhaghosa remarks, ('uyyojanatthe nipāto' Sum.I.p.171), it has an exclamatory significance. The relative pronoun yena is mostly employed as connective corresponding to the acc. yan already dealt with (§50.c). e.g., appamattam etam.....yena puthujjano Tathāgatassa vanānā vadamāno vadeyya AD I.3 "this is just insignificant......that (lit. whereby) a man of the world may say extolling the praises of the Tathāgata..."; ko nu kho bhante hetu kho paccayo yena mātugāmo n'eva sabhāya nisIdati .....A II.62 "what is the reason, Sir, what is the cause whereby a woman neither sits in the assembly.......". The inst. sg. of the interrogative neuter pronoun forms a corresponding adverb with the sense of "how?". e.g., (gāthā) sorata kena katancā dantam āhu Sn 513 "how may they call him compassionate and how subdued ?". The form etena is once found with a sense similar to that of the connective yena. e.g., yadeva pitigatam cetaso ubbilāvittatam etena etam olārikam akkhāyati D I.37 "inasmuch as....(it consists of) joy and elation of mind, (thereby) is this called gross".

e. Instrumentals with local and temporal sense may appear as adverbs of place and time respectively (cp. VGS §199.4 &5).
i. **Local sense:** e.g., antarena yamaka-sālānaṃ D II.134,137,169 "between the pair of sal-trees"; cp. Vedic adv. āntarena "within" (VGS §198.6). The majority of these are regional adverbs, being instrumentals of nouns denoting the cardinal points. e.g., puratthimā vāto pacchimena samhareyya S V.444 "the easterly wind would carry (it) westward"; puratthimena nagarassa naṃ santhāgāram kārāpetvā M I.343 "having caused a new mote-hall to be built to the east of (lit. eastward of) the city"; pacchimena ca puratthimena ca dvāḍasa yojanāni ahosi āyāmena D II.146,170 "was twelve leagues in breadth on the west and on the east"; uttarena Manasākaṭasssa D I.235 "northward of Manasākaṭa". Adverbs of similar import are formed from the relative and demonstrative pronouns, viz., yena and tena, frequently occurring in the coordinate construction "yena......tena.....", which is discussed elsewhere (inst. of place §80.b).

ii. **Temporal sense:** e.g., adhunā kālakato M II.243 "died recently"; ādiken'eva na byākāsi M II.213 "...did not explain it at the very start"; literally it would imply "initially", in which case the modal character of these local and temporal adverbs is made clear. There is an elliptical use (?) of the inst. sg. of the demonstrative neuter pronoun, viz. tena, meaning "then", possibly standing for tena samayena. e.g., tena kho pana bhante ahesum....D II.203 "then, Sir, there were....". On the analogy of these uses we may regard kālena
in the following examples as an inst. of time employed adver-bially: kālena gamanaṁ S V.78 "going at the (proper) time"; lit."seasonably"; cp. kālena dhammassavanam Sn 265 "listening to the Doctrine at the proper time"; akālena M III.48 "at the wrong time (lit. unseasonably)"; nidhānavatim vācaṁ bhāsitā kālena D I.64;III.106 "speaking (well-)grounded speech (i.e. words) at the proper time(lit. duly)". A similar use of a time-denoting word is samayena found only in verse. e.g., samayena laddhā Sn 388 "obtained in time". A few archaic instrumentals also belong to this group. e.g., divā ca rattī ca D II.147 "by day and by night". On the analogy of divā we are inclined to take rattī too as a Vedic inst. sg. of -ī nouns, analogous to śucī (inst. sg. vide VGS §.80 & f.n.2). The reading in other places is, however, with the acc. rattīm (§2) or the archaic loc. ratto (§2).

ff. There is one adverb of quantity formed from the compound stem ye bhuyya-, corresponding to Skr. yadbhūyas, ye being the eastern pronominal form (§10). e.g., ye bhuyyena D I.17,105, II.48 "mostly, for the most part (> usually)"; cp. Skr. prāyena "mostly", adverb of quantity. In the following we have the inst. sg. of an avyayībhāva compound used as an adverb denoting manner: anupubbena parikkhayaṁ gacchati M II.67 "decreases gradually". Another similar inst. adverb from an irregular stem is sabbatthatāya D I.251;II.187;M I.38;A III.226 "on the whole", which, as the v.l. sabbattatāya suggests, corresponds to Skr. sarvātmanā (>sarvātmatāya); vide SS.§77.
§ 76. Instrumental of Time.

The temporal use of the inst. in Pāli has brought it into contact with many other cases, especially the acc. through the idea of extension and the loc. through the idea of time at which (KVG §545.b., SS §78, VGS §199.5). This latter construction is supposed by Speyer to be a peculiarity of Pāli and Jaina Prk. He suggests that in both these uses of the inst. the fundamental conception is that of concomitancy (SS §78).

The local grammarians too were aware of these divisions of the inst. in the temporal sense. Pāṇini lays down the aphorism\(^1\) that the third case-affix is to be employed after words denoting the duration of time and space when the accomplishment of the desired object is to be meant, e.g., māsenānuvāka'dhitāḥ "he learnt the anuvāka in a month". It is, however, significant of Kaccāyana's method of paying more particular attention to the exceptional usages, mostly idioms that do not occur in Skr. but only in 'Māgedhi', that he lays down no rule parallel to the above but provides for the quite unexpected turn of expression illustrated by *tena kālena etc.* with the observation that the inst. is used also in the sense of the loc.\(^2\)

\(^1\) 'apavarge tr̥ṭiyā' Pāṇ. II.3.6.
\(^2\) 'sattamyatthe ca' Kac. 292.
§ 77. a. Fundamentally, this inst. expresses the time throughout, during, within or for which an action extends. Since it denotes duration as much as the acc. Brugmann calls it the prosecutive inst. expressive, in this case, of extent in time (KVG §545.b). e.g., "mayā anupapannapubbā iminā dīghena addhunā M I.82 "not already found by me during all this long period"; iminā dīghena addhunā sandhāvitam S II.179 "coursed through all this long period"; imehi kho pana te bhante āsamattehi vasethi attthi kocī vīseso adhigato...S IV.300 "has any distinction.....been acquired by you, Sir, during these thirty years?"; sakkā divasāvasesena gantunti M II.119 "can be gone in the remaining part of the day". Mention must be made of the prosecutive inst. denoting time through which found in the stereotyped adverbial phrase kālena kālam which corresponds to the idiom "from (abl.) time to time". e.g., devo ca kālena kālam sammā-dhāraṇā anuppaveccheyya D I.47 (cp. M I.277) "from time to time the heavens will send forth bountiful showers"; kālena kālam manasikātabbāni M I.119 "should be pondered over from time to time (>time after time, i.e. continually)"

b. Not rarely the above conception of time within which coincides with that of the time after which (cp.SS §78) or before which something is happening.

i. Time after which: e.g., Samvāsena kho Mahā-rāja sīlam veditabbaṃ, tañ ca kho dīghena addhunā na itaram S I.78 "Great King, right conduct can be known only by living
together and that too by after a long time, not otherwise". This same nuance is expressed by the periphrasis accayena following the gen. of the time-denoting word. e.g., channaṃ māsānaṃ accayena saṅgāmo bhavissati A I.111 "After six months (lit. on the lapse of...) there will be a war"; cp. D II.140.

ii. Similarly the inst. may denote the time by which or before which an action is terminated, or unto which point continuity is implied. e.g., etena upāyena pāṭhamen'eva yāmena Kosinārake Malle Bhagavantaṃ vandāpaesi D II.148 "in this manner by (or before the end of) the first watch of the night he had made the Mallas of Kusinārā pay their respects to the Blessed One". The periphrasis spoken of above is used instead of this inst. also. e.g., tassā rattiyā accayena.... pāṇītaṃ khādanīyaṃ bhojanīyaṃ pāṭiyādāpetva D II.97, 127 "before the passing of that night....having prepared excellent food both hard and soft".

§ 78. Inst. of time when.

Sometimes however the idea of extension or duration is not so apparent (cp.VGS §199.5), in which case the inst. assumes a syntactical function similar to that of the loc. of time. This is what Kaccāyana means when he says that "the inst. is used also in the sense of the loc." (§76). As has been already referred to, the fundamental conception underlying this idiom is according to Speyer (SS §78) that of concomitancy. The fact, however, is open to criticism
since the same claim can be made for the adverbial use of
the inst. (§78). The logical connection between such adverbial
phrases as divā ca ratti ca, adhunā and ādiken'eva and the
inst. of time in tena samayena cannot be denied especially
when the adv. kālāna "at the right time, seasonably" seems to
established an intermediate link in the psychological
development of the idiom. This is also supported by the fact
that in Skr. there is no general use of the inst. parallel
to the loc. of time, whereas its adverbial use isquite common
(SS §77), but that it is widely used in later dialects like
Pāli and Prk. Probably, therefore, this is an idiom of popular
origin, evolved under the influence of such Vedic usages as
ṛtunā and ṛtubhiḥ "in due season" (VGS §199.5). Incidentally,
this is a further proof for Franke's argument that Pāli and
Skr. cannot have grown in the same region and that the former
is derived from a Vedic dialect isolated for centuries from
the group that produced (classical) Skr. (Z.D.M.G. 1892.p.315).

§ 79. The most frequent employment of the inst. of time
when or at which is found in the stereotyped phrase tena kho
pana samayena. This however has not still completely lost
the sense of duration, for, as context permits, it may be
sometimes rendered "during that time". e.g., tena kho pana
samayena āyasma Nāgito Bhagavato upaṭṭhāko hoti D I.160
"during that time the venerable Nāgita was the attendant on
the Blessed One". But the translation "at that time" can I
also be concurrently, and in some cases even preferably, used.

E.g., tena kho pana samayena Bhagavā divāvihāragato hoṭi paṭisallino S I.146 "at that time (or during that time) the Blessed One had gone to spend the mid-day in solitude"; tena kho pana samayena rājā...nisinno hoṭi D I.47 "at that time the king....was seated". It is significant of these examples that the narrative present hoṭi itself implies continuity of action, and so the inst. can hardly be said to have lost its original sense of duration.

a. It is interesting to find, however, that Buddhaghosa looks at the problem from quite a different angle. Commenting on tena samayena he says, probably echoing an earlier tradition, that in the Vinaya texts it is used to signify cause or reason because the inst. here represents the time as the occasion for the Master to formulate any precept.¹

He makes the same observation on tena kho pana samayena Sn p.13, viz. "it has been said (vuttam hoṭi) that the inst. is used because that specific moment was taken as the means (opportunity)" ². This clearly shows that he is representing

1. 'Vinaye pana hetu-attho karaṇattho ca sambhavati...tena samayena hetubhūtena karaṇabhūtena ca sikkhāpadāni paññā-payanto sikkhāpadapaññattihetum ca avekkhamāno Bhagavā tattha tattha vihāsi. Tasmā tadatthajotanatthām tattha karaṇavacanena niddeso kato". Pāpaṅcasūdani I.p.9.

2. 'tena samayena karaṇabhūtenā ti vuttam hoṭi' Pj.II.p.137.
an earlier tradition whereby all the different uses of the
inst. were supposed to be connected to its fundamental notion
of means.
b. Another idiom expressing an indefinite point in time,
where the idea of extension is hardly found, is aparena samayena "at another time, later on". e.g., So aparena samayena tamhā ābādhā mucceyya D I.72 "Sometime after he would be
relieved of that ailment"; So aparena samayena pabbajeyya D I
60 "later on he would wander forth (into homelessness)".
c. Similar uses are found in the following where the space of
time is so small that the idea of within or during is almost
lost. They are very much like adverbs. e.g., tena khaṇena.tena
muhuttena yāva brahma-lokā saddo abhuggacchati A IV.120 "that
very moment (simultaneously) the sound rose up as far as the
world of Brahmās"; te ekena khaṇena ekena muhuttena ekamaṃsa-
khalam....ekamaṃsapuṇjaṃ karissāmi M I.337 "in a moment, in a
second, I shall reduce you to a mash, a heap of flesh". Again,
a subtle variation of meaning is found in ekāhen'eva......
pakkamimsu D I.48 "they went away at one and the same day...." (cp. SS §78 R.1. Skr. ekāhna "at one and the same day").

§ 80. Instrumental of Place.
This corresponds logically to the above-described inst.
of time. Some of these instrumentals have come to be regarded
as adverbs. Most of them, however, still retain their indepen-
dant character. A few of these imply direction or route by
which and others are instrumentals with pure local sense, parallel to the loc. of time place, just as the inst. of time is used for the temporal loc. Still others approximate to a prosecutive inst. of the local variety denoting the stretch of space through which an action progresses. Such is the inst. found in idioms like vanena vanam which originally meant "through forest to forest". It is only later that this came to be regarded, probably due to the confusion of the ending-ā, as an inst. used for the abl. Of course the same can occur with the abl. instead of the inst. because psychologically "through one forest to another" is the same thing as "from one forest to another". The idea through which can also be expressed by the loc. (§164).

§ 81. a. The prosecutive sense is most clearly expressed by the following examples where the inst. stands parallel to the abl. e.g., vanena vanam gahanena gahanam patati M I.79 "gallops from (lit. through) forest to forest and thicket to thicket"; rathiyāya rathiyam sinhāṭakena sinhāṭakam (parinetvā) M II.108; D III.67 "having led him from (along) street to street and junction to junction"; but in the following the inst. borders on the idea of means and implies way by which as much as that through which: mā ekana (maggena) dve agamitha D II.45 "let not two go along the same route"; titthena eva gāvo pātaresi M I.286 "caused the cows to cross (the river) at or by (lit. through) the ford". (cp. KVG §545.a
b. To this class also belongs the adverbial use of the inst. sg. of pronouns, mostly yena, tena, aññena and ekena, where the local sense is expressed either as direction or place where.

i. Of these there are many instances where inst. expresses direction in a general sense. e.g., rājā Māgadho....Pasenadī Kosalaṃ abbhuyāsi yena Kāsi S I.83 "the King of Magadha.... marched against P.-Kosala in the direction of Kāsi"; yena kāmas pakkamati S V.149 "goes whither he likes"; na yena kāmas gamo D I.72 "unable to go whither he would". This is sometimes found reduplicated. e.g., yena yen'eva Bhagavā gamissati tan ninnā 'va bhavissanti brāhmaṇa-gahapatikā A IV.342 "whichever way the Blessed One goes, the brahmins and householders wend (are bent) that way"; yena yen'eva pakkamati...D I.71;M I.268 "wherever he goes..."; yena yen'eva āeti...D I.71; M I.180 "where it flies..."; yena vā tena vā palāyanti S III.85 "flee this way or that way..."; idha pādaṃ karissāmi aññena eva pādaṃ karomiti M II.69 "(thinking) I shall point my step this way(lit. here) I actually place it in another direction"; aññena sīsam gacchati aññana kāyo gacchati S II.231 "the head goes one way, the body another way".

ii. The idiom 'yena...tena...' found generally with verbs of motion implies the direction, the route by which and sometimes even the place where. Of these the last nuance is the most marked. Buddhaghosa says that it is used in the sense of lee.

1. '...gāmoti yena disābhāgena assa gantu-kāmatā hoti'Sum.II. p.212.
the loc. e.g., yena(square) mandalamalo ten'upasaṅkami D I.2 "whither the circular pavilion was thither he repaired"; yena Āḷāra Kālāmo ten'upasaṅkami D II.130 "where Āḷāra Kālāma was there he went". In the following it implies mere direction: yena Bhagavā ten'aṅjaliṁ pañāmetvā D II.37;Sn p.100 "pointing his clasped fists (in salutation) in the direction where the Bles. One was". Sometimes when the place gone to and the person sought for are both mentioned the adv yena may be repeated e.g., yannūnāhaṁ yena...Mallikāya Ārāmo yena Poṭṭhapāda paribbājako ten'upasaṅkameyyanti D I.178 "it would be well if I go where the monastery of Mallikā is, where (lives) Poṭṭhapāda, the wanderer". In the following it almost amounts to route along or by which: yena so kālakato tena ratham pesēhi D II.26 "where he has expired send the chariot that way".

iii. Corresponding to the above we find the idiom 'yena..... tad....' where the verb following tad is one such as normally takes the acc. of the place entered (§40). In tad therefore we have the adv. use of the acc. of place corresponding to the similar application of the inst. of place discussed here. e.g., yena(square) ̃ Icchānaṅkalam...tad avasari D I.87 "where Icchānaṅkala... was there he went (lit. entered)"; cp. M I.166,II.49 'tad'.

There is one local adverb of an historical character, viz. chamā "on the ground" (= Vedic ksamā) M I.387; D III.6; cp. Th2.112, where the Comy. has 'chamāyaṁ' (Th.A. p.116).

2. 'yena disābhāgema Icchānangalam avasaritabbam, yasmīṁ vā padese Icchānangalam' Sum.I.243.
§ 82. **Instrumental with Adverbial Prepositions.**

In Pāli as in Skr. and Vedic (VGS §198.3) genuine prepositions are virtually not used with the inst. We probably find the influence of the adverbial prefix saṃ- "together with" in constructions like mātaram pi puttena saṃñetā D III.163 as pointed out above (§63.a.ii). But these instrumentals cannot be said to be directly due to saṃ- which only emphasises the fact of association. Even in the Ṛg Veda an independent use of saṃ- with the inst. is hardly perceptible (VGS ibid).

But there are a few adverbial prepositions or prepositional particles (nipāta) which were originally adverbs used with the inst. in the Nikāyas. Such are aṅṇatra and alaṃ, also possibly tiro and vinā. e.g.,

a. The inst. with aṅṇatra expresses the thing set aside or kept off in reckoning. The abl. is the alternate idiom (§130.d).

   e.g., aṅṇatra ekena M I.483 "except one"; aṅṇatra tena Bhagavatā D II.222 "except that Blessed One"; cp. D I.168; A I.35. The inst. in these instances seems to be logical necessity owing to the idea of exclusion or comparison contained in aṅṇa- "else, other than".

b. With alaṃ the inst. expresses a prohibition or an invitation to cease or to stop (SS §76.11.) like astu and kṛtaṃ in Skr. and similarly means "enough". In the Nikāyas it nearly always occurs with the emphatic particle dāni "now, verily!".

   e.g., alaṃ dāni me attha-karaṇena S I.74 "enough of this
court-business for me!" alaṃ dāni ajja uyyāna-bhūmiyā D II. 26 "enough of the pleasance for today!".

c. In the Nikāyas tiro is once found preceding an inst. e.g. tiro dussantena mantati D I.103 "converses across (i.e. from behind) a curtain". The construction is, however, not quite certain since tiro is not found in Skr. with the inst. but only with the acc. or the abl. (SS §160).

d. Perhaps vinā "except, bereft of" is also to be included in this list. It occurs in Skr. as an adv. preposition with the inst. or the abl. in the sense of "without" and is there regarded as a sociative preposition like saha, of which vinā is the logical opposite (Macdonell Skr. Gr. §177.b). It is however not usual in the prose Nikāyas and occurs but rarely in the gāthā literature. e.g., ātīsāṅghā vinā hoti "is bereft of the group of relatives" Sn 589; cp. viṅā dandaṇa Vīn.II. 132 "without a support". In the former however -ā may be the inst. or the abl. sg. ending.

§ 83. Idiomatic Uses of the Inst.

The inst. is used in many idiomatic expressions (cp. SS §§74 & 75), most of which logically fall under the categories discussed in the preceding paragraphs.

a. Such is the employment of the inst. with kim meaning "what use or need is there of". Here the inst. actually expresses the means with an implied verb such as karissati or hoti. In
fact in the Vedas it is hardly found without the verb (karoti) showing thereby that originally it denoted the instrument (cp. VGS §199.1.h). kim is usually followed by pana in the Nikayas. e.g., kim pana tena muṇḍakena samanākena diṭṭhenāti? M II.46 "what is the good of seeing that shaveling of a recluse?"lit. "what (sci. shall I do) with that shaveling...seen?"; kim pana āyatomo....serivihārena...M I.469 "what is the good of an independent life to this elder....?"; kim te imānā pūtikāyena diṭṭhenā S III.120 "what is the use of seeing this putrid body" lit. "what will you do with this putrid body seen?".

b. Another set phrase similarly used is 'attho with the inst' which means "to be in need of", where normally hoti is to be understood. e.g., Tato bhoto yāvatākena attho tāvatakanā Ṣhareyyatanti D II.245 "from it you may take away as much as you are in need of"; sace bhante pāṇḍakena attho...M I.380 "if Sir, there is a need of food..."; cp. D II.176; S I.99;Sn 331.

In the last instance we find the inst. with the phrase 'ko attho' which is parallel to Skr. 'kim prayojanam' (SS § 75). Similarly like attho its derivative atthi (cp. Skr. arthin c. inst.) complies with the inst. e.g., atthi-pāṇhena āgamaṃ Sn 967,1043 "I have come as one in need of (asking) a question".

d. Another word employed in a similar manner is karaṇīyam. the verbal noun (nt.sg.) from the potential participle of kar-. It means "something to be done"; hence "necessity > need". e.g., rogahi sati bhesajjena karaṇīyam hoti M I.506 "when...
there is a disease, there is need for medicine"; appamādena
dhāma S IV.125 "need for diligence"; cetanāya karanīyan
A IV.312 "need for will"; cp. P.T.S.Dict. sub karanīya.
d. The set phrase 'ko pana vādo', probably elliptical form of
'ko pana attho vādena', meaning "what (need to) talk of", also
is construed with the inst. e.g., ko pana vādo aṅṅatara- aṅṅa
tarenāti D III.45 "what need to talk of each in turn", i.e.
"not to talk of each separately".

§ 84. We have already had occasion (§80) to refer to the
inst. used in the stereotyped adverbial phrase which consists
of a prosecutiva inst. followed by the acc. of the same word
denoting the limit ad quern. There are, however, many other
shades of the same idiom where the two cases seem to depend
on each other so closely that the syntactical function of the
one cannot be considered separately from that of the other.
The idiom thus has a compound sense and is nearly always to be
regarded as one adverbial phrase. e.g., sabbena sabbam
sabbathā sabbam D II.57,58; III.367 "completely (altogether,
all in all) and everywhere; sabbena sabbam sāsanam ajānanti
D II.251 "they know the message completely"; aṅṅena aṅṅam
vyākāsi D I.57 "he explained contradictorily", lit. "one with
or in terms of another (quite different)".

1. Comy. 'sabbena sabbam sabbathā sabbanti nipāta-dvayaṁ etam,
tassa attho: sabbākāreṇa sabbā, sabbena sabbāvena ca sabbā
jāti nāma yadi na bhaveyya ti'. Sum. II.p.497.

Most of the uses of the inst. discussed in the preceding paragraphs are adverbal. Apart from such there is a distinct class of adnominal instrumentals (cp. XVG §548). The following logical divisions may be observed:

a. With nouns and adjectives like nānakaranaṃ, viseso and adhippāyo, meaning "difference, distinction, particularity", the inst. is one of comparison (§86) and is used parallel to the corresponding abl. (§132.d). e.g., Atha kiñcarahi te bhante puthuJJanena nānakaranaṃ ? M I.392 "Then, Sir, where (is) your distinction (difference) from the common man?"; ko viseso ko adhippāyo kiṃ nānakaranaṃ paññitasse bālenāti ? S I.24 "what is the peculiarity, the distinction, the difference of the wise man (in comparison with or) from the fool?"; cp. S III.66 A I.267.

b. The opposite of difference, viz. equality or similarity, is also expressed by the inst., as with the words sama (cp. VGS 199.B.2.a) and its reduplicated form samasama. Such adjectives also comply with the gen. (§151.b), just as in the older language (SS §61 & §129). e.g., Āyasmatā Vidhurena samasamo hoti M I.331 "he is quite equal to the venerable Vidhura"; iminā pattena samatittikaṃ M II.7 "equal to a whole bowlful"; cp. na tena dhammena sam'atthi kiñci Sn 225 "there is nothing equal to (lit. with) this Doctrine".
c. Adjectives denoting *fulness* and its opposite *emptiness* also comply with the inst. With *puṇṇa* (Skr. *pūrṇa*, KVG §548) "full" Pāli prefers the older construction with the *gen.* (§151.b.2), but *suṇṇa* "empty, void" is frequently found with the inst.

- *suṇṇa*: idam āṭtena vā attaniyena vā S IV.54; M I.297; II 263 "this is empty of a Soul or aught pertaining to a Soul";
- *suṇṇa*: paricārikeya DII.202 "bereft of....disciples";
- *suṇṇa*: parappavādā samançhi aṇṇa D II.161; M I.64 "other sects are void of recluses". Similarly the inst. occurs with the noun *aṇṇa* "deficiency". It is apparent here that it borders on the inst. of relation (§70), for it may imply "deficient in respect of". e.g., *sace* te *aṇṇa* kāmehi...D II.243 "if there be a deficiency to you (in point) of pleasures...".

§ 86. Inst. of Comparison.

From the preceding discussion it becomes evident that with adjectives denoting *equality* etc. and their opposites the inst. borders on the so-called *Ablati-vus Comarationis*¹. That is why the rendering "in comparison with" is possible in such cases. The same construction is found

---

¹ Even in early Skr. the inst. is found in this connection side by side with the abl. "...there are a good deal of instances proving that Skr. had, especially in the ancient dialect, and inst. of the thing surpassed of the same power as the so-called Abl. Comarationis". Speyer SS §70.R.1.
with adjectives of the comparative degree. e.g., na tena seyosadiso vijjati D III.158 “there is no one greater than he or equal to him”; dhanena seyyo M II.73 “better than wealth”; hīnataro khajjopanakena M II.42 “weaker than a fire-fly”; Rāja Māgadho....sukhavihāritaro āyasmatā Gotamena M I.94 “the King of Māgadha...is one who lives happier than the venerable Gotama”; tena ca vedanā-sokhummena aññam vedanā-sokhummaṁ uttaritaram vā panītaram vā na passāmi A II.18 “I do not see a sense-pleasure nobler or sublimier than this exquisite feeling”. Thus it is seen that adjectives denoting all the three logical grades, viz. inferiority, equality and superiority, all comply with the inst.

§ 87., Instrumental of Agent.

According to Skr. grammarians the logical definition of agency (kārtrtvā) is that it is the substratum of action¹. It is held that the agent is to be distinguished from other case-concepts (kāraka) by virtue of its independent character (svātantrya) and therefore, according to Patañjali², the other cases are to be regarded as dependent on it (pāratantrya). For this reason the agent is considered to be the kāraka par excellence and the others are called upakārakas, i.e., auxiliary cases. This, however, as a logical difference, does not

1. 'kriyāśrayatvāṃ kārtrtvāṃ', Philosophy of Skr. Grammar p.244.
2. cited ibid p.229.
seem to have struck Pāṇini forcibly for he summarily deals
with both the instrumental and the agent by the same sūtra
(§61); whereas Kaccāyana apparently maintains the distinction
when he lays down two separate rules (ibid). But, as has been
pointed out earlier (§66), according to modern writers, the
agent and the instrument are both divisions of the wider cate-
gory of means (§62).

§ 88. a. The fundamental use of the inst. of agent is to
denote the original (logical) subject with passive verbs (KVG
§547), the original object being expressed by the nom. e.g.,
bhotā Gotamena anekapariyāyena dhammo pakāsito D I.110 "the
Doctrine was preached by the venerable Gotama in a manifold
way"; taṃ me samaṇena Gotamena okāsakamman katam Sn §.94
"permission was granted to me by the recluse Gotama". With the
agent of participles and adjectives the present participle
santa- is sometimes found implying a continuous temporal sense,
just as in the case of the nom. (§26.b); in a sense they border
on the absolute use. e.g., iti puṭṭhena satā, Ānanda, attthiti
assa vacanīyaṇ D I.175 "being thus questioned, Ānanda, you
should answer him saying 'there is'". When the inst. of agent
is used with verbs implying association, it has a definite
sociative sense. e.g., tāya...parisāya parivuto D II.30
"surrounded by that following". Sometimes the agent may be
the logical subject of a p.p.p. forming the first member of a
compound. e.g., Mārena pariyuṭṭhita-cittā D III.57 "with a
mind obsessed by Māra".
b. It is also as the agent of the infinitive in -tum which exhibits a passive sense when employed with sakkā, sukaraṁ etc. (§19.c). e.g., sakkā ca pana eso abhavissa nātum gahapatinā 
D I.170 "would that be able to be known by a householder?". Here the original object is put in the nom. (eso) being the grammatical subject in the passive construction. But there is at least one instance of it being preserved in the acc., unless we are dealing here with an eastern nom. nt.sg. -e of a co-ordinative compound. viz. na dāni sukaraṁ amhehi
lūbha-sakkārasiloke paricajjitum M I.52 "it is not easy for (lit. by) us to discard gain, esteem and praise". In the following the form does not show whether it is nom. or acc. : kallaṁ nu kho tena tad abhinanditum D II.69 "is it fitting that he should like it?"; na idaṁ sukaraṁ...agāram ajjhāvasatā...brahmacariyaṁ carituṁ D I.63 "it is not easy for one living at home..... to practise the Higher Life".

c. Similarly the agent is used with the impersonal construction (both for subject and complement) when the verb is the potential participle or the gerundive (nt.sg.). e.g., āraññaken'āvuso bhikkhunā...sabrahmacārisu sagāravena bhavit- abbam M I.469 "a forest-dwelling monk, friend, should be respectful towards his coelibates"; na dāni tena raññā ciraṁ jivitabbam hoti D III.64 "now that king cannot live longer".

1. cp. 'Infinitivus cum Instrumental im Pāli', Franke Z.D.M.G.1892.
2. Franke disagrees with Ed. Muller that this is a dat. as the translation suggests and maintains that it is the inst. of agent. Z.D.M.G. 1892.
d. With the causative the subject of the original active verb is denoted by the inst. of agent. This is called the hetu(-katt) by local grammarians. The acc. is the more usual idiom here, especially when the verb is intransitive such as those denoting motion (§59). e.g., te...purisehi rakkhāpenti D I.105 "they cause (themselves) to be guarded by men"; cp. sādhu me bhante Bhagavā tapojigucchāya aggam yeva pāpetu sāram yeva pāpetūti D III.48 "well, Sir, may the Blessed One make me attain to the summit, to the very essence, of the disgust for asceticism"; on the form me see §15.

e. The inst. sg. of the reflexive pronoun attā "-self", viz. attanā, is found in the Nikāyas used with active verbs, mostly in an emphatic sense "by himself, personally". e.g., upāsako attanā saddhāsampanno hoti A IV.221 "the disciple is himself endowed with faith"; so attanā matto pamatto pare madetvā pamādetvā S IV.307 "he being himself intoxicated and slovenly having made others(too) intoxicated and slovenly..."; attanā jāti-ddhamm samāno M I.161 "himself (personally) being subject to birth...". This use of the inst. seems to lie on the borderline between its functions of means and relation. e.g., attanā va attanāṁ vyākareyya D II.93 "(by means of) yourself explain yourself" (means); attanā ca jīvāhi aṁha ca posehi D III.66 "live (by means of this money) as far you are concerned and nourish others". Whatever be its origin, attanā has come to be applied in the Nikāyas in an adverbial manner, as in the following where it refers to a plural antecedent: yadā tumhe Kālamā attanā va jāneyyātha A I.189 "when you yourselves know", cf. reflexive pronom sūgama u voc. as adv. "substantially" U. G. S. 5115.
§ 89. As fundamental characteristic of the dat. case, to be particularly seen in its adverbal use, one may conclude that it denotes the thing with reference to which an action proceeds. It is the case of participation and interest. Brugmann remarks, with regard to all I.E. languages, that in general this case does not have such a close connection with the verb as the acc. or the gen. (KVG §552). In Pāli, however, it is doubtful whether the gen. is in reality more adverbal than the dat., though, as he rightly claims, the latter preponderates with the personal, due, no doubt, to its implication of participation and interest. Speyer, on the contrary, seems to have believed that it is the idea of destination which is the underlying conception in all the varied uses of the dat. It is implied by him that such applications of it as to denote participation and interest or purpose are merely due to the fact that "in the great majority of cases the destination purported by the dat. has an acceptation more or less figurative" (§S §80). But broadly speaking it may be safely affirmed with Macdonell that "the dat. expresses the notion with which an action is concerned. It is either connected with individual words or is used more generally as a complement to the whole statement" (VGS §200).
The local grammarians on the other hand emphasize the fact of recipiency as the chief notion underlying the various semantical aspects of the dat., as its name sampadāna (Skr. sampradāna) implies. Says Pāṇini: "The person whom one wishes to connect with the object of giving is called the recipient." It is left to the vārttika to extend its use so as to embrace the idea of purpose etc. It is significant that Kaccāyana does not lay down a parallel aphorism as he does in other places but introduces the dat. by specifically noting that "the person to whom something is given, is pleasing, or is borne (held) is called the recipient." As is customary with them, both Pāṇini and Kaccāyana (cp. Mog. II. 26 & 27) proceed to lay down supplementary rules to compass the other notions signified by the dat. But their aphorisms can hardly be found to exhaust even the fundamental adverbal uses of that case in either language. This is of course due to the fact that their definitions are established on observations more philological than psychological. Nevertheless it must be said to their credit that their observations are at least accurate if not exhaustive and that syntactical functions are universally known to comply with no well-defined or absolute categories.

1. cp. 'dative' from dare = to give in Latin.
2. 'karmaṇaḥ yamābhipravitī sa sampradānaḥ' Pāṇ. I.4.32.
3. 'yassa dātukāmo rocate dhārayate vā taṁ sampadānaṁ' Kac.278.
§ 91. Even in Skr. one cannot fail to observe a growing tendency for the uses of the dat. to fall in with those of the gen. (vide SS §§82, 84, 86). The origin of this interfusion can be traced back to I.E. times. It appears primarily in the relation between the so-called ethical or sympathetic dat. (implying interest) and the 'possessive way of expression' (i.e. the functional sphere of the gen.). Speaking of Vedic (Alt-Indisch), Havers makes the following observation: "We find observed with considerable exactness the rule that 'with pronouns of the first and second persons the sympathetic dat. is employed. But the gen. with all other pronouns, nouns and participles'. This applies to the relation between the dat. and the possessive way of expression. This rule is also to be presupposed for Indo-Germanic" (HKS §11). According to him, this interfusion was at first confined to the enclitic forms me and te, and later on by logical development extended to the proper names and finally to the nouns. He also points out that the general tendency of Skr. is to replace every dat. by the gen. (ibid). To put it more plainly, Havers establishes a syntactical connection between the sympathetic dat., which later on gave rise to the dat. of possession frequently occurring with bhavati (cp. KVG §553.5 & SS §86.d), and the regular gen. of possessor. In Pāli the confusion is increased by the morphological identity of the two cases due to the replacement of the dat. by the gen. in all declensions as in Prk. (cp. Pischel Prk.Gr. §361) except in the singular of the -a declension (cp. §4).
§ 92. As in other cases the categories and the sub-categories into which the dat. can fall may be multiplied indefinitely. But a prima facie division into main classes seems admissible. Firstly, there is the adverbal and the adnominal dat. proper which is in close connection with the verb and the noun(or adj.) respectively. This dat. occupies a purely syntactical position in the sentence-unit and therefore may be called the dependent dat.. Secondly, there is the so-called loose dat. which as Macdonell says is the complement to the whole statement (§89). Such, for instance, are the constructions going under the designations: dativus commodi et incommodi, i.e., the dat. of advantage or disadvantage, the sympathetic and the ethical dat., and the dat. of orientation, i.e., the dat. of the person from whose stand-point the statement is made. Brugmann includes under this category of loose dat. also the dat. of agent, which he regards as a dat. of the person participating, and the quite common dat. of purpose (KVG §554.3&5). All these constructions have their legitimate counter-parts in Pāli as well as a few quasi-legal or sporadic idioms (§114), mostly adverbal, which, since they do not fall clearly under any of the established categories, we have thought it advisable to discuss separately or in connection with those other idioms that bear close logical affinities to them. As regards the order of treatment, we have as far as possible tried to maintain a logical sequence after the manner of Brugmann and accordingly preferred to discuss first the dat. in special sense and in special connection with verbs.
§ 93. The Dat. in connection with Verbs.

With a large number of 'transitive' verbs the dat. denotes the person in whose interest or on whose behalf, i.e. for whom, the action is performed. Since that person(or party) is he who is ultimately concerned or interested in the act of the agent, it has been called the dat. of concern (SS §81). In other words, it expresses the so-called remote object with such verbs. In the Nikāyas it is used in special connection with the following verbs:

a. give, offer (KVG §553; SS §81.1.a); dādāti "gives": e.g., gāmavaraṃ pi mayaṃ āyasmato Ānānādasse dadēyyāma M II.116 "we would present to the venerable Ānanda a grand village"; atha kassa cāhaṃ bho Gotama imaṃ pāyasaṃ dadāti Sn p.16 "then to whom, venerable Gotama, shall I offer this milk-rice?". Psychologically connected to this is the dat. with dhāreṇī "owes" (cp. Kac.279;Pāṇ. I.4.35). This is the so-called dat. of the creditor. e.g., na kassa kiṃci dhāreṇi A II.69 "he does not owe anything to anyone".

b. say, announce (SS §81.1.c); akkhāti, bhāsatī, and śha (only aorist): e.g., yadeva te Brahmā śha M I.327 "whatever Brahmā spoke to you"; kan te atthaṃ abhāsatha D II.244 (V.) "what matter did he tell you?". The verb ujjhāpayati is similarly used in the sense of "complain to". e.g., paṭi-vissakānaṃ ujjhāpesi M I.126 "complained to (called to) the neighbours"; reply, assent; paṭi-sunāti1: e.g., Bhagavato

1. Kaccāyana gives suna as aroot taking dat.(279), probably a confusion between dat. with passives and the second person subject.
paccassosi D II.90 "replied to the Blessed One"; similarly paṭivacanam-karoti: e.g., tesam paṭivacanam-karissāmi D I.122 "I shall make answer to them"; preach; deseti (according to the vutti on Kac. 279 the dat. with this verb and vyākaroti is used to show interest or regard (sādaratthe): e.g., bhikkhūnaṃ dhammaṃ deseyya M I.27 "would preach the Doctrine to the monks"; explain; vyākaroti: e.g., evam-evam ... Nighanteṇa samanassa Gotamassa byākataṃ M I.374 "in this very way was it explained by the naked ascetic...to the recluse Gotama"; show, demonstrate, reveal; dasseti: e.g., tam rañño dassesum D III.65 "they showed him to the king"; āvi-karoti "lay bare": e.g., te āvikaromi Sn 84 "I (shall) reveal to you"; the dat. with this verb is used for the loc. according to the vutti on Kac. 279 (sattamayatthe); acikkhati "point out": e.g., mūlhasa vā maggam acikkheyya D I.85 "were to point out the way to one gone astray".

d. inform, communicate to: āroceti (ārocanatthe...Kac.279): e.g., Bhagavato āroceyyaṃ D II.207 "we shall inform (this to) the Blessed One"; sahāyakassa ārocetu D II.155 "let him inform (it to) the friend"; devatā pi me etam attañā ārocesaṃ D III.15 "even the gods communicated this matter to me".

e. teach; vāceti: (takes also the acc. as a faded causative §58.d.iii): e.g., yo bhavantānaṃ mante vācessati D II.248 "who shall teach mantras to you".
§ 94. The dat. is used similarly in special connection with verbs having the sense of:

a. *have faith in, confide in; saddahati* "has faith" (KVG §553. 3 & SS §86.c; cp. Latin *confido, fido, credo* with dat.): *e.g.*

Tathāgatassa assaddahamāno D III.8 "without (having) faith in the T."

Tassa mayham bhikkhava ye...saddhātabbañ maññissanti M I.227 "who think..., brethren, that they should rely on me"

Pasādīti "gains confidence" or "believe, trust in": *e.g.*, evaṃ pasanno aham bhoto Gotamassa M I.240 "so much do I believe in the venerable Gotama". The construction is more frequent in its adnominal use. *e.g.*, Bhagavato saddhāya gacchami A IV.81 "I...go out of faith for the Blessed One"

b. *pay attention to, heed; sussūsati* "wish to listen to": *e.g.*

Tassa te sāvaka sussūsanti D I.230 "to you (as such) the disciples listen"

Ādiyanti "pay attention to, *lit.* take one's word": *e.g.*, te (corā) n'eva rañño Magadhassa ādiyanti, na rañño Magadhassa purisakānam ādiyanti D III.204 "they (the robbers) heed neither the King of Magadha nor his officers"

Suṇāti "listen to": *e.g.*, tassa mayham bhikkhava ye...sotabbañ maññissanti M I.227 "who think..., brethren, that they should listen to me"

c. *pay homage to, respect; sakkaroti*: *e.g.*, aṁñe ca pañca dhammā, yehi mama sāvaka sakkaronti... M II.9 "...owing to which the disciples pay respect to me", where the acc. is found side by side.

1. The loc. is more frequent here. *e.g.*, Buddhe pasanno S I.34
§ 95. The so-called dat. of possession is found with the verb "to be" (KVG §553.5). According to Speyer it is also used with substantives in Skr. to denote the possessor (SS §86.d). e.g., tass'immāni satta ratanāni ahosūm D III.59 "to him there were (lit. he had) these seven jewels"; tesam pi Bhagavantānam ...upaṭṭhākā ahosūm D II.144 "to those Blessed Ones...also there were attendants". Sometimes the use is more figurative, the possession being not of any material thing but of a mental or emotional state. e.g., amhākam pi...atthi satthari pasādo M I.64 "we also...have faith in the Master". Or it may be employed to denote one's age or the time that has elapsed since a certain incident in one's life. e.g., Timesamattāni kho me gahapati vassāni pabbajitassāti S IV.300 "It is about thirty years, householder, since I was ordained (lit. to me ordained)". Owing to the presence of the participle in such constructions the dat. appears to have a semi-absolute character. When the enclitic personal pronoun (me, te, vo or no) is used it appears to be closer to the sympathetic dat. (§102). e.g., Tam vo hotu D II.180 "will you have this (lit. may it be for you i.e. yours)".

§ 96.a. With many verbs of motion the dat. of destination is employed (cp.SS §79). It generally answers to the English to, for, at, or even into. This destination expressed by the dat. is more or less metaphorical; a real going to would more preferably denoted by the acc. (§38) and a real moving into by th
loc. (§165) or even the acc. (§40). But the justification for the dat. seems to be in the fact that the logical conception underlying the use is the idea of going for or aiming at (cp. KVG §553.6), though according to local grammarians the aim, reached, attained, is never put in the dat. (vide SS§ 79)\(^1\). The dat. in this function is found with such verbs as: *gacchati* or *āgacchati*; e.g., tassa yā ratti vā divasa vā āgacchati A IV.17 "whatever night or day comes to him"; tassa mayhān brāhmaṇa nisinnassa taṃ bhayabheravan āgacchati M I.21 "to me thus seated, O brahmin, comes this terror!"; appo saggāya gacchati Dh 174 "few go to heaven"; *kamati* "come upon, i.e., affect"; e.g., nāssa aggi vā visāṃ vā satthanā vā kamati A IV.150 "neither fire, nor poison, nor sword comes upon (affects) him" (cp. Gradual Savings p.103 E.M.Hare); okkamanāya nibbānassa A IV.111 "faring to Nibbāna" (ibid 'faring to the cool') *eti* "comes"; e.g., etu me bho so puriso D I.60 "let the man come to me!"; *pahinoti* "sends"; e.g., Mallānaṃ dūtaṃ pāhesuṃ D II.164 "they send a messenger to the Mallas"; tassa te.... rathāṃ pahinissāmi M II.79 "to you (as such)...I shall send a chariot"; *añeti* "brings" (metaphorically in the sense of marriage); e.g., ahaṃ bhante Nakulapituno gahapatissa daharassā eva daharā āñītā A IV.61 "I, Sir, yet young, was brought (i.e. married) to the householder N. in his youth"; similarly with the compound verb *otāram labhati* "gain access to"; e.g.,

---

2. According to vutti on Kac.279 it denotes *regard* (sādaratthe).
labhati tassa māra otāram M III.94 "the Evil One will gain access to him"; abhinibbattati "come to being, evolve itself into"; e.g., api nu kho nāma-rūpam itthattāya abhinibbatti-ssathāti D II.63 "would name and form come to birth in (lit. evolve themselves into) this state of being (Comy.'itthattāyā ti itthambhāvāya Sum.II.502); itthattāya is the old dat. sg. of the abstract noun itthattam (*itthattvam); cp. itthattām pañña-pāpanāya D II.64. On the strength of this conclusion it is evident that we have the same dat. sg. in the stock-phrase 'nāparam itthattāya'D II.68,153, which Rhys Davids rendered as "after this present world there is no beyond". It should rather be translated "there is no further (coming back) to this state of being".

b. This dat. is also used with some verbs implying direction. As in the previous case the more usual construction is the acc. (§41), e.g., apposukkatāya cittam namati M I.168 (cp.D II.36) "his mind bends (inclines, turns) to(-wards) inactivity". A similar dat. is found with the compound verb namo karoti in the sense of "bow down to". e.g., namo karohi nāgassa M I.145 "bow down to the elephant!". A further development of the notion of "bowing down to" in homage is found with vandati where the dat. (of the person worshipped) borders on the idea of propitiation (cp. dat. or gen. with yaj- in Skr. SS §119.R) and the idea of direction. But this is only found in the older gāthā literature. e.g., nicamano vandi Tathāgatassa Sn 252 "humble in mind he bent down to the Tathāgata (in homage)".
§ 97. A quite frequent dat. in Pāli is the one found with verbs denoting "happening or occurring to (someone)". Logically it belongs to the class called dativus commodi et incommodi i.e. the dat. of advantage and disadvantage. Such verbs are:

a. uppaññati "arises, is born to"; e.g., khattiyakumārena brāhmaṇakaṇḍāya putto uppanno D I.97 "a son was born to the brahmin girl by a youth of the warrior caste". More often it is applied metaphorically. e.g., na Bodhisatta-mātā purisenu mānasam uppaññati D II.13 "a love for (other) men does not arise in (lit. for) the mother of the Being of Enlightenment"; brāhmaṇassā evarūpaṃ diṭṭhigatam uppannam hiti D I.224 "to the brahmin such a view as this arose"; mayham....sati udapādi D I.180 "to me arose....mindfulness". When the substantive denotes a group of people the idea is best rendered "among"; e.g., atha kho sambahulānaṃ bhikkhūnaṃ dhammī kathā udapādi D II.1 "then among many monks arose...a doctrinal talk". The same idiom is employed to denote something unfavourable happening to a person. e.g., sutavān'assa bhayaṃ udapādi D III.17 "on hearing this fear arose for him"; bhikkhuno uppanno hiti appamattako ābādho D III.257 "a slight illness crops up for the monk";cp. D II.127.

jāyati "be born" is similarly used with the dat. e.g., pamu-ditassa pīti jāyati D I.214 "joy is born to him who is glad-dened". In these examples the sense of "arise in someone" would permit the use of the loc. though such is hardly found with these specific verbs (cp. SS §§82,84).
b. Of similar syntactical significance is the dat. (of concern) found with verbs signifying manifestation and meeting. According to Kaccāyana it is here used in the sense of the loc. e.g., pātu-bhavati "appears to, manifests itself to"; e.g., yadā...Sanamkumāro...devānam Tāvatīṃsānam pātu bhavati D II.210 "when...Sanamkumāra...appears to the gods of the T. heaven"; kumārassa dibbaṃ cakkhun pāturahosi D II.20 "the divine eye arose to the prince"; sammuḵhi-bhavati "meet with (lit. be presented to)"; e.g., sammuḵhi bhūto no Satthā ahosi D II.155 "lit. the Master was presented to us, i.e. we met the Master". The same idea is contained in the following dat.: bahunāṅca dukkhadhāmmānam purakkhato hoti D III.183 "he is exposed to many evil things".

c. An idiomatic and popular usage is the dat. of the person with the verb hoti (usually the aorist ahosi) used impersonally to mean "it occurred to...". e.g., tassa purisassa etad ahosi D II.130 "to that man it occurred:..."; āyasmatō Ānandassa etad ahosi D II.107 "to the venerable Ānanda it occurred:..."; tumhākāṃevaṃ asa D II.154 "it would occur to you thus:...";

§ 98. a. Verbs implying pleasure (cp. Latin placeo c. dat.) or satisfaction take a person of the dat. to whom something is pleasing etc. This too is a dat. of interest. Such verbs are: ruccati² "is pleasing to"; e.g., na kho me 'tāṃ bhante ruccati M I.375 "this, Sir, is certainly not pleasing to me"; taṅca pana amhā kaṃ ruccati M I.93 "that too is pleasing to us".

1. ×attamgatthe ca' (G.C. 279
2. 'yassa... vocāta... va' ibid 278.
khamati "seems good to or for"; e.g., idam me khamati idam me
na khamati D III.42 "this seems good to me, that does not";
khamati te idanti D III.45 "does it seem good to you?"; amhākaṁ
...khamati M I.93 "it appears fitting to us".
b. The same idea of "fitting or suiting" is denoted by the
impersonal sameti which takes the dat. of the person for whom
someone else (put in the inst.) is agreeable or favourable. This is
closely related to the sympathetic dat. e.g., tehi pi me
saddhīṁ ekaccesu thānesu sameti D I.162 (163,247) "they agree
with me on certain points (lit. to me in certain points it fits
in with them)"); sameti me akkhaduttehi M II.107 "lit. to me
there is agreement with the gamblers". Sometimes both parties
are denoted by the dat. and the sense of the verb is "agreeable
to". e.g., tayidam bho Gotama sameti bhoto c'eva Gotamassa
amhākaṁca, yadidam sabbena sabbanti A IV.42 "this is agreeable
to both you, venerable Gotama, and ourselves, that is to say,
everything entirely".
c. kappati (Skr. kalpate c. dat. SS §85) "be fit for, suitable
to" similarly takes the dat., occurring usually in the negative
phrase 'na kappati' "is not proper". e.g. na Tathāgatassa pānā-
tipāto kappati A II.113 "the taking of life is not proper for
the T."; sace bhoto Udenassa na kappati M II.163 "if it is
not fit for the venerable Udena"; na etāṁ āyasmato...kappati
M II. 116 "this is not suitable for the venerable..."; cp.
na āmagandho mama kappati ti Sn 241 "the smell of raw flesh

1. khamati in the sense of pardon also takes the dat. (§99.f).
§ 99. With verbs expressive of anger, jealousy, envy, and suspicion the person on, at or against whom the feeling is exercised or directed, in other words the object of animosity (cp. SS §83.4 & 5), is denoted by the dat. case. Of this kind are:

a. dussati "to hate"; e.g., yo appaduttasssa narassa dussati Dh.126 "who hates the harmless man"; dubbhati (< *dubh- which seems to be a contamination of Skr. druḥ "bear malice or seek to injure", and Skr. dabh "injure, hurt or deceive") "hate, seek to injure"; e.g., yo pi me assa paccatthiko tassa pāham na dubbheyya M I.226 "I would seek to injure (plot against) even him who id my foe". This verb is found with the loc. in later Pāli (cp. J I.267;III.212, vide P.T.S.Dict. s.v.).

b. pihati (Vedic sprhati) "envy"; e.g., akuppana kissa pihessati M III.264 "being inirritable whom shall he envy?"; so tesam na pihemi M I.504 "As such I do not envy them"; hinnassa na pihemi M I.505 "I envy not the mean"; tassa me bahukā pihayanti Th I.62 "many envy me as such"(cp.SI.202, 236). maccharāyati (denominative from macchariya) "be envious of"; e.g., kimpana bhante Bhagavā arahattassa maccharāyatīti D III.7 "what, Sir, does the Blessed One envy sainthood(in others)?".

c. sapati "to swear at, curse"; e.g., sapassu ca me Vepacitti ....S I.226 "curse me Vepacitti...!

d. The compound verb vādām āropeti "contend with or against" also takes the dat. of the person opposed; e.g., Samanassa
Gotamassa vādaṃ āropehi S IV.323 “establish a contention against the venerable Gotama (i.e. draw the recluse Gotama into an argument)”.

e. aparajjhati “offend, do wrong to”; e.g., Pass’ Ambattha yāva aparaddhaṃca te idam ācariyassa...D I.103 “See, Ambattha, how deeply your teacher...has herein done you wrong”(Dial. II.128);
kim pana te Ambattha Sakyā aparaddhunṣi D I.91 “but in what then, Ambattha, have the Sakyans given you offence?”(Dial. I.113).
f. Expressive as it is of a feeling psychologically opposite to those denoted by the above verbs, khamati in the sense of “pardon” takes a similar construction. Here it may be noted that Pāli is more likely to preserve the older idiom of construing it with the dat. rather than follow the later Classical Skr. construction of kṣamati with the gen. (§82 Speyer SS). e.g., khamatu ca me āyasmā Ānando A V.198 “may the venerable Ānanda pardon me”; khamatam (v.l. khamatu) bhavam Gotamo Ambatthaṃ mānavassa ti D I.108 “may the ven. Gotama forgive the young man Ambattha”.

With most of the above verbs local grammarians enjoin the employment of the dat. (cp. Kaccāyana 279; Pāṇini I.4.39; Moggallāna II.27).

The Loose Dative.

§ 100. As has been already pointed out (§92), one of the two main functions of the dat. is to appear as a complement to the whole statement (cp. VGS §200). This however does not mean
that the so-called loose dat. (KVG §554, explained as 'the less-restricted dat!') has no relation whatever with the actual import of the sentence or what is logically implied therein. In fact the verb, denoting as it does the most 'dynamic' concept in the whole sentence, exercises a considerable amount of influence on the character of this of this dat.; and, according to the manifold turns of expression envisaged by the predicative connection so implied, the loose dat. assumes several distinct rôles: principally, that of the dat. of advantage and disadvantage (dativus commodi et incommodi), the sympathetic dat. with its secondary aspect of ethical dat., the dat. of orientation, the dat. of purpose and aim (dativus finalis), and finally, the dat. of the agent.

§ 101. Of these the most frequent, in Pāli as well as in the older languages, is the dat. of advantage and disadvantage. It denotes the person or party interested in the action (vide KVG §554.1), for whom some profit or loss is meant as a result of its accomplishment. Sometimes this is called the dat. of the person indirectly affected.

a. This is particularly true in Pāli of the dat. found with the verb karoti in both its meanings of "doing" and "making". In fact here the acc. which is more usual, to express the indirectly affected object is actually the parallel idiom (§58.c.iii). e.g., te Tathāgatassa sarira-pūjam karissanti D II.169 "they will do bodily homage to the T."; kiccam nesam karissami D III.129 "I shall do service to them"; kiṃ
hi paro parassa karissati D I.224,226 "what will (can) another do to one?". When karoti has the sense of "make or perform" the acc. is logically less admissible and the dat. seems to be the proper, if not the only, construction. e.g., Etha tumhe bhikkhave gihinam odāta-vasanānam uttari-manussa-dhamma pāti- hāriyaṁ karothā ti D I.211 "Come now, brethren, perform a miracle of superhuman nature for (i.e. before) these white-clad laymen". Compound verbs where the second member is a form of kar-follow the same construction. e.g., okāsaṁ-karoti "gives permission, grants leave"; e.g., karoti te Bhagavā okāsan D II.150 "the Blessed One grants leave to you"; bhesajjam-karoti "give treatment, pay medical attention"; e.g., tassa so bhisakko sallakatto1 bhesajjam kareyya M I.511 "to him that medical-man, that surgeon, would give treatment"; it is also found adnominally; e.g., tesaṁ antarāya-karo D I.227 "doing harm to them". This dat. is preserved even when the verb is in the passive. e.g., Channassa...brahma-dando kātabbo D II.154 "...the 'highest punishment' should be meted out to ...Channa"; similarly with the causative: āyasmato ca Ānanda saṁ pañca-sataṁ vihāraṁ kārāpesi M I.353 "he built a residence for the ven. Ānanda for five-hundred".

b. Various other verbs of a similar character are construed likewise with dat... They are mostly transitive and have the directly affected object in the acc. A few intransitive verbs

1. This is an irregular -o form of a -r stem (vide PLS §94.4) probably due here to the influence of the preceding -o.
however, are also found to comply with a dat. of this sort. Most of these bear a very close relation to the sympathetic dat. But the sense of advantage or gain is the principal notion underlying the use. e.g., Kumārasa setacchattāṃ dhārayitthā D II.19 "they held the white parasol (above) to the prince"; attano sukhaṃ esaño Dh 131 "searching happiness for himself"; mama hi pahutam sāpateyyaṃ...abhisaṅkhataṃ D II.180 "much wealth...was procured even for me". The sense of damage, harm or loss is found in the following: siyā kho pana Ānanda Cūndassa kammāraputtassa koci vippatiṣāraṃ upadaheyya D II.135 "would it be, Ānanda, that someone may stir up remorse for (i.e. in) Cunda"; samanassa Gotamassa parājayaṃ (karissāmi) D III.26 "shall bring defeat to the recluse Gotama"; anatthā me acari A V.160 "he did me injustice"; atthahi bhikkhave aṅgehi samanāgatassa upāsakassa ākañcamāno saṅgho pattam nikujjeyya A IV.344 "if the Order wishes, brethren, it may turn down the bowl to (i.e. boycott) the lay-follower who is possessed of these eight qualities"; imassa dāṇḍam panetu A I.138 "lay down a penalty for him". The idiom is more involved when the verb is intransitive. e.g., khattiyassa cepi ijjheyya dhanena vā dhaṁñena vā...M II.84 "if it would prosper for the warrior-prince in wealth or corn..."; bhittassa saraṇaṃ hoti D III.186 "he is a refuge to the frightened". Sometimes it is found in the sense of "on behalf of..." or "for my sake". e.g., abhivādehi me tvaṃ...Bhagavantaṃ D II.269 "you salute the Blessed One for me (i.e. for my behalf or for my sake)".

1. 'yassa dātukāmo rocate dhārayate vā taṃ sampadānaṃ' Kac.278.
§ 102. The Sympathetic Dative.

Havers has established for the Vedic dialect a point of contact in meaning between the dat. and the gen. (HKS §11). He says: "We may state with considerable certainty that the forms te, ma were originally pure datives". As pointed out above (§91) these pronouns of the first and second persons were first employed to denote the person sympathetically participating in the action, apart from the use of the dat. to denote possession (cp.KVG §554.2; SS §14). In the Nikāyas, however, there is no strict line of demarcation between it and the dat. of advantage and disadvantage as both imply interest in the action on the part of some person (who is not the agent).

a. The enclitic forms te, ma and vo, no are frequently found in such a rôle. e.g.,, na hi te tāta dibbaṃ cakkaraṇaṃ pettikaṃ dāyajectives D III.60 "indeed, child, the divine Gem of the Wheel is for you no paternal inheritance"; atha ca pana me uttānakuttānako viya khāyati D II.55 "even so to me it appears quite clear"; so vo mam'accayena satthā D II.154 "for you on my passing away that will be the Master"; Satthā ca no loke udapādi Sama-Sambuddho D III.122 "a Master arose for us in the world, a perfectly Enlightened One"; mā vata no ahosi dīgharattam ahiyā dukkhāyati D III.10 "may it not be to us for (our) disadvantage and grief for a long time".

b. This same sympathetic dat. may sometimes appear to be even more isolated in the syntactical scheme of the sentence. It
is then very much like a so-called ethical dat. (in Greek), a mere particle hardly entering into the main sentence-unit either grammatically or logically. It is more or less emphatic and is employed in connection with preceding particles like kho or pronouns usually of the first and second persons. e.g., evam santam pi kho te Poṭṭhapāda aññā va saññā bhavissati añño va attā D I.186 "even if it were so, Poṭṭhapāda, will perception be one and the Soul another?". Here te is hardly necessary to translate; a slight implication, however, of orientation i.e., a point of view peculiar to the person, is noticeable. Idan te Mallike samaṇena Gotamena bhāsitaṁ m II.106 "this, (mark you!) Mallikā, has been said by the recluse Gotama"; passanti no bhonto devā D II.213 "do you gods see?"; abhijānāsi no tvam ? D II/z.205 "do you acquiesce?"; tasam no amhākaṁ kadāci karahaci dhīghaṁ aṭṭhuno accayana rasa-patthavi udakasmīṁ samatāṁ D III.90 "for us sooner or later after a long while the savoury earth had arisen over the waters" (Dial. Vol. IV. pt. 3. p. 86). Here no is quite superficial beside amhākam.

c. This assumes a different syntactical rôle when used with the verb bhavati, as we have seen before (§95). It is there considered as a dat. of possession. Sometimes the verb may be quite another but yet logically implying being or existence. e.g., āsā ca pana me santiṭṭhati sakadāgāmitāya D II.206 "there is a desire (in or for) me for the state of the Once-Returner"; asītiko me vayo vattati D II.100 "I am 80 years old"
§ 103. Dat. of Concern bordering on an absolute use.

Very much similar to the gen. absolute is the construction often met with in the Nikāyas, where the dat. of the person ultimately concerned (in the action) is used with a participle denoting contemporaneous action. The continuous temporal sense imparted by the participle gives a semi-absolute appearance to the construction. e.g., ṭhānam kho pan'etam vijjati yan te ariye cakkavattivatte vattamānassa..... dibbaṃ cakkaratanaṃ pātubhavissati D III.60 "there is a possibility however that to you conducting yourselves in the noble way of the universal monarchs.... the divine Jewel of the Wheel will appear"; it may as well be rendered "...when you conduct yourself...." etc.; mā me bhonto atthakarane nisinnassa antarākathāṃ opāenti M II.122 "let not people cause interruption to me (as I am) seated at the administration of justice"; maggaṃ kho me gacchantassa kāyo kilamissati D III.266 "to me walking the way (i.e. as I am going...) the body will be fatigued". All these examples have the enclitic form te or me denoting the person concerned and are therefore apparently connected with the sympathetic dat.

§ 104. The dat. of orientation.

This denotes the person from whose standpoint the statement is made (cp. KVG §554.4). It is because of this notion of standpoint that we have preferred to call it the dat. of orientation. This is closely related to the
datives denoting the person interested in the statement described in the preceding paragraphs and therefore Brugmann includes it among the so-called loose datives (ibid). Local grammarians seem to have overlooked this use of the dat.; still one may see a connection between it and the function of this case called 'śādaratthe' by the vuttī on Kac.279. The employ, however, is not so rare as to be ignored. e.g., te......nāmagottā anussarato ayyaputta Sakyā bhavanti D I.92 'to one following up your lineage..... (it appears that once) your masters were the Sakyans'; cetayamānassa me pāpiyyo acetayamānassa me seyyo D I.184 'to me (while) thinking (it appears that) it is inferior, and (while) not thinking better' (cp. Dial.II.p.251); cp. dhīgā jāgarato rattī Dh 60 'to one awake the night is long'. The dat. of the found with adjectives implying priority or posteriority in time or space is only a variation of the same idiom. e.g., tesam pacchimā janatā A I. 71 'the people posterior to them'. Here the dat. may be rendered by "in comparison with or compared to", which indicates the close connection between the notion of comparison and that of orientation. Indeed it is doubtful whether tesam is at all the dat. or the gen. of comparison (vide §§110 & 151.b). In many other such instances the two are indistinguishable. e.g., purakkhatā bhikkhusaṅghassa D I.50 'seated in front of the order of monks'. Here the local adv. puras would prefer the gen. rather than the dat. (vide, gen. with adverbs §153.b).

§ 105. Dat. of the Agent.

It has been found by observers of the earliest dialect\(^1\), that of the Vedic mantras, that the dat. is used with gerundives (and also infinitives, as in 'vī śrayantā, prayāi devēbhyaḥ' "let (the doors) open wide for the gods to enter", vide VGS §200.ο.) to express the agent (KVG § 554.3). It is a dat. of the person participating but it is at the same time the executor of the action and consequently can be classed with the other loose datives. In later classical Skr. it was superseded by the gen. of the agent. Says Speyer: "It is likely that the gen. had not encroached so much on the dative's sphere of employment in the dialect of the brāhmaṇas and of ancient epic poetry as afterwards. In some cases the dat. is no more used in the classical language after having been employed so in the archaic dialect" (SS §86). In Pāli owing to the replacement of the dat. forms (except -āya in the sg. of a-nouns) by the gen., we are at a loss to find out exactly whether the case with the gerundives is the dat. or the gen.. But the fact that the Nikāya dialect on the whole may be said to preserve the older archaic idioms and in general is more allied to Vedic as we have seen in the preceding pages, lends support to the conclusion that here we have the dat. and not the gen. which in Pāli seems only to be employed to express the agent with passive participles in -ta as suta, vidita etc. (§154).

---

1. Speyer (SS §86.a) citing Delbruck (K.Z., X.V.III.p.81 etc.).
It is the gerundive in -aniya that is usually involved in this construction in the Nikāyas. e.g., sannipatitānam bhikkhave dvayaṃ karaṇiyāṃ M I.161 "for the assembled monks, brethren, there are two (things) to be done"; ye pi 'asa pitā atthe anusāsi, te pi Jotipālaeva māṇavassa anusāsanīyā D II.231 "whatever matters were dispensed by his father, let Jotipāla the youth himself administer all such affairs (lit. those too are to be administered by -for- J. the young man)". It may be mentioned that the gerundive in -tabba usually has the inst. to express its agent (§88.c). But in the impersonal use the enclitic forms me, te and no, vo, which were originally datives (vide §102), are found employed for the agent. e.g., evam hi vo bhikkhave sikkhittabbaṃ M I.127 "brethren, you should train yourselves thus"; tatrāpi te Phagguna evam sikkhittabbaṃ M I.123 "even in that matter, Phagguna, you should learn thus".

§ 106. The Dat. of Purpose.

Brugmann includes the dat. of purpose among the so-called loose datives. (KVG §554.5). But the fact cannot be overlooked that this dat. is much logically connected with the action denoted by the verb as the acc. of motion or of purpose. We have reason to believe with Speyer that the notion underlying the dat. of purpose is one of destination (SS §80), and that its sphere of application is that of the datīvus finalis in Latin.

Local grammarians connect the idea of purpose with that of recipiency and Pāṇinī's rule 'karmanā
yamabhipraiti sa sapradānaḥ' (I.4.32) is supposed to provide for the former application also. It is said that the fourth case-ending not only denotes sampradāna but implies uddeśya i.e. purpose as well, this latter sense too being implicit in the expression 'yamabhipraiti' in the rule already cited¹. Pāli grammarians include these 'final' uses under the designations tadattha and tumattha (vide vatti on Kac.279), the latter term making it quite clear that even the older grammarians recognized the logically datival origin of the infinitive (-āya corresponding to -tum). The dat. of purpose, says Brugmann in the place already cited, especially of verbal abstracts, was from primitive Indo-Germanic times the main foundation of the infinitive. Considering how much of the power of an infinitive the dat. of the nomen actionis has in Indian syntax (cp. Speyer SS§87.II), one can quite understand the implications of the statement. On the function of the dat. in -āya in Pāli, Geiger makes the following observation: "Er diert zum Ausdruck der Richtung und des Zweckes....Er bekommt dann ganz infinitivische Verwendung", i.e., "it serves to express direction and purpose....then it assumes complete infinitival application" (PLS §77). That the form in -āya was restricted in Middle Indian to the above uses viz., direction (or aim) and purpose, to the complete loss of such forms employed in other spheres of the dat., is supported by the fact that even Hemacandra, the PrK. grammarian, permits the employment of -āya (Prk. -ā) only when it expresses an

¹ vide Philosophy of Sanskrit Grammar p. 201.
aim or purpose (cp. Pischel Prk. Gr. §361).

It has to be noted that this idea of purpose can be variously expressed in Pāli as much as in Skr.. In the latter the dat. of purpose, the infinitive in -tum, and periphrases such as -arthaṃ and -nimittaṃ are concurrent idioms (SS §87.II). In Pāli we have also -atthāya and -kāraṇā. e.g., seve senāsanam bhikkhu paṭisallānakāraṇā Th 1.577 "the monk resorts to the dwelling-place for the sake of (lit., through the reason of) solitude"; dhanatthāya J I.254 "for the sake of wealth". Here the mere dat. paṭisallāṇāya and dhanāya would suffice. The form atthāya in the latter cannot be regarded as a dat. of purpose in ipso but only as an adverbial usage of that case (vide P.T.S.Dict. 'attham' and VGS §200.II.5) just as the abl. -kāraṇā in the former or the inst. atthena. atthāya as a dat. of purpose should mean "for which good" or "for which purpose (business)". e.g., yāy'eva kho pana atthāya D I. 90 "for which business you would come".

§ 107. a. It may express either the thing or state wished for or aimed at or the action intended to be accomplished. Of the former kind are usually the datives of nouns and abstract nouns. e.g., Vesālim pindāya pāvisi D II.122 (D I.178) "he entered Vesāli for alms"; vānijassa vānijjāya gacchato M II.232 "of the merchant going for trade"; gocarāya pakkamati S III.84 sets out for food"; yassa atthāya pabbajanti D II.153 "for the purpose of which....they leave(home)"; upasampādentī
bhikkhu-bhāvāya D I.176; II.152 "they ordain (him) for monkhood". Other dative forms beside those in -āya are only rarely expressive of purpose; such, for instance, is the feminine -yā of ī-nouns. e.g., ekāyano ayaṁ bhikkhave maggo sattānām visuddhiyā M I.65 "certain, O monks, is this path for the purity (i.e. purification) of beings".

In the latter case, i.e., when an action is intended, the nomen actionis itself is put in the dat. and looks very much like an infinitive (cp. SS § 37.II.). e.g., samaṇaṁ Gotamam dassanāya upasaṅkamitum D I.108 "to go (in order) to see the recluse Gotama"; catuddisam rakkhāya upagacchati D II.12 "goes to guard the four quarters"; na cāsā nāvā...pāram gamanāya M I.134 "and there would be no boat...to cross over (to the other shore)". The close relation to the infinitive is seen by the acc. (of object) preceding the dat. in these examples. The objective gen. may sometimes stand in place of this acc. e.g., upamā kho me ayaṁ bhikkhave katā atthassa vināṇāpanāya M I.117 "a simile has been given by me, brethren, for the vindication of the meaning". Other similar datives of purpose are found in the following: upasaṅkami divāvihārāya M I.359 "came to spend the day"; cīvaram paṭīsevati...n'eva davāya na maṇḍanāya maṇḍāya na maṇḍanāya na vibhūsanāya M I.10 "he wears the robe...not for sport, nor for pride, nor for ornament, nor for decoration".

b. Though the dat. in these examples play a part similar to that of the infinitive still in most of them the infinitive in -tum cannot be substituted for the former without creating a
marked difference in the idiom. But there are some instances, especially of the datives of *nominà actionis* or *nominà verbàlia* used purely as infinitives\(^1\). Here the dat. just as much as the corresponding infinitive grammatically and logically stand as a complement to the main verb of the sentence. Such verbs are *labhati, pahoti, arahati, sakkà* etc. e.g., *na mayam labhimhà pacchìna kàle Tathàgataà dàssanàya D II.147 (M II.131)* "we do not 'have the luck' to see the T. in his last moments"; .... *labheyyàma...dhammikàà kàthà sàvanàya M I.160 (D III.80) ".. would we get a chance to hear a doctrinal talk..." (cp. Geiger 'hat das Glück' for *labhati, PLS §204.3*); *na sakkà gàñànaàya D III.111 "not able to count"; dàssanàya...pahoti M II.131 "is able to see" (cp. Geiger 'vermag zu sehen' *ibid*); similarly with adj. *dullabhà*: *n'esà kàthà Bhagavato dullabhà bhavissati pacchà pi sàvanàya M II.2 "it will not be difficult for the Blessed One to hear this talk even later"; cp. *pubbe va nàthhi yàdidaa yudhàya Sn 831 "as before there is nothing (namely) to fight", where yudhàya is an archaic dat. of yudh f. (vide P.T.S.Dict.). Such archaic dat. forms as infinitives are by no means rare in the gàthà literature (PLS §204 l.a.b.c).

**c.** There are some idioms, which though covered by the general description given above, are worth special notice (cp. SS §88.1). Such are the datives, mostly of abstract nouns, expressing "to serve for, to conduce to, or tend to" usually

\(^1\) "Endlich werden nicht selten Dative der Nomina verbalia als Infinitive verwendet". Geiger PLS §204.3; cp.$§77.2.$ibid.
making up the whole predicate, as for instance in: idam vo¹ hitāya, idam vo sukhāyā ti D I.230 "this (will serve) for your good, this for your happiness". Similarly we find the stock-phrase 'atthāya hitāya sukhāya devamanussānam' (e.g., D II.45, 103) employed without a verb. But generally to this so-called predicative dat., is subjoined the verbum substantivum which is either the primary verb bhavati or others of correlated meaning such as samvattati (or samvaṭṭati) and paṭipajjati. e.g.,
tesam tam bhavissati digharattam hitāya sukhāya D II.142 "for them it will be for their good and happiness for a long time";
sallekhāya subharatāya viriyārambhāya samvattissati M I.13 "it will conduce to higher life, peace and exertion"; mañato anatthāya samvattati A I.5 "it will tend to great harm";
āhārupacchedāya paṭipajjī M I.245 "he tended (inclined) towards the stopping of food".
d. Another use of the same dat. is to express the aim with verbs of wishing, striving, endeavouring etc. This is the true dat. of the aim (cp. SS §89; FLS §77). e.g., ghaṭati vāyamati lābhāya A IV.293 "exerts (himself) and strives for gain"; na viriyāḥ ārabhissati tass’āṅganassa pahānīya M I.25 "does not make an effort for the destroying of that evil".
This construction is more prominent in its adnominal use with such nouns as icchā and āsā. e.g., icchā lābhāya A IV.293 "desire for gain"; āsā ca pana me santiṭṭhati sakadāgāmitāya

1. 'vo' here, as the other dat.-gen. forms in the following examples, is most probably the dat. Speyer notes that in the Vedas two datives in this manner are usual. SS §88 R.
D II.206 "there is a desire for me for the state of the Once-
returner"; ussukam āpānnāni hōti āyasmato Mahā-Kassapa-
pindapāta-pāṭilābhāya Ud 4. "...eagerness for the obtaining-
of alms for the venerable Mahā-Kassapa". Still in these exam-
pies the aim denoted by the dat. is only metaphorical. But
sometimes it is used with verbs of bending, turning and leading
implying actual direction, parallel to the dat. of destination.
(§96.a). Here the idea of purpose is only very slightly implied.
e.g.; tassa cittam nāmati ātappāya M I.102 "his mind is incli-
ned (lit. bends) to exertion"; so niyyāti takkarassa sammā
dukkhakhāyāti M I.68 "it leads to the perfect ending of Ill
of the doer thereof"; no hināya āvattati D III.50 "he does
not return to the low".

e. Finally, there is an important adnominal use of this dat.
It is frequently found with hetu and paccayo denoting cause
or reason. Usually the two nouns are linked together in the
idiom. The logical justification for the dat. with these seems
to lie in the fact that the notion implied is one of aim,
denoting as it does that to which the cause leads. The same
nuance is expressed by the English exp idioms 'the reason for'
and 'the cause for'. The form in -āya seems to be generally
employed in this connection. e.g., ayam aṭṭhamo hetu aṭṭhamo
paccayo mahato bhūmicālassa pātubhāvāya D III.109 "this is
the eighth reason, the eighth cause, for the appearance of a
great earthquake"; (cp. D II.107 and Geiger PLS §77.2). The idiom
however is not restricted to the older form. The ending -ssa,
borrowed from the gen., is also found. e.g., es'eva hetu esa
paccayo jarāmaranassa D II.57 "this itself is the reason, this the cause, for decay and death".

§ 108. The Dat. of Suitability.

The dat. is also found with verbs, nouns (including adjectives) and particles (originally adverbs or prepositions) having the sense of befitting, suiting and counterpoising (cp. SS §87). Such are the verbs kappati and pahoti (cp. Pān. II.2.13 & 2.16), nouns like kālo, akālo, adjectives of the sense of paṭirūpa and prepositions like alam.

a. Nouns: e.g., bhattassa kālo M II.186 "(it is) time for dinner"; etassa Bhagavā kālo...D II.2 "it is time for this..."; Sometimes there is a double dat. with this construction, one of the thing suitable and the other expressing the person for whom it is so. e.g., na dāni te tuitebhāvassa kālo D I.95 "it is not the time for you for silence". The negative akālo is as frequent: akālo kho tāva Kassapa pañhassa S I.19 "it is not yet the time, Kassapa, for questions"; akālo Bhagavantam dassanāya D I.151 "it is not the time to see the Blessed One". turn

A different/of the same idiom occurs with the stereotyped phrase 'kālam maññasi' used in polite request. e.g., gaccha tvam Ānanda yassa dāni kālam maññasi D I.85;II.104 "go now, Ānanda, (and attend to that) for which you think it is time".

b. Adjectives: The adj. paṭirūpa is similarly construed with the dat. of the person for whom something is fitting. e.g.

e.g., amhākaṃ paṭirūpaṃ D II.180 "it is fitting for us";  
na kho te etam Phagguna paṭirūpaṃ kulaputtassa .... M I.123 "it is not fitting for you, a householder ....";

c. Sometimes the idea of suitability is expressed by the noun in the dat. without the help of any adj. meaning such. e.g.,  
yāva nāgassa bhūmi nāgena gantvā D I.50; M II.113 "having gone on the elephant as far as the ground was (suitable) for the elephant".

d. With alam the noun in the dat. may either denote a thing or state in which case the dat. is parallel to the infinitive or a person for whom something is fit or proper. Being originally an emphatic particle in affirmative sentences alam in connection with a dat. does not really govern that case but the latter belong to the syntax of the whole sentence (as dat. or infinitive absolute). It is mostly found with the dat. in -ṣya, which is closely related to that of purpose and aim dealt with in the preceding paragraphs. e.g., nālam sallāpāya D III. "not fit to talk"; alam vacanāya D II.64 "one must say..."; alaṅca te antarāṣṭiya M I.131 (II.257) "is certain to be for your harm"; alam vat'īdam kulaputtassa padhānatthikassa padhānāya M I.167 "quite ample for the nobleman striving for concentration"; alam attano no paresaṃ A IV.330 "enough for himself but not for others". A curious use of alam is found in 'alam me rañño va hotū ti'M II.54 "it is as good for me as for the king". Chalmer's rendering "I have nothing do with the king" is entirely at variance with Neumann's "Genug schon, dass es vom Könige kommt". Here me is the dat. of concern and rañño.

1. Vide P. T. S. Dick. alam
appears to be a use parallel to that of the inst. with alam (§82). It may be noted that in Skr. alam with the dat. of the person sometimes denotes competency: "one is fit for or a match for another" (VGS §200.4; Macdonell Skr.Gr. §200.2.a).

e. With some adjectives denoting competency or possibility a similar dat. is found in the Nikāyas, used very much like the dat. (or even the gen.) in Skr. with words like paryāpta and śakta (SS §85). e.g., bhabbo "possible; fit"; bhabbo abhinibbidāya, bhabbo sambodhāya M I.1404 "has the capacity for breaking away (from the world) and for enlightenment"; bhabbo dukkakkhāyāya S III.27 "has the capacity for destroying Ill"; abhabbo puna virūḍhiyā M II.256 "impossible to grow again"; abhabbo parihānāya A II.40 "unlikely to decrease". With these the infinitive is also found showing that it is an infinitival dat. of the type discussed above (vide P.T.S.Dict.s.v)


Corresponding to most of the adverbal uses described in the previous paragraphs, there are datives which bear close syntactical connection to substantives, adjectives and indeclinables etc. (KVG §555). The various constructions such as the datives of advantage and disadvantage, of concern and interest, of destination, aim and purpose etc. have their adnominal counterparts.

a. Such formations as agent noun and verbal noun derived from verbs originally complying with a dat. of the person to
whom something is given, owed etc. retain that dat. e.g., na dātā hoti samanassa vā brāhmaṇassa vā annam pānam..........A II.203 "he is not a giver of food and drink...to either recluse or brahmin"; In gāthā literature and adnominal use of the dat. of the creditor (§93) is quite frequent. e.g., na hi te inam atti Sn 120 "there is no debt to you"; ananā dāni te mayam Th 1.138 "we are not indebted to you".

§110. b. A dat. of advantage and disadvantage is adnominally found with nouns denoting loss, gain, victory, defeat and the like. e.g., labhā rañño Pasenadissa Kosalassa M II.209 "a gain to king Pasenadi of Kosala!" (cp. D II.152); labhā vata bho Aṅga-Magadhānaṁ suladdham vata bho Aṅga-Magadhānaṁ M II.2 "a gain for the people of Aṅga-Magadha, a lucky thing for the Aṅga-Magadhas"; imassa jayo bhavissati, abbhantarānaṁ raññam para-jayo bhavissati D I.10 "to this (one) there will be victory, for the internal kings defeat"; tumhaṁ yev'assa tena antarāya D I.3 "by that there would be harm (danger)".

c. A dat. of interest (in the wider sense) is found with nouns implying necessity, use or purpose. The person for whom there is need or use of something is denoted by the dat. and that thing is put in the inst. (§83.b). e.g., attho "need": attho sace te bhante pindakena M I.380 "if, Sir, there is a need of alms for you (i.e. if you are in need of alms)"; attho me gahapati hirañña-suvañña D II.176 "there is a need of gold and wealth, householder, for me"; na ca me attho tādisena purisena S I.99 "to me there is no use of such a person".
kim "what (good, use)?", in interrogative sentences; e.g.,
kin te samāna-bhāvena Th 1.821 "what (good) to you by the
state of a recluse? (i.e. what is the use of the recluse-state
for you?)"; kiccā "business or purpose"; e.g., yām vo
kiccā sarīrena Th 1.719 "whatever purpose there is for you
in the body".

§ 111. With adjectives implying superiority or inferiority
the usual case in the older language is the gen. of compari-
son (§151.b). This function too seems originally to have
belonged to the dat., for logically the thing from the point
of view of which something else is considered to be superior
or inferior can be denoted by the dat. In fact such adjectives
as sādhāraṇa can be optionally construed in Skr. with either
the gen. or the dat. (vide Monier William's Dict. s.v.). The
connection generally is one of relation; hence even the inst.
and abl. are used in comparison (§§86 & 132). Consequently
it is quite probable that the ending -ssa in the following
may represent a dat. e.g., atthi imassa sannāgataassa uttarim
nissaranaṃ M 1.38 "there is (a place) of release superior
to this conscious world"; asādhāraṇaṃ aṅnesam Kh 7 "unequal
to others". This notion of orientation might have developed
from the employment of the dat. with adjectives like garu as
found in the following: satthā no garu M 1.265 "the Master
is venerable to us"; avisamvādako lokassa D I.4,63 "he
breaks not his word to the world,(lit.)of consistent speech to
(from the point of view of) ṭo the world"; vibavadiṭṭhiyā te
paṭīvīruddhā M 1.68 "they are opposed to the theory of non-
becoming".
§ 112. With nouns and particles invoking homage or adoration (nomo), happiness and prosperity (bhaddam), and blessing or welcome (sagatam) the dat. is employed to denote the person who is the object of such. e.g., namo tassa Bhagavato... D II.2886 "homage to that Blessed One...!"; bhaddam tavati D II.180 "prosperity to you!"; sagatam bhante Bhagavato D I.171; M II.2 "welcome to the Blessed One!"; sagatam ayasmato Anandassa M I.212 "welcome to the ven. Ananda". It may be observed that with nana the dat. is logically due to the idea of direction implied in the act of bowing (cp.§96.b). But with the rest it seems to be due to the sense of advantage conveyed by the terms bhada and sagatam (which were originally exclamatory accusatives, vide §28).

§ 113. We have already (§96.b) mentioned the adverbal constructions involving the dat. of destination (cp. KVG §553.6; SS §79). An adnominal employment of the same is found with nouns like magga "way" and gamana "going, journey".

E.g., Samaņo Gotamo Brahmana sahayataya magga janati ti M II.206 "the recluse Gotama knows the way to the company of Brahmas"; saggassa magga caikkhati D III.187 "he points the way to heaven"; Nalakaragamassa maggam M II.206 "the road to the village of the basket-makers"; the noun gamana in this sense is however found only in the gatha literature. E.g, saggassa gamanena Dh 178 "by (the) going to heaven". Here there is the possibility of it being the gen. corresponding to the original acc. of destination (cp. objective gen. § 143.b.).
§ 114. Sporadic Uses of the Dat.

There are some uses of the dat. (at least of -ssa forms felt like dative) that seem to fall under none of the above established categories. It is impossible to distinguish some of these from the gen. For instance, we find the dat. (-ssa) where we would have normally expected a loc. e.g., bhikkhusāṅghassa nissiṇnām A IV.205 "seated among the order of monks"; where the v.l. -sāṅgha shows that even the earlier editors were puzzled by its irregularity. It is doubtful whether this is elliptical for some such expression as bhikkhusāṅghassa purato nissiṇṇām or -ssa purakkhato nissiṇṇām (cp.§104). A similar sporadic instance of the -ssa form, probably for the loc. of relation, occurs in the passage:

akaraṇīyā ca bho Gotama Vajjī rāṇā....Vedehiputtena, yadidaṃ yuddhassa, aṇṇattra upaliṇpanā... A IV.20 "the Vajjīs, venerable Gotama, cannot be defeated (lit. done), that is to say in war, without diplomacy...". We may compare the actual dat. (-āya) found in later Pāli (with the use of yuddhassa) denoting relation. e.g., muto'si me ajja vadhāya J.VI.312 "you are free today as regards death". Similarly yuddhassa might stand for "in the matter of or as regards war". In the following bhayassā seems to denote cause or reason just as an abl. or an inst. (bhaya or bhayena): bhayassā kiccaṃ karoti D III.186 "he does the work for fear or owing to fear", where the Comy. has 'bhaye uppanne' implying, probably, that bhayassā stands for the gen. absolute (§158)'bhayassā uppanmassā' or 'bhayassā sato'. We may however
compare such English usages as 'he did not do it for fear' or 'he did not dare to cross the dry river-bed for the dust'.

Similar is the use of kisa as an adverb of reason. e.g., kisa pana me bhavam Gotamo ëdiken'eva na byêkäšiti M II.213 "why did not the ven. Gotama explain this to me at the very beginning".

A dat. by attraction is a frequent phenomenon in the Nikåyas. e.g., yassa tañ paribhuttam sammåparinëmañ gaccheyya annum Aññatra Tathågatassåti D II.127 "lit. for whom once eaten it would be digestable except (for) the T.". Here Aññatra would normally require an inst. (§82) or an abl. (§130.d); but the dat. is due to the preceding yassa. Similarly: lâbhà bhante Ghatikàrassa kumbhakàrassa....yassa Bhagavà evam abhivissattho ti M II.54 "(it is) a gain to the potter G. .... in whom the Blessed One has confided" (lit. that the Blessed One has confided in him).

§ 115. In Vedic (VGS §200.B.3) and classical Sanskrit (SS §92) the dat. is sometimes found denting the time to come, when a limit is made in time for something to be done. It is parallel to the English 'for' in expressions like 'we shall leave it for tomorrow'. So, in Pâli the irregular old dat. form svatánàya is frequently found in the sense of "for the morrow". What may be this is generally called the terminative dat. e.g., svatánàya bhattam D II.96,125 "meal for tomorrow" (on the form svatana vide FLS §6.54). On the analogy of this we may regard the form uttaràsså in the following as a terminative dat. : ajj'eva me dhammàni jàyantu sv'eva gabbhiniyo hontu uttarass'eva paccantitì A I.240 "may my corn grow today;....and ripen later". It may be observed that both are adverbial usages.
CHAPTER VI

THE ABLATIVE CASE.

§ 116. The fundamental character of the abl. is to denote the point starting from which an action proceeds. Generally speaking it serves to denote the whence, and, according to Speyer, is therefore the very opposite of the dat. (SS § 93). On the whole the difference between the abl. and the dat. seems to be similar to that implied between the English 'from' and 'for'. Speaking of the function of the former in Sanskrit Hopkins says that it "indicates primarily a 'then' and 'thence' idea, leading to a causal notion and almost to the designation of an agent. 'Thence' becomes 'because of' (ēnasah because of sin), but it rarely assumes instrumental sense....". This may be taken as true of the syntactical rôle of the abl. in Pāli as well but for the fact that in Pāli the morphological identity of the inst. and the abl., in the -ā ending of the singular and completely in the plural, has brought the two cases into closer connection and consequently established further points of contact between them.

§ 117. The abl. or the fifth case (pañcamī-vibhatti) has been called the apādāna-kāraka by local grammarians. Pānini lays down the rule that "the fifth case-affix is to be

employed to denote *apādāna*. This term literally means "a taking away from" (apa + ādāna), i.e. generally a withdrawal, thus bringing about clearly the contrast between it and the dat. which is called *sampradāna-kāraka* (Pāli *sampadāna*) wherein the underlying notion is that of giving to. "If there is a withdrawal, that which stays is *apādāna*" says Pāṇini, implying thereby that what is meant is the *terminus a quo*. Kaccāyana gives a categorical definition of the scope of this kāraka. According to him, "that, from which there is a withdrawal (moving away), fear or a taking away, is denoted by the designation *apādāna*". In all these the fundamental notion is the same, viz., that of *whence*. Thus it is clear that ancient Indian grammarians were aware of the logical unity underlying the various uses of the abl. as much as modern writers on syntax.

§ 118. As regards form the abl. in Pāli presents more problems than any other case. We have already referred (§116) to the coinciding of the older inst. sg. of a- nouns, viz., the form in -ā which survives in such instances as sahatthā etc. (*vide* §6), with the ending -ā of the abl. sg. of a- nouns which corresponds to Skr. -āt. Beside this form, in all other declensions Sanskrit has -as for both abl. and gen. sg. which however is absent in Pāli. Here the forms -smā and its phonetic development -mhā

1. *'apādāne pañcamī' Pāṇ. II.3.28.*
2. cp. Speyer SS §97, citing Pāṇ. sūtra 'dhruvamapāya apādānāṃ'.
3. *'yasmādāpeti bhayamādatte vā tadapādānāṃ' Kac. 273.*
borrowed from the pronominal declension appear beside the -ā form. But its employment is restricted to a few uses denoting separation in the general sense (vide §6.a) especially in connection with the verb pabbajāti. The syntactical interfusion of the abl. and the inst. in the older language ($116) has resulted in the loss of the original abl. ending which in Pāli is superseded by that of the inst. in the rest of the vowel declension (masc. and neut.). In the plural everywhere the two cases are formally identical, whereas in Skr. it is the dat. (plural and dual) which coincides with the inst. in spite of the contradictory syntactical conceptions (cp. SS §93).

The suffix -to which even in Sanskrit (-tah) is not considered as a proper abl. ending (cp. SS §106) is frequently used in the Nikāyas with all types of nominal stems (cp. PLS §77) mostly in an adverbial sense. The still older (non-case) suffix -so (Skr. -sah) which is regarded in later as distributive suffix is found here in purely adverbial formations and stands in most instances in the sense of 'vasena'.

§ 119. The abl. in Pāli is on the whole an adverbal case, there being hardly any adnominal uses. Even the few to be met with in the Nikāyas presuppose some verb which has come to be omitted, probably for reasons of idiom, but still can be understood. As regards syntactical categories¹, we have placed the

¹. Speyer (SS §93) gives four heads: I. Abl. of Separation, II. Abl. of Distance, III. Abl. of Origin and Cause, and IV. Abl. expressing 'on what side'.
abl. of starting point first and treated those of origin and cause as developments of the former. The second is the abl. of separation, third the abl. of distance, i.e. the abl. denoting the point from which distance is reckoned, and finally as fourth the abl. of viewpoint, under which heading have been discussed the abl. of comparison and the abl. implying 'on what side'. Those ablatives which appear as pure adverbs and are therefore classed by local grammarians as 'indeclinabl es' have been dealt with separately though they could still be placed under one (or more) of the above headings according to their specific meanings. In all these categories, however, the unity of the fundamental conception is evident, and sometimes we may account for the same abl. in more than one way.

§ 120. The Abl. of Starting Point (origin).

We have said that the fundamental function of this case is to denote the point, whether it be a place, person or thing, starting from which an action proceeds ($116$). This includes therefore such notions as origination, production, rising, issuing, birth etc. Accordingly the abl. of origin appears to be only one phase of the abl. of starting point. Again, that from which something originates can sometimes be regarded as the cause for the latter's origin, for the idea of 'through which' can psychologically correspond to that of 'through which'. Hence the abl. of cause is best included in the abl. of origin. In fact, as Speyer observes (SS §102), the abl.
denoting origin is at the same time an abl. of cause. In Pāli as in Skr., however, the abl. expressing the starting point, in its literal or narrower meaning, is quite a common idiom. The adverbial form in -to seems to be rather frequent in this connection, though the -ā forms are by no means infrequent.

a. The abl. expresses from what origin there is a rising or issuing (cp. SS §100; KVG §533.3). It is found with such verbs as jāyati, uppajjati and abhinibbattati. e.g., bhayāni..... bālato uppajjanti A I.101 "fears.....arise from the fool"; mukhato jātā D III.81 "born from the mouth"; cp. kāṭṭhā have jāyati jātavedo Sn 462 "fire (Agni) is born from wood"; siyā nu kho tesaṃ aggimaṃ nānādāruto abhinibbattānāṃ kiṃci nānā-karaṇāṃ.....M II.130 "would there be any difference.....between those fires kindled from various kinds of wood". In the last two examples it is the idea of 'kindling from' that is implied though the verbs in both cases mean only "to be born" or "arise". The abl. is therefore used to denote the material from which fire is kindled (cp. KVG §533.4).

b. The same abl. is also used to denote the former state or shape or thing out of which some other state etc. proceeds or is produced (cp. SS §100). It occurs with such verbs as abhinimmināti "create" and keroti "make". Though psychologically this function of the abl. comes very close to the instrumental sense, Pāli just like the older language (cp.§116) does not permit the construction with the inst. e.g., so imamhā kāya aññaṃ kāyāṃ abhinimmināti D I.77; M II.18 "from this body he
creates another body"; cp. yathā pi pupphāsimhā kayirā mālagūne bahū Dh 53 "as one would make many garlands from a heap of flowers"; it may even occur with the verb merely understood. e.g., ....khiramhā dadhi, dadhimhā navanītam, navanītamhā sappi, sappimhā sappimando D I.201 "......from milk (sci. is obtained) curds, from curds butter, from butter ghee and from ghee cream"

§ 121 As we have remarked in the preceding paragraph the abl. of origin is at the same time an abl. of cause. For the sake of illustration we may adduce the following example where the abl. -samodhana can be rendered either as "from the contact and friction" implying point of origin or as "through the contact and friction" which points directly to a cause: dvinnam kaṭṭhanam samphassa-samodhana usmā jāyati tejo abhinibbattati M II.242 "from the contact and friction of two sticks warmth arises and fire is kindled". Even in most of the instances given in the previous paragraph the abl. implicitly contained the cause-idea. This connection between the causal abl. and that of origin was known to the ancient grammarians according to whom the fifth case-ending denotes not only avadhi or 'limit of separation' but also janavatva or 'state of being that which produces', as in 'dharmādutpadyate sukham' i.e. "from Dharma arises Happiness". "Here", says a modern Indian critic.

"virtue (Dharma) is the cause that produces happiness as its effect. Sometimes it implies substratum and place of origin as in, 'vaśvikāgrat prabhavati' and 'Himavato Gaṅgā prabhavati'. What is significant here is the distinction made between 'to be born owing to' and 'to arise or spring from'.

§ 122. The Abl. of Cause.

This use of the abl. brings it into contact with the inst. which as we have seen elsewhere (§67) is also employed to denote reason of cause. Pāṇini has two parallel rules to that effect¹ and Kaccāyana lays down the same rule in both cases, viz. 'hetvatthe' (291 & 277 -hetu-). But according to Pāṇini the abl. is forbidden and the inst. is of necessity, if, firstly, the cause or motive be at the same time the agent; secondly, if it be an abstract noun of the feminine gender expressing a quality (cp. SS §102). This distinction seems on the whole to be preserved in the Nikāya prose. Those forms in -ā of feminine nouns such as assavani K II.38; M I.168, and saddhā M I.16,123, are instrumentals of cause and not ablatives (vide §6 here, and Franke Z.D.M.G.1892). They represent either the Vedic ending -ā of feminine nouns, as Franke has shown in the place cited, or a shortening of the usual feminine sg. in -āya, as Geiger thinks, though there is no valid reason to object to the former view (vide PLS §80.1).

1. 'hetau (ṛṭiyā)' Pāṇ.II.3.23 & 'akartaryrne pañcamī'

II.3.24; cp. also following 'vibhāsa guṇe'striyaṁ'II,3.25.
And the abl. with the adverbial suffix -to found in such instances as rājato vā duruttassa corato vā pihatassa Kh 7 does not denote agent, though the commentator glosses it by '.....corehi pihatassa' (Pj.I.p.215), but as an abl. expressing 'from what side' as Sanskrit 'tvattah' i.e. "from your side" (§131.d., cp. SS §101). Generally speaking the abl. of causality and the inst. of reason are interchangeable and not seldom are found side by side. But, as Speyer points out, if the efficient cause be some obligation or other binding motive by virtue of which (i.e. from which) some effect is produced, the abl. alone is to be employed (SS §102). This is so because it is the logical function of the abl. and not of the inst. to denote that from which something results as consequence. For instance, in an example like the following, the abl. is almost obligatory: yā tā honti āpadā aggito vā udakato vā rājato vā corato vā.....A II.68 "whatever calamities there be from (i.e. due to, owing to) fire, water, kings or robbers....", the implication being that these arise from the mentioned sources. In general this abl. may express many different shades of the notion of causality.

a. It may denote the cause proper, in which case it can be rendered by such expressions as "from", "through", "as a result of" or "in consequence of". e.g., āsavānaḥ khayaḥ ānasavaḥ cetovimuttāṁ upasampajja A I.107; D III.102 "through the (or on the) extinction of the banes entering that emancipation of mind which is free from such"; atha aṅñatara satto āyu-
Brahma-vimānam uppajjati D III.29 "then a certain being in consequence of the expiry of his span of life or his merits leaving the Abode of Radiance enters the Brahma-abode of Emptiness"; sabbaso rūpasanānānaṃ samatikkamā, paṭīghasānānānaṃ atthāngamā, nānattasaśānānaṃ amanasikārā.....ākāsānapacāyatanam upasampajjajā viharati D II.112 "On the complete passing away of form-perceptions, on the expiry of all hateful thoughts, and through not dwelling on various (perceived) things,......he enters the sphere of infinite space and abides therein." In all these examples the abl. conveys implicitly an idea of time (after which). The construction is consequently parallel to the locative absolute (§183.d); hence the possibility of rendering the abl. in some of the above instances by a temporal phrase beginning with 'on'. Here we may observe the temporal conception implied in the idea of causality. In the stock-phrase 'kāyassa bhedā param maraṇā...' it is the temporal sense that is pronounced, there being practically no causal implication. e.g., sabbe te kāyassa bhedā param maraṇā sugatiṃ sagga-lokaṃ uppajjanti D II.141; III.169 "all of them on the disruption of the body after death are born in a happy state in heaven". The abl. bhedā here actually means "after the disruption..." (and not "as a result or in consequence of the breaking up...") and is very much like the inst. of time after which (vide §77.b).
In the foregoing examples it is the abl. of noun itself that is employed to denote cause. But frequently we find the abl. sg. of words meaning cause or reason as periphrases replacing the direct construction. As regards Sanskrit, Speyer says "Nothing impedes concrete nouns to be put in the abl. of cause, but often they are expressed by periphrase, especially by means of hetoh" (SS §102). In the Nikāyas are found such forms as hetu, kāranā and paccayā used in this connection.

Geiger considers the first as a postposition corresponding to the old gen.-abl. in -os (PLS §83.2). Local grammarians regard these also as genuine ablatives of cause and not as indeclinables (nipāta) as we would have expected. As periphrases they either appear in the rôle of postpositions or are construed as the second member of dependent determinative compounds where the gen. is implied as the first member. e.g., avijjapaccayā saṅkhārā, saṅkhārapaccayā viññānam (etc.)... D I.45 "through (or from) ignorance (arise) the constituents, from these consciousness...."; jātipaccayā jāramaranaṁ M I.261 "decay and death (occur) owing to birth"; kusālaṁ bhikkhave dhammānaṁ samādāna-hetu evaṁ idam puṇṇaṁ pavaḍḍhati D III.59 "owing to the acquiring of good things, brethren, merit increases in this way"; cp. attaḥhetu2 parahetu dhanahetu Sn 122 "because of himself, others or money". But more frequently these abl. forms appear as separate words and the actual noun denoting cause is put in the gen. case. e.g., issariyassa kāranā

1. Vutti on Kac.277 gives hetu side by side with hetunā as abl.
2. Comy.'attaḥhetūti attano jīvitakāranā' Pj.II.179 [of cause.
"I deprived him of life through the motive of (obtaining) mastery" (lit. through the fact of glory); in this example, as well as in the gāthā passage given above (with -hetu), the postposition conveys the meaning "through the motive of" and not "as a result of" as in the others, hence it approaches the dat. of purpose in sense "for the sake of" or "for the purpose of". In the following however no such idea is contained: yesaṁ kho ahaṁ samyojanānaṁ hetu pāṇātipāti asaṁ M I.361 "owing to which fetters would I become one destroying life?"; Taṁ kissa hetu? D II.14 "What is this due to? (lit. this through the cause of what)". There is no doubt, therefore, that the form hetu is the abl. sg. corresponding to Skr. hetoh which is used after the gen. of the actual noun denoting cause, as mentioned by Pāṇini (II.3.26). He also allows the use of the inst. if the noun is a pronoun (ibid 27) which the vārttika illustrates by 'kasya (and kena) hetunā vasati' (cp. Pāli kissa). Moreover the abl. -bhayā in the following proves beyond doubt that hetu to which it refers is also abl.: Taṁ kissa hetu? Niṇḍābyārosana-upārambhahayāti A II.31 "what is that due to? It is due to the fear of..."; (on the phonetic change of -oh > -u see §13.).

e. The abl. is also used to express the source of fear with the noun bhavam. The more usual construction is the gen. expressive of the source of fear (§150.c); the acc. is also found with verbs of fearing, especially when the object of fear is a person (§36.a). The abl. is found in the Nikāyas.

1. 'saṣṭi hetuprayoge', illustrated by 'annasya hetor vasati'.
2. 'sarvanāmanastrāti ca'.
only adnominally. e.g., na kutocı bhayaṃ samanupassati D 1.70,
172 "he does not encounter fear from anything"; cp. papatanani
bhayaṃ...maranato bhayaṃ Sn. 576 "fear from falling......
fear from death (i.e. fear of falling...)". The abl. kuto,
originally "from which" gains the adverbial import of "whence"
and is frequently found with bhayaṃ, either separately as in
kuto bhayaṃ Dh 212,271,362, or compounded with the latter as
in akutobhaya "with nothing to fear from anything" § 1.192;
Th 1.510,2.333; Sn 561.

§ 123. The Abl. of Separation.

As fundamental characteristic of the abl. we have
mentioned in the previous chapter its function of denoting
the point from which an action proceeds. Now, the psychological
fact behind the conception of proceeding from is the notion
of separation. It is implied not only in the idea of going
away from but also in that of origination. According to local
grammarians it is the fundamental notion underlying all the
primary uses of this case; hence the name aśvadhi (limit of
separation). Cakrabarty¹ regards the notion of origination
(janayatva) itself as being contained in the conception of
aśvadhi. In fact there is equal justification for either
division to be regarded as the first because fundamental
unity of conception. Speyer, probably following the older
grammarians, places the abl. of separation at the beginning
of his treatment of that case. (§§ 93).

¹. Philosophy of Sanskrit Grammar p. 201.
§ 124. The abl. accordingly is needed when wanting to express from or out of what place there is a starting or moving (cp. SS §94). In its proper sense it is employed with all verbs implying going, coming, receding, approaching etc. All the available abl. sg. endings are employed in this connection.

a.i. With gacchati and āgacchati: e.g., aham kho sakamhā gāmā amuṃ gāmaṃ āgañchita M II.20 "I came from my village to that one"; dūrā vat'āmāhā āgatā D II.139 "we are come from a far", where dūrā is adverbial; cp. Kosalānaṃ purā rammā āgamā dakkhiṇāpatham Sn 976 "he went to the land of the South from the delightful city of the Kosalas". With nikkhamati: e.g., vihārā nikkhamma D I.152 "going out of the monastery"; gharā nikkhamati S I.176; cp. Ud 22 "goes out of the house"; Ātumāya (v.l. Ātumāyā) mahājanakāyo nikkhamitvā D II.131 "a great multitude of men leaving Ātumā"; nagaramhā nikkhamantassa S I.211 "of one going out of the city". With vāti (with prefixes ni- and pa-): e.g., Bārāṇasiyā niyyāsi M II.40 "he went out of B."; cp. niyyanti dhīrā lokamā Dh 175 "the wise go out of the world"; Naṅgaramhā pāyāsi M II.119 "he set out from Naṅgara".

ii. The adverbial ending -to is also frequently used with such verbs. e.g., gāmato...paṭikkamati M I.207,III.157 "he returns...from the village"; yato kuto cī naṃ puriso āgaccheyyaM I.284 "from whatever place (lit. whence-ever) a man may come to this (locality)"; dūrato vā āgacchantam D II.162 "coming from a-far".
iii. The pronominal form -sma is found particularly used with the verb pabbajati (vide §5.a); but the form in -a too occurs with the same verb, e.g., yasmā kasmā ce pi kulā agārasma anagāriyaṃ pabbajito hoti M I.284 "from whatever family one sets forth from-home-to-homelessness" (cp. M I.210); sakaya kulā pabbajito D I.111 "entered (the Order) from a Sakyan family".

b. Apart from the simple construction with verbs of motion the abl. of separation is found in its "manifold application to kindred conceptions" (SS §95). Of the kind are verbs implying:

i. falling from, descending and ascending from: e.g., antalikkhā paptanti D II.137 "fall from the intermediate space i.e. the sky"; yānā paccārohitvā D II.95 "alighting from the chariot"; pabbatā orohitvā D III.38 "descending from the mountain". This abl. according to local grammarians is an elliptical construction instead of the acc. with the gerund in -tva.

ii. It is also found with verbs meaning to shift, deviate, fall off, quit and such like. e.g., Tusitā kāyā cavitvā D II.12 "passing from the Tusita-abode"; tambā kāyā cutā D I.20 (cp. D III.146) "passing away from that body or quitting that body"; maggā okkamma D II.128 "deviating from the road"; vokkamma Satthu sāsanā D I.231 "falling off (leaving) the religion of the Master"; apakkam'eva imasmā dhammā-vinayā

1. 'tva lope kamādhikaranasu' vutti on Kac.277.
D III.6 "he went away for good from this Doctrine and Training".

iii. The causatives of verbs originally implying motion are construed similarly. e.g., raṭṭha vā nagarā vā pabbājeyyum D I.99 "they would exile (them) from country or town". This is however comparatively rare as a construction in the Nikāyas. It is interesting to note that the -śmā form occurs with the causative as with the original pabbajati. e.g., raṭṭhasmā pabbājeti D I.92 "he exiles (him) from the country".

c. Verbs meaning to appear, manifest (oneself), assemble, gather, break forth, arise, wake up etc. take an abl. of the place or state from which the appearance etc. occurs. e.g., antalikkhā pātubhavanti D II.15 "appear from the sky"; dasahi lokādhā tūhi devatā...sannipatitā D II.263 "gods from ten world-systems being assembled"; tamhā udakarahadā sītavāri-dhāra ubbhājītvā D I.74 "fountains of cold water breaking forth (issuing) from that pond"; āsanā vuṭṭhabhītvā D I.124 "rising from his seat"; utṭhāy'āsanā D II.95 "rising from his seat"; samādhimhā vuṭṭhabhītvā D II.27 "waking up from the trance".

§ 126. a. The abl. of separation is also found with verbs denoting taking, receiving, collecting, carrying, lifting up, pulling out or extracting. Here the abl. is due not so much to any sense of motion implied in the verb as to the notion of withdrawal generally underlying such. e.g., kāyamhā vāto civaram apavahati M II.139 "the wind carries away the robe from the body";
generally underlying them, e.g., hatthato pattaṇa gahetvā
Ud 29 "having taken the bowl from his hand"; ito ca bhiyyo
haratha D II.180 "take away more from here also"; te susānā
vā saṅkārakūṭā vā pāpanīkā vā nantakāṇi uccinītvā.....M II.7
"having collected rags from the cemetery, dust-heap or shop..";
ghaṭiyā odanaṃ uddharitvā Ud 29 "taking out rice from the
vessel"; karanḍā uddhareyya D I.71 "would draw out from the
casket"; puriso muṇjamhā isīkaṃ pabbāheyya M II.17 "as if a
man would draw out a reed from the muṇja grass".

b. Since the idea of 'taking' (cp. 'conception' from Latin
capiō = I take) is contained in such verbs as learn and hear
from, the abl. is found with these denoting the person from
whom one learns etc. e.g., ito pana vā sutvā S V.110
"having heard from here (i.e. him)"; Bhagavato sammukhā
dhamikāṃ kathāṃ savānāya M I.160 "to hear a doctrinal talk
from the lips (from the presence) of the Blessed One". In
such instances the gen. can be used alternately (cp. SS §96).

§ 126. The abl. is also used with verbs of separating and
disjoining to denote that from which there is a dissociation,
i.e. generally a withdrawal (cp. SS §96). As we have seen
elsewhere (§73.c) the inst. is here the parallel idiom and
perhaps even more widely used than the abl.. The following
examples illustrate the many shades of meaning expressed.

a. It is primarily found with verbs literally implying
disjoining, separating and dissociating. e.g., yo kho maṇ
pisunāya vācāya mittehi bhedeyyāti S V.385 "if one were to separate me from my friends with slanderous talk"; cp. viṇā kacchā abhassatha Sn 449 "the lute slipped from (his) arm".

b. It is also found with verbs meaning to make loose, free, cleanse, release, save etc. (cp. KVG §533.5; SS §96.6). e.g., abhijjāya cittām parisodheti D I.71 "cleanses his mind of avarice"; thīna-middhā cittām parisodheti D I.71 "cleanses his mind of sloth and torpor"; na parimuccati dukkhasmā M I.3, 65 "he is not freed from sorrow"; āsavehi cittām vimuccī D II 35 "the mind was purged of the bane"; tamhā ābādhā mucceyya D I.72; M I.275 "he would recover from that disease"; bandhaṁ mucceyya D I.72 "he would be released from bondage"; tamhā āsavyā mucceyya M I.275 "he would be freed from that serfdom".

c. With verbs meaning to be free of or from, be empty or vacant of, be aloof, desist, abstain from, removed or absent from etc. e.g., vivicca akusalehi D II.186 (D I.37) "aloof (free) from evil (things); dasahi saddehi avāvittā D II.170 "not free from (lit. separated from) the ten noises"; cp. its causative: brāhmaṇam etasmā pāpakā diṭṭhigata vivecitū ti D I.226 "may you free (lit. seven) the brahmin from this evil view"; virato methunāmā gāmadhammā D I.4 "abstaining from the vulgar matter of sex-intercourse"; viratā adinnādānā D II.12 "abstaining from taking what is not given"; gaṇasamā vūpakaṭṭho A IV.435; M III.110; Ud 41 "aloof from the crowd"; sakamhā gāmā vā nigamā cīra-vippavuttho M II.233 "long absent from his village or township".
d. It is employed also with verbs having the sense of deprive of or be bereft of (cp. SS §96.d; KVG §533.7). e.g., yasā nikkiṇṇo D III.11 "bereft of glory" (Comy. '...tato parihiṇno hutvā'); (pitaraṇa) jīvitā voropesiṁ D I.84,85 "he deprived (his father) of life"; atha nam... jīvitā voropeyya S III.113 "then.....he deprived him of his life with a sharp sword"; na koci kañci jīvitā voropeti m I.517 "no one deprived another of life".

e. The idea of separation is contained also in words meaning disgust, revulsion, aversion or loathsome ness. Consequently the abl. is found with such verbs as nibbindati "to get disgusted with or of". Here the loc. is the parallel idiom (cp. c. loc. S I.124;II.94;IV.86,140;A V.3 ) or even the inst. (vide sub nibbiṇṇa P.T.S.Dict.). According to Speyer (SS §97 N.B.), in Sanskrit the verb jīgupṣate (Pāli jīgucchati) "to shrink from" is found with the abl. (Paññinī vārtt. on I.4.24) in the archaic literature but with the acc. in classical Sanskrit. He says that nirvidyate (Pāli nibbindati) is construed with the abl. or the inst., sometimes even with acc. and gen.. Accordingly the Pāli loc. seems to be a later development (probably from the close relation it bears to the nimitta-sattāmi, §177.b), whereas the abl. seems to be the normal and earlier usage. e.g., tasmā brahmacariyā nibbijja pakkamati m I.519 "he gets disgusted with that higher life and goes away"; cp. Māra nibbinda Buddhamā Th I.1207 "Evil One, cease from molesting (lit. get tired of) the enlightened one!".
§ 127. The Abl. of Distance.

The point from which (i.e. whence) distance in space or time is counted or reckoned is expressed by the abl. case (cp. Speyer SS §98 II.). It denotes in other words the terminus a quo. One cannot fail to see here a logical connection between this one and the abl. of separation. For the point from which distance is reckoned may be looked upon as that starting from which the reckoning takes place. In fact the fundamental unity of conception underlying these, as well as the abl. of origin etc., can hardly be overlooked. Local grammarians consider the notion of avadhi as comprising all these uses; hence the logical importance attached to it as the designation of the fifth case. Kaccāyana provides for the various uses of the abl. of distance by the rule dūrantikaddhakālanimmaṇa...... thokākattusu ca (277), which means that the abl. is to be used to denote the ideas of distance, nearness, reckoning in space and time and so on. The vuttī explains it by 'dūratthe, antikatthe, addhanimmaṇe, kālanimmaṇe...... tam kārakaṁ apādāna saññaṁ hoti'.

§ 128. This abl. is frequently employed to express the place or limit from which a distance is reckoned (in a literal sense), the terminus ad quem being put in the acc. case (cp. §39.a&b). The following examples imply conception in space:

a. e.g., ito ce pi yojanasate viharati D I.117 "even if he lived (within) a hundred leagues from here"; Kivadūro pana
"How far, good Kārīyana, is the township of the Sakyans, named Medaluṃpa, from Naṅgaraka?". This is also found adnominally with nouns like magga etc. e.g., Kusinārāya Pāvanadadhānamagga-pañci-panno hoti D II.130 "he has entered upon the journey from (lit. road) from Kusinārā to Pāvā".

b. The same construction is applied to the allied notion in time. The distinction is maintained by Kaccāyana according to whom, as seen from the rule cited above, the point from which or whence distance in space is reckoned is the addhānanimāṇa and in time is kālanimāṇa, e.g., ito ekanavute kappe D II.2 "in the ninety first aeon from this"; ito tinnaṃ māsānaṃ accayena D II.106 "on the lapse of three months from now".

§ 129. While in the previous examples the distance is definitely expressed by some 'measurement' in time or space, more often this abl. appears with adverbs and prepositions denoting space or time indefinitely. Hence it joins such prepositions as ā, vāva and pabhuti. The indeclinable ā which originally was a Vedic postposition following the acc., loc., or abl., meaning "to, towards or from", is preserved in Sanskrit (vide Macdonell Skr.Gr.§176.2.) but does not occur in the Nikāya prose. It is however found as preposition c. abl in the Jātakas in the sense of "upto, until, about, near" (vide P.T.S.Dict. s.v.). The preposition vāva, on the other hand, is quite common in the Nikāyas either with the absolute form of noun or adj.(base), or
with nom., acc. or abl. (ibid., sub yāva). The acc. is frequently found with it as in yāva tatiyakam D I.95 "till the third (time)" or in the stock-phrase yāva jīvam It 78 "till life (ends)" or "for life", but the abl. is by no means rare. e.g.,
yāva Brahma-lokā pariyesamāno D I.223 "searching upto the
world of Brahma"; yāva Brahma-lokā pi kāyana vā saṃvaṭṭeti
D I.78 "covers with the body (everything) upto the Brahma-
world"; cp. A III.17; yāva sattamā pitā-mahāyugā D I.113
"as far as the seventh line of ancestors"; yāvad eva (v.l. yāva-
deva) manussehi suppakāsitam D II.113,114,219;III.122 , where
the case is however doubtful (vide §9). What is significant
in the case of both Ā and yāva with the abl. is that, at least
in the instances found in the Nikāya prose, the construction
does not signify the terminus ab quo but the notion which is
the very opposite of it, viz. the terminus ad quem. Thus we
have here the same logical phenomenon as it confronted us in
the case of the inst. implying mutuality (i.e. both separation
and union, vide §73.c.). Though the preposition pabhuti is
derived from the Vedic prabhṛti (originally a fem. noun), it
is hardly found in the Nikāyas as such. It occurs once in a
compound, viz. kuto-pabhutika D I.94 "dating from, coming from
whence". The original use is however restored in the Comys.
(e.g., tato pabhuti Vv.A. 158 "from that time").

§ 130. With Adverbs. Many adverbs denoting space or time are
joined to the abl. to express the point from which distance or
extent is implied. The most frequent are those meaning "far"
or "near". But with derived adverbs of the type of dakkhaṇato, uttarato the gen. seems to be of necessity (cp. Pāṇī. II.3.30; vide§153. b.) and with those ending in -ena such as antareṇa mostly the gen. but sometimes also the acc. (§53). Pāṇīni (II.3.34) allows optional construing with all words meaning "far" or "near" (cp. SS §98.II.R.2). e.g.,

a. This abl. has a wide application in the Nikāyas. e.g.,
na yito dūre Manasākaṭanti D I.248 "M. is not at a distance (i.e. far) from here"; ēsaṇne ito Manasākaṭam D I.248 "M. is in the proximity of (lit. from) this (place)". Similar is the abl. with ēru in sense more or less metaphorical: ēru cittam samādhīmaḥ M I.116 "remote is the mind from concentration"; cp. ēru pāmadamhā Sn 27,156,157 "far from indolence!". The derived form ērakā is also found with the abl. e.g., ērakā va samāṇnā ērakā va brahmaṇnā D I.167 "far indeed from recluse-ship as well as from Brahmin-ship"; ērakā 'ham...vahārasamucc- he dhā M I.367 "I am far from...violation of convention"; ērakā te anuttāraya vijjācaramaṇasampadāya D I.99 "they are far from the blessing of knowledge and conduct".

b.i. The abl. of distance with pure adverbs is no less frequent. In the following examples it is the notion of distance in space that is signified and the adverb is local. e.g., uddham pāda- talā adho kesa-matthakā D III.104; M I.57; S IV.111 "upwards from the sole of the feet and downwards from the top of the (knot of) hair"; bahi dvārakotṭhakā Ud 52 "outside of (lit. from) the gateway"; ito bahiddhā D I.21;II.151 "outside of this (hence)"; bahiddhā parisāya D II.211 "out of the crowd";
tiro raṭṭhā tiro janapadā D I.116\(^1\) "from beyond the kingdom, from beyond the country".

ii. Similarly we find the abl. of distance with temporal adverbs and prepositions meaning "before" or "after". e.g., pubbe va' sambodhā S II.5; M I.17;II.211 "previous to enlightenment"; ito pubbe D I.184 "before this"; tato pacchā D II 269 "after that". The noun in the abl. may even be a person as marking off a period in time. e.g., Ahesum kho bhikkhu tayā pubbe samaṇabrāhmaṇā M I.327 "there were, monks, recluses and brahmins...even before you"; mayam pana amhā (v.l. asmā) pacchā uppanā D III.29 "we were born after him"; anantarā kho... sadda-pāṭubhāvā D II.206 "after the appearance of the sound..."; (cp. Skr. anantaram c. abl. Macdonell Skr. Gr.§177.c.2); param is the only proper preposition used with the abl., but its function here seems to be that of a temporal adverb. e.g., param maranā D II.68,141 "after death (lit. beyond from death)" tato param nānussarati D I.19;III30 "he does not remember beyond that". The same applies to oram which however is only found in the Sutta-Nipāta. e.g., oram vassasatā pi miyyati Sn 804 "he dies on this side of (lit. from) a hundred years".

c. Finally, we may consider the abl. usually found with the adverbial preposition aṇṇatra or aṇṇattha (< Skr. anyatra = elsewhere, beside, except) as one denoting the limit of exclusion, which conception is psychologically akin to that of

\(^1\) cp. Comy. 'tiro raṭṭhāti para raṭṭhato, tiro janapadā ti para janapadato' Sum.I.286.
underlying the abl. of distance. Originally in the Vedas the word anyá-tra was purely an adverb with a local sense like atrá, viévátra etc. (cp. VGS §179.3.). But in later Sanskrit it came to be employed as a prepositional adverb or pure preposition, through the development of the idea of 'elsewhere' into the notion of 'apart from' (cp. Macdonell Skr. Gr. §178.c.). In the Nikāyas we find the prepositional sense prominent with the abl. e.g., na aññattha tava sāsanā D II.206 "lit. not elsewhere from your Order" (i.e. nowhere except in your Order); nāaññatra Tathāgatassa pātubhāvā S V.14 "not apart from the appearance of the T."; aññatra adassanā S I.29 "except from blindness". Sometimes it occurs in the developed idiom 'kiṁ aññatra'. e.g., kiṁ aññatra ahusitattā D I.90 "what else beside non-practice?". In Pāli, but not in the earlier language (i.e. Vedic or later Skr.), the inst. can be used concurrently. (§82.a). This is probably due to the logical contact brought about by the comparative sense implied in añña- (Skr. anya = other) which is capable of taking the inst. (§86) or the abl. (§132.a.ii).

§ 131. The Abl. of Side and View-point.

Speyer has shown (SS §103.IV.) how Sanskrit, just as Latin, uses the abl. not only for the sake of signifying from what side (usually cause) but also on what side. Here, he says, the ending -taḥ (Pāli -to) is employed, it seems, by preference, at least in the case of indicating space and directing.
Sometimes it is concurrent with the loc. of point at which.

In Pāli we find many instances of this abl. appearing in various functions some of which are, logically speaking, highly involved. Such, for instance, are the following:

a. rukkhā mūlata chetvā M I.366/ "having cut the tree from (or at) the root"; cp. mūle chindeyya, mūlena chetvā S II.88 (§172.a.); (citakaṃ)...pādota vivaritvā D II.163 "having opened... (the funeral pile) from (or on) the side of the feet"; mukhato ca nāsato ca kannato ca assāsapassāse uparundhiṃ M I.243 "I stopped inhalation and exhalation from (or at) the mouth, nose and ears". In its metaphorical application this so-called ablative partis not rarely touches upon the abl. of cause. e.g., rājato vā duruttassa corato pīlitassa vā Kh 7 (VIII.2.) "harassed on the part of the king and molested on the part of thieves", where the Comy. has 'corehi...pīlitassa...' (Pj. I. p. 318), the ending -ehi probably representing the inst. of agency (§122).

b. In the preceding examples the adverbial force of the suffix -to is quite apparent. In fact most of these ablatives denoting 'on what side' have the character of adverbs. Such are the following ablatives (mostly in -to and a few in -ā) which according to the vutti on Kac.277 are used in the sense of 'direction in which' (disā-yoge). These uses are mostly borrowed from Sanskrit (vide SS §103.IV.). e.g., puratthimato nagarassa D II.161 "on the east of the city";
pācinato Rājagahassa...tassa uttarato D II.263 "on the east of R. ...to the north of it"; dakkhiṇato nagarassa sīsam chindeyyuṃ A II.241 "on the south of the city they would behead (him)"; samantato dvādasa yojanāni D II.39,139 "on all sides twelve leagues"; parito parito jānapadesa D II.260 "round about on every side" (Comy. 'samantā samantā' Sum.ii.687).

The ending -ā is also found, though not so frequently as the above suffix -to. e.g., pasādassa hetthi D I.198 "on the ground-floor of the mansion"; samantā ca gocaragāmāṃ M I.167 "all around the alms-village".

c. Nearly all of the above adverbial ablatives signify space, the region in which, and are therefore syntactically parallel to the loc. In the following examples the notion of direction rather than locality is emphasized. e.g., mā me purato atṭhāsi D II.139 "do not stand in front of me"; Bhagavato purato nisīdi D II.135 "he sat in front of the Blessed One"; Bhagavato purato ṭhito D II.138 "stood in front of the Blessed One". The -ā form is also found. e.g., tesam sammukhā na vyākāsiṃ D I.222 "I did not declare it before them"; Bhagavato sammukha...bhāsati A I.163 "he speaks...before the Blessed One". Sometimes it can only be rendered by a pure adverb of manner as "personally" or "directly". e.g., sammukhā ma täm bhante sutaṃ D II.115 "I have it, Sir, personally"; na kho me mārisa so Bhagavā sammukhā diṭṭho D II.268 "I certainly, friend, have not seen that Blessed One personally". The repetitive phrase 'piṭṭhito piṭṭhito' is adverbially used to
denote "continually at the back" or "whenever behind". e.g.,
Bhagavato piñṭhito piñṭhito (aṭṭhāsi) D III.73 "he stood at
the back of (just behind) the Blessed One". Sometimes it is
more or less an adverb of manner. e.g., Bhagavatam piñṭhito
piñṭhito anubaddhā honti D I.1 "they followed the Blessed One
closely from behind". A similar abl. is dūrato which means
not "from afar", at least not in the following example, but
"in the distance", being an abl. adv. as the above and not an
abl. of separation. e.g., disvā... Bhagavatam dūrato va
āgacchantam D I.179 "having seen....the Blessed One coming
in the distance (even when he was still far off)".

d. Sometimes this abl. of 'on which side' when applied
metaphorically comes to mean "with respect to" and thus
approximates to an abl. of relation. In fact the notion of
view-point eam which is the fundamental conception behind the
abl. of relation can hardly be separated from that of the
'side on which'. Such are: ubhato sujāto putto mātito ca
piñṭito ca D I.1, 113, 137; A III.151 "well-born on both sides,
both with respect to the mother and the father"; though it
is primarily an adv. it sometimes appears as the first member
of a compound in the rôle of an adj. e.g., ubhato-bhāga-
vimāṭham D II.111 "polished on both sides".

§ 132. Abl. of Comparison.

With comparatives the abl. appears not
seldom, beside the inst., as a case denoting comparison (cp.
KVG §535). According to Speyer (SS §105), it is the same abl.
as the one expressive of the notion 'on what side, with respect to', described in the preceding paragraphs, that is frequently applied in comparisons to signify the thing compared with, provided there be superiority, inferiority or discrepancy. For, as we have seen earlier, in the case of identity, likeness, similarity or equivalence the inst. (§85 & §86) or the gen. (§151.b.) is of necessity, and the dat. also in the case of counterpoise (§108; cp. §110'). This is due to the fact that the abl. has as its fundamental character the notion of separation which logically cannot be associated with the idea of identity etc., whereas the conception of superiority etc. implies difference and hence psychologically separation. It may be mentioned that in comparison it is only the legitimate ablative ending (-ā < Skr. -at) that is employed and the -to form is only found with pronouns. According to local grammarians this is called the abl. of distinction ("vibhatte" Kac.277) a. It is primarily found with comparatives of adjectives.

e.g., nirayā ...tircchānayoni seyyo M II.193 "animal-birth is better than the purgatory"; koc'ānno attanā piyataro S I.75 "whoever else (is) more beloved than oneself ?"; amhehi abhi-kantatarā...D I.216 "more beautiful than we". Sometimes it occurs with the comparatives of adjectival compounds. e.g.,
aññehi pindapātehi mahapphalatāro D II.136 "having greater benefits than other alms"; attanā vimuttiñānādassanasampannataram S I.139 "possessing greater insight and knowledge of emancipation than himself"; alamattadassananataro c'eva pitarā
D II.231 “having more insight into profitable things than the father”. The suffix -to, as remarked above, is found only with pronouns. e.g., tato ca uttaritaram D I.16 “and nobler than that”; (cp. Dh 42 ); ato mahantatarena avijjâkhandhena M II.131 “with a mass of ignorance greater than that”; tato santataram M I.91 “more peaceful than that”.

b. Secondly it is found with words, other than pure comparatives of adjectives, expressing superiority or inferiority such as varaṁ “better”, ativiya “in excess of, more than” and uttarî- “superior (lit. upper)”. e.g., attadanto tato varaṁ Dh 322 “the self-tamed (i.e. one who controls himself) is better than they”; paramīya vanṇapokkharatāya samannāgato ativiya aññehi manussehi M III.176 “endowed with the highest bloom of complexion much more than other people”; uttari-manussadhammā iddhipâtihiyā M III.12 “miracles excelling (those of) human nature (i.e. mundane)”; uttari-manussadhammā alamariyaññanadassanaviseso S IV.300 “truly genuine knowledge and insight much above human things”.

c. Thirdly it occurs with all words meaning “other, different, changed” etc. such as añño (itara, apara), nānabhāva, vīnā-bhāva and aññathabhāva. e.g., tambā nimittā aññam nimittam M I.119 “a sign other than that (sign)”; añño koci mayā upaṭṭhakārō M II.51 “any attendant other than myself”; sabbehi eva piyehi manāpehi nānabhāvo vīnā-bhāvo aññathabhāvo

1. It is quite clear that -dhammā is abl. sg. and the Comy. has ṯpañcasīla-dasasīla-sankhātā manussadhammā uttari'
118 "(there is) a change, an alteration, a differentiation from all things lovable and pleasant".

§ 133. Abl. of viewpoint.

From the foregoing it is seen that the abl. generally expresses the point of view. It is the underlying unity of conception behind the various uses discussed above such as the ablatives denoting on which side, relation, comparison etc.. The notion of viewpoint is also signified by a class of ablatives in -to (but never with the regular endings), the syntactical function of which seems to be closely related to that of the abl. of comparison. They have the sense of "in terms of" or "as", and can be expressed by the periphrasis vasena as well.

a. This is mostly found with verbs of judging, considering, seeing etc. e.g., na maya tan sarato pacchagacchama M II. 114 "we do not hark back to that as final" (lit. as essential); cp. sarañca sarato natva Dh 12 "having known the essential as essential"; byakatañca me byakatato dharetha M I.431 "that which I have explained take as explained"; na viññanam attato samanupassati M I.300 "does not consider consciousness as the Soul"; accaya accayato disvā D I.35;III.55 "seeing decay as decay"; gottato pi anusarati....savaka-yugato pi anusarati D II.8 "remembers in relation to (or by way of) clan and the pairs of disciples"; pathavito na maññati M I.4 "does not regard (it) as earth"; cp. pamādaṃ bhayato disvā Th 1.980 "seeing indolence as fear". In the above examples the abl.
in some cases borders on the adverbial use. In the following example it is more like an adverb of manner than anything else: evam visesato ṇatvā Dh 22 "thus having known especially".

b. In the above examples, as pointed out before, it is the suffix -to that is generally employed to denote viewpoint or relation. However, though the -to forms assume the role of the regular case-forms of the abl. in these and some other instances, still a full and complete identity between them can only be found in the pronominal declension, just as in Sanskrit (cp. SS §108). Pāṇini gives a considerable number of rules about the use of this suffix, which show that its sphere of employment, though mostly coinciding with that of the abl. proper, is more often a different one.

c. A similar syntactical part is played by the suffix -so which is itself no case-ending at all, but belongs to the adverbs with non-case suffixes (vide KVG §580-585). It is however regarded as an ablative form by Pāli grammarians. For instance, under the use designated 'pamāṇatthe', vutti on Kac.277 gives such examples as 'dīghasō' etc. There is no doubt, therefore, that this ending -so, though not recognized by Pāṇini as a regular case-form of the abl., came to be regarded in popular speech as an ablative ending. In fact its similarity to the -to suffix in sense - for we can paraphrase -so with -vasena as well - brought about an almost complete identity with the latter. This too generally expresses the idea of relation; thus e.g., imam-eva kāyam dhātuso paccavekkhati M I.57 "he
considers this very body in terms of the elements"; dhātuso bhikkhave sattā saṃsandanti samentī S II.154; III.66. "according to their natures, monks, beings unite and agree". In these examples, especially in the second, the adverbial connotation can hardly be overlooked. But the original distributive sense of this suffix, viz. the meaning "into" or "in", is not seldom found in the Nikāyas. e.g., bilaso paṭīvibhajītvā M I.59 "dividing into (so many) parts"; Kosinārake Malle kula-parivattaso kula-parivattaso ṭhapetvā D II.148 "keeping the Mallas of Kosinārā each family-circle separately in a group".

§ 134. The Adverbial Ablative.

In the preceding paragraphs we have already referred to a considerable number of ablatives employed as pure adverbs and some even as prepositions (such as ārā). Beside these there are many other ablatives in -ā and -to ( -smā occurring only with pronominal stems), and a considerable number of -so forms with ablatival sense, used as adverbs. These may be dealt with according to the syntactical categories established in the previous chapters.

a. The abl. singular of demonstrative, interrogative and relative pronouns is frequently found as adverb of reason and manner. Logically they are ablatives of cause. e.g., tasmā vedanā ti vuccati M I.293 "therefore is it called 'sensation'"; tasmā etam kallaṃ vacanāya D I.168 "therefore it is fit to say..."; cp. D II.283; tato "therefore, thence" D I.72,212; Pv I; ettato "therefore, by reason of this" S I.
185. We may compare with these the adv. inst. tena. The Comys. treat them as adverbs of reason, cp. 'tasmā ti kārana-vacanaṃ' Pj.I.167. The interrogative and the relative are not so frequent. e.g., kuto pana kāyena....D II.176 "how.... with the body...?"; yato kho Kassapa bhikkhu diṭṭhe va dhamme .....upasampajjā viharati, ayaṃ vuccati....D I.168 "wherefore, Kassapa, a monk in this very life attains to....and abides therein, that is called....". But it is more often found in its original function of denoting "whence". e.g., yato aham pabbajito D II.151 "Since (or whence) I was ordained", implying the limit of reckoning.

b. There are some other old forms mostly in -ā forming and temporal and local adverbs. e.g., catutthajjhānā vuṭṭhatāvā samanantarā Bhagavā parinibbāyī D II.156 "having arisen from the fourth ecstasy the Blessed One passed away immediately"; saññā paṭhamam upajjati pacchā dhānaṃ D I.185 "firstly perception is born, afterwards knowledge"; mā pacchā vipaṭṭi-sārino ahuvatttha D II.147 "do not be repenting later on"; pacchā uppannā D I.18 "produced afterwards". All these imply time. The local sense is expressed only by a few and most of them have gained prepositional force in Pāli. e.g., samantā Vesāliḥ D II.98 "around Vesāli"; antarā magge D II.207 "mid-way on the journey".

c. Similarly the ablatives ettāvatā and kittāvatā are used as adverbs of quantity and degree. e.g., ettāvatā niruttipatho D II.63 "thus far (is) the scope of language";
ettāvatā sammā samucchinno D I.34 "so far well uprooted";
ettāvatā tapo-jigucchā aggappattā D III.48 "by so much (is)
disgust for asceticism brought to the highest pitch"; kītāvatā
cā ānanda attānām paññāpento paññāpenti D II.65 "how far do
those who postulate a Soul do so?"

d. A large number of adverbs belonging to various logival
categories are formed with the suffix -se and have the sense
of ablative adverbs. This is the original function of -so.
e.g., sabbaso jātiyā asati D II.57 "there being no birth in
every way (i.e. completely); ādiso va aparaddham D I.180
"at fault from the very start (initially)"; antamaso kumbha-
dāsiyāpi D I.168,169; M I.286; III.127; A V.195 "even at least
a water-maid"; yoniso paññāṃ pucchitum D I.118 "to ask a
question wisely (lit. according to origin)"; yoniso manasik-
karoṭi D II.214 "reflects over wisely"; sabba-lahuso A IV.247
"as quickly as possible". Similar is the abl. -so in the
frequently occurring phrase bhiyyosomattāya(D II.11 etc.)
"mostly"; bhiyyo < Vedic bhūyas adverbial acc. (cp.VGS §178.2).
With the ablative adverb abhinahas "frequently, always" S I.194
we may compare its acc. used adverbially, viz. abhināha. This
shows how two cases even so apart syntactically as the acc.
and the abl. can meet in the adverbial use.

§ 135. Quasi-legitimate uses of the Abl.

a. We have seen earlier how the suffix -to forms adverbs

1. Comys. equate it to inst. adv. of manner. e.g., 'ayoniso ti
anupāyena' i.e. "tactlessly" Sum.III.810.
with a simple local sense without any implication of separation
but merely denoting the side on which. This suffix was origi-
nally (in I.E.) applied to pronominal stems to form adverbs
of a general character. E.W. Hopkins (J.A.O.S. Vol.38) has
pointed out the fact that Skr. 'ita ehi' does not mean "come
hence" but "come hither". We find this observation supported
also by Pāli idiom. Here ito is found in an adv. sense of "here"
or "hither" and not "from here". e.g., ito hi kho ahaṁ bhante
āgacchāmi samnassā Gotamassa santikā M I.373 "I come here, Sir,
from the presence of the recluse Gotama". Normally the case
ought to be the acc. of place gone to. But since such a use
of the acc. sg. of pronouns is inadmissible— the same exists
in English for we cannot say 'come to this' but 'come here'
the adverbial form ito is employed instead. But once such a
usage came to exist it did not stop with the pronouns, its
legitimate sphere, but came to be regarded as a general
construction and was applied to nouns as well. So we have the
curious use of paralokato "to the other world" for the acc.
paralokam, in the Sutta-Nipāta (579): tesaṁ maccuparetānaṁ
gacchataṁ paralokato "of those subdued by Māra going to the
other world (lit. other-world-wards). Probably the influence
of this confusion of the abl. and the acc. seems to exist in
the stock-phrase 'anāvattidhammo tasā lokā', "not liable to
return from that world", for the BSk. version has the acc.
implying the place gone to as in * tatra perinirvāyinyo (stiriyo)
'nāgāminyo 'nāvṛttikadharmīnyah punar imaṁ lokam' Divyāvadāna
p.532 "....not liable to come back, to this world"
b. The abl. and the inst. show striking similarities in usage and development. We have seen how the inst. forms with the acc. an idiom with various shades of meaning (vide §84). Parallel to this inst.-acc. construction, which we have regarded more or less as adverbial, we have in the Nikāyas an abl.-acc. construction also. e.g.,

hadayā hadayam manne aññeya tacchati M I.32 "knowing heart to heart, methinks, he shapes the felloe" (cp. Dial. I.22 "his heart, methinks, knows my heart, as he shapes that felloe")

cp. anubandhin padā padaṁ Sn 446 "he followed step to step" (lit."from step to step", if we are correct in taking padā as an abl. sg. and not as the old inst. sg. in -ā.). In the gāthā literature again we find the abl. of separation with the acc. of destination used in this manner like the inst.-acc. found in vanena vanam etc. (§84). e.g., gabbhā gabbham tamā tamam Sn 278 "from womb to womb and gloom to gloom";
te mayam vicarissama gāmā gāmanā nagā nagaṁ Sn 180 "we (as such) shall wander from village to village and from hill to hill". The two cases here are to be taken as one whole idiom having the character of an adverbial phrase.
§ 136. The genitive of the sixth case (Pāli chaṭṭhī = Skr. sāṣṭī) is on the whole a dependent case. It is used not only in connection with verbs and substantives but also with adjectives and adverbs (cp. VGS §202). But it is predominantly adnominal and in this respect appears in direct contrast to the acc. As the proper employment of the latter is to qualify the verb, so the gen. is normally used to qualify some other noun. It does so by assigning it to a particular class or description, or by distinguishing it as a part of a whole. So the fundamental notion expressed by it is to mark the belonging to or being part of. This possessive or partitive application admits of the almost universal rendering of the gen. in Pāli as in the older languages by the English of. Generally speaking, with substantives the gen. plays the part of an adj. as seen by the alternate constructions of either compounding it with the substantive qualified as kammāraputta D II.126; A V.263 "artizan-son" for kammārassa putta "son of an artizan", or of using instead of it the derived adj. as rājā Māgadho M I.94 "the Māgadhan King" for rājā Magadhānāṃ "the King of the Magadhāas", and, porisam dhuraṃ Sn 256 for purisassa dhuraṃ, or other adjectival formations such as those with the suffix -ka. As a qualifying word it expresses the most diverse logical relations between the two noun-concepts as in Skr. or even in Latin and Greek (cp. KVG §556 and SS §110).
The adverbial use on the other hand is not so diverse but presents sufficient inter-relations between the noun- and the verb-concept to demand separate investigation. In all such uses the fundamental unity of conception appears to be the partitive notion. Says Brugmann: "As its fundamental character we may abstract (i.e. infer) that in the gen. the noun-concept (Nominal-begriff) appears when the verb concept does not refer to its full range but when the former (noun-concept) is represented as a sphere which is only touched by the action" (KVG § 529). We cannot discern the original relation between the adnominal and the adverbal uses. In spite of the unity of the principal notions expressed there are, at least in Pāli, a good many syntactical divergences.

§ 137. Owing to the predominance of the adnominal connection and its consequent remoteness from the action of the main verb, the local grammarians consider the gen. as falling outside the logical sphere denoted by the term kāraka. According to them, actual relations subsisting between the noun and the verb in a sentence are only expressed by the six genuine kārakas, viz., kartṛ, karman, karaṇa, sampradāna, apādāna and adhikaraṇa. They divide the vibhaktis into two main classes kāraka-vibhakti and upapada-vibhatti, the former having a definite relation to the action (kriyā) and the latter having none. The actions are generally performed by various agents (sādhanā = efficient) which are directly or indirectly related to the verb. The term kāraka is only applied to such. The gen. according to orthodox
opinion is not a sādhana and consequently does not constitute a kāraka\(^1\). It is however disputable whether this observation of the ancient grammarians can be without reservation extended to the whole sphere of the genitive's employment, especially to its adverbial function. On the whole their treatment of this case is not so clear-cut and exhaustive as of the others. In definition of the gen. Pāṇini has only the loose aphorism 'saṣṭi śese' (II.3.50), which the kāśikā explains as meaning "in all other instances, i.e. if none of the other cases enjoined (II.3.1 - 49) be available, one should use the sixth case (vide Speyer, SS p.82,f.n.1.). Kaccāyana attempts a clearer definition when he lays down the rule 'yassa vā pariggaho taṃ sāmi' (235) i.e. "that which has possession is called sāmi", and supplements it later on by saying 'that the sixth case-affix is employed in denoting sāmi (possessor)\(^2\). As for the other notions expressed by the gen. he gives only a few extra rules (305 - 310) which hardly compass even the adnominal uses. This indifferent treatment of the gen. on the part of local grammarians is due to the fact, as we have pointed out before (§30), of their dealing with syntax solely from the point of view of the verb and not viewing the sentence as one psychological unit. The conception of kāraka is only the logical outcome of such an outlook (cp. the meaning of kāraka from kr "to, do or make", denoting action).

2. 'sāmismīṃ chaṭṭhi' Kac.303. Moggallāna has the somewhat abstract definition 'chaṭṭhi sambandhe' (II.41).
§138. As regards form the gen. has on the whole preserved the older case endings. It has even outgrown its legitimate sphere, and, as we have seen earlier (§91), replaced the dat. both in the singular and in the plural, the only surviving dat. form being the one in -āya of the a-declension (§4). The reason of this substitution of the gen. for the dat. in Pāli becomes apparent when we consider that even as early as in the dialect of the Brāhmaṇas that gen. (syntactically) had begun to encroach upon to the proper sphere of the dat.1. In the Epics this replacement has gone even further and in the later classical language almost ousted it from its proper employ, but for a few fundamental uses (vide §§ 86). In Prākṛt the dat. has become obsolete, a few traces of it being only found in the artificial dialect of the dārāmās (SS §100), and in the Asokan inscriptions where a few -ehi forms are preserved (§9). A further point of contact with the dat. is found in the sympathetic use of the enclitic forms me, te and no, vo, to which phenomenon we have already alluded (§102).

§139. Thus in Pāli the sphere of the genitive includes many uses of the dat. in the earlier language. In the great majority of cases we can assign a gen. or dat. to a particular syntactical category only on the analogy of Vedic and Classical Sanskrit. The gen. has also come into contact with the abl., in its adverbial uses such as with verbs of taking, hearing etc. and with the loc. in the partitive and absolute uses. It has,

1. cp. gen. with śraddhā and dā in the Aitareya and such uses as 'tasaḥ ha phalasajite' (VCS §102, B.2a).
moreover, to close affinities to the acc. of external object as with verbs of remembering and imitating, and, to the inst. of agent especially with participles and the inst. of means with such verbs as meaning to fill etc. Most of these uses overlap one another and such divisions as the gen. of possession, of material, of distinction, and of origin or the partitive, subjective and objective gen. and others are made merely made for the sake of convenience; they do not imply that absolute categories are possible. As we have remarked before, the unity of the logical functions of the various genitives remains unaffected (cp. SS §110).

The Genitive with Substantives.

§ 140. The Possessive Gen. represents the simplest syntactical function of that case, viz., of classifying a noun by naming its possessor. It is generally placed before the qualified noun as, for instance, in sabbe Bhagavato puttā S I,192 "all the Blessed One's sons". In verse or poetical prose, however, it is often found following the noun as, for instance, in Puttā Buddhassa orasā S III.83 "sons of the Buddha, self-begotten". Though in this limited sense of denoting the possessor it is apparently a simple construction, what normally passes under the designation 'possessive gen.' is so varied in application that the most different logical relations may find expression by it (cp. SS §110). For instance, in such expressions as Sundarikāya nadiyā tire Sn p.79 "on the bank of the
river S.

and brahmāṇasaṃ pada-saddena Sn p.80 "by the sound of the foot-steps of the of the brahmin", the gen. properly speaking denotes no physical possession at all, the implication is more or less metaphorical. The latter, for instance, clearly means 'brahmāṇasaṃ kata-pada-saddena', and consequently has a logical implication of agency rather than of possession. When the qualifying noun denotes a person and the qualified the result of some action on that person's part, the notion of agency can hardly be overlooked. Thus e.g. in pitu vacanām D III.181 "the father's word", the implied meaning is, like in the above, 'pitarā bhāsitam vacanām'.

§ 141. We may notice the following other relations expressed by this gen.:

a. As in other I.E. languages the gen. in Pāli is capable of standing as the predicate of the whole sentence. e.g., sakam te Mahārāja! D II.173 "all (is) thine, O Great King!". Here there is no doubt that te stands for the gen. and not the dat. (vide P.T.S.Dict. sub saka-).

b. With the verb 'to be' (bhavati) in the sense of "becoming" it is always doubtful whether the case is dat. or gen. of possession. But we may reasonably regard the following as genitives of possession since similar uses exist in the earlier languages (KVG §558.2). e.g., te rañño cakkavattissa anuyuttā suhāsum D III.62 "they became dependents of the universal monarch". This confusion is found even without the verb 'to be' in purely adnominal constructions. For instance, in rogānam
Ayatanam D III.182 the word rogana can mean "a province of diseases" or better perhaps "a province for diseases".

c. Such contact between the sympathetic dat. and the possessive gen. has already been noticed (§102). It is mostly found, as pointed out there, with the enclitic forms of the personal pronouns which, though originally pure datives, are however found as genitives even in Vedic (cp. HKS §11.). In the following examples it is the possessive sense that is more marked: dibbam te cakka-ratanam thanam cutam D III.59 "your divine Gem of the Wheel has fallen from its place"; yava ma idam brahmacariyam na iddham... D II.114 "till this higher life of mine is not complete..."; yattha me assa chando va... tam mam'assa musa D I.25 "where there was desire for me... that was false of me". Here the parallel use of me (dat.) and mama (pure gen. form) side by side shows how far the syntactical confusion has gone.

d. With the relative pronouns the noun to be qualified may not immediately follow the gen. of possessor, which thereby assumes a rôle different from the above sense. e.g., ...yassa kho pan'assa Vaseṣṭha Tathāgate saddhā nivṛtthā... D II.84 "lit. of whom would, O Vaseṣṭha, faith be placed in the T..."; santi bhante devā yesam na sakkā gaṇanāya vā saṅkhāto vā āyum saṅkhātum D III.111 "there are gods, Sir, of whom it is impossible either by reckoning or counting, to number the years (span of life)".

§ 142. The subjective Gen. can also be regarded as an exten-
sion of the possessive gen. (cp. KVG §559) since the verbal noun qualified represents some action of the person denoted by the noun in the gen. (vide §140). But more particularly it denotes agency as shown by the following examples where the action is expressed by a p.p.p. in -ta: imassa ca bhikkhuno duggahitaṃ D II.124 "also a mis-conception of this monk"; paresaṃ subhāsitaṃ D I.3 "good-speech (lit. well-spoken) of others". We may observe from these examples that the gen. in such instances is interchangeable with the inst. of agent (§83). Orthodox grammarians are divided on the question whether these two constructions are universally interchangeable. According to Pāṇinī the inst. is of necessity if the verbal noun be attended by its subject and its object at the same time. This is understandable since otherwise the presence of two genitives would lead to confusion. Speyer considers that we may extend this observation to all such instances as where the subjective gen. would be used together with some other sixth case (SS §114). But according to other Indian authorities the gen. of the subject is nowhere forbidden (ibid). On the whole the observation of Pāṇinī seems applicable to Pāli concinnity as well. In fact here the gen. even seems to be preferred with most participles of clearly nominal standing, and in the following example, coming as it is after the verbal noun, the gen. conspicuously possesses the agent sense: na kho Tapassi ācinnam Tathāgatassā dandaṃ dandaṇti paññāpetum M I.373 "it is not the practice of the Tathāgata, Tapassi, to lay down punishment as punishment".
b. In such instances as those discussed above the gen. can be interchanged with the inst. of agent and implies kārtrī, the agent of a passive (hence originally transitive) verb. But when the verbal noun is formed from an intransitive verb the gen. seems to denote not the agent to be expressed by the inst. but the subject implying an original nom., e.g., iti rūpassa samuddayo M I.61 "so the arising of form"; paṭīgha-saṅgānakatthaṅgā D III.262 "by the disappearance of ideas of ill-will"; catuṇṇam māsānām accayena Sn p.102 "on the lapse of four months". In the first example, for instance, the idea implicit cannot be paraphrased by 'rūpāna samuddayo' as in paresāhī subhāsītam for paresām subhāsītam but must be taken as 'iti rūpāṇa samuddoti'.

c. With other types of verbal nouns where there is no participial sense and the verbal element is less emphasized, neither the inst. of agent nor the nom. of subject can possibly be substituted. e.g., idam pacchimakaṁ Ānanda Tathāgatassā Vesāli-dassanam bhavissati D II.122 "This, Ānanda, shall be Tathāgata's last sight of Vesāli (lit. Vesāli-seeing)"; rāgāṇaṃ niyyānaṁ bhavissati D I.9 "there will be an exit of kings". Here the gen. being used along with the verb 'to be' has a strong possessive sense. The latter example clearly borders on the subjective and possessive gen.

§ 143. The Objective Gen. is not so frequent as the above, since usually Pāli prefers to retain the acc. even with verbal nouns. e.g., Bhagavatam dāsanaṇāya M II.23,46; A I.121; III.381
"for seeing the Blessed One". But the dat. of purpose dassanāya has greater verbal force than any other type of nomina verbalia, being more or less an infinitive (§ 107.a). Even in such instances, however, one not rarely comes across the gen. of object. e.g., ariyānaṃ dassanāya Dh 206 "for the seeing of the noble ones" (i.e. in order to see the noble ones); manobhāvanīyānaṃ pi bhikkhūnaṃ asamayo dassanāya D III.36 "it is not the time even for the seeing of self-composed monks".

a. It is frequently found with primary nominal formations formed by adding such suffixes as -a to the root. In such cases the gen. is almost of necessity and qualifies the noun. e.g., catunnaṃ bhikkhave dhammānaṃ ananubodhā......, D II.122 "Brethren, owing to the non-understanding of four things"; Tathāgatassa pūjāya D II.137 "for the honouring of the T."; lobho cittassa upakkileso D I.91 "greed is a defilement of the heart".

b. With verbs of motion the normal construction is to retain the acc. of destination or the corresponding dat.. But when the motion implied is towards a person the gen. is used similar to the objective gen. e.g., upasaṅkamanāṃ pāhaṃ bhikkhave tesam bhikkhūnaṃ bahukāraṃ vadāmi S V.67 "even the approaching (going to) of those monks, brethren, I say is of advantage".

c. With the so-called nomina agentis or agent-nouns the gen. and acc. are promiscuously employed. (vide §33.). It must be stated, however, that with those formed with the suffix -tr (Pāli -tā) the acc. seems to be favoured, while the gen. is
the commoner idiom with those having possessive sense such as
-vin and -in (f.-ini). are used with e.g., Evan opanayikassa
dhammassa desetâram D II.222,228 "the preacher of a such a
redeeming doctrine"; ariyanaṁ adassävi M I.1 "a non-beholder
of Noble Ones"; lâbhinî Bodhisatta-matâ hoti pañcannam kâma-
gunânam D II.13 "the mother of the 'Being destined for Enlight-
enment' is receiver of the five-fold pleasures".

§ 144. The Partitive Genitive/ proper denotes the whole, a
part of which is meant by the qualified word as in bhâgo mara-
ṇassa Sn 427 "a share of death", bhâgi āyussa A II.80,III.42
"having a share of life" or kîncideva desam vâcâya A V.39 "a
certain portion of the speech".

a. But the more frequent type of this gen. in Pâli is that
which carries the notion of selecting or distinguishing out of
a multitude, usually of persons but sometimes even of things.
In this case it is interchangeable with the loc. of the persons
among whom (§167). In fact the two cases occur side by side
in the same context. e.g., Katî jâgaratâm suktâ, katî suttesu
jâgarâ S I.3 (V.) "How many are the sleeping among the wake,
how many are awake among the sleeping?". From the following
examples it may be observed that in Pâli as in Skr. (SS §116)
the partitive gen. may not only attend substantives but all
kinds of pronouns and adjectives. Such a gen. may also appear
in various logical connections.

b. With certain adjectives and nouns it denotes the person
or thing that is distinguished from the rest. e.g., tvam yeva
nesaṃ eko cakkhumā D I.191 "you alone are the seeing among them", or that which is selected out of many. e.g., imesaṃ tīnnaṃ aṅgānaṃ jātiṃ ṭhapayāma D I.121 "of these three factors let us keep birth aside".

c. With numerals grammatically denoted by substantives as satam, sahassam etc. the nouns qualifying are put in the gen. case. This is called the genitive-attribute (PLS §117.3).

e.g., bhiyco naṃ satasahassam/payiupāsati D II.256 "a hundred-thousand (of) yakkhas worship him". Here the nom. of apposition is the parallel construction (§24.c).

d. With indefinite pronouns such as aṇṇataro, aṇṇatamo, eko etc. it denotes inclusion among a group or class. e.g., etesaṃ vā aṇṇatarena D I.21 "or by one or the other of the same"; aṇṇataro ca kho pan'āyasma Kassapo arahatam ahohi D I.177 "the ven. Kassapa will indeed be one among the saints"; tesaṃ aham aṇṇatamo M I.17 "of them I am one".

e. With substantives and adjectives denoting mastery and power it takes a slightly different turn of meaning and can be rendered by the English over. e.g., evaṃ mahiddhiko kho bhikkhave sīho migaṛjā tiracchānagatānaṃ pañānaṃ, evaṃ mahe-sakkho...S III.85 "so powerful indeed, monks, is the lion, the king of beasts, over beings of the animal class, so majestic...."; Satthā devamanussānaṃ M I.69 "The Master of gods and men".

f. When option between two persons or things is intended the persons or things considered in making the comparison are put in the gen. case. Here it closely resembles the gen. of
the persons regarding whom a statement is made (i.e. the gen. of relation, §156). e.g., ko nu kho āyasmantānaṃ sukhviharitarorājā vā Māgadho...āyasmā vā Gotamo M I.94 "of you two honourable ones, who is the more happy-living, the king of Magadha...or the van. Gotama?"; ayam imesam dvinnam puggalānaṃ......hīnāpuriso akkāyati M I.25 "he of these two persons appears as the lesser one".

With superlatives or adjectives having superlative sense such as those meaning first, last, foremost etc. a similar gen. of the persons (or things) of whom, from amongst or regarding whom the statement is made, is frequently found. e.g., khattiyo dvipadam seṭṭho S I.6 (V.) "the warrior is the best among bipeds (i.e. two-footed beings)"; ye te ahesuṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ pubbakā D I.104 "those who were the foremost of the brahmins"; gimiṃanaṃ pacchime māse M I.306 "in the last month of the summer (lit. of the warm months)"; pañcannamaṃ bhikkhu satānaṃ pacchimako bhikkhu D II.155 "the last (monk) of the five hundred monks".

Even with adjectives of equality and identity or those of superiority such as sadiso and visiṭṭho this gen. is commonly employed. This sometimes gives rise to a double genitive, for the gen. of comparison (§ 151.b.) may also appear side by side with it, as in the following example: nāssa hoti koci paññāya sadiso vā visiṭṭho vā sabba-sattānaṃ D III.158 "of all beings, there is no one who is equal to him or superior". Of course assa here may as well stand for the dat. (§1104), or may be alternately expressed by the inst. (§§85,86) or the abl. (§132)
§ 145. The Gen. of the Material may also be regarded as expressive of the partitive notion (cp. KVG §559). This is comparable to the gen. of material or stock drawn upon, found with verbs of filling and lacking in Latin and Greek and generally comes under the so-called Genitivus Materialis et Originis though in Pāli, just as in Skr. (SS §113), the pure gen. of origin is not very frequent. It is only found adverbially with the verb pāhoti (Skr. prabhavati = originate) "to rise from". (e.g., yato cāyām Gāgā nadī pāhoti S II.184 "whence arises the river Ganges", where yato is the abl. representing more normal construction, whereas the gen. occurs only in instances of a metaphorical nature such as sammādiṭṭhissa, bhikkhave, sammāsaṅkappo pāhoti M III.76 "right aspiration originates from (lit.of) right views"). In Pāli the gen. usually expresses the substance or thing of which something else or some object is made, consists of, full of or is laden with. The following distinctions may be observed.

a. When the qualified noun denotes an artificial product, the gen. always expresses the material of which the former is made. e.g., suvānṇassā pabhassarāṇi Sn 48 "ornaments of gold". This is, however, not found in prose; but the gen. denoting that of which something else consists occurs though not frequently. e.g., aṅgulīnāṃ mālāṃ M II.98 "a necklace of fingers".

b. When it is attended by the actual verb of making or preparing etc. the gen. seems to border on the inst. of means. It is then, so to speak, half-way between the adnominal and

1. cp. Buckland Green 'Notes on Greek and Latin Syntax' §46.3.
the adverbial constructions. e.g., sālinām odanaṃ (racayitvā) M I.31 "having prepared a meal of rice"; mahantam hiraṇa-suvaṇṇassā puṇjaṃ kārāpetvā M II.63 "having caused a great heap of gold and bullion to be piled up"; pāṇīyaṃ khādani-yaṃ bhajanīyaṃ paṭiyādāpetvā pāṇḍuṁūṭikassāḥ sālino... M II.56 "having prepared excellent hard and soft food (consisting) of the choicest golden rice". That in such instances the verb is not of necessity and the gen. can be purely adnominal is shown by the example udakassa dhārā D II.15 "torrents of water", where it borders on the descriptive gen.

c. When the qualified noun denotes a limited space to be filled, the gen. of the material is logically related to the gen. with adjectives and verbs of filling (§§151.b.ii. & 149). e.g., unphodakassa kējam S I.175 "a pail of hot water" (i.e. a pail full of...); pāṇcamattāni taṇḍulavāhasatāni pāhesi pāṇḍuṁūṭikassāḥ sālino M II.54 "sent about 500 cart-loads of the choicest golden rice".

d. As partitive genitives, the above uses may be said to express logically the notion of quantity. Closely related to this is the gen. of description expressive of quality. This is generally known as the gen. of quality (KVG §559). It is however not so frequent in Pāli or Skr. as in Latin and Greek. e.g., (kusāvatiyā)catunnaṃ vaṇṇānaṃ dvārāni ahosi D II.170 "In Kusāvatī there were doors of four colours". This may also mean "there were gates for the four castes", in which case vaṇṇānam would be the dat. of interest.
§ 146. It is not to be expected that the whole sphere of the adnominal genitive's use is included in the categories established in the preceding paragraphs. No divisions can be absolute or exhaustive in treatment. There are bound to be many other uses which may or may not fall within such categories. A most abstract use of the gen. is to be found in the construction with such causal postpositions as hetu and kāraṇā, which are both ablatives (cp. §122.d & §13). There is however the parallel construction of compounding these (especially hetu) with the preceding noun, which would otherwise be put in the gen. (cp. §136). E.g., atta-hetu M III.43 "due to himself"; vedanāhetu M II.216 "due to sensation"; cīvarahetu A I.147 "for the sake of a robe". According to Pāṇini the sixth case-affix is to be employed in the construction with hetu1. The vārttika illustrates this by 'annasya hetor vasati' "lives by reason of food". Pāli follows the same usage with both hetu and kāraṇa. E.g., issariyassa kāraṇā D I.84 "by reason of glory" (i.e. for the sake of glory); yāsam...hetu brahmācariyaṃ carasītī M II.46 "owing to whom...you live the Holy Life"; accharanām hetu M II.64 "owing to heavenly damsels"; puttadārassa hetu M II.187 "for the sake of child and wife". On the analogy of these examples we may not hesitate to place in this category the form kissa found in the frequent interrogative phrase tam kissa hetu D II.14; M I.1; A II.31, as a genitive qualifying hetu. Consequently kissa here is pronominal substantive and not adj. as in kissa...kammassa D II.185; it is not to be confused with the later adv. Kissā "why". (cp. §131.122).
Several classes of verbs are construed with a gen. Most of these adverbal uses correspond to the adnominal constructions discussed above. In the majority of instances the gen. in special connection with verbs appears concurrently for an acc., inst., or abl. and sometimes even for the loc. Generally speaking it is the partitive notion that underlies such functions. One hardly meets with adverbal genitives expressive of the idea of possession in Pāli (of the Nikāyas) as found in Skr. with verbs of owning and ruling such as prabhū, Is, and Vedic rāj and kāi (VGS §202). But there is a considerable number of verbs construed with the gen. having a sense analogous to that of the acc., but, with this difference: that unlike the latter it expresses that the action affects the object not as a whole, but only in part. It is used with verbs having the following senses:

a. remembering, thinking of; e.g., nāgavanassa sumarati Dh 224 "thinks of the elephants' haunts".

b. imitating, following; taṁ tassa anugam hoti S I.72 "it follows him"; cp. evaṁ gihi nānukaroti bhikkhuno Sn 221 "so the householder imitates not the monk". In such instances, however, the prefix anu- also favours construing with the gen. e.g., dhammassa cānudhammaṁ vyākaronti M I.368 "preach what is consistent with the doctrine". A similar gen. is found with the verb anumodāmi in the sense of "appreciate". e.g., N'eva kho tyāham brāhmaṇa anumodāmi na paṭikkosāmi A II.36 "brahmin,
I appreciate you nor blame you". Skr. grammarians are at a loss to explain these uses. They regard them as anomalies.

c. It is also found with verbs having the sense of desiring of, expecting of etc. e.g., yassa dāni devaśa icchissati Brahmat Sanañkumāro D II.210 "of whichever god the Brahma S. now desires (anything)". A similar construction is found with the gerundive pāṭikaṅkham. e.g., Saddhassa hi Sāriputta ariyasāvakassa etam pāṭikaṅkham S V.226 "Of the faithful Aryan disciple, Sāriputta, this should be expected".

d. In the gāthā literature are found a few verbs of harming, robbing, plundering and conquering, construed with a similar gen. e.g., ahāsi me Dh 3 "he robbed me"; Alopati sahasa yo paresam Th 1.743 "who forcibly plunders others"; uccāvacēh'upāyehi paresam ahbijigīsati Th 1.743 "by various means he (cheats, harms or) overcomes others". As rendering of this rare verb Mrs. Rhys Davids has 'cheat' and Neumann 'vernichten'. But P.T.S.Dict. prefers 'overcome' or 'covet', after Comy. 'jīnītur icchati' (on J.VI.193). It should, however, literally mean "desire to kill", since it is the desiderative of han, normally reading 'jigīmsati'.

§ 148. A peculiar idiom is found with the verb jānāti, which with a sense different from the usual "to know" (like vid-), seems to be construed with a gen. According to Pāṇini (II.3.51) jā is to be employed in agreement with the gen. of the...
instrument (karāṇa); then ānā must not be equivalent to vid but, says the kāśikā, must mean "to wean, fancy or have an opinion of". In certain contexts in the Nikāyas jānāti construed with the gen. seems to exhibit this last sense, and, hence imply a partitive notion. e.g., na tvam tāta Raṭṭhapāla kassaci dukkhaśa jānāsi M II.56 (cp.60) "dear R., you know not of any sorrow". Here, the Comy. points out, the exact meaning is "you have no experience even of a little of sorrow" (appamattakam pi kālabhāgaṃ dukkhaśa). In this example the gen. certainly expresses the thing of or regarding which there is knowledge, and is comparable with the English expression 'to know of any sorrow'. But there are other uses of this verb, which, though similar in meaning to the above, are still logically different. e.g., ko nu kho pana bho jānāti jīvitānaṃ D II.233(246) "lit. who indeed knows of the living". Here the context shows that the meaning is "entitled to have an opinion of", as the P.T.S. translation goes: "who indeed can answer for the (survival of) the living". With ājānāti however the case is the dat. since the same is found in Skr. e.g., Āmagandhe...bhāsamānassa na ājānāmi D II.242 "I do not understand you speaking about...the smell of raw flesh".

§ 149. An inst.-like gen. is found with verbs having the sense of fullness and satisfaction. (cp.88 §123.6). Though these verbs pūrati, tappati etc. are often construed with a gen. the more logical construction seems to be with the inst. of means. e.g., dvinnam...dhammānāṃ atitto...mātugāmo
kālam karoti A I.78 "unsatiated with two... things, the female dies"; cp. puriso pāyātāsa sattatī J I.135 "the man is satisfied with the milk-rice"; dhīro pūrati puṣṇāsa Dh 122 "the wise man is filled with merit"; nivesanāni...nānādhaṇṇāsa pūretrā Sān 305 "having filled the dwellings... with various kinds of grain". With verbal nouns, especially nomina agentis, formed from these roots, the gen. of filling falls into the category of the objective gen. e.g., labhati lūkhasa vā paṃtāsa vā bhojanāsa yāvadatthan pāripūri D iiii.267 "he obtains sātīty (lit. fulfilment) in (lit. of) gross or excellent food". In such cases even the loc. is admissible.

§ 150. The abl.-like gen. (SS §125) occurs with certain verbs where some notion of separation or distance or some such ablative function seems to be implied. We have already referred to the gen. used with local adverbs such as dakkhina, uttara, and sammaḥ, denoting the point from which distance or direction is reckoned (§130) and the gen. of origin employed instead of the corresponding abl. with the verb pahoti (§145). As Spayer points out (SS §125) the gen. is admissible in such instances when there is at the same time room for the conception of belonging to (being part of) and that of proceeding from.

a. With such verbs as paṭiṃghāti the person from whom something is received is denoted by the gen. In the following example the presence of the participle gives a semi-absolute appearance to the construction: paṭiṃghāti... na dvinnām
bhunājanānam M I.307 "he does not receive...from two people at meals". The same verb in its metaphorical sense of "accepting a confession" follows a similar construction (cp. SS §83.6 & Pāṇ. I.IV.41). e.g., yo ca accayam desantassa yathā-dhammanā patigānḥati S I.239 "who does not pardon (lit. accept of) one confessing a transgression, according to the Doctrine"; or with semi-absolute sense: parassā kho pana accayam desantassa yathā-dhammanā nappatigānḥati A I.103 "he does not pardon one confessing..." etc. or "he does not accept when one makes a confession...". The verb ādiyanti in the sense of "taking the word" (Comys. 'vacanam na karonti' i.e. "obey") may admit of a similar gen. e.g., mahārājānam na ādiyanti D III.204 "they do not heed or obey the great kings"; later on the same page: n'eva rañño Māgadhassā ādiyanti. It is however not quite certain whether this is the gen. or the dat. with verbs of listening to like suṣṭusati etc. (§94.b.).

b. With verbs of hearing, especially sunāti, the gen. seems to be the general construction, the abl. being hardly ever found in the Nikāyas (§125.b.). This may be regarded as a gen. expressive of the origin of sound or the source from which the perception comes. e.g., āyasmato Sāriputtassa sutvā bhikkhū dhāresanti M I.14,46 "having heard from (lit. heard of, i.e. learnt of) the ven. S. the monks will take (it) to heart" (cp. D II.2,148); na aññassa samānassā vā brāhmaṇassā sutvā A I.142; M III.186 "not having heard from another recluse or brahmin..."; Tesam sutvā D III.61 "hearing from
them". Even with passive forms of this verb the gen. is preserved. e.g., tesañca sotabbam maññissanti A IV.16 "lit. they think it should be heard of them" i.e. "they think they should be heard". In the above examples the gen. denotes the person from whom one learns or hears and is therefore logically parallel to the abl. But when the gen is attended by participles of verbs denoting talking, sounding, howling, conversing etc. the construction not only appears to be semi-absolute but seems to be used in place of an acc. rather than an abl., though at the same time it expresses the source of sound. e.g., assuttha no tumhe...siŋgālassa vassamānānassa S II.271 "did you not hear the jackal howling....?"; nāmāni me kittayato suṇātha M III.69 "hear me repeating the names" i.e."listen while I am repeating..."(absolute); assosi kho āyasmā Amuru-ddho dāyapālassa Bhagavatā saddhim mantayamānassā M I.205 "the ven. Anuruddha heard the Blessed One talking with the park-keeper"; assosi kho āyasmā Sāriputto Sunakkhattassa Licchaviputtassa parisatiṁ vācaṁ bhāsamānassā M I.68 "the ven. Sāriputta heard Sunakkhotta the Licchavi speaking these words among the rabble". In such cases the Comys. supply the implied object, usually 'saddam', in their paraphrase. e.g., for sutvā devassa vassato Sn 30, the Comy. has 'vassato saddam sutvā' (Pj.II.p.42). But the acc. of the object may not be always implied, since the verb suṇāti can occur with an intransitive sense, as for instance in: kinti te sutam brāhmaṇānāṁ...bhāsamānānāṁ D I.104 (cp. D II.237) "What! have you heard from the brahminā...speaking".
c. Similar to the above ablative gen. is that which is expressive of the source of fear with verbs of fearing such as bhāyati "fear", tasati "tremble at" and āsāṅkati "suspect". The abl. too is found in the Nikāyas, but only with noun bhayam and never adverbally, (§122.e.). Here the local grammarians regard the abl. as the proper case. Kaccāyana’s rule dutivā pañcaminām (311) is interpreted by the vātti as meaning that the sixth case-affix is used sometimes (kvaci) instead of the second and the fifth, examples for the latter being those such as 'sukhassa bhāyāmi' etc. The acc. however is rarely found with the verb bhāyati as in bhāyasi mām sāmanā ti Sn p.48 "do you fear me, recluse?"; it appears to be almost of necessity when the object to be feared is a person (§36.a.). Otherwise the gen. is the commoner adverbal construction. e.g., kim nu kho aham tassa sukhassa bhāyāmi M I.247 "what! indeed, do I fear that happiness?"; na bhāyitabbaṃ etassa sukhassāti vadāmi M I.454; III.2337 "I declare that one should not fear this happiness". In verse however the gen. is found even with personal nouns, e.g., sabbe bhāyanti Maccuno Dh 129 "all fear Death", or adnominally, e.g., kālassā meghassa bhayena tajjita Th I.308 "oppressed with fear of the black cloud". The verb tasati occurs only in verse in this construction. e.g., sabbe tasanti danḍassa Dh 129 "all tremble at punishment". But āsāṅkati is found even in prose with the gen. e.g., Ṭena kho pana samayena rājā Māgadho Ajātasattu Vedehiputto Rājagahaṃ patisaṅkhārāpeti rañño Pajjotassa āsāṅkamamāno M III.7 "at that time Ajātasattu King of Magadha, son of Vedehi, was fortī
fykng Rājagaha out of suspicions for the King Pajjota". In
Skr. however āsaṅk "to suspect" takes the gen. with the prefix
abhi- and the acc. when it is used with ā- (cp. Cappeller's Dict.)

§ 151. The Gen. with Adjectives.

We have already referred to the gen. used with verbal
adjectives implying 'possession' such as those ending in -vin
(f. -vinI) and -in (f. -inI). When formed from transitive roots
these agree with an objective gen. (§143.c.). A similar gen.
is found with upādāya which, though a gerund in form, is still
capable of qualifying a noun as much as an adj. e.g., catunnaṃ
mahābhūtānaṃ upādāya rūpaṃ M I.185 "whatever form depends on
the four great elements". But apart from being used parallel
to the acc., the gen. with some other adjectives appears in
place of a loc., inst. or dat., at least from a logical point
of view.

a. With adjectives of knowledge, skill and experience the
gen. of the thing in which one is skilled etc. is logically
akin to the acc. with transitive verbs (SS §124.III.). But
the concurrent idiom is the loc. of relation, owing to the
fact that the noun in the gen. with such adjectives expresses
that regarding which one is skilled etc. (§175.a.). Kaccāyana
enjoins the use of the gen. in place of the loc. with such
words by the rule 'chaṭṭhī ca' (310), which according to the
vuttī is to be taken as implying that the sixth case-affix is
employed instead of the third and seventh (laid down in the
previous rule 'tatiyā sattamīnañca'-309) optionally (kvaci).
It is found in the Nikayas with such adjectives as: kevali "perfected, expert"; e.g., brahmaceriyassa kevali A II.23 "perfected in the Higher Life" or "expert of the Higher Life"; kusala "clever, skilled"; e.g., purso kusalo bherisaddassa A II.185 "a man clever in the tone of the drum"; kusalo aham rathassa anagapaccanga nam M I.395 "I am skilled in the parts and accessories of the chariot"; imesa dhammamaam sukusalo D I.180 "extremely gifted in these things"; akusala imassa lokassa M I.225 "having no knowledge of (unversed in) matters of this world"; kovido "adept, proficient"; e.g., yogakkhemassa pathassa skovido Th 1.69 "proficient in the path of deliverance" ariyadharmassa skovido M I.1 "with no knowledge of the Noble Doctrine". With kovido the gen. is logically quite similar to the objective gen. But the concurrent construction is with the loc. as seen by the corresponding gloss 'ariyadhamme akusalo' (Ps.I.p.22). The addition of prefixes (negative etc.) to these various adjectives does not necessitate the alteration of the construction, as may be seen from the above uses with skovido, akusalo, sukusalo etc.

b. With adjectives of likeness, equality and similarity and of fulness or completeness, the gen. is parallel to the inst., of comparison in the former case, and of means (in the narrower sense) in the latter case.

i. The notion of comparison can be diversely signified in Pali as in Skr. In certain nuances the inst. (§§85,86) or the abl. (§132) of comparison are even preferred. With those denoting superiority or inferiority and even of equality etc. the dat.
is also perhaps used in the Nikāyas (vide §110). With such adjectives as sadiss, samsa, samasa and sādhāraṇa, however, the case is more likely to be the gen., considering the popularity of this construction in Skr. (SS §§124.4. & 61). Here the inst., just as in the earlier language, is particularly concurrent, but the abl. cannot be applied as all these adjectives denote "similarity", and thus implying no "distinction" (vibhātta) for the latter to be permissible. e.g., so mātu pi sadiso pitu pi sadiso M II.153 "he is like his mother and also his father"; assa...sadiso D III.158 "equal to him"; attano samasa samam D I. 174 "equal to himself". With nīcataram, acc. adverb from the comparative stem nīcatara-, it is either the dat. or the gen. that is used. e.g., nīcataram Bhagavato S I.144 "lower than the Blessed One". Here the abl. would be the more logical case, but the gen. is frequent with other local adverbs in the Nikāyas ($153).

ii. The gen. found with adjectives of fulness such as punna and pūra can be regarded as the adnominial corresponding to the adverbal use discussed above($149). The parallel idiom with the inst., however, cannot be used with the adjectives, since these (not being verbs) do not imply means. e.g., nagaram...punnam sāsparānam S II.182 "the city...full of mustard"; pūram hiraṇṇa suvannassa kumbhim D II.176 "a pot full of gold and bullion"; ayaṃ Aciravati nadi pūrā udakassa D I.224 "this river A. is full of water"; pūrā anāgarānam M I.365 "full of ambers"; pūrannānappakārassa asucino M I.57 "full of all kinds of filth". This seems to be one of the oldest functions of the gen. in I.E. (cp. Latin gen. c. planus).
c. We have already discussed the gen. employed with certain verbs derived from the root \( \text{jn}\) prefixed by anu- or \( \text{a-} \) (§148). A similar gen. is found with with verbal adjectives belonging to the same root, especially with samanu\( \text{n}\)na "approving of" or "favourable to". e.g., na p\( \text{\-n}\)am atip\( \text{\-t}\)ayato samanu\( \text{n}\)na hoti D III.48 "he is not approving of one taking life"; samanu\( \text{n}\)na me Satth\( \text{\-a} \) S I.1 "the Teacher is favourable to me". The gen. in these cases, however, is not a certainty since in even in Skr. the dat. is applicable with some verbs from \( \text{jn}\). For instance, with \( \text{\-n}\)\( \text{\-\-n}\)\( \text{n}\)\( \text{\-n}\)\( \text{\-}\) \(\text{\-n}\)ati "to learn or understand" the acc. of the thing, or the dat. or the loc. of the person, is quite frequent. (vide Cappeller's Dict. s.v.). But the thing approved of is found in the Nik\( \text{\-\-a} \)yas with the loc. e.g., samphappal\( \text{\-\-p}\)pe ca samanu\( \text{n}\)na hoti A V.305 "he is approving of frivolous talk"; adinn\( \text{\-\-n}\)\( \text{\-d}\)\( \text{\-n}\)\( \text{\-n}\)\( \text{\-n}\)a veramaniy\( \text{\-\-a} \) ca samanu\( \text{n}\)na hoti A II.253 "he is also approving of abstinence from taking what is not given".

§ 152. Dat.-like Gen. with Adjectives.

We have seen earlier (§138) how the gen. in the older language had encroached upon the syntactical sphere proper to the dat. and ousted it from many of its legitimate uses. The fact was noticed even by early Skr. grammarians (cp. P\( \text{\-n}\)\( \text{\-n}\)ini 'caturthyarthe bahula\( \text{\-\-n}\)' II.3.62). This replacement has proceeded in the adjectives on a wider scale. Speyer calls such uses in Skr., where the forms show the actual case unlike in P\( \text{\-\-\-}\)li in which the dat. and gen. are for the most part identical, the dat.-like gen. So with adjectives of friendship and enmity,
good and evil, fitness and unfitness etc. we find a gen. (in Skr.) apparently for the dat.. Since there is no reason to suppose that Pāli retained the dat. with such adjectives, it seems not unjustifiable to regard the following -sa forms as genitives. The dat. if used in such cases would express the point of view (cp. KVG §554.4).

a. It is especially the case with adjectives having the sense of pleasing to. e.g., pitā puttānaṃ piyo hoti D II.178 "the father is dear to (or beloved of) his sons"; bahunā janassā piyo ahosi D II.19 "he was beloved of many people"; so even with compounds where the first member is such an adj.: piyaddassino hoti bahunā janassā D III.167 "has a pleasing appearance for many people" (lit. has an appearance beloved of many people). With the enclitic pronouns it is very doubtful whether the case is gen. at all. e.g., na kho me tām pāṭirūpaṃ D II.30 "it is indeed not fit for me" (cp. dat. §108).

b. With passive participles used as adjectives the gen. not only denotes the people concerned but borders on the function of agency (§154). e.g., Samanā...Gotamo rāñño Pasenadī Kosalassā sakkato garukato mānito pūjito D I.116 "the recluse...Gotama is respected, honoured, revered and worshipped of King Pasenadī of Kosala"; avāhā-vivāhakānaṃ apatthī hoti mittāmaccaṇaṃ paribhūto hoti D III.183 "unwanted of those giving or taking in marriage and despised of friends and colleagues"; sādhussammato bahunājanassā D I.47; II.150; Sn p.92 "well-revered of many people"; ekeṣaṃ samaṇa-brāhmaṇānaṃ sāmaṇḍa-saṅkhātā ... D I.166 "regarded as compatible with recluse-ship of (i.e. by) some recluse and brahmins."
§ 153. The Gen. with Adverbs.

In connection with the abl.-like gen. (§150) we had occasion to mention its use with adverbs derived from nouns such as dakkhinato etc. where the gen. marks that of which a region or direction is considered, thus psychologically coinciding with the ablative notion of that from which direction or distance is reckoned. The use of the gen. in such instances is due to the slight partitive sense implied, whereas the abl. should be the more logical construction. However the local grammarians regard the gen. as of necessity in such cases, (vide Pāṇ. II.3.30), an observation supported by the fact that in the actual literature the abl. though logically proper is never found with these regional adverbs (whether in -to or -ena) the gen. being the only construction. It is so even in the Vedas (VGS §202.D.) and the language of the Nikāyas is no exception.

a. Adverbs in -to are always construed with the gen. e.g., dakkhinato nagarassa D II.321 "on the south of the city"; pācinato Rājagahassa D II.263 "on the east of Rajagaha"; With those ending in -ena, the kāśikā on Pāṇ. II.3.31 allows optional construction with gen. or acc. (§53). But the former seems to be the more usual even here with those signifying regions or quarters. e.g., puratthimena nagarassa M I.343 "(by) the east of the city"; uttarena Manasākaṭassa D I.235 "to (lit. by) the north of the Manasākaṭa". But even with other adverbs in -ena the gen. is not unusual though the acc. is by far the more frequent. e.g., antareṇa yamakasālāṇaṃ D II.169 (134,137)
b. Pāṇini allows optional construction with abl. or gen. of all words meaning far and near (II.3.34). Pāli grammarians permit the use of the abl. acc. or inst. (vide vutti on Kac.277 'dūratthā and 'antikatthe'). But the only cases attested in the Nikāya prose are the abl. and the gen., the former being restricted to pronominal forms (ito and tato, vide §131.b) and the latter being used with all types of nouns. e.g., Bhagavato santike D II.162 "near the Blessed One (lit. in the proximity of the Blessed One)"; Vedehi-puttassa avidūra D I.94 "at no distance from the son of Vedehi"; Amuruuddhassa santike sammukhe SV.294 "in the presence of A."; so nātidūre nācāsanne āsana­ssa parivattati M II.138 "he takes his position neither at too great a distance nor in too close proximity of the seat"; avidūre ambavanassa M II.141 "in the vicinity of the mango-grove".

c. Finally there is the gen. employed with adverbial prepositions such as heṭṭhā "below" and upari "above" (cp.VGS §202.D). Here too the abl. is the concurrent idiom. e.g., tassa eva pasādassa heṭṭhā D I.198 "below that storey". In the post-canonical works this gen. is widely used to denote many turns of expression. With reference to space it is used in the sense of "on top of, on, upon" as in kassa upari sāpo patissati Dh A.I. 4, or with reference to time as in catunnam māsānaṃ upari.

§ 154. The Inst.-like Gen.

We have seen how the subjective gen. can sometimes be used for the agent (cp.SS §§66;129.R.2) when the noun qualified
is a p.p.p. (§142). When the participle has a predicative force, as is frequently the case in Pāli just as in Skr., the gen. is clearly used instead of the inst. of agent. This is found with all types of verbs. e.g., Mayham kho bhikkhave.... anuttaras vimutti anuppattā § I.105 "the highest emancipation, brethren,... has been attained by me"; suto nu bhavatāḥ Asito Devalo istā ti? M II.186 "have you heard of the sage A.D.? "; amatāḥ tesam bhikkhave aparibhuttam yesam kāyagatāsatī aparibhuttā A I.45 "immortality has not been realized by them, by whom full awareness of body has not been experienced"; kodhā ca pana asa esa vācā bhāsīta M I.68 "through anger were these words spoken by him"; Tathāgatassa... cattāro iddhipāda bhāvitā D II.103 "the four bases of supernormal powers have been cultivated by the T."; Itthan Bhagavā Sakkasa devānaṁ indassa paññam puṣṭho vyākāsi D II.279 "in this wise did the Blessed One explain being questioned by Sakka, the lord of gods" viditaṁ hi bhante tassa purisassā M I.365 "it is known, Sir, by that man..."; dīgham addhānaṁ sandhāvitaṁ samsaritaṁ mamaṁe'eva tumhākaṁca ti D II.90 "a long course (of lives) has been traversed and gone through both by me and you" (Comy. 'mayā ca tumēhi ca' Sum.II. p.543). We may observe the following other idioms expressed by the agent-like gen.:

a. Its employment with participles used as adjectives denoting respect or the opposite has been referred to earlier (§152.b). A similar gen. is frequently found with verbs (p.p.p.) denoting praise, homage and salutation. e.g., Api ca āyasmaḥ Mahā-Kaccāno Satthu c'eva samvannito sambhāvito ca viṁśūnām sabrahma-
“Even so the ven. Mahā-Kaccāna is praised by the Master and esteemed by his co-celbates”; cp. ye puggalā atṭha sataṃ pasatthā Sn 227; Rh 6 "those eight people who are praised by the good", where the Cony. has the inst. 'sappurisehi ...pasatthā’ (Pj.I.p.182).

b. The same gen. is employed with certain other participles which are not strictly passives. e.g., ādiso va tesāṃ aparaddhaṃ D I.180 "they are at fault from the very start"; yāva aparaddhaṃca te idaṃ ēcariyassa...D I.103 "How deeply have you been wronged by your teacher..."; tuyh'eva etaṃ dukkatam D II.115 "this is misdone by you"; tumh'eva etaṃ aparaddham D I.222 "by you yourself (it) has been wronged". In the last three examples it is very much like the subjective genitive.

c. When the noun in the gen. is attended by another participle, the construction approximates to a semi-absolute gen. e.g., aparāmasato c'assa paccattam yeva nibbuti viditā D I.22 (III.28) "by him (when he is) free from clinging tranquillity is realized"; tadapi tesāṃ bhavatam...ajānataṃ apassataṃ vedayitam D I.40 "that too has been experienced by you as such even without knowing or seeing on your part". Here the sense "even without your knowing..." of the participial phrase shows how closely related it is to the gen. absolute implying disregard (anādara, vide §169.a.), for "even without knowing your knowing" can also be expressed by "in spite of your not knowing...". But the fact that the participles agreeing with tesāṃ bhavatam merely qualify the 'agent' of the verb viditam and are therefore strictly speaking not detached from the rest of the construction shows its difference from the actual gen. absolute.
§ 155. This contact of the gen. and the inst. is not restricted to the agent-like gen. described in the preceding paragraph. The gen. is also used in certain other places where in the normal course of concinnity we would have expected an inst. denoting means or the sociative notion.

a. Thus the gen. is found in place of the inst. with certain nouns and verbs which logically must admit of an inst. of means. In such cases it seems to be used on the analogy of the subjective gen. e.g., mantassa ājīvino D III.65 "living (by means of the mantras); sabba-cetaso samannaḥaritvā D II.204 et seq. "having considered well with his mind". Here the v.l. cetasā appears like an attempt at 'correction'.

b. It may also appear, as remarked above, in place of the sociative inst.. It is even found with or 'governed' by the sociative prep. sādhiṁ. e.g., māma sādhiṁ sammodimsu D I.157 "they conversed with me". The idiom 'sammukhiḥ-bhāvaṃ gaccgati' "comes face to face" or "meets with", would normally admit of an inst. of the person met with coming under the sociative class (cp. māssi-bhāvaṃ gato tayā etc. §63.a). In the following example the gen. māma can also imply possession in a metaphorical sense: māma sammukhiḥ-bhāvaṃ āgantuṃ D III.13, 19 "to come face to face with me" or "to come to my presence".

§ 156. The Genitive of Relation.

In Pāli, as we have seen earlier, the notion of relation (that concerning whom) can be expressed by cases like the acc. or the inst.. The proper case however would be the inst. loc..
There are however certain instances where the gen. too seems to be employed to denote the person concerning whom a statement is made. It is found both adverbally and adnominally.

a. Adverbally it signifies the person regarding whom something is said or meant. e.g., Tañ ca kho silavato vadāmi no dussillassa D III.259 "I say it of the virtuous man, not of the evil"; The frequent phrase 'ko pana vādo' also 'governs' a similar gen. e.g., Idha bhikkhave appuriso, yo hoti parassa avanno tam apuțtho pi pātukaroti : ko pana vādo puțṭhassa A II.77 "Here, monks, an evil person even unquestioned discloses bad reports of others; what talk of (him when) questioned?" (i.e. how much more when questioned or what would you say about him if he is questioned?); similarly, ko pana vādo manussa bhūtassa M I.227 "what (use is there to) talk of the human being?" (i.e. not to mention the human being)

b. Adnominally it denotes the person to whom something is attributed or of whom some qualification is said to exist. Thus it resembles the possessive gen. e.g., acchariyaṃ idam āyasmato Kosiyassa D II.270 "this is wonderful of (or regarding) the ven. K."; abbhutāṃ idam āyasmato Janavasabhassa yakkhassa D II.206 "this is marvellous of the spirit, ven. J.". A similar adnominal gen. is found with compound 'vutta-vādino', where the gen. can also be regarded as used instead of the agent with vac vutta (p.p.p. of vadati). But the mere likely explanation is that it denotes the person regarding whom something is said by the speaker (vādin). e.g., kacei te bhoṭo Gotamassa vutta-
vādino D I.161 "what! are you true reporters concerning the ven. Gotama?" (lit. tellers of what is said); vutta-vādī c'eva Bhagavato homi D III.115 "I am a true reporter (lit. a teller of what has been said) of the Blessed One". There is one example of a similar gen. which (if it is not a nom. sg. formed from the dat.-gen. stem*bhikkhun-) is to be regarded as a gen. of relation. viz. Idha bhikkhave bhikkhuno cakkhunā divā na nimmattaggāhi hoti nānavyājanaggāhi hoti yatvādhikaranām ensā cakkhundriyāṃ asāmyutaṃ viharantaṃ abhijjhādomanassā pāpakā akusalā dhammā anvāssaveyyum A II.16 "Here, brethren, (speaking) of a monk, he does not take an object (as a theme for reflection) having seen it, ....".

c. A gen. is found with the idiom 'kittisaddo abhuggato' "a report has been broadcast" denoting the person concerning whom something is reported. Comparing with the gen. found in the phrase 'ko pana vādo' discussed above, it may be regarded as denoting the person concerning whom the report is broadcast. But according to ancient grammarians the gen. is due to the accented prefix (karmapravacanīya), viz. abhi- in abhuggato, as much as the acc. which is concurrently used in such contexts (vide acc. of relation §42.). e.g., Mayhaṃ kho ayyāya evam kalyāṇo kittisaddo abhuggato M I.125 "Concerning (cp. English 'of') my lady such a good report has arisen"; evam te kalyāṇo kittisaddo abhuggato M I.394 "thus of you a good report has arisen"; dussilassa...pāpakā kittisaddo abhuggato Ud 86 "an evil report arose...about the unvirtuous one"; idam me dānanām dadato kalyāṇo kittisaddo abhuggacchati D III.258 "about me...".
The Gen. of Time.

§ 167.

The gen. sg. of time-denoting words such as cirā, kāla, and divā (§2) is used adverbially to denote after what time or within or during what time an action takes place. In the former, i.e. when it expresses after what time, the gen. is parallel to the abl. as found in cirā (Skr. cirāt) etc., but in the latter sense it is clearly concurrent with the inst. as in kālena, cirēna and divā. In the Nikāyas however the abl. of these words is hardly found even in the sense of time after which (even cirā is not attested but cirēna) for the inst. has replaced it in such functions. Though in Skr., therefore, it may be said that the gen. here "always stands on the ground of the abl." (SS §128), the same cannot be stated for Pāli, where the gen. of time may be taken as standing for the inst. with the corresponding temporal sense (§76.a).
a. The gen. sg. cirassē is only found in the negative phrase 'na cirass'ēva' and can be substituted for 'aciran'ēva'. Similarly it has the sense of "not long after". e.g., na cirass'ēva kālaṃ akāsi D II.195 "not long after he passed away"; cp. D I. 177, 202; II.11,35,153 (cp. Skr. cirasya Wædonell Skr.Gr.§202.5). The compound form sucirass'ēva is similarly found meaning "after a very long time". e.g., atha kho āyasā Aññāsi Konḍañño sucirass'ēva yena Bhagava ten'upasaṅkami S I.193 "then the ven. A.K. after a very long time came whither the Blessed One was". The extended form cirassē is frequently found in place of cirassē with the same sense. Here we have an interesting instance
of the interplay of morphological and syntactical development, for, it is certainly the result of a want felt in the mind of the Pāli speakers as regards the form cirassa (with an ending unusual for adverbs) to which they added the nasal (-am) in order to bring it into uniformity with the adv. acc. on the analogy of forms like circa and muhuttaṁ, though the acc. is logically out of place here. e.g., cirassam kho bhante Bhagaśa imaṁ pariyyaṁ akāsi yaddidam idhāgamanāya D I.179; S I.142 "It is a long time since (i.e. after a long time) the Blessed One has thought of coming this way".

b. The form kālassa is found in the sense of "early" very much like the inst. kālena (§76.e.2.). e.g., kālass'eva vuttohahanto A V.263 "rising quite early (in the day)"; Sīṅgālako....kālass'eva vuttohya D III.180 "Sīṅgālaka.....having arisen early".

c. As regards the term divassa, it is always found in the compound expression 'divā-divassa', which means "early in the day". The form divā is also an adverb from Vedic divā (§2). e.g., Ata kho Sandhāno gahapati divādivass'eva Rājagaha nikkhami...D II.36 "then the householder S. set out from R. very early in the day". On this passage the Cony. has 'divassa divā nāma majjhanhātikkamo', according to which it should mean "after the mid-day". But our rendering fits in better with the context. Similarly: Sāvatthiyā niyyāsi divādivassa M I.174 (S I.89) "yeu he set out from S. early in the day". The expression seems to be parallel to a reduplicated form *divā-divā with an intensive sense [cp. udagga-udagga etc. W. Stede 'Reduplikationskomposita im Pāli' (ZfB Vol.6 (1925)p.89)].
The absolute use of the gen. in Pāli is restricted, just as in Skr. (SS §369), to a few standing phrases. Though it is sometimes concurrent with the loc. absolute, it is still far from possessing the general character of the latter. It has been observed with regard to Skr., by writers on syntax\(^1\), that there are at least two principal conditions governing the use of the gen. absolute, especially with regard to the character of the subject- and predicate-factors that constitute the absolute clause. Firstly, the substantive is almost always the name of a person (or a personal pronoun), very rarely to be supplied. Secondly, the predicate must have a durative sense, that is, it may be either an ordinary present participle or an adj. or a verbal formation having the value of an adj... Though there are not sufficient examples in the Nikāyas to make a detailed investigation, we may fairly observe that the above conditioned are for the most part fulfilled even in Pāli.

a. Strictly speaking, the construction seems to be limited to the expression of action going on but not cared for while performing the main action. Hence local grammarians denote this nuance by the term anādāra, i.e. disregard\(^2\). In describing

\(\text{vide: Grammaire Sanscrite} \ \S 226, \text{by Louis Renou (Paris-1936)}\)

and Speyer \S 369 Sanskrit Syntax, both referring to the exhaustive treatise by P de Saussure 'de l'emploi de genitif absolu en Sanscrit'.

2. This nuance is said to express 'garva rasa', Renou \text{ibid.}
the employment of the gen. Kaccāyana lays down the rule anādare ca (307) which the vutti explains as meaning that the sixth case-affix is employed to express the action not fully attended to while performing the main action or the seventh case (anādare ca chaṭṭhi vibhatti hoti sattami ca). He is here relying on Pāṇini sūtra (II.2.38) which says śaṣṭau cānādare, the conjunction ca being expressive of 'option' as this is primarily the province of the loc. absolute, which is enjoined by the preceding sūtra (37) viz. vasya ca bhāvena bhāvalakṣeṇam (cp. SS p.287.f.n.2). As pointed out above it occurs but rarely in the Nikāyas, and, may be rendered by such expressions as "though, not withstanding, in spite of" and the like. e.g., So kho aham...akāmākānaṁ mātāpitunnaṁ assumukhānaṁ rudantānaṁ kesamassum ohāretvā...agārasmā anagāriyaṁ pabbajitam M I.163 "despite the parents unwilling and crying I shaved off my hair and beard...and set forth from home to homelessness"; seyyathāpi brāhmaṇa puriso daliddo assako anālhiyo, tassa akāmāsas bilam olaggeyyum M II.178,181, "it is as (if there were ) a poor, needy and destitute wretch and (they) in spite of his not wanting would drop him into a hole". (Here the phrase 'bilam olaggeyyum' is of very doubtful sense. The P.T.S. Translation has 'reserve a joint he does not want', agreeing with Neumann's 'man nötigte ihm gegen seinen Willen einen Bissen auf: da hast du, lieber Mann, ein Stück Fleisch zu essen.....'. The reading too being doubtful (vide M II.178) either of the translations seems admissible). In the former example, we may notice, the predicate-factor is a present participle (rudantānaṁ etc.) but
b. But, as is shown by the parallelism with the loc. absolute, in its simple temporal employment the gen. absolute denotes an action going on or a situation existing at the time when the action of the main clause intervenes. Then it may be rendered by "while" or "as" or the participial construction in English ("this being so . . . ."). Instances of this are however rare in the Nikāyas, being superseded by the loc. absolute.

e.g., Tatra me brahmaṇa viharato mago vā āgacchati moro vā kaṭṭhaṃ pāteti M I.20 "As I dwell there, brahmin, an animal may approach or a peacock cause a twig to fall"; tesaṃ vo bhikkhave evaṃ samaṇānāṃ satam evaṃ paṭiṇānāṃ satam yā samaṇa-sāmīcīpaṭipadā taṃ.....M II.281 "When, brethren, you are so famous and acknowledged (for your recluse-ship), whatever right course of life there is for the recluses that . . . . .".

Sometimes the notion of anādara is faintly implied (cp. SS §369b), e.g., āturakāyassa me sato cittam anāturam bhavissati S III.1 "even while I am sickly (in spite of my being sick) of body, my mind is not diseased". Here the gen. can also be regarded as aposessive (§159.c.).

c. In the above examples the predicative factor has the durative notion and is almost always a present participle. There is however one past participle (pakkanta-) involved in a similar gen. absolute construction. Logically it seems to be a development of the gen. of time already described (§157). Its purely temporal character and origin are to be seen from the fact that the same phrase occurs as a loc. absolute (§183.b. iv.). The only difference (from the simple gen. of time) is
that the time-denoting term is not one word but an expression consisting of a personal noun and a participle. The implied sense, however, is fundamentally the same, viz. the time after which or since which (cp. SS §128.R.2). It occurs in the stock-phrase 'acira-pakkantassa...' and the presence of the time-denoting word अचरा (cp. acirassa(m)) makes quite clear the parallelism with the simple 'noun + participle' construction as found in Skr. 'चिराह कालो मैत्रेया वसंतसेनयाः सकासः गतस्या' (SS ibid). It occurs in the following passages:

atha kho te paribbājakā acirapakkantassa Bhagavato Poṭṭhapādam sañjambhariyam akamṣu D I.189 "Then those wandering ascetics, not long after the Blessed One had departed, began to tease P.");
cp. D II.8; M I.110; atha kho āyaṃ Anando acirapakkantassa rañño Pasenadissa Kosalassa yena Bhagavā ten'upasaṅkami M II.117 (cp. D I.86; S III.95) "then the ven. Ānanda, not long after King P. of K. had departed, came where the Blessed One was".

The use of this past participle in the gen. absolute construction is a later development in Pāli and is contrary to the general laws prevailing in Skr. mentioned above.

§ 159. The above usage shows, in fact, the transitional stage in the formation of the gen. absolute. Speyer points out that apart from the genuine gen. absolute Skr. upon the whole shows a preference for employing the gen. of participle either as dat.-like gen. or when depending on some substantive. This may also be said of Pāli where there are many instances of the 'gen. + participle' which seem to be only semi-absolute constr-
uctions (cp. SS §§370; Renou Grammaire Sanscrite §226.Note 1.). The logical relation between such genitives and the main sentence (or a word in the main sentence) "though not wholly wanting is very loose indeed".

a. The following examples seem to border on the dat. of concern: tesam bhikkhave sattanam evam kamana.... aniththa.... dhamma abhivaddhanti M I.309 "For such beings desiring thus.... unpleasant mental states increase" or "notwithstanding their desiring thus..."; Imam kho me somanassam sevato akusala dhamma parihayanti D II.278 "For me indulging in a state of mental ease evil things decrease"; gocare bhikkhave cara tam sake pettike visaye na lacchati M.ero otaram D III.58 "To you wandering (or as you are wandering) in such pastures, your own paternal range, the Evil One will not find occasion to enter".

b. It may even border on the adverbal dat., as for instance, the dat. with verbs of trusting and relying on (having faith in) e.g., ye kho pana bhikkhave Sunettassa Satthuno Brahmalokasahavyataya dhamman desentassa cittani na pasadesa A IV.135 "those who, monks, did not engender faith in their minds when the Master was (or in the Master) preaching doctrine (conducive) to the companionship, of Brahma-world".

c. Or it may have the possessive sense at the same time. e.g., kitta vat nu kho avuso Satthu pavivittassa viharato sava ka vivekas nanusikkhanti M.I.14 "how far, friends, do the disciple of the Master living in seclusion not train themselves for seclusion (or whereas the Master lives in seclusion). A curious
construction with the singular of the noun and the plural of the participle is found in the following where, contrary to the law prevailing in Skr., the gen. is of a common noun and not of a personal noun, though it is personified by the presence of -rāja-: Sinerussa ca pabbatarājassa jhāyamānānaṃ dayhamānānaṃ accī vātena khittā yāva Brahma-lokā pi gacchati A IV.103

Of the King of Mountains, Sineru, (sci. from amongst those) burning and ablaze, the sparks shot forth by the wind go up as far as the Brahma-world. Similar is the following: jhāyamānānassa pana sarīrassā, yaṃ ahosi chavīti vā....tassa n'eva chārikā paññāyittha na masi D II.164 "of the burning body (or while the body was burning) whatever was the skin etc. ...... of that there was seen neither soot nor ashes" (cp. last ex. §158.b)

d. There are some other instances where the participle alone does duty for the whole construction. This happens when the personal pronoun is of the third person, which is usually dropped e.g., sabhāgatassa vacanām na rūhati D III.185 "of him (or when he is) gone in the midst of an assembly the evidence is not valid". The Comy. supports absolute idea. ('sakkhipuṭṭhassa sato')

e. Sometimes it borders on some other use of the gen. itself. as for instance the gen. of origin. e.g., Seyyathāpi āvuso sakalikaggikassa jhāyamānāsa añā vā accī uppajjatī A V.9 "just as, friends, from (a fire of) logs burning (or while logs are burning) another spark arises.

f. Elsewhere (§144) we have referred to a loc.-like gen. denote the persons among whom something happens, or takes place (cp.
KVG §537.3). A similar gen. is found involved in a semi-absolute construction. e.g., Purimāni bhante divasāni purimatārāni nānātitthiyānaṃ samanabrāhmanaṃ kutūhalasālāyaṃ samissimānaṃ samipatitānaṃ, ayam antara kathā udapādi II.2 (D I.180) "In former days quite of yore, among the recluses and brahmīns of various sects gathered together (or while they were gathered...) in the hall of inquiry, this side-talk arose"; atha kho Vāsetṭha-Bhāradvajānaṃ jaṅghā-vihāraṃ anucañcamantānaṃ maggāmagge kathā udapādi D I.235 "then while Vāsetṭha and Bhāradvaja were engaged in a walk, (or between them engaged in a walk) this talk arose on the very way".
CHAPTER VII.

THE LOCATIVE CASE.

§ 160. The seventh case (sattami = Skr. saptaami) or the loc. serves to denote the where, i.e., the scene of an action. But it is capable of expressing such nuances as are denoted by the English prepositions in, on, at, among, with, by, near, over or about. Moreover its employment is not restricted to actual space as normally understood by 'where', but extends into other spheres of thought (cp. SS §38.6). Consequently there are various uses of the loc. which can be classified as those denoting, for instance, the varying conceptions of time, of circumstance, of motive, (the nimitta-sattami of local grammarians), of relation, the loc. absolute with its various subdivisions and so on. Though fundamentally the loc. denotes just where, i.e. the place where, an action takes place and thus appears to express an a static notion, it is nevertheless capable of having a dynamic import as when it signifies the aim reached with verbs of motion and allied meaning, being in most such instances parallel to the acc.. But in spite of all these syntactical variations of application, logically the fundamental unity of conception underlying all its uses appears more markedly in the case of the loc. than with most other cases. Apart from these adverbial uses the loc. is also employed adnominally in the Nikāyas with a descriptive sense, but even here some verbal concept is implied. seems to implied.
§ 161. The fundamental characteristic of the loc., according to local grammarians, is to denote that which is the (relevant) basis (ādhāra) for the action. Hence the designation ādhāra-vibhatti. The place in or on which something happens is, in their opinion, that which maintains the process implied by the main verb (kriyā). Says Kaccāyana: yo'ādhāro tamokāsāṃ (280), meaning thereby that which is auxiliary (to the action) is the location (space or opportunity); whereas Moggalāna's rule sattamyādharā (II.34) is interpreted by the vutti as implying that "what is auxiliary to the action by way of supporting the agent and the object which are its co-efficients is called the seventh kāraka" ('kriyāadhārabhūtakattukammānaṃ dhāraṇena yo kriyāyādharāro tasmiñ kārake nāmasmā sattami hoti'). These go back to the Pāṇini sūtra ādharō'adhikaraṇaṃ, which means according to the vaṛttikā that that which is related to the action as the site where the action takes place is called adhikarana. It is interesting to note that Kaccāyana does not employ the term ādhāra as the original notion of the loc., as the other two, but the word okāsa (okāsa sattami Kac.304). This notion of location, according to the vutti on Kac.286, is four-fold: 'svādhāro catubbhido byāpiko opalesiko vesyiko sāmipikoti', viz., 1. when it expresses inhesion, inherence or concomitancy; 2. when it implies occupation or juxta-position; 3. when the notion of residence or habitation is meant; finally, 4. when it signifies proximity, vicinity or neighbourhood. Though this division is necessarily arbitrary and incomplete, it is to the credit of the writer that some of the fundamental logical connections of the loc. are touched upon.
§ 162. We have already referred to the contact of the proper sphere of the acc. with that of the loc. (§§40 & 45). In Pāli, as in Skr., the former is not alone in bordering on the latter's employ since, as we shall see in the succeeding paragraphs, other cases like the inst., dat., gen., and even the abl. come into contact with it. These various points of contact seem to have been made very early in the history of I.E., for in special form the loc. is only preserved in Indo-Aryan and Balt-Slav., having coalesced in Greek with the dat.-aad-inst., in Latin with the abl.-inst. and in Germanic with the dat. (vide KVG §536). In Pāli the loc. form was more liable to preservation as already the inst. had coalesced with the abl. (completely in the plural and in the -ā ending of the singular) and the dat. with the gen. in both numbers. Nevertheless the original sg. ending -e of -a nouns seems to have been superseded even in the older Nikāyas by the later form -smiṃ (-mhi) borrowed from the pronominal declension, though the replacement has not gone so far as in the case of the abl. (§5.b.). This has been extended even in to other declensions such as those in -i and -u in the sg., but the plural is the same as that of the earlier language.

§ 163. The Loc. of Place Where.

The fundamental function of the loc. is to express the spot, the exact place, where an action is done or takes place. Here we may observe the following distinctions (SS§123A):

a.i. In its simplest form it conveys the notion of being in
or within. e.g., nirayamhi paccati A V.75 "he is tortured in hell"; Vesāliyaṁ viharati Ambapāli-vane D II.94 "lives at (or near) Vesāli in the grove of Ambapāli". The construction in the latter is idiomatic. In such frequent instances where the verb of 'being or living' is placed between two locatives the former invariably denotes the **neighbourhood** in general (cp. Eng. 'at') and the exact spot, the actual **location**, is expressed by the latter which is almost always the name of a residence of some sort. Similarly: so Vesāliyaṁ parisati evaṁ vācaṁ bhāseti D III.13 "he speaks these words among the rabble at V."; tesaṁ tīnāni satthāni hatthesu pātu-bhavanti D III.73 "sharp weapons appear in their hands"; tassa rukkhassa chāyāya nisīnnaṁ M I.74 "seated in the shade of that tree".

ii. With the verb 'to be' complemented by a noun this loc. may sometimes be parallel to the **gen. of description**. e.g., amanussa-rājā divi homi D II.206 "I am the non-human king in (or 'of') heaven".

iii. With the verb **uppaṭijjati** "be born" the loc. is used concurrently with the acc. (§40.a.) to denote the place where one is born or arises. When this verb has the sense of "attain to", which should be the literal sense of ud+pad (or even upa+pad), the acc. of direction should be the mere logical construction. There seems to be, however, a semantical confusion between the two notions of "being born in" and "born into, attain to". The context in most cases still shows that the loc. is properly used when the sense is "to be born in". e.g., Tathāgato loke uppajjati D I.62 "The Tathāgata is born in the world"; Padumake
pāṇa bhikkhu niraye Kokāliko bhikkhu uppanno S I.152 "In the P. purgatory, O monk, the brother K. is born". This confusion of the acc. and the loc. has left its mark in a curious construction where the -e form can also be regarded as the Māgadhi acc. sg. (see Eastern forms §10), unless it is an editor's error. viz.,

parama maraṇa sugatīṃ saggām loke uppajjanti A I.32 "after death they are born into a happy state in heaven".

iv. Even when the prefixes adhi-, paṭi- etc. are added to verbs of 'being' or 'living', the loc. is maintained and the acc. is not used though we may expect the latter according to the tendency of such compound-verbs to become 'transitive'; e.g.,

tasmiṃ sāle adhivatthā devatā M I.306; S I.197 "the godhead inhabiting that sal-tree"; Vesāliyam paṭivasanti D I.150 "live at Vesāli" cp. Nālandāyaṃ M I.371, Āpane Sn 104.

v. The verbs tiṭṭhati and vattati (< sthā and vṛt) in the sense of standing by or abiding by are construed with a loc. (vide SS §138.3.). Such idioms as 'ovāde tiṭṭhati' are not alien to Pāli concinnity though not exemplified in the Nikāyas. It is however quite frequent in the Jātakas; e.g., ovāde thatvā J I.153;IV.367 "abiding by the advice". These verbs are construed with the loc. even when prefixes are added owing to their character as primary verbs of location like the above root vāg. e.g., mahā-paṭhāvi udake patiṭṭhitā D II.107 "the wide earth is established in the water"; hīne kāye patiṭṭhitā M I.327 "placed in a low body"; nāma-rūpe patiṭṭhitā D II.63 "established in name and form".

vi. This loc. of place where may sometimes be used in an
or metaphorical sense in such expressions as "to sit at or preside over" and "to find or see something (quality etc.) in a person". e.g., rājā attakaranē nisinno D II.20; M II.122 "the king seated at the administration of justice (or presiding over the cases)"; ime pañca-nīvarane appahīne attani samanu-passati D I.73 (cp.M I.367) "he sees the five hindrances undestroyed in himself"; evam paripunnam...silakkhandham... aňñesu samānabrāhmaṇesu na samanupassāmi D I.206 "such a complete...aggregate of virtues...I do not find in other recluses and brahmīns"; na ca pana etam amhesu samvijjati D I.3 "this indeed does not exist in us"; tesam te kārā amhesu mahapphalā bhavissanti M I.281 "those actions of theirs ensure to fruit and profit in ourselves". The loc. in these examples denotes location however abstract it may be. In some of these the dat. or the gen. are admissible in place of the loc., especially when it is said to exist in a person; when however the noun in the loc. is not personal this option is less possible. e.g., natthi kāmesu doso M I.305 "there is nothing wrong in pleasures".

§ 164. b. The surface trodden or touched on, upon, or the space over, at, or the thing through which motion is implied is denoted by the loc. e.g., udake pi abhijjamāne gacchati M II.18 "walks on the unbroken (surface of the) water"; Vesāliyām pindāyā caritvā D II.102 "having gone for alms over Vesāli"; abbhokāse cañkamanti M II.119 "they walk on the open ground (or in the open air)"; suparikammakatasmiṃ dantasmīṃ yam yad eva....
danta-vikatim kareyya D I.72 "as if he would make certain ornamentations on the well-levelled (surface of an) elephant's tooth"; ayokhilam hatthe gamenti A I.141 "they send an iron spike through the hand".

c. Or it may denote the dominion, territory or thing on, in or at. e.g., nisidi Bhagavā paññatte asane M II.2 "the Blessed One sat on the seat that was prepared"; anke nisidāpetvā D II.20 "having made (him) to sleep on the lap"; pallaṅke nisidi D II.210 "sta on the couch"; puppham iva udumberesu Sn 6 "like flowers on the trees". This is called opasilesikadharo hy the vutti on Kac.280.

d. It may also denote the thing or place near, on, about, at, in short, proximity (samīpattha). e.g., anñatarasmiṁ rukkhamūle nisidi D II.162 "he sat near or at the foot of the tree"; Ukkaṭṭhāyaṁ viharati Subhagavane M I.1 "lives at or near Uk. in the Subha grove" (cp. remarks under a.i.). This sense is also brought about by placing anu- before the noun in the loc. as adnominal prefix. e.g., anuTire Mahiyā Sn 18 "near or along the bank of the river M."

e. This loc. also denotes the people among whom one lives or something happens. (cp. KVG §537.3; SS §133.e.). The partitive gen. denoting a group of people out of whom some are selected can sometimes psychologically coincide with this loc. (§144.a.). e.g., Bhagavā Sakkesu viharatid II.253 (cp. Kurūsu3 D II.55) "the Blessed One lives among the Sakyans"; Kosalesu càrikanā

1. Comy. 'samīpatthe bhummavacanam' PPs.I.12. 2. 'anuTireti tīrasamipe' Pj.II.28. 3. 'tāsmiṁ kurūsu janapade' Sum. II.p.481.
carati M II.45 (140 Videhesu) "he sojourns among the Kosalas";
Vāsetṭha-Bhāradvājā Bhikkhusu parivasanti D III.80 "Vāsetṭha and Bhāradvāja reside among the monks"; devasu Tāvatimsesu pātur-ahosā Ud 22. "he appeared among the T. gods"; Saddhāvāsesu devasu antarahitā S I.26 "disappearing(from) among the S. gods" (vide abl.-like loc. §173.c.); te Nighanthesu pabbajantīti M I. 93 "they enter (the homeless life) among the naked ascetics".

f. In certain constructions, especially with verbs of living and others implying co-residence, the person under, with or in the company of whom one stays is expressed by the loc. case. This seems to have originated in such earlier usages as the Vedic 'sā hāsmin jyoguvāsa' "she lived with him" (cp.KVG §539), and the loc. of the person with whom one stays is a frequent idiom in Classical Skr. (cp.ŚŚ §137.2). This may be called the sociative loc. e.g., Bhagavati brahmacariyam caranti D I.156; II.208 "they practise the Holy Life under or with the Blessed One" (cp. Sugatasmin...D II.208). It may occur adnominaliy: samane Gotame brahmacariyavāsā M I.524 "Higher Life (is) with the recluse Gotama". Similar is the following gāḍṭhā idiom: Vesiyāsu padissati...dissati paradāresu Sn 108 "he is seen in the company of harlots...and others' wives". A periphrasis for this construction is -santike which itself is a sociative loc. e.g., alattha...Bhagavato santike pabbajjam D II.153 "he received ordination under the Blessed One". This also borders on the abl.-like loc. found with verbs of receiving (§173.a.) and may be rendered "received...from the Bl. One". Synactically related to this sociative loc. is the one found in the stock-phrase cittam vase vatteti A IV.24 "keeps the mind..."
Sometimes periphrastic turns of expression such as majhe, visaye, antara, antaram, pase, samipe etc. are used for the loc. (either with the gen. of the noun or as the second member of a compound). e.g., saṅghamajhe osaranti M I.469,II.8 "come into the midst of the Order of monks"; Māravisaye(pakkhanno) Th 1.253 "falls into the realm of Māra"; also in the gāthā literature postpositions ending in other case-suffixes, particularly of place where, are used as periphrases for the loc. e.g., susamvutatto visikhantaram caram Th 1.1119 "walking in the streets well-restrained in body". It is however not clear (as far as the Nikāya language is concerned) whether these periphrases always make the meaning of the loc. more precise as Speyer seems to think (cp. SS §133.e.).

§ 165. The Loc. of Place Whither.

As has been already pointed out, the loc. not only expresses the place where something takes place but also the spot whither (into which) motion is directed. This construction exists in Vedic and Classical Skr. just as in Latin and Greek, especially with verbs of falling, throwing and casting (cp. VGS § 204.1.b.; SS §§134.B. & 134*). It is quite common in Pāli and in most instances concurrent with the acc. of the goal (§40-). Kaccāyana refers to the loc. used for the acc. (312) but the vutti gives only examples, of the type '...bhikkhusu abhivādenti' and none with verbs of motion. The following distinctions are to be observed:
a. The place into or to which one moves, is carried or betakes oneself: e.g., Sāvatthiyam agamāśiṁ D II.270 "I came to Σ"; ekanta attānaṁ upasamharitvā D II.212 "having betaken himself to one side"; cp. ye Padune niraye upanītā Sn 677 "who are carried into Paduma hell".

b. The place or spot one enters or descends into: e.g., Vesāliyam piṇḍaya pāvisiṁ D II.102 (III.16) "he entered (into) V. for alms". Here however the reading is not quite settled. The P.L.S. text reads 'Vesāliṇī pādāya pāvisi'D II.102 and continues 'Vesāliyaṁ piṇḍāya caritvā' but Peer (Sd) has 'Vesāliyaṁ pindaṭāya pāvisi, Vesāliyaṁ piṇḍāya caritvā' with the loc. in both places. In the other passage (D III.16) the P.T.S. also has 'Vesāliyaṁ piṇḍāya pāvisi'. Syntactically, it is not necessary to alter any of the MSS. since the loc. as well as the acc. is permissible. The loc. in saṁghamajjhe osaranti also belongs to this class (cp. end of para.164.f.), and the acc. is actually found with this verb osarati. e.g., gāmaṁ osara- M I.176 "enter the village". Similarly the passage: mātu-kucchāsīṁ okkamati D III.231 "enters into the mother's womb, occurs with the acc. -kucchā at D II.63.

c. The place or spot into which one falls: e.g., na cāsa kānicī phalāni bhūmiyam patitāni M I.366 "none of its fruits are fallen on (onto) the ground". Similar is the construction in pakkhanno Māravissaye Th 1.253 (cp. end §164.f.).

d. With verbs having the sense of submerging and sinking into or in: e.g., paṭhāvīyāpi ummāja-nimmājaṁ karoti seyyathāpi udake D I.78 "he dives into the earth and emerges out of it as in water".
e. With verbs of throwing, casting and the like to denote the place or spot on, onto or into which: e.g., kālaketānaṁ ca nāmaṁ sūsāne chaddhessanti D III.3 "they throw him (when he is) dead into the carnal ground"; tela-doniyā pakkhipitvā D II.142 "having put into an oil-vat"; cp. thale khitto Dh 34 "thrown on the land".

f. With verbs meaning to keep, place on, over, across etc.:
e.g., samaṁ pādaṁ bhūmiyaṁ nikkhipati D III.146 "he places the foot horizontally (i.e. flat) on the ground"; rittam pi pattam sīse nikujjeyyaṁ D III.1203 "they would place an empty bowl over his head". Similar is the use of the loc. with the verb karoti (cp. SS §133 R.1.). e.g., amse katvāna cilvaram Th.1.197 "having put the robe over (across) the shoulder"; tam hatthe karitvā D I.76; II.13; M II.17 "having taken it into his hand" (lit. having put it on his palm). A metaphorical turn of the same idiom is found in the compound verb 'manasi-karoti'. e.g., sādhukam manasi karothe D II.2 (204) "take it well into your head" (i.e. reflect well in your mind).

g. With verbs of striking and hitting the spot at or on which the blow is dealt: e.g., āyasamato Vidhurassa sīse paharaṁ adāsi M I.336 "he gave a blow on the head of the ven. Vidhura"; cp. sīse paharaṁ adāsi M I.126 "gave a blow on the head". But the person to whom the blow is given is naturally denoted by the dat. case. e.g., bhikkhunīnaṁ pānīnaṁ pahāraṁ dadeyya M I.123 "would give a blow with his hand to the nuns" (i.e. would strike the nuns with his hand).

h. With the idiomatic phrases 'saṅgahāṁ gacchati' and 'samodhā-
-nam gacchati' the loc. denotes that *within which* something is comprised or included or *into which* something fits. e.g., yāni kānicci jāngamānaṁ pāñānaṁ padajātāni sabbāni tāni hatthipade samodhānaṁ gacchati M I.184 "whatever foot-prints there are of walking animals, all those go into an elephant's foot" (i.e. are comprised within or included within an elephant's foot) ye keci kusala dharmā sabbe te catusu ariyasaccesu saṅgahāṁ gacchanti M I.184 "whatever good thing there are all those are comprised within the four Noble Truths". A similar loc. is involved in the elliptical construction: Brahmuno pakati-vanṇo anabhisambhavanīyo so devānaṁ Tāvatimsānaṁ cakkhupathasmiṁ D II. 244 "For Brahma's usual appearance is not (sufficiently) materialized as to appear (fall within) the scope of or in the Tāvatiṁsa gods' vision". That some such infinitive as patitum is to be understood is made clear by the Comy. which has 'anabhisambhavanīyo ti appattabbo' (Sum.II.640). The P.T.S. translation has "not sufficiently materialized to impress the vision of the Thirty Three gods". The loc. here can also be regarded as denoting relation (§174).

§ 166. **The Loc. with Verbs.**

The loc. also appears in special connection with certain classes of verbs. Here it seems to express notions allied to the fundamental conception of *place where*. Such are:

a. Verbs denoting the thing touched in *binding* etc. (cp.33 §139.4).
For instance, it may signify that around which, to which or at (by) which the action of tying is performed. e.g., sise sisa-vețhanam bandheya M II.193 "he would tie the turban around his head"; dalha thambhe vō khile upanibaddhe M II.232 "tied to a stout pillar or a peey post"; asurindam kanţhe....bandhaneshi bandhitvā S I.221 "having tied the lord of the asuras at (or by) the neck with strings".

b. Verbs of sticking, adhering, attaching, clinging, hanging on, depending on etc. e.g., rajojallam kāye na upalippati M II.136; D III.168 "does and dirt do not stick to his body"; pāvalā su nāma te pīṭhakasmiṁ allīna D III.19,21 "your back-bones are sticking to the chair"; kāyasmiṁ allīnā M II.139 "clinging to the body"; kanṭhe āsattena M I.120 "hanging on his neck"; cp. vāto va jālamhi asajjamāno Dh-221- Sn 71 "like the wind not sticking in(on to) the net (i.e. caught in the net)"; nāmarūpa-asmiṁ asajjamāno Dh 221 "not clinging to name and form".

c. Verbs of relying, trusting, having faith in etc. e.g, Evaṁ pasanno aham saṁane Gotame D II.149 "I have such faith in the recluse Gotama"; Sele brāhmaṇe abhippasanno Sn p.105 "extremely pleased(or confident) in the brahmin Sela"; Tathāgata saddhām paṭilabhati D I.63; M I.179,267,344;III.33 "conceives faith in the Tathāgata". The dat. is here the parallel case (§94.a.).

d. Verbs having just the opposite sense, of doubting, being unsettled or not.clear in mind, suspecting, and being disgusted. Here as well as in the above type (c.) the loc. is expressive of relation, i.e. the thing regarding which, e.g., i). dvīsu mahā-purisalakkhaṇesu kaṅkhati vīcikicchati nādhimuccati na sampasīdati
M II.135 "he doubts, hesitates to believe in, is not settled with regard to, two signs of the Super-man"; cattāri'īmāni bhikkhave bhayaṇī udak'orohante pāṭikaṅkhitabbāni M I.459 "these four dangers (lit. fears) should be expected (lit. suspected) in (the case of) one going into the water". The gen. is also employed with this verb (§147.c). ii. With nibbindati the loc. appears concurrently with the abl. or the inst. (§126.e.). e.g., sutavā ariyasavako rūpasmi nibbindati M II.20 "the learned disciple is disgusted in (i.e. with, of) form"; cp. nibbindati Bhagavati bhavagate Th 2.522 "gets disgusted of what is given to becoming".

e. Verbs of catching, taking, seizing agree with a loc. of that (usually a part of the body) by which one is caught, the person being denoted by the acc. e.g., tam' enam dve balavanto purisa nānābhāsau gahetvā M I.365 "him as such two strong men taking by the arms (in various ways)"; tam bhikkhum bāhayaṇ gahetvā D I.221; A IV.206; Ud 52 "having taken that monk by the hand"; pādesu gahetvā Sn p.32 "taking by the legs"; elakam lomesu gahetvā M I.228 "having caught the ram by its hairs"; dubbalataram purisaṃ sise vā gahetvā khandhe vā gahetvā M I.121 "taking a weaker man by the head or the body"; kesesu paramasitva M II.47 "seizing by the hairs". The inst. of means is not used in this connection, for it is expressly employed to signify that limb or part of the body of the agent with which (by which) the action is done (§66.a).

f. With verbs meaning to fall at one's feet (SS §139.4.), to kneel down or prostrate oneself before, the person before whom
such an act of obeisance is done is denoted by the loc. Here the dat. may also be optionally used implying the person to whom obeisance is done (§96.b.). e.g., atha ca pana samāṇe Gotame evarūpaṁ nipaccakāraṁ karoti S I.178 "even then he performs such low act of obeisance before the recluse Gotama"; mayi nipaccakāraṁ karonti yathā Bhagavatī M II.124 "they fall prostrate before me as before the Blessed One"; cp. Bhagavatī pādesu sīrasā nipatati Vin.II.192 "he falls (prostrate) with his head before the (or at the) feet of the Blessed One"; karonti kho Vāseṭṭha Sakyā raṇī Pasenadimhi Kosale nipaccakāraṁ abhi-vādanaṁ...sāmicikamman D III.83 "the Sākyans, Vāseṭṭha, certainly do obeisance and perform acts of greeting...before King P. of K."

§ 167. The Partitive Locative.

We have seen that the gen. which is the proper case for expressing the partitive notion is capable of denoting not only the whole of which a part is meant but also the multitude of persons or things out of which a selection is made (§144; cp. SS §116). With this latter function of the gen. is logically connected the notion of persons (from) amongst whom some are specified, and this is denoted by the loc. case. Hence in this connection the gen. and the loc. are interchangeable (cp. SS ibid) So Kaccāyana has the rule that in expressing specification (i.e. selection or separation) the loc. or the gen. can optionally be used¹. This loc. is therefore in origin different from that

1. 'niddhāraṇa ca' Kac.306, enlarged by the vutti as 'niddhāraṇatthe ca chaṭṭhī vibhatti hoti sattāmi ca'.
which expresses the persons or multitude amid or among whom
whom something (event etc.) takes place or an action is performed
(§164.e.). With pure adjectives of the comparative or super-
lative degree the gen. seems to be preferred (§144.d. & e.), but
the loc. is by no means rare with such words as aññatara and
adjectives prefixed by bahu- etc. implying comparison.

a.i. When the multitude is denoted by a noun in the plural the
loc. is used parallel to the gen. e.g., etad anuttariyam bhante
padhānesu D III.103,106 "this, Sir, is unique among the
exertions"; imesu pāñcasu kāmagunēsu aññataramsīm M III.114
"in one among these five kinds of pleasures"; samāsu vā samāna-
sammatā D II.185 "those held in esteem as recluses among the
recluses"; cp. suttesu bahujāgaro Dh 29 "much awake among the
sleeping"; suttesu jāgarā S I.3 (V.) "those awake among the
sleeping".

M.ii. When however the word denoting the multitude is a collective
noun (sg.) the loc. is of necessity and the gen. is logically
ruled out. e.g., tasam parisēyam koci D II.210 "a certain one
among the assembly"; cp. khattiyo setṭho jane tasmiṃ ye gottapaṭisārino M I.358 (V.) "the warrior is the highest among those
people who rely on lineage".

§ 168. The above mentioned option in the use of the loc. or
gen. has extended even to other partitive notions. Just as the
gen., as pointed out before, is capable of denoting the whole of
which a part is meant (by the qualified word), so the loc. may
sometimes express that in which (i.e. of which) something else constitutes a part. It is usually found with verbs having the sense of: i). declaring, saying, calling; ii). thinking, considering, deeming; and iii). assigning, defining and laying down. In general the loc. with these denotes the thing as part of which or as coming under which something else is characterized, thus:

i. With verbs of declaring etc. e.g., idam assa musāvādasmiṃ vadāmi A 1.206 "I say this is part of his falsehood"; idam kho aham Udāyi iñjitasmiṃ vadāmi M 1.454 "I declare this, Udāyi, as part of (his) movement"; vuttaṃ kho pan'etaṃ bhikkhu mayā yān kīñci vedayitaṃ tam dukkhasmiṃ S IV.216 "It has been declared by me, monk, that whatever is known by seeing comes under sorrow"; idam aham tesaṃ...sammohavīhārasmiṃ vadāmi M 1.21.251 "this I declare as part of the complete delusion in which they...live". Here the Comy. paraphrases the loc. with the acc. (-vihārapariyāpannaṃ vadāmi) treating it as being parallel to the complementary acc. found in the double acc. construction with verbs of speaking, thinking, considering etc. (vide §58.b.). The loc. here can reasonably be regarded as a predicative loc.

ii. With verbs of considering etc. e.g., nibbānasmiṃ na maññati M I.4 "he does not think (consider) it as (part of) nibbāna"; pathaviyā na maññati M I.4 "he does not think (it as part of) earth". The P.T.S. translation of this passage has "in the earth" for pathaviyā, which would be syntactically
untenable according to the above explanation.

iii. With verbs of assigning etc. e.g., taṅca sukhasmiṁ paṇṇāpeti S IV.228 "he lays it down as (part of) happiness"; na kho āvuso Bhagavā sukhaṁ yeva vedanāṁ sandhāya sukhasmiṁ. paṇṇāpeti M I.400 "the Blessed One, friend, does not rank (a thing) as (part of) pleasure just because of pleasant feeling".

b. In all these examples, it may be observed, the loc. being used parallel to the predicative acc. (of apposition) in fact plays the part of a complement to the main verb of the sentence. The loc. here, as pointed out above (a.), is a part of the predicate. When the main verb is a form of bhū "to be" the construction appears as a proper predicative loc.

i. e.g., idam pi assa hoti sīlasmiṁ D I.63 "this is (part of) his goodness"; idam pi'ssa hoti caraṇasmiṁ D I.100 "this too is part of his conduct". Commenting on the former Buddhaghosa has 'idam pi assa bhikkhuno pāṇātipātāveramāṇi sīlasmiṁ ekaṁ sīlāṁ hoti' which clearly shows that he regarded the locative as partitive (niddhāranatthe). He too points out that it is employed in the sense of the nom. in its complementary rôle as predicate. The construction accordingly borders on the predicative and partitive notions.

ii. Sometimes the same is found without the verb. Then it forms the actual predicate of the sentence. e.g., idam pi me tapasmiṁ

1. 'paccattāva-vacanatthe vā etam bhūmannā, Mahā-Āṭṭhakathayaṁ hi idam pi tassa samāppassa sīlanti ayaṁ eva attho vutto... idam assa hoti sīlasmiṁti idam assa sīlāṁ hotiti attho' Sum. I.183.
D III.44 "this too part of my asceticism"; kinca bhikkhave bhikkhuno āyusmiṃ D III.77 "what is (the purpose in) life to a monk?". With this latter we may compare the gen. used with the phrase 'ko pana vādo' (§156.a.).

iii. This same use is sometimes found in more abstract idioms. e.g., yathā tam bhikkhave avissayasmiṃ M I.86 "because, monk, it does not come within the scope(of...)"; idam tesam hoti āsanasmim D II.208 "this is the nature of their sitting (i.e. the order of their seats)". In the former the syntactical nature of the gen. loc. is not far from its simple local sense, while in the latter it borders on the loc. of relation.

§ 169. The Adnominal Locative.

Most of the adverbial uses described in the preceding paragraphs find their logical counterparts in the adnominal application of this case. (cp. KVG §539; SS §135). Of these the great majority are descriptive in sense and stand parallel to the usual gen. of description (§144.d.), to which however the analogy is not restricted. The loc. appears adnominally in the sense of place where, place gone to and the like; in fact it can stand for any of the adverbial uses with a few exceptions.

1. Comy. 'idam pi kammaṃ mama eva tapasmiṃ; paccatte vā bhummam, idam pi mama tapo ti' Sum. III.838.
2. Comy. 'Idam tesam catunnaṃ āsane (v.l. āsanaṃ) hoti' Sum. II 639. Here the v.l. shows the syntactical confusion of the loc. and the nom. in predicative sense.
But this does not detract from the validity of the general observation that the loc. is fundamentally an adverbial case, though its psychological connection with the verb is not so clearly defined as in the other cases. For the loc. is more as auxiliary (ādhāraka) to the progress of the action (kriyā) than instrumental (sādhaka).

a. Primarily it is found qualifying a person or thing as the loc. of place where or time at which implied with the notion of living or being conveyed by some such verb understood. e.g., parito gāmesu manussā evām āhamsu D II.264 "people (living) in the villages all around said thus:..."; dasasu lokadhātusul devatā sannipatitā D II.139,255 "gods(living) in ten world-systems being assembled"; vigatavalāhake deve abhido majjhantika -samayaṃ suriyo M II.42; D II.182 "(like) the heavenly sun in a cloudless sky at noon time".

b. In the above examples the gen. can be substituted for the loc. In the following the gen. appears even preferable, though in such instances the loc. is frequently used: Pakati esa Kassapa lokasmiṃ D I.168 "This (is), Kassapa, the nature of (lit. in) the world"; cakkhuṃ loke antaradāyissati D II.140 "the Eye of the World will disappear"; na c'assa kāye balamayyā D I.72 "he has no strength at all of (lit. in) body"; loke vivattacchaddo D II.17 "one who has lifted the veil of the world". In the last example the loose position of the loc. outside the compound would make the rendering "with regard the world" (taking the loc. as denoting relation) more plausible. But at

1. cp. v.l. 'dasahi lokadhātūhi devatā sannipatitā' (abl) D II.283
any rate all the above locatives have the general character of qualifying the nouns to which they are applied.

c. The above observations hold good in the case of the following examples as well, where the loc. is clearly parallel to the gen. of possession though in a markedly abstract sense. We may compare such English usages as 'the good in...' or 'the fault in'. e.g., nekkhamme ānissāmaṁ D I.110; II.41 "the advantage of (lit. good in) renunciation"; iddhipāṭihāriye ādīnavam D I.212 "the evil in the performance of miracles"; kāmesu ādīnavam D II.274 "the evil in pleasures of the senses"; jātidhamme ādīnavam viditvā MIII.162 "having seen the evil of what is subject to birth".

d. Apart from such uses, the loc. sometimes may stand for other logical connections as in: sīlesu paripūrakārino D II.202, where the loc. seems to be used for the inst.-like gen. (§149) with verbs of filling, or denotes pure relation. Another adnominal use directly derived from the adverbal construction is found with nouns (substantives and adjectives) having the sense of faith, confidence, and their opposites disgust, doubt, hesitation etc. (§166. c. & d.). There again the notion of relation is quite conspicuous. e.g., Buddhe avacappasādaṁ D II.93 "with inviolable faith in the Buddha"; Ālāre Kālāme Ulārām pasādaṁ D III.131 "Great faith in Ālāra Kālāma"; mayi kañkhā D I.105 "doubt in me"; kañkhā vā vimati vā Buddhve vā dhamme vā saṅghe vā paṭipadaya vā D II.154 "doubt or perplexity concerning the (or in the) Buddha, the Doctrine, the Order or the Path".
§ 170. The Dat.-like Locative.

We have seen earlier how the loc. sometimes expresses the person or thing towards which an action is directed (§166.c. & f.). Pāli, just as Sanskrit (vide SS §145), extends that idiom to many kindred conceptions, and thus the loc. comes to be employed in such nuances as would otherwise be construable with a dat. It may stand parallel to such constructions as the the dat. of remote object, of advantage and disadvantage, of concern and viewpoint, of possession or the dativus finalis. With some of these conceptions as, for instance, possession, the gen. is capable of being used parallel to the dat...

a.i. It is concurrent with the dat. of the remote object when used with such verbs as those of giving, bestowing, conferring, devolving and the like. Kaccāyana provides for these and similar uses by the rule sampadāne ca (313), whereby he means that the loc. is also permissible in certain functions of the dat. Why this optional construction is possible can easily be understood when we consider the psychological relation between such English idioms as 'give something to a person' (dat.) and bestow or confer something upon a person' (loc.). e.g., Tathāgate arahante sammā-sambuddhe dānaṁ deti M III.254 (cp. āyasmatā Sāriputte)M III.263) "gives alms to (lit. bestows on) the T., the Saint, the perfectly Enlightened One"; Saṅghe Gotami dehi M III.253 "give,Gotami, to the Order". This construction is adnominally found with nouns and participles derived from the root dā. e.g., niganṭhesu pi dāne samādapeti M I.379 "he makes (me) give even to the naked ascetics"; anupanite dinnaṁ M II.1
"what is given to one uninitiated". It may also stand for the dat. of remote object in the double acc. construction/compound verbs having karoti as the second member (§58.c.ii). e.g., karonti ranñe...nipaccakāram...D III.83 "do obeisance to the king...", where the actual verb is nipaccakāram-karoti; na me tesu bhikkhusu anusāsanī karaniyā ahosi M I.124 "there was no advice to be given to those monks by me".

ii. With verbs such as samvidahati "bestow, provide for" and samavossajjati "devolves, confers on or upon", the loc. is the more appropriate construction logically though the dat. is not ruled out. e.g., Govinde brāhmaṇe sabba-kiccāni samavossajjīva D II.267 "having devolved all duties on G. the brahmin"; rakkā-varanaguttīṃ samvidahati khattiyesu...migapakkhiṣu A I.110 "he bestows (confers) protection, safety and shelter upon warriors,... and birds and beasts".

b. It can also stand for the dativus commodi et incommodi. Here in many instances the construction borders on the loc. of relation. e.g., abhūtaṃ vacanan ca tasmīṃ rūhati D III.183 "false reports too arise against (or about, regarding) him"; no ca kumāre bhavissati antarāyō Sn 691 "whether there would be any harm to (on) the prince"; api nu so puriso evamkāri tasmīṃ kulle kicca-kāri assa M I.136 "But would he in doing so be doing the right thing for (with regard to) the raft"; attānaṃ āvikattā satthari vā viññūsu vā brahmacārisu vā M II.128 "discloser of himself to the Master, to the wise and the holy".
c. We discussed elsewhere (§163.a.vi) the abstract use of the *loc.* as denoting the person in whom something (trait, virtue, fault etc.) is said to exist, with verbs like *asmyijati* etc. Closely related to it is the *loc.* found with the verbs *bhavati* and *atthi*, which, denoting as it does the thing or person to whom something is attributed, coincides logically with the *dat.* or *gen.* of possession. e.g., cattāro 'me bhikkhave acchariyā abhutā dharmā Ānande D II.145 "there are, monks, these four wonderful and marvellous qualities in (to or for) Ānanda" (i.e. he has these four...); tayidam (domanassaṃ) Ghaṭikāre kumbhakāre natthi na ca bhavissati M II.51 "that too is neither in G. the potter nor will be" (cp. v.l. Ghaṭikārassa etc.); n'atthi c'etam amhesu...D I.3 "this too is not in us" (i.e. we do not have this also).

d. In several instances the *loc.* may even stand as a concurrent idiom for the so-called *dativus finalis*, especially, as Speyer points out with regard to Skr. (SS §146), for the infinitive-like *dat.*. It is found:

i. With verbs of wishing, desiring, resolving etc. and nouns denoting longing, eagerness, anxiety etc. jivite apekham karohi D II.191 "quicken thy longing after life" (P.T.S. Translation); cp. kāme nāpekkhete cittām Sn 435 "the mind does not long for pleasure" guttīsu rakkhāvarāṇesu ussuko D III.148 "anxious for the protection and sheltering...".

ii. With verbs of inducing, inciting, rousing, directing and training: e.g., ...sakā pariṣāṃ uyyojesi Bhagavati brahmacariye M I.524 "roused his group for the Higher Life under the
Blessed One" (i.e. "urged them to practise the Higher Life..."");
ananulomike käyakamme samādapetvā A I.106 "having directed
(him) to improper bodily action"; dāne samādapeti M I.379
"induces to give..."; kumāraṃ rajje samanuṣāsati M II.75 "he
exhorts the prince...for kingship"; yannūnāhaṃ Rāhulaṃ āsavānāṃ
khaya vilayyamā M III.277 "well would it be if I were to train
Rāhula for the destruction of the banes"; cp. parallel idiom
with dat. vinayāya sikkhati Sn 974, and with acc. (of purpose or
direction) nibbānaṃ sikkhati Sn 940,1061.

iii. With verbs of employing, ordaining, enjoining, anointing,
etc. e.g., kammante payojeyya D I.71 "he would employ (invest)
that for business" (lit. in business); Govindiyā abhisācchāsami
D II.232 "I shall anoint (him) for the Chief-Steward-ship" (or
appoint to...); these uses are very much like the simple loc.
of place where (the matter in which) and in the following it
implies location quite plainly: pettike taṃ ṭhāne ṭhapayissāmi
D II.232 "I shall install him in his paternal office".

§ 171. The Inst.-like Locative.

The various nuances expressed by the loc., in Pāli just
as in Skr., bring it into contact not only with the dat. but
even with other cases, especially the inst. Kaccāyana lays down
(312) that the loc. is used sometimes in the sense of the inst.,
the vutti illustrating it with such examples as 'pattesu piṇḍāya
caranti' and 'pathesu gacchanti'. There are a good many instances of the loc. concurring with an inst. of means in general,
including such divisions of it as that of instrument, cause, and even of agency.

a. e.g., sīhassa migarañño vighāse\(^1\) samyaddho jara-sigālo....

D III.24 "the wretch of a fox fattened on (by) the broken meat of the lion, the king of beasts"; sabbesu dhammesu anuppalitto M I.171 "unsmeared by all things"; upamāyaṃ idh'ekaccaviṇānuprisā bhāsitassa atthaṃ ājāṇanti A V.194 "by a simile some wise people in this world understand the meaning of what is said"; so cakkhunā rūpaṃ disvā piyarūpe sārajjati appiyarupe byāpajjati\(^2\) M I.266 "seeing an object with his eye he is pleased with the pleasant and irritated by the unpleasant"; pāde\(^3\) pādaṃ acchādāya M I.354; D II.137,190 "covering (ā + chād) one foot with the other"; apadāne sobhathi paññā A I.102 "wisdom shines through (in) character".

b. The loc. also has more or less the instrumental sense of "according to" (vide inst. of cause §68.b.) with words denoting restraint, training or conducting oneself, and with the verb naccati "dances". In the former case it expresses the code or precept according to which (lit. in which, cp. Eng.'to be trained in') one is trained etc. and in the latter denotes that (music, band, orchestra etc.) to the accompaniment of which one dances, sings etc. e.g., paṭimokkhe samvero D II.50 "restraint in (i.e. according to) the Higher Discipline"; sikkhati sikkhapadesu D I.63,250 "trains (himself) in the precepts"; ariyadhamme avinīto S III.42 "not trained according to the

---

Noble Law"; carissāma Govindassānusāsane D II.244 (V.) "we shall conduct ourselves according to the advice of Govinda"; turiye naccati naṭṭaki Th 1.267 "the dancing-girl dances to the (accompaniment of) instrumental music".

§ 172. Loc. parallel to the Inst.-Abl.

We have seen that in a good many categories there is no actual line of demarcation between the syntactical spheres of the inst. and the abl... The logical relations expressed by the inst. of separation, of comparison and so on, for instance, properly belong to the logical scope of the abl... Such points of contact of these two cases find their expression even in their common parallelism with the loc... In the following instances the loc. is logically concurrent with the abl. but there is at the same time nothing to prevent the substitution of the inst. for the latter. Most of them border on the loc. of relation.

a. In denoting separation: tassa taṃ cittaṃ hine vimuttaṃ D III. 258 "his mind freed from low things"; cp. inst. with vimutta (§73.b.); ko su nāma dāni maṃ imasmiṃ kule paribhindi A IV.87 "who indeed estranged me (broke me away) from this family?". Here, it may be remarked, the loc. seems to be preferred to the abl. because the noun expressing the thing from which separation is implied denotes a place. If it were a person the abl. or the inst. would be given preference. Similarly we find such constructions as kulesu sakkariyamānaṃ D III.44 "being respected in (or by) the families", where the inst. of agency would
preferably be used if the noun were personal. Similarly: so tam rukkham mule chindeyya A I.204 "he would cut that tree at (by, from) the root". Here the abl. is actually found. e.g., tam rukkham mūlato chetvā M I.366 "having cut that tree from the root", where the abl. borders on the notion of side on or at which and that of point from which. It is significant of the syntactical fusion of these cases that the inst. too occurs, this time coordinately with the loc. in similar context. e.g., so tam rukkham mule chindeyya, mūlena chetvā....S II.88 "he would cut that tree at the root and having cut it by the root........".

b. In denoting cause or means (process through which): e.g., Tam pi Bhagavā na manasākasi yathā tam anuttare upadhi saṅkhaye vimutto S I.125 "The Blessed One did not even ponder on this, being emancipated through the destruction of the bases of becoming". Here saṅkhaya would be the usual construction or rarely saṅkhayena, i.e., the abl. or the inst. of cause. These varied uses of the same idiom show the futility of attempting to treat of syntax according to absolute categories. The same relation may be expressed in many different ways according to the context mostly determined by the principal verb of each sentence. This goes to support the observation that the laws governing syntactical change are psychological and not merely logical.

§ 173. The Abl.-like Loc.

Apart from the above uses where the loc. can be explained either by the abl. or the inst., it is frequently employed in
some other functions properly belonging to the abl. Most of these uses too border on the loc. of relation and some even on that of cause (nimitta).

a. It is chiefly found with verbs of receiving and obtaining such as labhati, and, those of expecting, seeking, learning such as paccāsimsati and ugganāhāti (cp. KVG §538.1.). e.g., Atha kho Raṭṭhapālo kulaputto mātāpitūsu pabbajjam alabhamāno M II.57 "Thereupon, Raṭṭhapāla, the householder's son. not obtaining permission to leave home from (lit. at, i.e. at the hands) of his parents": api nu so labhetha brahmanesu āsanam vā udakam vā ti D I.98 "would he receive a seat or water (for washing the feet) from the brahmins (at the hands of the brahmins)"; kim pana ... bhikkhu-saṅgho mayi paccāsimsati D II.100 "what indeed ... does the Order of monks expect from (of) me". The prefix pati-, it may be observed, being a karmapravacaniya, should normally be construed with the acc., gen. or the abl. (vide Pān. II.3.11). The abl. however is not found in the Nikāyas. The gen. (or the acc.) occurs side by side with the loc. e.g., na...sāvakesu anusāsaniḥ paccāsimsāmi mama (v.l. māmaḥ) yeva sāvakā anusāsaniḥ paccāsimsanti M II.10 "nor...do I seek instruction from my disciples, it is they who seek instruction from me".

b. The loc. is also used with verbs and nouns of fearing, trembling etc. to show the source from which fear is anticipated (or in which it arises). Here the abl. as well as the gen. can be regarded concurrent. The loc. in these instances too can be/as denoting cause or relation (nimitta-sattamī). The construction however is mostly found in verse. e.g., etam bhayam maranem pekkhamāno S I.2
"anticipating this fear from (lit. in) death"; marane me bhayam natthi Th 1.20 "I have no fear from (lit. in) death"; anumettesu vajjesu bhayadassāvi D I.63 "seeing fear (danger) even in the smallest vices"; siho va saddesu asantasanto Sn 71 "not trembling at sounds like the lion"; asantasam jivitasanūkhayamhi Sn 74 "not trembling at (the prospect of) the end of life".

c. Pāli grammarians regard the loc. found with verbs of disappearing etc. as being used instead of the abl. of separation. Kaccāyana, by the aphorism vena vā 'dassanām (276), allows optional construing with the abl. or the loc. such words as antarahito. But the loc. can be regarded in such examples as expressive, abstractly no doubt, of the place in which the action of disappearing or vanishing takes place. Here we have one more instance of a syntactical change brought about by a difference in viewpoint which is psychological. e.g., bodhirukkhamule antarahito D II.40 "disappearing from (lit. at) the foot of the tree of Enlightenment"; evam evam brahma-loke antarahito Bhagavato purato pāturahosi S I.137 "in this wise disappearing from the world of the Brahmās he manifested himself before the Blessed One".

§ 174. The Loc. of Cause and Relation.

It has been shown earlier, especially with regard to the adnominal and the abl., inst.- and the dat.-like locatives, that the loc. in those instances usually borders on the abstract notion of place where and that of relation (the thing concerning or regarding which). In some instances, such as the inst.-like
loc., the 'relation' expressed even implied cause. In fact there is no real boundary-line separating the nimitta-sattami — the name given to the loc. denoting cause, motive or purpose by local grammarians — and that denoting relation. The former seems to be but a division of the latter's sphere of application. The following distinctions are made merely for the sake of convenience and do not affect the logical unity underlying all such uses.

a. The Loc. of Relation in Pāli has a pronounced employment as compared with its almost negligible occurrence in the older language (cp. Speyer SS §141.6). Speyer refers to it only in the its narrow sense of 'the point in which'. In most instances it can be rendered by the Eng. phrases such as 'concerning, as regards, in the matter of, with regard to' and the like. The relation expressed is usually with regard to the whole statement, in which case the loc. is adverbal. e.g., Iti-h-idam Sakuludāyissa paribbājakassa parisā Sakuludāyīṃ paibbājakāṃ antarāyaṃ akāsi Bhagavati brahma-cariye M II.39 "In such wise did the wanderer Sakuludāyi's company oppose him in the matter of (practising) the Higher Life under the Blessed One"; pubbe anussutesu dhammesu cakkhum udapādi D II.32 "insight arose regarding previously unheard of things". In some instances, while the notion of relation is not lacking, the loc. may be rendered by 'on' or even 'in'. e.g., akaccasu ṭhānesu sameti D I.162 "there is agreement on (i.e. concerning) certain points"; ālokite vilokite sampajānakāri hoti M I.57 "he acts
mindfully with regard to (lit. in) looking forward or side­
ways”; abhikkante ...sampajānakāri D II.95 "acting mindfully
in going...". In the last two examples the loc. being of
present participles has also the temporal sense of "when".

b. But sometimes the 'relation' implied may be only with
regard to a particular thing expressed by one word in the
sentence, in which case it is adnominal. e.g., indriyesu
gutta-dvāro D I.63 "having guarded doors with regard to the
senses"; kāmesu micchācārā D II.13 "wrong conduct with regard
to the pleasures of sense"; aparapaccaya satthu-sāsane D II.14
"independent of others as regards the message of the Master".
In such instances the loc. can be even translated by the Eng.
'in', but nonetheless it is expressive of relation rather than
of the notion where, however much abstract it may be in sense.
To this class also belongs the loc. attending on the phrase
'ko pana vādo', denoting the person with regard to or about
whom the speaking is implied. We have referred to its use with
the gen. earlier (§156.a.). e.g., ko pana vādo manussabhūte
A I.161 "lit. what talk about a human-being ?" (implying "it
is unnecessary to talk about a human-being or in the case of a
human-being").

§175. There are many other modifications of the same idiom
too varied to be treated exhaustively. The following division
serves a practical purpose:
a. In the adnominal use this loc. seems to border on the gen.
on the whole. It is found with such nouns (substantives and adjectives) of ability and skill as those of kusala, kevala, kovida, katavi etc. which we have earlier discussed under the gen. (§151.a). Kaccāyana enjoins the promiscuous use of the two cases with such words1. The loc. however is not so copiously attested in the Nikāyas as the gen. The former seems to be employed only when the notion of relation is conspicuous. e.g., hatthasim pi katavi assasim pi katavi...M II.69 "experienced with regard to (the riding of) the horse as well as the elephant.

b. The same loc. is sometimes found employed, as in Skr. (cp. SS §141.6.) to denote the quality, art, etc. in which one excels, is weak, equal or unequal, or that in point of which one is distinguished as pure, defiled etc. e.g., añño samāno vā brāhmaṇo vā Bhagavato bhiyyo bhīṣṇatāro yadidham sambodhiyam D III.99 "another recluse or brahmin much more penetrating in point of enlightenment than the Blessed One"; evam so tasmin thāne parisuddho hoti D III.46 "thus as regards this point he is pure".

c. With various verbs of speaking, explaining, preaching, asking, disputing, conversing, etc. the loc. denotes the topic or subject on, about, over or regarding which the speaking etc. is done. This seems to border on the nimitta-sattamī more than any other loc. of relation, especially in its application with verbs of speaking asking. e.g., Bhagavā dhammaṃ deseti kusalesu

1. 'śāmissarādhipati-dāyādasakkhi-pañṭibhū-pasutakusalehi ca' (305).
dhammesu D III.102 "the Blessed One preaches the Doctrine with regard to the good things"; Bhagavā dhammaṃ deseti padhānesu D III.103 et. seq. "the Blessed One preaches (the Doctrine) on (the subject of) exertions"; ... upattīsu vyākaroti D II.201 "makes declarations as to (regarding) the births..."; pucchāmi Brāhmaṇāṇaṃ Sāmaṃkumāraṃ... paravediyesu D II.241 "I question the Brahmā S. on matters others would fain know", where the loc. is used in place of the usual acc. in the double acc. construction with pucchāmi (§58.c.); but sometimes this loc. of relation occurs with the double acc. e.g., Tatra maṇḍ aṇnataro tāpasa-brahmacāri Nigrodho nāma adhijigucche pañham pucchi D I.176 "there a certain ascetic-student named Nigrodha asked me about 'the higher forms of austere scrupulousness of life' (P.T.S.)";
ko nu kho pahoti sāmaṇena Gotamena sādhiṃ asmiṃ vacane paṭimant etum M II.147 "who can dispute with recluse G. on this topic?"; abhisānāni-nirodhe kathā udapādi D I.177 "the talk fell on the (lit. arose concerning the) higher cessation of perception". Similar is the loc. with anusāsati "instructs". e.g., khattiya ... rajje anusāsi D II.236 "instructed the princes...... on kingship".

§ 176. The Loc. of Reason and Motive.

From the last two paragraphs it may be observed that the loc. in some instances not only denoted relation (the thing regarding which) but even implied a causal notion at the same time (the thing on account of which). It is curious how
the local grammarians while overlooking the wider category of relation — Kaccayana only mentions specifically the loc. with words like sāmi but does not seem to have grasped the fundamental unity of conception as we understand by the notion of relation — had observed and provided for the comparatively rare use which they call the nimitta-sattamī. We do not agree with Speyer (SS §148) in his inclusion of the loc.of reference (i.e. relation) in the nimitta-sattamī of the Indian grammarians. On the other hand the conception of the orthodox school merely constitutes a division of the wider category of relation. But he is undoubtedly justified in postulating a logical connection between the dat.-like loc. and the so-called nimitta-sattamī. The former denotes the spot towards which there is movement and this may be applied broadly to signify the person or thing towards whom or which some action some action is directed, in other terms, that on account of which something is done. He adds: "Speaking exactly, the dat.-like loc. ... is but a consequence of this general faculty to denote that about which one is engaged" (SS §147.IV.). The conventional examples which of the grammarians, which Speyer himself follows, do not however occur in the actual literature. In its simplest form it signifies the cause for some action as, for instance, in: sarira-

2. 'kammakaraṇanimmittatthesu sattamī' Kac. 312.
3. 'dīpi cāmmesu haññate' and 'kuñjaro dantesu haññate' common to both Skr. and Pāli grammarians; vide Kāś.on Pān. II.3.36.

and vutti on Kac.312, Mog.II.36.
bhanga\textsuperscript{1}siyā sampah\textsuperscript{e}ro D II.166 (V.) "there would be a quarrel over the distribution of the relics"; mama sāvakā adhisile sam-bhāventi M II.9 "the disciples respect me for my higher virtue" (cp. adhipānāya M II.10); idha khattiyā khattiyam kismicid eva pakaraṇe"khuramundaṃ karitvā D I.98 "the princes having inflicted the punishment of shaving off the head on one (of their fellows) for some offence or other..."; kismicici-d-eva karaṇe
....jīvitā voropesum A IV.65 "killed (him)...for some offence (matter) or other".

§ 177. a. With words denoting love, hatred, sympathy, antipathy, friendship, enmity, anger, pity, compassion and jealousy etc., Pāli just as Skr. (SS §148) employs a loc. similar to the nimitta-sattamī. The sense of "towards, against, for" is here quite conspicuous. e.g., atthi me tumhesu anukampā M I.12 "I have pity on (towards) you"; sattesu kāruṇīnataṃ paṭicca D II.38 "owing to (his) compassion for beings"; sabrahmacaṇḍisu kupito A V.80; M I.101 "angered with (against) the co-celibates"; purisesu māṇasaṃ D II.13 "a love for (other) men"; aṁnāmāṇāhamhi cītīni padūsenti D I.20 "set their hearts at enmity against each other"; paralābhāsakkāragarukāramāṇanavandanapūjanāsu issati upadussati issāṃ bandhati A II.203 "he is jealous for, angered against and breeds envy towards the gain, honour, respect, worship and homage that others receive".

1. Comy. 'sarīra-bhaṅga-nimittam dhātu-koṭṭhāsa-hetu' Sum.II.608.
b. Under the abstract use of the loc. (vide §163.a.vi.) we may also place the following where the loc., though capable of being rendered by the Eng. 'in', is still syntactically far removed from the pure local or temporal function: porohacce rame D II.243 "I delight in the office of chaplain"; tasmā'ham nagehe rame D II.243 "therefore I do not delight in (life at) home". Here the inst. is the concurrent idiom (§71.a). When, however, it occurs with the past participles of such verbs as ramaṭi, yuñjati and others like nivīṭṭha, gathita, giddha, and and even pure adjectives of the type of piya and manāpa, the loc. logically borders on the nimitta-sattamī (cp. SS §148). e.g., uccepake vate ratā M II.7 "devoted to (engaged in) the vow of eating the leavings"; amussā itthiyā sāratto M II.224 "attached to this woman"; abhirato paviveke D I.60 "devoted to solitude"; adhicitte yuttā M I.451 "attached to (engaged in) higher thought"; hatapahate nivīṭṭho M I.286 "given to killing and slaying"; pañcakāma-guṇa gathita D I.246 "intoxicated with the five-fold pleasure of sense"; kāmesu giddho D III.107 "avaricious for pleasures of the sense". All these are included in the general category of relation.

§ 178. In general the loc. may denote a disposition or behaviour towards somebody (cp. SS §149). Then it is synonymous, as Speyer points out, with the construction paṭi + acc. (cp. Pāṇini example 'sādhu Devadatta sādhur mātari or mātaram prati', corresponding to which Moggallāṇa gives 'sādhu Devadatto mātaramabhi' II.10). In the Nikāyas the most conspicuous use of this idiom is with the
verbs paṭipajjati and some other compounds of the same root. e.g., kathā maya bhante mātugāme paṭipajjāmāti D II,141 "how shall we, Sir, conduct ourselves towards the women-folk?"; tathārūpāsu (kaññāsu) cārīttam āpajjita hoti M I,268 "he commits misbehaviour even towards such (girls)". But this loc. is not restricted to such verbs alone. It may occur wherever the notion of towards someone is implied by the predicate. Such idioms as 'cittām āghāteti', 'samannenaṃ karoti' and 'dandaṃ nidahati' are always construed with a loc. of the person, perhaps with the exception of the first where the dat. is not an unlikely alternative. In the other two the loc. is actually due to the sense of the noun and not to any peculiarity of the verbs karoti and nidahati. e.g., Sāriputta-Moggallāṇesu cittām āghātētvā S I,151 "having incited his heart to hatred against Sāriputta and Moggallāna"; ...Tathāgate samannenaṃ kātabbā M I,317 "...a search should be directed towards the Tathāgata"; cp. sabbesu bhūtesu nidhāya dandaṃ Sn 35 "having laid aside the weapon against all beings".

§ 179. The Loc. with Local and Temporal Sense.

a. The Loc. of Distance. The loc. may denote not only place where but also the distance at which one thing or fact is from another (cp. SS §144.9.). According to orthodox grammarians the loc. or the acc. can optionally be used to denote distance but if an interval of time is to be signified the loc. alone is

1. vide Speyer SS §144.R.1. citing Patañjali I.p.455.
to be used. In denoting *space* the loc. can stand not only for
the Eng. 'at' but also for 'within'. e.g., yannānāham imāsu
tālantarikāsu dhanu-sate dhanu-sate pokkharāṇīyo māpeyyam D II.
178 "well would it be I were to cause ponds to be constructed
in the spaces between these palms at every hundred bow-lengths";
suneyyāma taṃ Bhagavantaṃ dasasu yojanesu M II.90 "if we could
but hear that Blessed One within or at (a distance of) ten
leagues (sci. from here)". In this idiom the point from which
distance is counted is denoted by the abl. and the loc. marks
the *intervening space* implied between the two limits of reckoning
*ab quo* and *ad quem*.

§ 180. The Loc. of Time. This is, generally speaking, only
a narrow division of the broader conception of the loc. of
circumstance which also includes the *absolute* use. Logically
no strict line of demarcation can be drawn between the idea of
time at which and that of circumstance under which something
happens. So even Kaccāyana has one rule for both functions,
viz., kālabhāvesu ca (315) which the vutti explains as meaning
that the loc. should be employed to signify the *time* (kāla) in
which or the circumstance (bhāva) under which the agent per-
forms the action? Since the latter includes under this loc.
such examples as 'pubbanhasamaye gato' and 'also others of the
type of 'gosu duyhamānāsu gato' (absolute) and 'duddhāsu āgato'
(circumstance), it is clear that according to the orthodox

1. 'kālabhāvesu ca kattari payujjamāne sattamī vibhatti hoti'.
tradition the loc. absolute and that of circumstance were regarded as distinct variations of the same loc. of time. This last denotes such notions as the time in or at which or within which and is the logical counterpart of the loc. of place where for it similarly expresses when an action takes place. The acc. is here the concurrent idiom (§46). e.g., ....tāyaṃ velāyaṃ imaṃ udānaṃ udānesi D II.136 "at that time the Blessed One uttered this solemn utterance"; yasmiṃ samaye uppaṇjanti saññī tasmiṃ samaye hoti ti D I.130 "at which time the perceiving arises at that time it exists"; cp. ...tāsu tāsiyeva jātisu D II.91 (V.) "in various births...".

§ 181. The Loc. of Circumstance, as pointed out before, is the general conception under which the notions of time at which etc. are included. In the case of the temporal loc., as may be seen from the foregoing examples, the word in the loc. is always one that denotes time such as samaya, velā, kāla, jāti etc., but when implying circumstance it is not necessarily so. Generally it denotes the circumstance (accompanying the prevailing event) under which the action comes to pass (cp. Speyer SS §143.8). e.g., tathārūpāsu āpadāsu bhogehi pariyodhāya vattanti A II.68 "In such (times of) distress they safeguard themselves by means of the wealth (in reserve)"; appekāda namantane pi bhuñjāmi sālīnām odānan...M II.7 "at other times I partake of the meals of rice...at the invitation (of someone else)"; etarahi vā mamaccaye vā attadīpā viharissant i S V.154 "now or on my demise they will live as islands unto themselves". In the last two
examples the loc. is interchangeable with the inst. In fact
the second accave has as v.l. the form accavena which is regularly employed elsewhere. Sometimes this borders on the loc. of
relation, e.g., Dutiye ca ...antânantam lokassa paññāpentī D I.

22 "Even in the second case...they maintain that the world is
finite or infinite"; cp. kasmā na paridevesi evarūpe mahabhaye
Th 1.706 "why do you not lament at (in time of) such great
danger"; maranasmiṇa socati Th 1.712 "he does not grieve
(in time of or) over death". Under this loc. Speyer places the
word kāle "in due time" which occurs in Pāli only in gāthā as
the concurrent idiom for kālena which is usually found in prose,
e.g., annañca laddhā vasanañca kāle Sn 971 "having received
food and raiment in due time".

§ 182. The Locative Absolute.

The absolute construction of any case plays the part
of a subordinate clause to the principal sentence. As regards
the origin of this employment there is diversity of opinion.
We have seen that the absolute use of the gen. does not represent
an isolated construction but there is a logical connection
between it and the main sentence. It is either temporal or has
the sense of notwithstanding or in spite of (§158). In the case
of the loc. too the temporal idea seems to be the main significance of the absolute construction. Macdonell thinks that it
started from the ordinary use of the loc. (VGS §205.1). Combined
with a participle it came to be regarded as a temporal or quali-
fying (i.e. adverbial) clause where the noun alone could not be employed. But Speyer traces the origin of the absolute notion to the participial employment (SS §365). According to him, the loc. of the participle is the essential factor in it and the nominal portion is just accessory. The fact, however, seems to lie midway between these two views. The fundamental function of any absolute case is, broadly speaking, to denote an attendant circumstance (vide inst. of attendant circumstance bordering on an absolute use §68.d.). It differs from the simple temporal or modal use of a case only in the predicative character of the participle. Since the latter's presence makes it virtually a clause separate from the main sentence having a predicate of its own, it is regarded as freed or detached (absolutus) from the construction of the rest of the sentence. But there is always a logical connection between the two. Logically it is parallel to the adverbia! use of the case involved and as such may be temporal, modal, conditional, hypothetical, causal or concessive. It may be remarked that the participle thus construed is either a present or a past passive one. The future participle is never employed in this connection nor others which lack the adjectival quality such as the active past participle, since these cannot agree with the substantive put in the oblique case (cp. SS §365). These two factors of the absolute construction are called its subject and predicate. The loc. absolute is a frequent idiom in Pali and appears in various nuances, some of which are syntactically much involved. We may notice the following distinctions:
§ 183.a. In its simple temporal sense, it does not vary much from the loc. of time except in the presence of the participle. e.g., Atha kho Pañcasikha Gandhabba-putto abhikkantāya rattiyā ...yena Bhagavā ten'upasaṅkami D II.220 "Thereupon Pañcasikha, the (son of the) heavenly musician, when the night was far spent... ...came whither the Blessed One was"; idha pana bhikkhave bhikkhu rattiyā nikkhantāya divase paṭihite iti paṭisahācikkhati...A IV.321 "Here, brethren, a monk, when the night is over and the day has set in, reflects thus..."; tasmā tasmā ca kālahate Tathāgataṁ upasaṅkamitvā...D II.33 "when this or that person is dead he approaches the Tathāgata...".

b. While having the temporal sense, especially with the present participle, the loc. absolute may denote the circumstance that attends on or accompanies the main action. e.g., ukkhāsu dhariyamānāsu Rājagahaṁ ā niyyāsi D I.49 "he set out from R. while torches were being held" (or with torches being held...). Such clauses are usually rendered in English by the participial clause 'torches being held, he left R.' Similarly: imasmim ca pana veyyakāranasmiṁ bhaññamāne sahāsi loka-dhātu akampittha D I.46;II.288 "while this explanation was being delivered a thousand world systems shook"; cp. setambhi chatte anuhīramāne sabbā ca disā viloketī D II.16 "he looked on all the regions while a canopy was held over him"; saṅghasmiṁ bhijjamānasmiṁ nāññāṁ bhiyyo amaññatha M III.154 (V.) "the Order (i.e. the Church) being in (the course of) disruption they did not think of others". The absolute loc. denoting simultaneity may also be included under this group. e.g., Parinibbute Bhagavati
saha parinibbāṇa bhūmicālo ahosi D II.156 "Simultaneously with the passing away of the Blessed One there was an earthquake"; ossatthe ca Bhagavato āyusaṅkhāre mahā-bhūmicālo ahosi D II.106 "with the renouncing of his vital element (i.e. when he shook off the sum of his remaining life) by the Blessed One there was a great earthquake".

c. In the last two examples the absolute phrase represents an action or process immediately preceding that of the main sentence, and may be rendered "as soon as, no sooner than" etc. Hence the loc. absolute is used in a general way to denote the time since or after which some action is supposed to take place. It is frequently found with such formations as 'acira-pakkante' etc. where a time-denoting word is compounded with the participle, in which case it is completely identical with the gen. absolute in its temporal function (§158.c.). e.g., Atha kho Bhagavā acirapakkante Vajjiyamāhite gahapatimhi bhikkhū āmantesi A V.192 cp. D II.204;M I.192 "Thereupon, not long after the householder V. had departed, the Blessed One addressed the monks"; Ekam samayam āyasmā Ānanda Sāvatthiyam viharati...aciraparinibbute Bhagavati D I.204 "Once the ven. Ānanda was living at S. not long after the Blessed One had passed away"; aciraparinibbutesu Sāriputta-Moggallānesu S V.163 "not long since S. and M. had passed away"; sattāha-pabbajite...rājisimhi dibbam cakkaratanam antaradāyī D III.60 "seven days after the Royal Sage had left home, the divine Jewel of the Wheel disappeared"; sattāha-jīte Ānanda Bodhisatte Bodhisatta-mātā kālam karoti D III.14;M III.122 "seven days after the Bodhisatta is born, Ananda, his mother dies"
d. Sometimes when the main sentence is a negative statement the subordinate clause expressed by the loc. absolute construction may denote "even when, i.e. in spite of or notwithstanding" as much as the gen. absolute expressive of anādara (§158.a.). e.g.,

deve vassante deve galagālayante vijjatāsu niccharantīsu asaniyā phalantiyā n'eva passeyya n'eva saddām suṇeyya D II.131 "even when the rain is falling, torrents are pouring, lightning is issuing and thunder is pealing he would not see or hear a sound";

evan pi kho yasasā Ānando Bhagavātā olārike nimitte kayiramāne ...nāsakkhi paṭivijjitaṁ D II.103 "even when a material (ample) sign was made by the Blessed One, the ven. Ānanda was not able to realize...";

"...even when the Doctrine has been methodically preached by me". In these examples the sense of anādara is emphasized by the presence of eva or evam, just as the temporal sense is supplemented in the following by the insertion of atha at the beginning of the main sentence: Asmiṁ ti kho panā bhikkhave adhiṁte, paṁcannāṁ indriyānaṁ avakkanti hoti S III.46 "when (the thought) 'I am' is conceived, then, there is the appearance of the five sense-organs".

§ 184. As pointed out above the temporal notion is not the only idea expressed by the loc. absolute. It includes many other shades of meaning.

a. For instance, it may stand for an adverbial clause denoting
cause as those which in English begin with 'because, as a result of, since'. e.g., Mā kho tvaṃ tāta dibbe cakka-ratane antara-
hite anattamanodhoti D III.60 "do not be disheartened, dear one, because the divine Jewel of the Wheel has disappeared"; ettakamhe:
vā dūkkhe nijjinnē sabbā dūkkhaṁ nijjinnam bhavissati M I.93
"as a result of so much sorrow being exhausted all grief comes to an end"; Govinde brahmāne kālakate rājā Disāmpati paridevesi
D II.231 "when (implying because) the brahmin G. died King D. lamented"; evam h'etaṃ Mahāli hoti bhikkhuno puratthimāya
dīyā okamsa-bhāvite samādhimhi D I.153 "Thus it occurs to the monk, Mahāli, as a result of self-collectedness being developed with regard to the eastern quarter".
b. It may also signify a condition that exists or should exist for the fulfillment of the main action, which may be rendered by such expressions as 'if, on condition, provided that' etc. This construction is not logically very different from the above (cause).
i. e.g., Bhave kho sati jāti hoti D II.31 "when (if, on condition that) there is becoming, there is birth"; kimhi nu khaosati jarāmaranaṃ na hoti S II.7 "which being absent (if what is absent) is there birth and death?"; kismin sati piyappiyaṃ na hoti D II.277 "what being present is there no (difference of) pleasant and unpleasant?".
ii. When the main sentence is interrogative the subordinate clause represents a hypothetical condition as those with 'supposing, now if' etc. in English. e.g., dassane Bhagavā sati kathāṃ paṭipajjītabbo D II.141 "supposing there is seeing
how should we behave?": tasmiṣ ankarāṇīye kayiramāne ko Edīnavo pāṭikāṅkho ti A I.57 "supposing something that should not be done is committed (by him) what (consequence) should be expected?".

iii. In this stereotyped absolute construction with sati not rarely we find in the Nikāyas a plural subject made to agree with the singular participial predicate (sati). This is grammatically due to the fact atthi is not seldom found in Pāli just as in Skr. used with a plural subject. (cp. sub atthi P.T.S.Dict).

e.g., pādesu sati abhikkama-pāṭikkamo paññayati S IV.171 "when there are feet, movement (lit. going and coming) appears"; tesu Skāresu tesu liṅgesu ...asati... D II.62 "were there no modes, features....". This use of the singular predicate for plural in the (loc.) absolute construction is, however, more than a mere grammatical peculiarity. It exists even in other I.E. languages1.

§ 185. In the examples discussed in the preceding paragraphs the loc. absolute construction without exception consisted of the subject-part which can be either a noun substantive or pronoun (or even a noun clause as in 'asma ti kho pana bhikkhave adhigate... S III.46), and the predicate-part which is usually a participle. It is however not necessary that the predicate of the absolute loc. should be always a participle. Just as a

1. Otto Jespersen points out in his 'Philosophy of Grammar' that there is such a construction in Spanish (p. 129).
a noun (adjective or substantive) can stand as predicate of an independent clause or sentence, so in the absolute construction some such word with a predicative force may stand for the verbal element. Nearly always it is an adjective or, as in some of the examples referred to, a participle used as an adjective (cp. samāhite, nijjīne in a.). Adjectival compounds are frequently employed in this rôle. e.g., pañca-vassa-satāyukesu bhikkhave manussosu tayo dhammā vepullām agaṇamsam D III.70 "when men were of five hundred years life-span three things increased"; te atira-dakkhiṇiyā nāvāya tirā-dassīṁ sakunam muṇicanti D I.222 "when the ship is so far that the shore is not visible they let free a bird that finds the shore".

In most cases, however, the predicate is incomplete without some such loc. of a participle as sati, ōhite etc. But this want is not always felt. e.g., bahukamhi thokam denti paṃtamhi lūkham denti A IV.10 "there being much he gives little, and there being excellent (food) he gives gross (food)".

§ 186. Occasionally the subject-part of the absolute construction is to be understood. This is especially so in the case of the stock-phrases evam sati, evam sante etc. (cp. acc. absolute: evam santam D I.186; vide §56). e.g., evam sante tassa purisassa appāṭihirakatam bhāsitaṃ sampajjati D I.193 "when this so that person's talk appears (lit. becomes) foolish". But it is not seldom found with other participles usually of 'intransitive' verbs. e.g., evam vutte te bhikkhū Bhagavantam etad avocum D I.1 "When (it) was said thus those monks replied
to the Blessed One:”. A similar construction is found in: Saṅghe Gotami dehi, saṅghe te dimna ahaṅc'eva pūjito bhavissāmi saṅgho ca M III.253, where the second 'saṅghe' is just loc. of person given to (§170.a) and not the loc. of the absolute construction. In the following example the loc. sg. 'vimuttasmiṁ' also appears to be employed absolutely: ariyasāvako....virāgā vimuccati, vimuttasmiṁ vimuttam iti ānāmaṁ hoti M I.500 "the noble disciple...is freed through detachment, when free he obtains the knowledge that there is freedom"; cp. avijjāsavā piciṣṭam vimuccati, vimuttasmiṁ vimuttam iti ānāmaṁ hoti M I.184; III.20

A. When the participle which is the predicate of the absolute construction is passive it may be sometimes attended by the agent, i.e., the logical subject of the verb represented by the participle, the grammatical subject/either put into the loc. or not expressed at all. e.g., yo bhikkhave Tathāgatena evam...evam ācikkhiyamāne...na passati S III.139 "who(ever), monks, does not see...when it is being thus pointed out by the Tathāgata"; vandite ca pana āyasmatā Mahā-Kassapena.....sayam eva Bhagavato citako pājali D II.164 "when worshipped by the ven. Mahā-Kassapa...the funeral pyre of the Blessed One blazed forth by itself". In the last example the loc. (vandite) can not be strictly regarded as absolute for the construction can stand even if it were the nom. (vandito). Here we have an interesting link in the development of the absolute use from the participial construction (cp. Speyer SS§365). The loc. here is used with a temporal significance (when worshipped).
Such temporal employment of the locative sg. of participles is not unusual in Pāli. e.g., supinante pi någamā Sn 293 "he did not come even in a dream (lit. even in or while dreaming) where the Comy. has 'supinenāpi na agamasi' (Pji II.318).

b. Sometimes it is very doubtful whether the construction is absolute or whether the loc. involved is just temporal or local. This is especially the case when the words in the loc. are such as denoting pi time or place. e.g., samvattamāne loke yebhuyyena sattā Abhassara-samvattanikā honti D III.28 "when the world is evolving or in the evolving world the beings on the whole tend to be radiant"; Seyyathāpi nāma sardādasamaye viddhe vigatavallhake deve Siddico...bhāsate ca tapate ca virotate ca S I.65 "Just as in autumn when the sky is clear and free from clouds (or in a clear, cloudless sky) the sun shines bright, warm and brilliant".

§ 187.

The Adverbial Locative.

a. Many locatives, especially of words denoting time and space (place), have acquired the character of adverbs (cp. 88 §150). In the sentence they are mostly found as separate elements qualifying the cation as denoted by the main verb.

i. The most frequent adverbial locatives in the Nikāyas are those of proximity or the opposite, generally denoting where, such as santike, avidīre and sammukhe. As pointed out before (§150), these usually agree with the gen. of the preceding noun which limits the sense of the adverb. e.g., Bagavato
Santike imaṃ gāthāṃ abhāsi D II.254 "he uttered this verse in the presence (lit. proximity) of the Blessed One"; Atha kho Brahmāyussa brāhmaṇāssa avidūre ambavanassa etad ahosi M II. 141 "then this thought occurred to the brahmin B. (when he was) not far from the mango-grove"; Anuruddhassa saṃmukhe pātur- ahosi S V.294; D II.206 "appeared in front of Anuruddha". These adverbs can be used even with verbs of motion denoting the place gone to. e.g., pahiṇeyyasi tvam Ānanda Vaggumudītirīyānaṃ bhikkhūnaṃ santike dūtam Ud 26 "send (you), Ānanda, a messenger to the (presence of) V. monks".

ii. The above sense of place gone to is mostly expressed by the pronominal forms kuhiṃ, kahāṃ, yahīṃ etc. derived from kasmīṃ, yasmīṃ etc. These are used exactly like kutra, yatra, mostly with verbs of motion. e.g., kuhiṃ gamissasi D II.343 "where will you go?"; kahāṃ nu kho bhavaṃ Gotama viharati D I.150 "where does the ven. Gotama live now?"; yahīṃ yahīṃ tantaṃ Tathāgato sukhasmiṃ paññāpeti M I.400 "in relation to whichever (thing) the Tathāgata lays down this or that as part of happiness".

iii. A peculiar use of the adverbial loc. is found in -agge (Skr. agre "at the head"; cp. SS §150) which in Pāli has acquired the sense of "since". It is mostly found as the second member of an adverbial compound. e.g., ajjatagge pāṇupetam saranaṃ gataṃ M I.368 "taken refuge for life from today (i.e. from now on till life lasts)"; yadagge ahaṃ Mahāli Bhagavantam upanissāya viharāmi na ciraṃ tīni vassāni D I.152 "it is not more than three years, Mahāli, since I have lived under the
Blessed One". The forms yadagge and tadagge are found coordi-
tately in the sense of "from... till...". e.g., yadagge ahāṃ
bhavatā Bhagavatī abhippasando... tadagge kho pana... D I.93
"since I gained reliance in the Blessed One, from that time
onwards...".

iv. A few archaic forms of original locatives are found in the
Nikāyas with the causal and modal sense. Such are evī and raho(§2
which though originally meaning "in the open" and "in secrecy"
have come to signify the adverbial notions of "openly" and
"secretly" (manner). e.g., evī ca eva raho ca M I.321.

b.i. At other times however these adverbs are found not as
separate words in the sentence but as words qualifying some
adjective and limiting its application. This is found in the
instance when the adverb is compounded with the adjective as
the first member of an aluk-samāsa both together constituting
an adjectival compound (bahubbīhi). e.g., majjhe-kalyāṇama
(dhammaṃ) D I.62; D III.76 "(the doctrine) good-in-the-middle";
pubbe-nivāsa-paṭisasāyutta dhammā katha D II.1 "doctrinal talk
regarding previous (lit. be-fore) lives". But more often the
adverb is left outside the compound. e.g., pubbe ananussutassā
dhammassa D II.32 "of the doctrine not heard before".

ii. This kind of compound can also be formed from the peculiar
adverbs of the class of kuhim etc., the second member usually
being a derivative form of some verb of motion. e.g., kuhimgāmi
bhavissati M I.8 "lit. whither-going shall he be".
## APPENDIX

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nom.</td>
<td>pathamā prāthamā</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>paccatta-vacana S I.183;II.659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voc.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>āmantana</td>
<td>ālapana</td>
<td>āmantana</td>
<td>kathā-savana-yutta-puggala-vacana Pps.I.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acc.</td>
<td>dutiyā dvitiyā</td>
<td>karman</td>
<td>kamma</td>
<td>kamma</td>
<td>upayoga-vacana Pj.II.140 Sum.II.410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inst.</td>
<td>tatiyā trtiyā 4</td>
<td>karana</td>
<td>karaṇa</td>
<td>karaṇa</td>
<td>karana-vacana S I.33 Sum II.410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(agent)</td>
<td>(kartrā) (kattu) 5</td>
<td>(karaṇa)</td>
<td>(karaṇa)</td>
<td>(karaṇa)</td>
<td>(karaṇa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dat.</td>
<td>catutthi caturthi</td>
<td>sampradāna</td>
<td>sampadāna</td>
<td>sampadāna</td>
<td>sampadāna-vacana Pj.II.317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abl.</td>
<td>pañcamī</td>
<td>apādāna</td>
<td>apādāna</td>
<td>avadhi</td>
<td>nissakka-vacana Pj.II.395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gen.</td>
<td>chatthi saṣṭī</td>
<td>sambandha</td>
<td>sāmi</td>
<td>sambandha</td>
<td>sāmi-vacana Pj.II.210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loc.</td>
<td>sattami saptami</td>
<td>adhikarana</td>
<td>okāsa</td>
<td>ādhāra</td>
<td>bhumma-vacana S I.33;SumII.410</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>